# Foreword

*Racism is a subtle and complex phenomenon ... Whatever its subtle disguises and forms, it is deeply divisive, intolerant of difference, a source of much human suffering and inimical to the common sense of belonging laying at the basis of every stable political community. It can have no part in a decent society.*

Bhikhu Parekh
The Commission on the Future of Multi-Ethnic Britain
The Runnymead Trust, 2000

If you are invited to write a foreword to a book, it is likely that you will agree with much of what the book says, and this is no exception. The elimination of racism and promotion of good relations between different races and cultures is one of the most challenging issues facing all of us today. In producing such an important book based on new methodology and real knowledge of the subject, Sam Magne has made a major contribution to broadening our understanding. The experiences and perceptions it contains are real and often make for uncomfortable reading.

This year marks the 10th anniversary of the murder of Stephen Lawrence – a tragedy that brought about the Macpherson recommendations and amendments (in 2000) to the Race Relations Act 1976. Without the possibility of changing the past, the Devon and Exeter Racial Equality Council has looked to learning from past and present experience and to brightening the future. For some years it has been appreciated that, in an increasingly Multi-Ethnic Devon, there was call for researching the gap between the needs of Black and Minority Ethnic people here and those of local service providers. Through the generous financial support of the South West Regional Development Agency, we stepped up to this challenge and this handbook is the result.

For most people, an increasingly diverse society is not so much a threat as a challenge. The need is to rise to that challenge, and deal with unthinking dominance and structural defects in our society far more profound and at a much higher level than the personality of practitioners and managers. This demands wisdom of a kind that can only be achieved through knowledge and understanding of the backgrounds, hopes and fears that exist among Black and Minority Ethnic people.

Public bodies and their staff have newly revised and heightened duties for preventing individual and institutional racism. This handbook contains

insights into the points where those duties and the real experience of Black and Minority Ethnic people converge, illustrating the effects of complacency and its consequences, providing ways forward, reliable procedures and real solutions for clients, staff and society at large.

Any person whose view is that people should be treated in the same way as anyone else is not being sufficiently thoughtful. A more subtle approach is called for, based on a deeper appreciation of the complexities of operating in a multi-ethnic society. In the light of the Macpherson Report findings, I hope people will read this handbook with open minds and reflect on the important messages it contains.

There is a wealth of information, guidance and good sense in this pioneering work. That makes the handbook not only interesting of itself but potentially of great value to practitioners and managers in performing their day-to-day work. It must be a high priority to ensure that the political and organisational will is found to put the detailed lessons into practice to demonstrate commitment to the values of fairness, respect for human dignity and inclusiveness.

Above all, this handbook will help people at all levels cope with an ever-changing world of increasing diversity and complexity.  I commend it to you.

**Tanvir Ahmed**
**Chair**
**Devon Racial Equality Council**

**Cover note:**
This Handbook *Multi-Ethnic Devon* contributes a rural insight to an influential time in race equality, following the Parekh Report on *The Future of Multi-Ethnic Britain*. The Handbook's Devon-earth cover and the colour-shades of the leaves are symbolic of the local source and great ethnic diversity informing its contents.

**Author's note: "Black and Minority Ethnic"**

Race equality matters when people find themselves isolated, vulnerable to abusive behaviour and overlooked as a result of prejudice and failures in society to accommodate diversity. The participants' experiences conveyed in this Handbook illustrate just how much it matters and that we need to be able to talk about it in order to bring about positive change. The tool of appropriately descriptive language, however, to describe the people for whom the impact matters most, is elusive. Politically loaded and culturally sensitive terminology comes in and out of favour. No term is available that can comprehensively describe the huge diversity of ethnic identities that bring a wealth of heritages, culture and language to Devon's demography. There is no one particular ethnic identity around which to construct a phrase that will keep the reader in mind of the individuals and families who know that their ethnicity is marked out in the landscape by difference. In this diverse demography, 'Black' does not suffice alone as a description and nor does 'Black and Asian' reflect the plethora of ways that individuals from Britain and around the world chose to describe their identity (see chapter 4). This handbook has settled for the term 'Black and Minority Ethnic' in the absence of a better phrase, with the recognition that the substance of the realities that this research has the privilege to share, must transcend the reservations over terminology.

# Multi-Ethnic Devon – A Rural Handbook

**FINDING YOUR WAY AROUND THIS BOOK**

How to use this report
to support your work with
Black and Minority Ethnic people in rural Devon

How to use this report
to help you respond to racist behaviour
that targets you

How to use this report
to help you eliminate racist behaviour from
your place of work
your community

How to use this report to enrich what you do and think

A navigation tool for use by readers of this Handbook from a fellow reader:

This is your quick-reference tool to the full report. This is to give you a flavour of what you can expect to find throughout the pages of the report, and to encourage you to turn to it for help. Photocopy this tool for all your colleagues, keep one by every desk, and let it help you source the information and guidance you need as you work to eliminate racism. Completely.

# The story of the Rural Outreach Project report: Multi-Ethnic Devon

**This report is different** to any piece of research I have seen. It echoes with the voices of the people whose lives resonate through the pages. It tells the story of racism from the perspective of those for whom it is a daily reality.

**The author has listened** -and learned- and now communicates. She has faithfully and respectfully collected tales that evoke for us all what it is like to live in Devon if you are a person with Black or Minority Ethnic roots. She has allowed the brilliant thinking of many creative solutions to emerge from those individuals who know, really know, what they are talking about.

**The author helps us** look at our individual responsibilities- and privileges- as we continue to eliminate racism from our lives. She helps us look at our collective responsibilities- and duties- as we eliminate racism from our institutional edifices.

**If you take the time** to read the report from cover to cover your life will be enriched by the experience. Alternatively, if you use it as the invaluable work of reference that it is, your effectiveness on working against racism in Devon will be significant.

**We'd like you to use this book as a resource** – not just to read but also to help you in working through your thoughts and in planning action.
**Here is how to** use the book in your working life:
➔ Each chapter has new insights, experiences, ideas, problems, solutions. So that you can source the information that you need, when you need it, we have identified overleaf key strands of learning in each chapter. Use this **'*Navigation Tool'*** to pick out key learning points that grab your interest and to get a quick overview.
➔ Use the contents list to search in more detail for the location of topics
➔ Read the summary report to get a condensed version of key issues
➔ Go to the Chapters you're interested in to get the data and detail you need for practical work and to hear the voices of the participants verbatim.
➔ Let the case studies and quotes in the chapters help to sensitise you to the realities that this Handbook is about.
➔ There's a **'*Think Sheet'*** at the end of this section, designed to help you keep a track of the issues that strike you, your ideas and plan of response. Photocopy and use a *'Think Sheet'* for each chapter.

We've also included a number of worksheets and tools that we hope you will find useful in both group sessions and individual work, as an aid to planning race equality initiatives. We've flagged these *tools* up in the contents table with the symbol ✂. Most of these tools can be accessed in the handbook's web-based Appendices at www.DevonREC.org

There are chapters with full statistics, the most detailed and up-to-date data available. There is a detailed guide to Impact Assessment, invaluable to organisations fulfilling their statutory duties under the Race Relations Amendment Act. There are new approaches to overcome the frustrations and failures of other attempts to expose the nature, often invidious as well as overt, of racism in rural and urban Devon and its devastating impact on us all. There are ideas for building new networks of support. There are recommendations for improving practice across the relevant agencies. There are suggestions about changing the way we behave.

**We live in a racist society**. This report will help it - and us - change for the better.

*Chris Taylor*   B.Sc.(Hons.) Dip.SLS FRSA
Devon Racial Equality Council Executive Lead – Rural Outreach

# *Navigation Tool* – Multi Ethnic Devon

**Story of chapter 1 - key outcomes**
1. This research brings together a meeting of a) the voice of rural Black and Minority Ethnic people and b) the things that service providers need help with in order to listen better
2. Black and Minority Ethnic people are interested in safe means of having a voice
3. The main issues raised by participants centred on experiences of racism – the handbook is constructed around this experience and around the things participants recommended should be done next

**Story of chapter 2 - the research process: learning from doing**
1. Research process of note in itself- methodology developed to centre on the Black and Minority Ethnic contributors' interests rather than the researcher's
2. Cannot use standard methods of consultation outreach and why

**Story of chapter 3 - Devon: demography, diversity and change**
1. Devon *is* diverse
2. Statistics need background to be informative
3. Diversity and rurality means no 'communities' as such
4. Mixed Heritage on the increase

**Story of chapter 4 - identity and ethnicity**
1. Ethnic heritage is too complex for broad categorisations
2. Self-identification is key
3. Faith can be more important than nationality
4. Children's sense of identity raises particular issues
5. Good record keeping is vital

**Story of chapter 5 - isolation and belonging**
1. Isolation and belonging- what makes the difference
2. Multiple layers of isolation affect Minority Ethnic people
3. Women's situations are different to those of men
4. Multi-Ethnic networks are needed
5. Complex language issues means communication in person is best

**Story of chapter 6 - experiencing and coping with racism**
1. Racism – it's something in common for so many
2. Whole person approach: the way to understand racism and its effects
3. People are scared to report and forced to keep a low profile
4. Long-term damage is being done

**Story of chapter 7 - working lives**
1. Institutional racism – people are confused and need clearer understanding about how it works
2. Subtleties of discrimination and prejudice
3. Behaviour can be racist without language
4. Valuing Black and Minority Ethnic business and skills needs attention

**Story of chapter 8 - education**
1. Children's plight and parents' struggle: better family-school relationship building is needed
2. Race needs reflection in the curriculum
3. Bullying and racism  flourish together
4. Support services constrained and need funding to maximise potential
5. Adults' learning and support needs are diverse and need flexible responses

**Story of chapter 9 - faith and religion**
1. Church of England permeates rural secular society
2. Rural isolation makes worship hard for members of other faiths
3. Religious intolerance denies cultural identity
4. People are in hiding - why has that happened
5. Faiths have big role to play in pastoral support

**Story of chapter 10 - Health and Social Welfare**
1. Language support needs more attention and new solutions
2. Staff have unresolved, common questions about culture and care
3. Racism issues for staff as well as service users need attention
4. Staff put forward good solutions to improve race equality in health care

**Story of chapter 11 - supporting service providers**
1. Service providers are struggling and need help – advice is given
2. Specialists are needed to drive organisational change
3. Impact Assessment – full methodology and how to use it

**Story of chapter 12 - promoting cultural diversity and improving race equality**
1. The major recommendations and the way forward – key advice
2. Signposts to background information in other chapters

**The next stage of the story** depends very much on the commitment and endeavour of the people who take account of the issues raised in this book and make a response in their work.  We wish you well in taking race equality in Devon forward.

# *Contents*

| | | |
|---|---|---|
| | ➢  ✖.  Objective Oriented Planning – a problem and solution analysis tool | |
| Participants' recommend-ations | **Chapter 12** | |
| | •  **Promoting Cultural Diversity & Improving Race Equality – *the participant's suggestions*** | |
| |   ➢ Introduction. | 12.1 |
| |   ➢ List of key recommendations for promoting cultural diversity and race equality. | 12.2 |
| |   ➢ How the key recommendations were formulated. | 12.3 |
| |   ➢ Presentation of ideas contained in each recommendation, with commentaries and references to Chapters that provide detail: | |
| |     ◆ Consciousness raising & training (including in schools) | 12.3 |
| |     ◆ Networks and peer support | 12.12 |
| |     ◆ Bridge building across cultures – celebrations of culture & diversity | 12.22 |
| |     ◆ Improving access to information & services | 12.24 |
| |     ◆ Race equality support services | 12.26 |
| |     ◆ Equality in employment | 12.28 |
| |     ◆ Political action & leadership | 12.29 |
| |     ◆ Media | 12.31 |
| |     ◆ Initiative on the part of BME individuals | 12.32 |
| |     ◆ Consultation & influence | 12.34 |
| |     ◆ Effect & promotion of demographic change | 12.35 |
| |     ◆ Inter-religious understanding | 12.36 |
| |     ◆ Cultural centres | 12.37 |
| |     ◆ Closer look at trans-racial adoption | 12.38 |
| Information sources | •  **A list of some useful resources.** We include signposts to some of the reference sources we have used and sources we have been told will be useful to service providers in addressing some of the issues this research raises. | |

This handbook and supporting tools can be accessed at
www.DevonREC.org

_____

| *THINK SHEET* – photocopy and use when you read a chapter | | | |
|---|---|---|---|
| What are the ideas and experiences that catch my interest? (Write your summary notes below) | Page ref. | What can I do to respond to these issues? | What could my organisation do to make a response to these issues and to help me make mine? |
| | | | |

| What are the ideas and experiences that catch my interest? (Write your summary notes below) | Page ref. | What can I do to respond to these issues? | What could my organisation do to make a response to these issues and to help me make mine? |
| --- | --- | --- | --- |
|  |  |  |  |
| 6 month check – what progress have I made in making my response? | | | |
|  |  |  |  |
| Organisational progress check: If you had ideas about things your organisation could do, send a copy of this sheet on to a relevant colleague/ manager, and keep a note here of whom you have contacted and the consequent feedback/ action. | | | |

# Chapter 1
# BLACK & MINORITY ETHNIC LIVES IN RURAL DEVON:
## The Handbook's construction around the key research outcomes

## Themes in this chapter

- Really rural voices
- Interest in safe means of having a voice
- Issues of Concern
- Recommendations
- Issues apart from race and equality?
- Transport
- Countryside
- Community Safety

## Whose voices?

Between 2000 and 2003, the Devon & Exeter Racial Equality Council has been reaching out into the rural Districts of Devon, to listen to the experience of Black and Minority Ethnic rural people.

Most of the work of the Racial Equality Council and other agencies' action on race equality in Devon has centred on Exeter. This raised real questions and concern about the un-appraised and un-addressed situation of Black and Minority Ethnic people in rural areas. For this reason, the brief for the Rural Outreach Project was given specific rural parameters and focussed on work in the 7 Districts of East, Mid and North Devon, South Hams, Teignbridge, Torridge and West Devon. The urban areas of Exeter and Torbay were not included within the brief.

In the process of this work, issues arising from the experience of 170 Black and Minority Ethnic individuals and family members have been collated, and are presented in this report.

The aim has been to provide a platform for the voice of Black and Minority Ethnic people whose perspective is both distinctive and mostly unheard, because of their rural situation. In listening to these voices, we hope that the outcome will be that rural service providers will be better informed, and better equipped to address race equality in the rural context.

In order to help prepare service providers to engage with Black and Minority Ethnic peoples' experience, the research has also listened to over

180 service providing staff, from a wide range of service-providing sectors and organisations. We have heard from staff regarding the concerns they have about the situation of excluded Black and Minority Ethnic people whom they have served. We have also heard about the difficulty experienced by many organisations in knowing how to address race equality, in the rural setting.

The information provided by service providers has supported what we have heard from the Black and Minority Ethnic participants, and has helped to set the context for the report's discussion about the way that its recommendations should be addressed.

We have also made use of background information from some other relevant reports and resources. These are listed within the resources list at the back of the Handbook. (It is also hoped that the full desk study mapping race equality research and action in rural areas, which was conducted by Philomena de Lima, will be published soon by the Commission for Racial Equality (CRE).)

## What was said & heard

This Handbook has been constructed around the key issues emerging from the work with Black and Minority Ethnic participants. The research was designed to be as responsive as possible to the direction in which the participants' experience would lead it. We made sure that the debate was open to the participants' concerns that had nothing to do with race and equality, as well as to the issues that were directly related to identity. In this way, the research was intended to provide a Black and Minority Ethnic input to service providers' general planning, as well as planning related to promotion of diversity and anti-racism.

The *overall key finding* of the research was that, whilst there were some clear and widely held views about what generally makes life in Devon good or bad (respectively the countryside and transport), most of the discussion did focus on issues related to ethnic identity and experience of prejudice. Given the low rates of involvement in any kind of consultation, and the fact that nearly two thirds of the participants described experiences of discrimination and prejudice, this was perhaps unsurprising. Only 20% of the participants ('n' = 135) reported having ever been involved in any kind of survey – whether related to race equality or not. By contrast, 61% expressed an interest in having future involvement and voice on race equality issues through Racial Equality Council initiatives.

The key areas of interest and concern were as follows:

| Box 1.1 Issues raised for discussion by participants | No. of people raising points on these subjects |
|---|---|
| 1. Experience of prejudice & discrimination | 111 |
| 2. Transport | 62 |
| 3. Health & Social welfare | 54 |
| 4. Faith & Religion | 47 |
| 5. Countryside | 44 |
| 6. Shopping – general | 15 |
| Shopping – ethnicity related | 21 |
| 7. Education | 24 |
| 8. Community safety – general | 6 |
| TOTAL | 384 |

Participants completed their input to the research by contemplating on the issues they had raised and then putting forward their suggestions for ways to promote cultural diversity and improve race relations.

These suggestions coalesced to form the following recommendations:

| Box 1.2 Participant's key recommendations | No. of people contributing to this proposal |
|---|---|
| 1. **Awareness raising & training (including in schools)** | 62 |
| 2. **Networks and peer support** | 31 |
| 3. **Bridge building across cultures – celebrations of culture & diversity** | 31 |
| 4. **Improving access to information & services** | 19 |
| 5. **Race equality support services** | 17 |
| 6. **Equality in employment** | 14 |
| 7. **Political action & leadership** | 14 |
| 8. **Media** | 11 |
| 9. **Initiative on the part of Black and Minority Ethnic individuals** | 8 |
| 10. **Consultation & influence** | 6 |
| 11. **Demographic change – its effects and its value.** | 5 |
| 12. **Inter-religious understanding** | 4 |
| 13. **Cultural centres** | 4 |
| 14. **Adoption – placement matching issues** | 2 |
| **TOTAL** | 228 |

These recommendations are described and discussed in detail in chapter 12.

Chapters 6,7,8,9,and 10 look in depth at the experiences that underpin the recommendations made directly by the participants. These chapters examine in particular the participant's experiences of prejudice and discrimination and issues raised by participants relating to health & social welfare, education, and religion. These were major areas of concern with a direct bearing on Black and Minority Ethnic experience of life in Devon and form the main substance of this Handbook.

It's also important to pause to describe here the three other general themes that were raised by participants as issues of concern - but described by them as being un-related to race or equality.

- **Transport**
- **Countryside**
- **Community Safety**

The fact that these are issues of heated interest to most of the general public living in Devon does not discount the value of adding the voice of Black & Minority Ethnic people to that of the wider population. It's also important to recognise that whilst the participants were provided with the opportunity to cover all aspects of everyday life in Devon, these aspects attracted the focus of their attention. We also noted that whilst at first sight these issues seem un-related to race and equality, in the context of issues raised by the research as a whole we found that they do have a bearing on Minority Ethnic isolation and demography, for reasons which we'll explain.

We'll look at these issues here, rather than in a separate chapter, since whilst they represent a significant proportion of concern, the concern was expressed briefly, in simple and similar terms by most people.

**1). Travel and transport** around Devon was considered a major problem by many of the participants.

Most of the concern centred on public transport, which was perceived as inaccessible and expensive. Several of our participants were not car owners or were disabled, and public transport was a key issue for them. 31% of our participants were unemployed, retired or occupied in unskilled work and 31% also lived in villages or 'out in the sticks'. We noted that therefore inaccessibility of public transport together with rural isolation and low income, would be socially excluding factors that could combine to

reinforce each other and exacerbate other aspects of Black and Minority Ethnic isolation (see chapter 5).

For both the public transport- and car-dependent participants, the size of Devon also presents a problem, in terms of accessing centrally provided services and cultural outlets and in terms of finding support and networking with Black and Minority Ethnic peers. We look at the issues of isolation and networking in more detail in chapters 5 and 12.

Several participants felt that travel in and out of a county the size of Devon was also inhibited by poor road networks and connections to the outside world. For some this impacted on the feasibility of keeping regular contact with family.

Others described the difficulties in acquiring or getting driving skills recognised. As one driving instructor told us:

🗨 *The Driving Standards Agency need cultural education. They also need awareness about English as an Additional Language. Examiners don't give instructions slowly and well in advance. It's no good to have an interpreter because it's too confusing. Examiners are harder on foreign pupils.*

Car dependency is a feature of life in rural Devon and, therefore, barriers to the ability to drive are a matter of real concern. In addition to the discrimination described by the instructor above, participants also described the heavy emphasis put upon written and spoken English fluency in the Driving Test. Driving is essentially a physical and visual skill, and high levels of reading, writing and spoken English skills do not play a part in driving itself. If it did, most Britons would be ill prepared to drive abroad. In this sense, the Test format culturally discriminates against people who speak English as an Additional Language.

Other travel issues were also raised concerning volumes of traffic, traffic noise and dangerous driving.

The following table gives a flavour of the participants' experiences of travel and transport in Devon:

🗨 *Improved transport in Devon could make life here better - I don't drive and the county is so big.*

🗨 *I felt very isolated because we were very far from Exeter and the house was far outside the village and I had no transport and the bus service was very expensive and it's a bad service to Exeter.*

💬 *Communication is one of the worst things about life here. Travel to London to get abroad is difficult because of the travel connections. A better train service to London would make life better. The link road could be dual carriage. There are too sharp turns on it too.*

💬 *There's a high turnover of incomers to East Devon from the South East of England. They're very surprised because they move to the area and find that the transport here is very poor. Lots of people come to the office for information about transport. Often people have retired to rural villages and can't drive because of temporary illness or deteriorating eyesight. Mobility amongst the elderly tends to be dependent on the ability of the husband to drive. Also young people who haven't got cars need transport.*

💬 *A bad thing about life in Devon is that I have to fly home from London and there are no connections from Exeter or Bristol. It's difficult for older parents (disabled) to get the train from the airport in London. It would be better if there were flights from Bristol and Exeter so that we could go home.*

💬 *We have no bus service here. But we have a bus shelter! £4000 was spent on it but it gives us no proper protection from the rain and the drain floods in it. We sometimes use buses from the neighbouring village to meet friends. My Dad isn't happy about me using buses on my own.*

💬 *The transportation system is different from that of my country.*

💬 *Reducing traffic speed and noise and improving public transport could make life in Devon better. Public transport is impossible - unreliable and inconvenient*

💬 *Other concerns include lack of a late bus to return from Exeter if you want to go to cultural entertainment there.*

💬 *Have no car - this limits were I can go and where I can work.*

💬 *Disability parking problems for getting to social and religious events. Driving will soon become difficult for us because of eyesight. We're very dependent on the car.*

🗨 **2). The Countryside** was the main point of attraction about life in Devon for a third of the participants ('n'=135) who described what makes life in Devon good. It figured as a factor in several participants' decisions to move to Devon (both as a point of attraction in itself and for some participants as a contrast to pressures of city life) and contributes to the sense of quality of life for many. However, whilst some participants even valued the extremities to which one can 'get away from it all' in rural places, others felt that isolation was a negative consequence of rural life:

🗨 *Best thing about Devon is the countryside and sea and isolation.*

🗨 *Devon's beautiful, but there's nothing here- you can't live on a view. It's a total desert.*

In fact, as described in chapter 5 rurality is an influential factor in the distinctive nature of Black and Minority Ethnic demography in Devon, and compounds the isolation that many of our participants experience. For this reason, you'll see in chapter 5 that rurality has been counted as a score in a Multiple Index of Isolation which we have constructed.

## 3). Community Safety

The Police have been involved in a number of the cases for which the Racial Equality Council has provided complainant aid. Analysis of case notes provided most information about Policing and Community Safety. In some instances the Police involvement was in response to calls directly to them about incidents of violent and aggressive behaviour. In other cases the police were involved through the Racial Equality Council. The support provided for victims of racism and issues to do with the reporting of incidents are covered in chapter 6, which deals with experience of prejudice and discrimination.

A few participants also talked about fear of crime that they did not link to racially motivated experiences. These concerns centred on anti-social behaviour on the part of young people:

🗨 *Lax discipline especially vandalism is one of the bad things about living here.*

🗨 *The behaviour of some of the drunken natives is one of the bad things about life at college here.*

> 🗩 *Need more facilities for the young to keep them occupied - off the streets.*

> 🗩 *I don't like my son [16] to go out at the evenings because the youth in Tiverton are out of control. He goes round to his friend's houses. One of the worst things about life in Devon is people getting drunk.*

> 🗩 *The drugs scene is sending the town down hill - there've been deaths. There's nothing of the kids to do – they just hang out in the square or drive or take drugs in the square.*

> 🗩 *Youngsters cause trouble all the time. Tiverton seems rough with lots of unemployment. Worry about the windows being smashed at night.*

Given that 65% of the participants described experiences of prejudice and discrimination, and that 89% experience multiple layers of isolation, any sense of fear of crime is bound to be amplified with a consequent increase in the feeling of vulnerability.

The participants themselves identified and discussed the above three themes – transport, countryside and community safety – as issues apart from race equality itself. And they do stand as issues in themselves. However, the learning from this research is that there is important value in appraising 'single' issues in the light of a broader perspective. This involves illuminated assessment to flag up possible ramifications of the impact of any one issue on a person, through analysis of how that issue encroaches on other aspects of the quality of a person's life and by using wider information about Black and Minority Ethnic experience in Devon.

We hope that the information provided in this book provides a resource for service providers in taking a 'person centred' approach to engagement with Black and Minority Ethnic people in rural Devon and in assessing the impact of service planning and delivery.

In the next chapter, we begin by setting the backdrop to accounts of personal experience, by looking at Black and Minority Ethnic demography in Devon, and the profile of our participant sample.

This handbook and supporting tools 🛠 can be accessed at
www.DevonREC.org

## Chapter 2
## DESIGNING, CARRYING OUT & LOOKING BACK ON THE RESEARCH PROCESS

**Themes in this chapter:**

- How the brief for this research was constructed
- When the research was done
- Who we reached with this research
- The outreach methods used
- What was successful, what wasn't
- The participant interaction methods used.
- A focus on action as an outcome of research.
- Feedback to participants

**How the brief for this research was constructed**

The Devon & Exeter Racial Equality Council began to formulate its plans for research in the late 1990s, as the demand for its services grew and the need for action in rural areas became ever more evident. The Racial Equality Council was also alert to the need to broaden action in rural areas through partnership working, and of the need to help rural service providers to understand the issues and work out their responses.

Devon, up until that point, had figured in some leading work in the Southwest which drew attention to the rural dimension of race equality - firstly Eric Jay's *'Keep them in Birmingham'* report and then Mohammed Dalech's *Challenging Racism in the Rural Idyll*. Both of these are seminal reports recommended to the reader. Reports such as Miriam Azar's *Exeter in Black and White* had also looked in further detail at the situation in Exeter. But little had been done to dig deeper and assess why so little race equality action extended beyond the 'rural' major towns and cities into the rural districts, and what kind of responses were needed in these areas.

One of the specific recommendations in the *Challenging Racism in the Rural Idyll* report was that Racial Equality and Black and Minority Ethnic groups should 'recognise and develop activities in rural areas as well as urban areas'. So, with the recognition that both Jay's and Dalech's researches had laid the foundation of the arguments for action on race equality in the Southwest, and acknowledging the deficit of 'remoter-rural'

action, the Racial Equality Council decided to focus its research specifically on Devon's rural areas.

Hence the basis of the research brief was to:

- keep a very rural discipline by focussing specifically on the 7 rural Districts in Devon
- work with as many rural Black and Minority Ethnic people as possible to
  - ➢ find out about their situation
  - ➢ assess if their experience had a rurally defined character
  - ➢ establish with the participants, what race equality action was needed in rural areas
- work with service providing staff among the breadth of agencies operating in rural areas to ascertain what help they needed in addressing the issues raised by the research's Black and Minority Ethnic participants
- develop recommendations for action that both address the concerns of Black and Minority Ethnic people and give service providers rurally relevant guidance
- develop a business plan for the Racial Equality Council that would drive its future rural work and rural partnerships

The detail of issues to be covered with Black and Minority Ethnic participants was then developed further, with four aims:

1. to ensure that participants could have the opportunity to raise as broad a scope of issues as possible, making the research as person-centred and -led as possible
2. to enable participants to bring up issues of concern - whether race equality related or not – for as wide a range of service providers as possible
3. to illuminate the rural aspects of Black and Minority Ethnic experience of life in Devon.
4. to enable the research to act as a platform for further engagement and action as directed by the participants

From these specifications, a list of key questions and sub questions was drawn up with the Racial Equality Council, listed in Table 2.1 in the web-based appendix to this chapter (www.DevonREC.org). These questions were also informed by the gaps in knowledge that the Racial Equality Council (REC) had itself, and the questions with which the REC was conscious that rural service providers struggled.

The questions and sub-questions then provided the framework for the discussion with Black and Minority Ethnic participants through in-depth interviews, workshops and questionnaires. We aimed to make the opportunity to participate as accessible and as attractive as possible, by offering these different types of opportunities. The questions and formats were designed by constructing activities and guided discussion which would help participants to think through and express their experiences – many of which they might not have articulated before. An analysis framework was constructed to ensure that all information arising would by processed and cross-referenced to inform the research questions and throw up any unexpected outcomes. By careful design of this participation and analysis framework, all questions were standardized across the different participation methods, which employed different visual, narrative and debate techniques to suit the setting. Questions were framed openly, and where written techniques were used, they were posed in the form of first person prompts to enable the responses to be as participant-centred and -led as possible.

The Rural Outreach Project was funded with an initial grant of £20,000 for the research from the Regional Development Agency (RDA).  A further grant of £9000 was also provided by the RDA together with a grant of £2000 from the Children's Fund Black, Minority Ethnic & Traveller Theme to support the initial costs of developing the report as a handbook for web production and hard copy publication.

## A focus on action as an outcome of research.

The brief for the Rural Outreach Project has always been to stimulate action in response to its findings.  In addition to producing its outcomes and recommendations as a resource, the Project has been called upon over the 3 years in which it has gathered learning to share that learning with others and to inform action being taken by them.

Much happened during the 3 years of the project, in particular the arrival of the Race Relations Amendment Act (2000) on the statute books and the attendant Duties upon Public Bodies.  This generated much interest in the project with the desire for local information to guide service providers in undertaking new race equality measures in a locally relevant way.  It was recognized that service providers had to take action before this research report was available, and that the project needed to address service

providers' need for support in the meantime, in order to encourage and maintain their interest in race equality.

Hence the project engaged in a number of activities in order to maximize the impact of the research on action in Devon, and to prepare the ground for interest in its final recommendations set out in this book. A detailed list of these activities is listed in the web-based appendix to this chapter (www.DevonREC.org).


## When the research was done

The research initiative, known as the Rural Outreach Project, began in March 2000 and was concluded in July 2003. The project was conducted by a research consultant working on a part time basis over that time (including a 6 month maternity break). In the first year, the research brief was refined in the light of a mis-match between the general assumption of the agencies involved, that quantitative data was 'out there somewhere' and just needed to be brought together, and the reality of very poor ethnicity record-keeping on the ground and the added impact of the Data Protection Act on the sharing of such data. It also became clear that there was little other research available at that point to inform the specifically rural nature of the research. Consequently, the emphasis of the research was centred firmly on its qualitative brief, and attention was shifted away from desk-study and quantitative analysis.

The majority of the work with service provider participants was done in the first and third years of the research, and the work with Black and Minority Ethnic participants was continuous throughout. At the same time, the project was called upon to share its key interim findings at a number of events in Devon held by agencies who wanted to take a closer look at race equality issues.

The project also fulfilled it's brief to drive the Racial Equality Council's (REC's) business planning in Year 3, in which approx. 10% of the project's total time was spent in writing the Business and Service Plan and making the case for it to Agencies and partners. This enabled the project to translate the key recommendations arising from the 3 years of research, in concrete project plans. This also happened at a time in which the REC's race equality work in Devon faced a serious funding threat, and in which a strongly evidenced business plan enabled the concerns of the project's participants, and the work of the REC, to be successfully argued with Devon's public sector and the Commission for Racial Equality.

The final months of the project were spent in capturing the quantitative outcomes from the 2001 Census whose details were published in 2003, analysing this and the research data, and the production of this handbook.

## Who we reached with this research

In total, this research encompasses the experience of 170 Black and Minority Ethnic people who live or work in the rural parts of Devon.

The research has also listened to staff concerns among a range of service providers about addressing race equality issues over the course of 90 workshops, meetings and phone discussions (over 180 staff).

The full profile of the Black and Minority Ethnic participant sample in this research can be seen in chapter 4: Identity and Ethnicity.
By way of a summary, we can say that the research sample encompasses the full range of age, ethnicity, religion and language skills among the rural Black and Minority Ethnic population and is split almost equally among women and men. The sample reflects the population breakdown indicated by the 2001 Census in terms of population growth and rural dispersion. The majority of the sample are people who were born outside the UK (c.f. an even split between Black and Minority Ethnic people born in the UK and overseas, according to Census 2001 data for Devon). Immigration notwithstanding, most of the participants had strong English skills or at least good conversational abilities, but difficulties in communicating in English raised significant issues for a minority. The research has also included Europeans within its brief but the proportion of visibly Black and Minority Ethnic people in the sample is much higher than the European proportion. (By contrast, the 2001 Census data shows that the Irish and European part of the population in Devon is greater than the visibly Black and Minority Ethnic population.) The 2001 Census data also shows that 53% of the European and visibly Black and Minority Ethnic population is Christian, but the research sample focuses more on other faiths, with only 36% coming from a Christian background. 31% lived in remote rural countryside and villages, and the rest lived in small and market and sea-side towns. A few people with Traveller backgrounds are also included in this research but, due to the weight of research and development work already done on Traveller issues in the UK and Devon, Travellers form a minority of the research sample. (In-depth information about the situation of Travellers can be found by reference to the Travellers Education Service and the County Gypsy Liaison Officer. Contact details are in the resources

list at the end of this book. A link to a pdf manual on Traveller issues is also included. )

## The outreach methods used

The ROP's outreach began by producing and distributing a leaflet that explained the rationale for the project and asked Black and Minority Ethnic people to get in touch with us and take part. People were able to do this by filling in and returning a reply slip at the back of the leaflet, selecting the type of participation they wanted. This leaflet was circulated to a large number of agencies and individuals who agreed to distribute the leaflets to potential Black and Minority Ethnic participants, by making them available to staff, to service users, to the public or to individual contacts. We then planned to organise workshops, interviews and the distribution of questionnaires on demand.

The work of recruiting distribution outlets for the engagement leaflet involved extensive phone discussions, meetings and written communication with individuals and organisations from public, voluntary and private sectors. In most cases considerable time was spent in making chains of contact to the person in each organisation who felt they could deal with the request, plus a good deal of explanation of the project's rationale, its intended benefits and the help we sought. Wherever possible we encouraged organisations to support the distribution of the leaflet with their own communications/ cover letters by way of introduction and support. We also took agencies' and individuals' advice about other contacts they suggested as a means of reaching out to Black and Minority Ethnic participants.

We also sought to reach people by asking Faith groups and regional Black and Minority Ethnic networks if we could meet members in person to explain the project and encourage interest. Few participants were gained through these routes and feedback from contacts indicated a number of reasons why this was so. Factors included: groups' limited rural memberships; limits on organisations' capacity to communicate with members on the behalf of the project; the infrequency of occasions when rural members gathered and the difficulty of arranging appropriate occasions during which to introduce them to the researcher.

The Racial Equality Council's own members were also encouraged to help with publicising the project to potential participants, and every opportunity

was made to take advantage of public events in which the project was involved, to invite participation.

Conversations during the course of the research also indicated that, had more time been available, outreach to Black and Minority Ethnic students at private schools and to Black and Minority Ethnic health staff within the private and nursing for the elderly sectors would have been valuable.

## What was successful, what wasn't

Towards the end of Year 1, the project's greatest success in finding and involving participants has been through 'snowballing' of contacts – i.e. talking to people and making face-to-face/ phone contact through them and then finding further contacts again  - a largely personal, verbal process. Indeed only 4 of the Black and Minority Ethnic participants in Years 1 & 2 approached the project as a result of seeing its leaflets, rather than as a result of snowballing.  Consequently, in Year 2, instead of seeking out leaflet distributors as the main strategy for attracting interest, we concentrated on making verbal chains of contact, explaining the project and the participation options. We also continued to send leaflets to people who said they would pass them on personally to their Black and Minority Ethnic friends/acquaintances. The one route through which a response leaflet did work was via distribution through a Health Trust direct to Black and Minority Ethnic staff, who were able to return the slip through the internal mail. Overall, however, most of the research participants got engaged with the project and selected their means of participation purely through conversation.
Copies of the general response leaflet and the response form specifically sent to Health staff are provided in the web-based Appendix to this chapter (www.DevonREC.org).

On the whole the use of leaflets was not a successful gateway for securing people's agreement to participate, whether left in public places, distributed through village media, passed on through intermediaries or handed out directly by the researcher to potential participants.
Feedback from various contacts has suggested the following reasons:

- People who have been contacted through the post are often too busy and overloaded with paper-based information to respond.

- Contacts who said that they had friends/acquaintances to whom they could pass on ROP materials actually felt, when it came to it, that they

were 'singling-out' their Black and Minority Ethnic contacts, and felt too uncomfortable about this to do it.

- The use of a leaflet to ask individuals to contact the project with their choice of engagement was an administrative barrier between the person and their participation, which just prevented people from getting round to contacting us.

- The ROP leaflet had been adapted, lengthened and shortened for different audiences, but ultimately it may just not have been attractive enough.

- The most likely factor in the failure to attract participants through written media was reflected in their choice of participation method. Most people opted for interviews and wanted to talk about the issues in a confidential and relaxed setting. Some people had a look at the questionnaire and then decided that it raised so many issues for them that they felt it would be easier for them to reflect on and unfold their experiences face to face. Most of the interviews took 3 hours – people wanted to talk and wanted the time to feel that they were understood. For some participants, a long interview was in fact the easiest option for them in contrast to attending a workshop or responding to a questionnaire. Most interviews were done in people's homes or at their places of work. One interview was conducted with a health worker in sentences interspersed with instructions and conversations with ward colleagues, while she was on a hectic shift. Another was conducted with a manager during an evening of business at his restaurant. People were on the whole busy, and they were glad that the research could come to them and fit in with their schedules. Verbal communication was attractive to people whereas written communication was impersonal, inconvenient and time-consuming.

Table 2.2 (in the web-based appendix to this chapter www.DevonREC.org) lists the starting points for each of the 'snowball' routes in the outreach. These 'starting points' were arrived at after significant work had been done to establish that they were routes that could in principle facilitate outreach to Black and Minority Ethnic audiences. The different routes are summarised under the headings:

- Black and Minority Ethnic 'groups'
- Faith communities
- Agencies (Public Sector)
- Voluntary Sector
- The Racial Equality Council
- Unions
- Education
- Media
- Health
- Private Sector

Of the 51 snowball starting points 17 ultimately led to people willing to participate in the research. In addition to these formal lines of outreach, the researcher also had some success in approaching Black and Minority Ethnic members of the public and in restaurants directly, where it seemed appropriate to do so.

Table 2.3 in the web-based Appendix to this chapter shows the detail of the ultimate participant sources (www.DevonREC.org).
The table shows that the most successful lines of outreach included (in order of greatest success in terms of participant numbers)
1. Plymouth University (Seal Hayne campus)
2. Co-ordinators of the Adult English as an Additional Language Service
3. Contacts provided via Racial Equality Council members
4. Direct approaches by the researcher to Black and Minority Ethnic members of the public
5. Outreach to Black and Minority Ethnic staff through a Health Trust
6. A 10% response rate from a mail shot of English and translated questionnaires to nearly 100 foreign food restaurants, with interpreters making telephone calls to each Indian and Chinese restaurant to let them know about the research and follow up calls to encourage response.
7. Individuals known to the researcher
8. Contacts provided by the research's Black and Minority Ethnic participants

Table 2.3 does however show that the largest number of participants gained through any one source was 23, and that a great number of lines of outreach were needed to generate the sample size we achieved. This outcome, together with the inability to reach participants through the usual sources (i.e. faith groups and the Black and Minority Ethnic voluntary sector) is a function of the lack of formally organised Faith and Black and Minority Ethnic activity in rural areas, and of the limited extent to which city-based and regional groups reach rural people.

Information about 35 people was also provided through DEREC's complainant aid service, in which case-workers provided anonymized information to the researcher.

We had also had high hopes that significant outreach would be made to Adult students of English as an Additional Language (EAL) through the Adult EAL service in Devon. This line of outreach began by piloting the use of the workshop materials with Adult EAL students in one District. The materials were then developed with Adult EAL providers to have a dual benefit of collecting research information and acting as a terms' worth of curriculum material. Plans were agreed to pilot these materials with a large group of students in another District before rolling it out for wider participation with other Adult EAL providers. Unfortunately, due to circumstances within the Adult EAL service, this curriculum-based line of outreach was never bought to fruition. However, individual co-ordinators did help with contacts which snowballed to produce a number of participants.

The schools' ethnicity monitoring and EAL pupil support data also enabled us to identify a number of key schools with whom we had hoped to work. However, despite contacts with advisors and co-ordinators in the Local Education Authority and County Education Directorate, collaboration did not develop into introductions to schools.

Repeated attempts were made to reach out to Black and Minority Ethnic people through contacts within the Race Priority Action Teams (RPATs) which were being established in each District under the Community Safety Partnerships. In principle, these RPATs are intended to be the main interagency driver for action to tackle racism locally. However, many of these Teams have taken many months to develop their networks and establish a local, active profile. Towards the end of this research project significant activity developed in two of the Teams in Teignbridge and South Hams, who combined forces and then commissioned their own piece of research. They used a consultancy firm which provided a team of researchers with various language skills, who spent a short but intensive period following the snowball starting points provided by the RPATs and making face to face contact with a large number of Black and Minority Ethnic participants by visiting restaurants and following up leads. Once RPATs begin to take effect and develop relationships in the community, their potential for outreach can be significant provided that it is done sensitively and using outreach workers with language and race equality skills. The RPATs were also able to develop sustained relationships with

their research participants by attracting the interest of over 20 people who said they wanted to keep in touch and get involved with RPAT activities. Our own face to face research has had the same benefits, with 83 participants expressing an interest in future DEREC activities.

In addition to participating directly in the research themselves, many of the service provider participants were also asked to help the project to attract the interest of their Black and Minority Ethnic staff and users. Initial recruitment of service providers participants was often achieved by running workshops for multi-agency forums. Community health staff were also specifically recruited because of their particular role in working with isolated Black and Minority Ethnic patients, especially women. Considerable time was involved in finding and gaining the support of individuals within Health Trusts, but once the support of Directors of Operations and Directors of Personnel had been achieved, this line of engagement proved very productive, with many health staff eager to get involved. Most success was had in engaging service providers by providing workshops that were accommodated within scheduled staff or partnership meetings.

In chapter 12 we set out the main recommendations arising from the research. One of those recommendations relates to the need for Multi-Ethnic networks in the rural districts, which would bring together rural Black and Minority Ethnic people. These networks would serve a number of purposes, including the opportunity for people to meet and raise issues of concern in a relaxed setting. By having these networks, members would be able to collate issues of concern, discuss them and put them forward to the relevant service providers. In this way Black and Minority Ethnic people would have specific and creative opportunities to inform the development of services in their communities, and to raise issues in a way which feels 'safe' and 'positive' amongst other activities. This form of networking and opinion gathering would cut out the need for numerous, agency led and snap shot consultation exercises. Moreover, this research has demonstrated that outreach to people in rural areas requires multiple lines of outreach, extensive effort applied to 'snowballing' contacts, and a great deal of time and face to face work with individuals, because of the lack of rural Black and Minority Ethnic 'representative' groups. Many rural service providers have approached the project wondering if we have found the magic ingredient which will succeed in helping their various consultation exercises reach a significant number of Black and Minority Ethnic people in their sample. However, the project experience indicates that quick snapshot exercises in the current rural situation are unlikely to

reach Black and Minority Ethnic people because of the current lack of infrastructure or groups through which to reach people. This experience adds weight to the argument for a consultation mechanism, such as would be available through rural networks, would be geared towards the interests of those from whom the information is sought and would make feasible rural dialogue with a diverse and distinctly rural Black and Minority Ethnic population.

### **The participant interaction methods used.**

Interviews, workshops and questionnaires were the three participation methods offered to Black and Minority Ethnic participants.

| Semi-structured interviews | Unstructured interviews – including phone calls | Questionnaires | Workshops |
|---|---|---|---|
| 38% | 13% | 25% | 24% |

Most people opted for **semi-structured interviews** (i.e. interviews in which the researcher made sure the discussion covered the research framework but which enabled the participant to lead the flow and breadth of conversation and bring up issues of interest to them). These interviews typically lasted for 3 hours and provided in-depth information.

The **unstructured interviews** were conducted largely on the phone, and in particular at the beginning of the research, with people who wanted to make a quick, focussed input.

The **questionnaires** were provided in English, and also in Chinese and Bengali to those participants who asked for them or to whom we felt it was prudent to offer the option. A copy of the questionnaire is available in the web-based appendix to this chapter (www.DevonREC.org). Questionnaires were distributed to participants with a cover letter which introduced the project. In the distribution of the questionnaires to foreign food restaurants, copies were supplied in Bengali and Chinese together with English copies where relevant, and cover letters were also translated. Interpreters were also employed by the project to make phone calls prior to the arrival of the letters to raise interest, and two weeks after the mail-shot, to offer thanks and encourage maximum response. As it happened, all but two participants chose to use the translated questionnaires and reply in that language. Only Chinese respondents chose to use the translated questionnaires and most of

these respondents used the translated form but wrote the answers in broken English. Similarly we noted that several of the Asian respondents with limited English skills also chose English as their means of communication with us. This may be accounted for by several possibilities:

- first language literacy skills may have deteriorated during the time that people had lived in the UK
- some participants' first language reading skills may be stronger than written skills
- some participants may have had low first language literacy skills ( this was a key issue experienced in the course of the Equal Voices Project conducted by Portsmouth University in Portsmouth).
- Some participants welcomed the sight of a familiar text but were keen to show willing by responding in English
- Many Asian restaurateurs are not Bangladeshi in origin

The **workshops** involved a variety of visual, group discussion and pair activities, which were designed to provide an element of interest and fun, to encourage debate and to stimulate the creation of recommendations for action. Depending on the size and language abilities of the participant group, different numbers of facilitators were used to ensure that discussion was properly supported and information recorded. As far as possible, discussion aids were picture rather than text based, and techniques such as Objective Oriented Planning (see the web-based Appendix to chapter 11 – www.DevonREC.org) were used to support participants in exploring issues and creating recommendations to address those issues. A curriculum linked version of the workshop process was also developed for use with adult students of English as an Additional Language. Whilst we had planned to offer workshops to individuals which would bring them together in a locality, we found that most individuals opted instead for interviews. Workshops tended to be organised instead, where groups of people, e.g. adult English as an Additional Language students, Further and Higher Education students and staff, and asylum seekers and professionals were already gathered.

Service-provider participants contributed to the project through phone conversations, meetings and 7 workshops. The workshops were organised by obtaining invitations to run the workshops with Inter-Agency Forums and in staff team meetings. It had become clear very early on in the research that most service-providing staff struggled with knowing how to respond in the rural setting to race equality and that, therefore, a systematic

audit of organisational practice was inappropriate. Instead the focus of the work with service providers was to develop an understanding of their difficulties and of the support they felt they needed to address race equality issues in rural areas.

## Feedback to participants

All participants in the research, who provided us with contact details, will be sent a Summary Report of the research. The full details of the research are also available in the form of this handbook on the Racial Equality Council's (REC) web site **www.DevonREC.org** and it can be purchased as a hard copy. The REC also intends to respond to the many participants who expressed an interest in future REC activities, and to keep them informed of the new projects and initiatives being developed.

## Appendicies

This handbook and supporting tools ✖ can be accessed at www.DevonREC.org

The Appendix to this Chapter is web-based and includes:
- Table 2.1   The research questions framework
- Table 2.2   Snowball starting points
- Table 2.3   Successful lines of outreach to participants and participation type.
- Response leaflet
- Health Staff response leaflet
- Questionnaire
- Restaurant mail-shot translated cover letter

# Chapter 3
## DEVON – DEMOGRAPHY, DIVERSITY & CHANGE

**Themes in this chapter**

- Rural distributions of Black and Minority  Ethnic demography
- Key features of rural diversity
- Immigration
- Changes in diversity and demography
- Religious diversity

## Introduction – a quick overview of the Multi-Ethnic Devon demographics presented in this chapter.

This chapter contains 21 tables presenting data from Census analysis, schools data and the demography of the research sample.  It is intended primarily as a statistical resource for the reader, and as evidence to set the background for discussion in the other chapters of this handbook.

The overall picture illustrates that the demography of Devon is a Multi-Ethnic reality, and one with distinctively rural characteristics.  Almost no co-ethnic, geographic clusters exist that can be described as communities. The diversity of ethnic origin is immense, reflected in the great variety of places of birth and languages spoken.  This diverse population is scattered over the rural landscape, with very few people having co-ethnic friends or family relations in the District they live in. 72% of Devon's Black and Minority Ethnic population live in the rural districts. Many live in remote rural areas and individuals and families are scattered over every single ward in rural Devon. This rural dispersal and diversity of identities means that people have little to draw them in common, and few opportunities of contact or means of seeking out co-ethnic peers.  A key character of rural Minority Ethnic demography therefore, is isolation.

The rural Minority Ethnic population is one which is growing and diversifying:  In the 10 year period since the 1991 Census, the population increased by 100%.  The research also indicates that the number of Mixed Heritage families is also the fastest growing Minority Ethnic group. 80% of schools have Black and Minority Ethnic pupils.

With a growing population of isolated individuals and families, and taking account of the experiences of discrimination described in other chapters of this Handbook, the demography indicates that there is a need for service

providers to look closely at both the quantitative and qualitative information in this Handbook, and consider the emerging issues and recommendations.

**Important notes on the presentation of census statistics**
Original Census 2001 statistics in their original are available on the website of the Office of National Statistics.  www.ons.gov.uk
The ONS presents the Census statistics for Devon and its Districts as percentages of total population.  In the data presentation we have constructed for this handbook, we have taken Census 2001 percentages and translated them into people numbers. The aim of this is to look at Devon's multi-ethnic demography in terms of people rather than as purely statistical concepts.
The population numbers we have calculated therefore, are a good guide to the real numbers (but will be fractionally affected by the fact that the Census percentages are rounded up by the ONS to two decimal places, and by the measures that ONS have taken to protect sensitive data).

We have also compared, as far as is possible, the data from the previous Census (1991) with the present data.  The categories under which data about ethnicity is collected, was changed in 2001. So whilst it is possible to make comparisons of the change in total figures of the Black and visibly Minority Ethnic population for each District, it is not possible to make comparisons for any one ethnic category.

Disclaimer:
We have aimed to make sure that no errors are made in copying the printed Census figures into our analysis, but cannot accept responsibility for any error arising from the analysis we have provided as a guide only.
Both the Author of this report and the Devon & Exeter Racial Equality Council are registered with HMSO for click user licences, allowing us to re-use and publish Census data in this report. **CENSUS DATA IS CROWN COPYRIGHT.  ANYONE WISHING TO RE-USE AND PUBLISH THE CENSUS DATA CONTAINED IN THIS REPORT, OR CENSUS DATA DERIVED FROM OTHER SOURCES ARE OBLIGED BY LAW TO OBTAIN A LICENCE FROM HMSO.** This can be done by making an online application at www.clickanduse.hmso.gov.uk/online/cup_online_home_content.asp or by contacting the Office for National Statistics on 020 7533 5888.  The analysis and computations of Census base data provided in this report remain the intellectual copyright firstly of the Author and then by extension to the Devon & Exeter Racial Equality Council.

**Table 3.1**

| Census 2001 figures for Devon Area and Local Authorities, relating to ethnicity (and comparisons with Census 1991 data, and analysis) | | Devon County | | | | |
|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|
| | | % | No. | 1991 No. | 1991% | 01/91 % increase |
| **Total populat-ions** | All people | 100 | 704493 | 646903 | 100.00 | **9** |
| **White** | British | 96.98 | 683217 | 643053 | 99.40 | **6** |
| | Irish | 0.48 | 3382 | | | |
| | Other white | 1.42 | 10004 | | | |
| **Mixed** | White & Black Caribbean | 0.12 | 845 | | | |
| | White & Black African | 0.05 | 352 | | | |
| | White & Asian | 0.17 | 1198 | | | |
| | Other mixed | 0.14 | 986 | | | |
| **Asian or Asian British** | Indian | 0.09 | 634 | 480 | 0.07 | |
| | Pakistani | 0.03 | 211 | 92 | 0.01 | |
| | Bangladeshi | 0.04 | 282 | 164 | 0.03 | |
| | Other Asian | 0.06 | 423 | 365 | 0.06 | |
| **Black or Black British** | Caribbean | 0.04 | 282 | 268 | 0.04 | |
| | African | 0.06 | 423 | 230 | 0.04 | |
| | Other Black | 0.02 | 141 | 341 | 0.05 | |
| **Chinese or other ethnic group** | Chinese | 0.19 | 1339 | 630 | 0.10 | |
| | Other ethnic group | 0.12 | 845 | 1280 | 0.20 | |
| **Sub-totals: BME incl. Irish & 'other white'.** | | 3.03 | 21346 | | | |
| **Sub-totals: BME excl. Irish & 'other white'.** | | **1.13** | **7961** | **3850** | **0.60** | **107** |

**Table 3.2**

| Census 2001 figures for Devon Area and Local Authorities, relating to ethnicity (and comparisons with Census 1991 data, and analysis) | | Rural Districts Combined Total | | | | |
|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|
| | | % | No. | 1991 No. | 1991 % | 01/91 % increase |
| **Total populations** | All people | 100.00 | 593417 | 548778 | 100 | **8** |
| **White** | British | 97.40 | 578000 | 546242 | 99.54 | **6** |
| | Irish | 0.46 | 2727 | | | |
| | Other white | 1.25 | 7416 | | | |
| **Mixed** | White & Black Caribbean | 0.11 | 636 | | | |
| | White & Black African | 0.04 | 242 | | | |
| | White & Asian | 0.14 | 852 | | | |
| | Other mixed | 0.11 | 676 | | | |
| **Asian or Asian British** | Indian | 0.06 | 372 | 268 | 0.05 | |
| | Pakistani | 0.02 | 108 | 55 | 0.01 | |
| | Bangladeshi | 0.03 | 151 | 84 | 0.02 | |
| | Other Asian | 0.03 | 196 | 216 | 0.04 | |
| **Black or Black British** | Caribbean | 0.04 | 224 | 217 | 0.04 | |
| | African | 0.04 | 257 | 154 | 0.03 | |
| | Other Black | 0.02 | 114 | 266 | 0.05 | |
| **Chinese or other ethnic group** | Chinese | 0.16 | 951 | 445 | 0.08 | |
| | Other ethnic group | 0.08 | 483 | 831 | 0.15 | |
| **Sub-totals: BME incl. Irish & 'other white'.** | | 2.60 | 15403 | | | |
| **Sub-totals: BME excl. Irish & 'other white'.** | | **0.89** | **5260** | **2536** | **0.46** | **107** |

**Table 3.3**

| Census 2001 figures for Devon Area and Local Authorities, relating to ethnicity (and comparisons with Census 1991 data, and analysis) | | East Devon | | | | |
|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|
| | | % | No. | 1991 No. | 1991 % | 01/91 % increase |
| **Total populations** | All people | 100 | 125520 | 115873 | 100 | **8** |
| **White** | British | 97.49 | 122369 | 115429 | 99.62 | **6** |
| | Irish | 0.49 | 615 | | | |
| | Other white | 1.29 | 1619 | | | |
| **Mixed** | White & Black Caribbean | 0.1 | 126 | | | |
| | White & Black African | 0.04 | 50 | | | |
| | White & Asian | 0.12 | 151 | | | |
| | Other mixed | 0.1 | 126 | | | |
| **Asian or Asian British** | Indian | 0.05 | 63 | 30 | 0.03 | |
| | Pakistani | 0.01 | 13 | 11 | 0.01 | |
| | Bangladeshi | 0.01 | 13 | 3 | 0.00 | |
| | Other Asian | 0.02 | 25 | 31 | 0.03 | |
| **Black or Black British** | Caribbean | 0.03 | 38 | 40 | 0.03 | |
| | African | 0.02 | 25 | 35 | 0.03 | |
| | Other Black | 0.01 | 13 | 53 | 0.05 | |
| **Chinese or other ethnic group** | Chinese | 0.13 | 163 | 99 | 0.09 | |
| | Other ethnic group | 0.07 | 88 | 142 | 0.12 | |
| **Sub-totals: BME incl. Irish & 'other white'.** | | 2.49 | 3125 | | | |
| **Sub-totals: BME excl. Irish & 'other white'.** | | **0.71** | **891** | **444** | **0.38** | **101** |

---

**Table 3.4**

| Census 2001 figures for Devon Area and Local Authorities, relating to ethnicity (and comparisons with Census 1991 data, and analysis) | | Mid Devon | | | | |
|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|
| | | % | No. | 1991 No. | 1991 % | 01/91 % increase |
| **Total populations** | All people | 100 | 69774 | 64258 | 100 | **9** |
| **White** | British | 97.57 | 68078 | 63963 | 99.54 | **6** |
| | Irish | 0.4 | 279 | | | |
| | Other white | 1.24 | 865 | | | |
| **Mixed** | White & Black Caribbean | 0.07 | 49 | | | |
| | White & Black African | 0.02 | 14 | | | |
| | White & Asian | 0.17 | 119 | | | |
| | Other mixed | 0.1 | 70 | | | |
| **Asian or Asian British** | Indian | 0.06 | 42 | 25 | 0.04 | |
| | Pakistani | 0.01 | 7 | 3 | 0.00 | |
| | Bangladeshi | 0.03 | 21 | 0 | 0.00 | |
| | Other Asian | 0.04 | 28 | 19 | 0.03 | |
| **Black or Black British** | Caribbean | 0.02 | 14 | 21 | 0.03 | |
| | African | 0.03 | 21 | 13 | 0.02 | |
| | Other Black | 0.01 | 7 | 49 | 0.08 | |
| **Chinese or other ethnic group** | Chinese | 0.15 | 105 | 42 | 0.07 | |
| | Other ethnic group | 0.08 | 56 | 123 | 0.19 | |
| **Sub-totals: BME incl. Irish & 'other white'.** | | 2.43 | 1696 | | | |
| **Sub-totals: BME excl. Irish & 'other white'.** | | **0.79** | **551** | **295** | **0.46** | **87** |

**Table 3.5**

| Census 2001 figures for Devon Area and Local Authorities, relating to ethnicity (and comparisons with Census 1991 data, and analysis) | | North Devon | | | | |
|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|
| | | % | No. | 1991 No. | 1991 % | 01/91 % increase |
| Total populations | All people | 100 | 87508 | 84800 | 100 | **3** |
| White | British | 97.58 | 85390 | 84349 | 99.47 | **1** |
| | Irish | 0.43 | 376 | | | |
| | Other white | 1.04 | 910 | | | |
| Mixed | White & Black Caribbean | 0.13 | 114 | | | |
| | White & Black African | 0.04 | 35 | | | |
| | White & Asian | 0.14 | 123 | | | |
| | Other mixed | 0.1 | 88 | | | |
| Asian or Asian British | Indian | 0.11 | 96 | 92 | 0.11 | |
| | Pakistani | 0.03 | 26 | 3 | 0.00 | |
| | Bangladeshi | 0.07 | 61 | 35 | 0.04 | |
| | Other Asian | 0.03 | 26 | 32 | 0.04 | |
| Black or Black British | Caribbean | 0.03 | 26 | 34 | 0.04 | |
| | African | 0.04 | 35 | 17 | 0.02 | |
| | Other Black | 0.02 | 18 | 38 | 0.04 | |
| Chinese or other ethnic group | Chinese | 0.13 | 114 | 86 | 0.10 | |
| | Other ethnic group | 0.09 | 79 | 114 | 0.13 | |
| Sub-totals: BME incl. Irish & 'other white'. | | 2.43 | 2126 | | | |
| Sub-totals: BME excl. Irish & 'other white'. | | **0.96** | **840** | **451** | **0.53** | **86** |

**Table 3.6**

| Census 2001 figures for Devon Area and Local Authorities, relating to ethnicity (and comparisons with Census 1991 data, and analysis) | | South Hams | | | | |
|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|
| | | % | No. | 1991 No. | 1991 % | 01/91 % increase |
| Total populations | All people | 100 | 81849 | 77565 | 100 | **6** |
| White | British | 97.04 | 79426 | 77217 | 99.55 | **3** |
| | Irish | 0.47 | 385 | | | |
| | Other white | 1.57 | 1285 | | | |
| Mixed | White & Black Caribbean | 0.1 | 82 | | | |
| | White & Black African | 0.05 | 41 | | | |
| | White & Asian | 0.16 | 131 | | | |
| | Other mixed | 0.18 | 147 | | | |
| Asian or Asian British | Indian | 0.06 | 49 | 22 | 0.03 | |
| | Pakistani | 0.02 | 16 | 4 | 0.01 | |
| | Bangladeshi | 0.02 | 16 | 6 | 0.01 | |
| | Other Asian | 0.03 | 25 | 37 | 0.05 | |
| Black or Black British | Caribbean | 0.05 | 41 | 29 | 0.04 | |
| | African | 0.04 | 33 | 11 | 0.01 | |
| | Other Black | 0.03 | 25 | 24 | 0.03 | |
| Chinese or other ethnic group | Chinese | 0.07 | 57 | 62 | 0.08 | |
| | Other ethnic group | 0.1 | 82 | 153 | 0.20 | |
| Sub-totals: BME incl. Irish & 'other white'. | | 2.95 | 2415 | | | |
| Sub-totals: BME excl. Irish & 'other white'. | | **0.91** | **745** | **348** | **0.45** | **114** |

**Table 3.7**

| Census 2001 figures for Devon Area and Local Authorities, relating to ethnicity (and comparisons with Census 1991 data, and analysis) | | Teignbridge | | | | |
|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|
| | | % | No. | 1991 No. | 1991 % | 01/91 % increase |
| **Total populations** | All people | 100 | 120958 | 108258 | 100 | **12** |
| **White** | British | 97.25 | 117632 | 107666 | 99.45 | **9** |
| | Irish | 0.48 | 581 | | | |
| | Other white | 1.26 | 1524 | | | |
| **Mixed** | White & Black Caribbean | 0.13 | 157 | | | |
| | White & Black African | 0.03 | 36 | | | |
| | White & Asian | 0.16 | 194 | | | |
| | Other mixed | 0.1 | 121 | | | |
| **Asian or Asian British** | Indian | 0.06 | 73 | 50 | 0.05 | |
| | Pakistani | 0.02 | 24 | 26 | 0.02 | |
| | Bangladeshi | 0.02 | 24 | 32 | 0.03 | |
| | Other Asian | 0.05 | 60 | 60 | 0.06 | |
| **Black or Black British** | Caribbean | 0.04 | 48 | 47 | 0.04 | |
| | African | 0.05 | 60 | 47 | 0.04 | |
| | Other Black | 0.03 | 36 | 66 | 0.06 | |
| **Chinese or other ethnic group** | Chinese | 0.23 | 278 | 89 | 0.08 | |
| | Other ethnic group | 0.08 | 97 | 175 | 0.16 | |
| **Sub-totals: BME incl. Irish & 'other white'.** | | 2.74 | 3314 | | | |
| **Sub-totals: BME excl. Irish & 'other white'.** | | 1 | 1210 | 592 | 0.55 | 104 |

**Table 3.8**

| Census 2001 figures for Devon Area and Local Authorities, relating to ethnicity (and comparisons with Census 1991 data, and analysis) | | Torridge | | | | |
|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|
| | | % | No. | 1991 No. | 1991 % | 01/91 % increase |
| Total populations | All people | 100 | 58965 | 52129 | 100 | **13** |
| White | British | 97.65 | 57579 | 51922 | 99.60 | **11** |
| | Irish | 0.41 | 242 | | | |
| | Other white | 0.98 | 578 | | | |
| Mixed | White & Black Caribbean | 0.11 | 65 | | | |
| | White & Black African | 0.07 | 41 | | | |
| | White & Asian | 0.13 | 77 | | | |
| | Other mixed | 0.12 | 71 | | | |
| Asian or Asian British | Indian | 0.05 | 29 | 35 | 0.07 | |
| | Pakistani | 0.02 | 12 | 2 | 0.00 | |
| | Bangladeshi | 0.01 | 6 | 0 | 0.00 | |
| | Other Asian | 0.02 | 12 | 22 | 0.04 | |
| Black or Black British | Caribbean | 0.03 | 18 | 18 | 0.03 | |
| | African | 0.05 | 29 | 14 | 0.03 | |
| | Other Black | 0.01 | 6 | 14 | 0.03 | |
| Chinese or other ethnic group | Chinese | 0.28 | 165 | 38 | 0.07 | |
| | Other ethnic group | 0.09 | 53 | 64 | 0.12 | |
| Sub-totals: BME incl. Irish & 'other white'. | | 2.38 | 1403 | | | |
| Sub-totals: BME excl. Irish & 'other white'. | | **0.99** | **584** | **207** | **0.40** | **182** |

---

**Table 3.9**

| Census 2001 figures for Devon Area and Local Authorities, relating to ethnicity (and comparisons with Census 1991 data, and analysis) | | West Devon | | | | |
|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|
| | | % | No. | 1991 No. | 1991 % | 01/91 % increase |
| Total populations | All people | 100 | 48843 | 45895 | 100 | **6** |
| White | British | 97.3 | 47524 | 45696 | 99.57 | **4** |
| | Irish | 0.51 | 249 | | | |
| | Other white | 1.3 | 635 | | | |
| Mixed | White & Black Caribbean | 0.09 | 44 | | | |
| | White & Black African | 0.05 | 24 | | | |
| | White & Asian | 0.12 | 59 | | | |
| | Other mixed | 0.11 | 54 | | | |
| Asian or Asian British | Indian | 0.04 | 20 | 14 | 0.03 | |
| | Pakistani | 0.02 | 10 | 6 | 0.01 | |
| | Bangladeshi | 0.02 | 10 | 8 | 0.02 | |
| | Other Asian | 0.04 | 20 | 15 | 0.03 | |
| Black or Black British | Caribbean | 0.08 | 39 | 28 | 0.06 | |
| | African | 0.11 | 54 | 17 | 0.04 | |
| | Other Black | 0.02 | 10 | 22 | 0.05 | |
| Chinese or other ethnic group | Chinese | 0.14 | 68 | 29 | 0.06 | |
| | Other ethnic group | 0.06 | 29 | 60 | 0.13 | |
| Sub-totals: BME incl. Irish & 'other white'. | | 2.71 | 1324 | | | |
| Sub-totals: BME excl. Irish & 'other white'. | | **0.9** | **440** | **199** | **0.43** | **121** |

**Table 3.10**

| Census 2001 figures for Devon Area and Local Authorities, relating to ethnicity (and comparisons with Census 1991 data, and analysis) | | Exeter | | | | |
|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|
| | | % | No. | 1991 No. | 1991 % | 01/91 % increase |
| Total populations | All people | 100 | 111076 | 98125 | 100 | **13** |
| White | British | 94.74 | 105233 | 96811 | 87.16 | **9** |
| | Irish | 0.6 | 666 | | | |
| | Other white | 2.3 | 2555 | | | |
| Mixed | White & Black Caribbean | 0.16 | 178 | | | |
| | White & Black African | 0.1 | 111 | | | |
| | White & Asian | 0.32 | 355 | | | |
| | Other mixed | 0.26 | 289 | | | |
| Asian or Asian British | Indian | 0.26 | 289 | 212 | 0.19 | |
| | Pakistani | 0.06 | 67 | 37 | 0.03 | |
| | Bangladeshi | 0.13 | 144 | 80 | 0.07 | |
| | Other Asian | 0.21 | 233 | 149 | 0.13 | |
| Black or Black British | Caribbean | 0.06 | 67 | 51 | 0.05 | |
| | African | 0.13 | 144 | 76 | 0.07 | |
| | Other Black | 0.02 | 22 | 75 | 0.07 | |
| Chinese or other ethnic group | Chinese | 0.34 | 378 | 185 | 0.17 | |
| | Other ethnic group | 0.33 | 367 | 449 | 0.40 | |
| Sub-totals: BME incl. Irish & 'other white'. | | 5.28 | 5865 | | | |
| Sub-totals: BME excl. Irish & 'other white'. | | **2.38** | **2644** | **1314** | **1.18** | **101** |

**Table 3.11**

| Census 2001 figures for Devon Area and Local Authorities, relating to ethnicity (and comparisons with Census 1991 data, and analysis) | | 2001 National Park Area breakdowns | | | |
|---|---|---|---|---|---|
| | | **Dartmoor** | | **Exmoor** | |
| | | % | No. | % | No. |
| **Total populations** | All people | 100 | 33552 | 100 | 10875 |
| **White** | British | 96.75 | 32462 | 97.57 | 10611 |
| | Irish | 0.56 | 188 | 0.41 | 45 |
| | Other white | 1.74 | 584 | 1.5 | 163 |
| **Mixed** | White & Black Caribbean | 0.13 | 44 | 0.05 | 5 |
| | White & Black African | 0.07 | 23 | 0.03 | 3 |
| | White & Asian | 0.23 | 77 | 0.14 | 15 |
| | Other mixed | 0.12 | 40 | 0.06 | 7 |
| **Asian or Asian British** | Indian | 0.04 | 13 | 0.07 | 8 |
| | Pakistani | 0.01 | 3 | 0 | 0 |
| | Bangladeshi | 0.01 | 3 | 0 | 0 |
| | Other Asian | 0.04 | 13 | 0.03 | 3 |
| **Black or Black British** | Caribbean | 0.08 | 27 | 0 | 0 |
| | African | 0.05 | 17 | 0.03 | 3 |
| | Other Black | 0.02 | 7 | 0.03 | 3 |
| **Chinese or other ethnic group** | Chinese | 0.07 | 23 | 0.03 | 3 |
| | Other ethnic group | 0.07 | 23 | 0.06 | 7 |
| **Sub-totals: BME incl. Irish & 'other white'.** | | 3.24 | 1087 | 2.44 | 265 |
| **Sub-totals: BME excl. Irish & 'other white'.** | | **0.94** | **315** | **0.53** | **58** |

**Table 3.12**

| Census 2001 figures for Devon Area and Local Authorities, relating to ethnicity (and comparisons with Census 1991 data, and analysis) | | Torbay Unitary Authority | | | | |
|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|
| | | No. | % | 1991 No. | 1991% | 01/91 % increase |
| **Total populations** | All people | 100 | 129706 | 119674 | 100 | **8** |
| **White** | British | 96.84 | 125607 | 118818 | 99.28 | **6** |
| | Irish | 0.6 | 778 | | | |
| | Other white | 1.33 | 1725 | | | |
| **Mixed** | White & Black Caribbean | 0.15 | 195 | | | |
| | White & Black African | 0.06 | 78 | | | |
| | White & Asian | 0.19 | 246 | | | |
| | Other mixed | 0.17 | 221 | | | |
| **Asian or Asian British** | Indian | 0.12 | 156 | 97 | 0.08 | |
| | Pakistani | 0.06 | 78 | 28 | 0.02 | |
| | Bangladeshi | 0.02 | 26 | 31 | 0.03 | |
| | Other Asian | 0.07 | 91 | 95 | 0.08 | |
| **Black or Black British** | Caribbean | 0.05 | 65 | 49 | 0.04 | |
| | African | 0.04 | 52 | 50 | 0.04 | |
| | Other Black | 0.02 | 26 | 105 | 0.09 | |
| **Chinese or other ethnic group** | Chinese | 0.18 | 233 | 149 | 0.12 | |
| | Other ethnic group | 0.12 | 156 | 252 | 0.21 | |
| **Sub-totals: BME incl. Irish & 'other white'.** | | 3.18 | 4125 | | | |
| **Sub-totals: BME excl. Irish & 'other white'.** | | **1.25** | **1621** | **856** | **0.72** | **89** |

| Table 3.13 Religion by Ethnicity in Devon from Census 2001 | All People | Christian | Buddhist | Hindu | Jewish | Muslim | Sikh | Any other religion | No religion | Not stated |
|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|
| ALL PEOPLE | 704486 | 527209 | 1693 | 335 | 650 | 1496 | 173 | 2808 | 114498 | 55624 |
| White | 696587 | 523988 | 1324 | 62 | 631 | 472 | 48 | 2732 | 112540 | 54790 |
| British | 683236 | 515041 | 1229 | 54 | 544 | 236 | 45 | 2571 | 109995 | 53521 |
| Irish | 3383 | 2659 | 25 | - | 3 | 9 | 3 | 33 | 358 | 293 |
| Other White | 9968 | 6288 | 70 | 8 | 84 | 227 | - | 128 | 2187 | 976 |
| Mixed | 3350 | 1758 | 33 | 10 | 13 | 193 | 6 | 32 | 883 | 422 |
| White & Black Caribbean | 818 | 496 | - | 3 | 3 | 5 | - | 7 | 202 | 102 |
| White & Black African | 359 | 204 | 4 | - | - | 29 | - | 3 | 86 | 33 |
| White & Asian | 1206 | 611 | 16 | 7 | 4 | 75 | 6 | 12 | 331 | 144 |
| Other Mixed | 967 | 447 | 13 | - | 6 | 84 | - | 10 | 264 | 143 |
| Asian | 1548 | 278 | 32 | 255 | - | 619 | 116 | 19 | 124 | 105 |
| Indian | 655 | 131 | 6 | 232 | - | 51 | 116 | 10 | 64 | 45 |
| Pakistani | 176 | 47 | - | - | - | 110 | - | - | 3 | 16 |
| Bangladeshi | 281 | 13 | - | - | - | 247 | - | - | 9 | 12 |
| Other Asian | 436 | 87 | 26 | 23 | - | 211 | - | 9 | 48 | 32 |
| Black or Black British | 824 | 549 | 6 | 4 | 3 | 65 | - | 7 | 76 | 114 |
| Black Caribbean | 285 | 187 | 3 | 4 | - | 12 | - | 4 | 39 | 36 |
| Black African | 398 | 292 | - | - | 3 | 42 | - | - | 20 | 41 |
| Other Black | 141 | 70 | 3 | - | - | 11 | - | 3 | 17 | 37 |
| Chinese | 1328 | 291 | 146 | - | - | - | - | 7 | 753 | 131 |
| Other Ethnic Group | 849 | 345 | 152 | 4 | 3 | 147 | 3 | 11 | 122 | 62 |

| Table 3.14 (% data from Census 2001) | East Devon | | Mid Devon | | North Devon | | South Hams | | Teignbridge | | Torridge | | West Devon | |
|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|
| Country of birth | % | No. | % | No. | % | No. | % | No. | % | No. | % | No. | % | No. |
| Republic of Ireland | 0.43 | 540 | 0.32 | 223 | 0.37 | 324 | 0.42 | 344 | 0.41 | 496 | 0.33 | 195 | 0.38 | 186 |
| Other EU countries | 1.04 | 1305 | 0.87 | 607 | 0.99 | 866 | 1.21 | 990 | 1 | 1210 | 0.82 | 484 | 0.92 | 449 |
| Elsewhere | 2.53 | 3176 | 2.27 | 1584 | 1.92 | 1680 | 2.84 | 2325 | 2.5 | 3024 | 2.05 | 1209 | 2.73 | 1333 |
| Cf. Sub-total BME excl. Irish & European | 0.71 | 891 | 0.79 | 551 | 0.96 | 840 | 0.91 | 745 | 1 | 1210 | 0.99 | 584 | 0.9 | 440 |
| Total born outside UK | 4 | 5021 | 3.46 | 2414 | 3.28 | 2870 | 4.47 | 3659 | 3.91 | 4729 | 3.2 | 1887 | 4.03 | 1968 |
| Cf. Sub-total BME inc. Irish & European | 2.49 | 3125 | 2.43 | 1696 | 2.43 | 2126 | 2.95 | 2415 | 2.74 | 3314 | 2.38 | 1403 | 2.71 | 1324 |
| Religion | | | | | | | | | | | | | | |
| Christian | 77.85 | 97717 | 75.4 | 52610 | 75.11 | 65727 | 74.68 | 61125 | 75.56 | 91396 | 75.54 | 44542 | 76.42 | 37326 |
| Buddhist | 0.18 | 226 | 0.19 | 133 | 0.17 | 149 | 0.39 | 319 | 0.23 | 278 | 0.21 | 124 | 0.19 | 93 |
| Hindu | 0.03 | 38 | 0.04 | 28 | 0.05 | 44 | 0.05 | 41 | 0.03 | 36 | 0.03 | 18 | 0.02 | 10 |
| Jewish | 0.1 | 126 | 0.07 | 49 | 0.06 | 53 | 0.11 | 90 | 0.07 | 85 | 0.05 | 29 | 0.12 | 59 |
| Muslim | 0.1 | 126 | 0.07 | 49 | 0.18 | 158 | 0.07 | 57 | 0.11 | 133 | 0.06 | 35 | 0.14 | 68 |
| Sikh | 0.01 | 13 | 0 | 0 | 0.04 | 35 | 0.01 | 8 | 0.02 | 24 | 0.01 | 6 | 0.01 | 5 |
| Other religions | 0.37 | 464 | 0.37 | 258 | 0.33 | 289 | 0.47 | 385 | 0.43 | 520 | 0.4 | 236 | 0.34 | 166 |
| No religion | 13.89 | 17435 | 15.98 | 11150 | 15.95 | 13958 | 16.53 | 13530 | 15.68 | 18966 | 15.62 | 9210 | 15.41 | 7527 |
| Religion not stated | 7.47 | 9376 | 7.87 | 5491 | 8.11 | 7097 | 7.68 | 6286 | 7.87 | 9519 | 8.08 | 4764 | 7.34 | 3585 |

| Table 3.15 % data from Census 2001 | Devon | | Combined 7 rural Districts | | DNP | | ENP | | Exeter | | Torbay | |
|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|
| **Country of birth** | **%** | **No.** | **No.** | **%** | **No.** | **%** | **%** | **No.** | **%** | **No.** | **%** | **No.** |
| **Republic of Ireland** | 0.4 | 2818 | 2340 | 0.39 | 151 | 0.45 | 0.35 | 38 | 0.43 | 478 | 0.53 | 687 |
| **Other EU countries** | 1.12 | 7890 | 5913 | 1.00 | 413 | 1.23 | 0.86 | 94 | 1.78 | 1977 | 1.08 | 1401 |
| **Elsewhere** | **2.64** | **18599** | **14344** | **2.42** | **1007** | **3** | **2.67** | **290** | **3.83** | **4254** | **2.24** | **2905** |
| Cf. Sub-total BME excl. Irish & European | 1.13 | 7961 | 5260 | 0.89 | 315 | 0.94 | 0.53 | 58 | 2.38 | 2644 | 1.25 | 1621 |
| **Total born outside UK** | **4.16** | **29307** | **22598** | **3.81** | **1570** | **4.68** | **3.88** | **422** | **6.04** | **6709** | **3.85** | **4994** |
| Cf. Sub-total BME inc. Irish & European | 3.03 | 21346 | 15403 | 2.60 | 1087 | 3.24 | 2.44 | 265 | 5.28 | 5865 | 3.18 | 4125 |
| **Religion** | | | | | | | | | | | | |
| Christian | 74.84 | 527243 | 450467 | 75.91 | 24221 | 72.19 | 77.43 | 8421 | 69.12 | 76776 | 76.19 | 98823 |
| Buddhist | 0.24 | 1691 | 1313 | 0.22 | 131 | 0.39 | 0.3 | 33 | 0.34 | 378 | 0.15 | 195 |
| Hindu | 0.05 | 352 | 230 | 0.04 | 3 | 0.01 | 0.06 | 7 | 0.11 | 122 | 0.05 | 65 |
| Jewish | 0.09 | 634 | 479 | 0.08 | 40 | 0.12 | 0.11 | 12 | 0.14 | 156 | 0.12 | 156 |
| Muslim | 0.21 | 1479 | 624 | 0.11 | 44 | 0.13 | 0.03 | 3 | 0.77 | 855 | 0.26 | 337 |
| Sikh | 0.02 | 141 | 63 | 0.01 | 7 | 0.02 | 0 | 0 | 0.07 | 78 | 0.04 | 52 |
| Other religions | 0.4 | 2818 | 2340 | 0.39 | 191 | 0.57 | 0.49 | 53 | 0.43 | 478 | 0.37 | 480 |
| No religion | 16.25 | 114480 | 91765 | 15.46 | 5949 | 17.73 | 13.65 | 1484 | 20.45 | 22715 | 14.91 | 19339 |
| Religion not stated | 7.9 | 55655 | 46136 | 7.77 | 2966 | 8.84 | 7.93 | 862 | 8.57 | 9519 | 7.9 | 10247 |

Multi-Ethnic Devon - A Rural Handbook

3.17

**Table 3.16**

| School Children among the BME population | Tot. BME pupils inc White ME. | total White non-British | | | total Mixed Heritage | | | total Asian | | | total Black | | | total Chinese | | | total other | | |
|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|
| | | sch | dod | % Sch/pop | sch | dod | % Sch/pop | sch | dod | dod/Sch % | sch | dod | dod/Sch % | sch | dod | dod/Sch % | sch | dod | dod/Sch % |
| East Devon | 409 | 198 | 2234 | 9 | 120 | 452 | 27 | 23 | 113 | 20 | 16 | 75 | 21 | 32 | 163 | 20 | 20 | 88 | 23 |
| Mid Devon | 238 | 113 | 1144 | 10 | 72 | 251 | 29 | 16 | 98 | 16 | 12 | 42 | 29 | 18 | 105 | 17 | 7 | 56 | 13 |
| North Devon | 251 | 116 | 1286 | 9 | 62 | 359 | 17 | 36 | 210 | 17 | 11 | 79 | 14 | 9 | 114 | 8 | 17 | 79 | 22 |
| South Hams | 337 | 184 | 1670 | 11 | 109 | 401 | 27 | 12 | 106 | 11 | 9 | 98 | 9 | 11 | 57 | 19 | 12 | 82 | 15 |
| Teignbridge | 301 | 122 | 2105 | 6 | 121 | 508 | 24 | 10 | 181 | 6 | 11 | 145 | 8 | 18 | 278 | 6 | 19 | 97 | 20 |
| Torridge | 180 | 77 | 820 | 9 | 77 | 254 | 30 | 2 | 59 | 3 | 9 | 53 | 17 | 7 | 165 | 4 | 8 | 53 | 15 |
| West Devon | 138 | 66 | 884 | 7 | 56 | 181 | 31 | 5 | 59 | 8 | 3 | 103 | 3 | 1 | 68 | 1 | 7 | 29 | 24 |
| **Rural Tot.** | **1854** | **876** | **10143** | **9** | **617** | **2405** | **26** | **104** | **826** | **13** | **71** | **595** | **12** | **96** | **951** | **10** | **90** | **483** | **19** |
| **Rural District av.** | **265** | **125** | **1449** | **9** | **88** | **344** | **26** | **15** | **118** | **13** | **10** | **85** | **12** | **14** | **136** | **10** | **13** | **69** | **19** |
| Exeter | 557 | 135 | 3221 | 4 | 167 | 933 | 18 | 93 | 733 | 13 | 26 | 233 | 11 | 23 | 378 | 6 | 113 | 367 | 31 |

Sch = number of school children according to School Ethnicity Monitoring data held at Devon County Council for 2003.

Pop = population figures from 2001 Census.

% Sch/ pop = school numbers as a percentage of population figures

The figures in the table above are constructed from population data from Census 2001 and school pupil data from 2003. Whilst the two sources are not from the same time snapshot, they are close enough to make an indicative comparison of the proportion of Black and Minority Ethnic school age children to Black and Minority Ethnic population.

With a total number of Black and Minority Ethnic people in the 7 rural Districts (including Irish and European) of 15403, and a total number of Black and Minority Ethnic (BME) school children in those Districts of 1854, the overall ratio of BME school pupils to BME adults can be estimated as 1 pupil : 7.3 adults. The ratio of White British school Children to White British adults is a similar balance of 1 pupil : 7.6 adults.

The number of school age children is likely to be an underestimate of population. Table 3.17 below indicates that difficulty was experienced in all Districts in encouraging returns of ethnicity monitoring data. Apart from in Torridge, data was not collected for between 1% and 11% of the school population and was a particular problem in North Devon and South Hams.

**Table 3.17**

| District | Pupil Ethnicity data refused | Pupil Ethnicity data not obtained | Total school population | % of total school pop'n ethnicity not known |
|---|---|---|---|---|
| East Devon | 274 | 124 | 16725 | 2 |
| Mid Devon | 593 | 5 | 9479 | 6 |
| North Devon | 1029 | 393 | 12423 | 11 |
| South Hams | 688 | 279 | 10959 | 9 |
| Teignbridge | 471 | 38 | 16418 | 3 |
| Torridge | 28 | 1 | 8112 | 0 |
| West Devon | 118 | 9 | 6805 | 2 |
| Exeter | 119 | 22 | 12997 | 1 |
| TOTAL | 3320 | 871 | | |

The schools data shows that 125 out of Devon's 373 schools had no Black or Minority Ethnic children. In other words, 67% of Devon schools, the majority *do* have BME children.

Similarly, when widening the definition of Minority Ethnic to include children whose ethnicities were described as other than White British, the data shows that 80% of Devon schools have children of Black and Minority Ethnic origin including European, Irish and Traveller children.

There were no Academic Councils that did not include Black and Minority Ethnic Children.

In chapter 4, analysis of the research sample shows that the proportion of Mixed Heritage families is greater than the number of Mixed Heritage participants in the sample (i.e. 38% were members of Mixed Heritage families vs. 8% Mixed Heritage participants). From this we can deduce that the percentage of the Mixed Heritage population is likely to increase with the next generation. This deduction is confirmed by Table 3.16 above, which shows that the Mixed Heritage total and school populations are the largest of the Minority Ethnic categories (second to White Non-British)and that the Mixed Heritage child population is the fastest growing of all the ethnic groups, with the Mixed Heritage school child to Mixed Heritage adult ratio being 1:4 in the rural Districts.

**Key issues arising from the research in relationship and contrast to Census Small Area Statistics**

**Diversity in every ward in rural Devon**
The small area statistics from the 2001 Census provide more detail about the demography of the Black and Minority Ethnic population in Devon. This data is provided at electoral ward level. It shows that when Irish and European people are included, there are no wards in the county of Devon that do not have a Black and Minority Ethnic population. When Irish and European people are not included in the count, the data indicates that only 3 wards have no Black and Minority Ethnic members. However, it should be noted that the data presented by the Census probably represents an undercount: In some areas known well to this research, the presence of specific ethnic groups is estimated to be significantly higher than indicated by the Census output. This might be accounted for by the amount of people who were not picked up by the Census and by the methods that were used in Census data statistical processing to deal with the undercount. In 2001, many efforts were made to improve the outreach and accessibility of the Census to people with English as an Additional Language, but based on the learning from the 1991 Census undercount it is still possible that many Black and Minority Ethnic people could be unaccounted for.

The fact that Black and Minority Ethnic people are part of almost every community in Devon demonstrates that diversity is not just an urban quality. Even when we compare urban with rural within Devon, we see that the 5 wards with the largest Black and Minority Ethnic population (including Irish and European people) ranging from 410 – 304 are in

Exeter. But these wards are followed with a ward in Teignbridge rural District with a Black and Minority Ethnic population of 285. (Excluding European and Irish people, the figures show that the Black and Minority Ethnic population is highest in eight Exeter wards followed by 127 people in a ward in Torridge.)

**Black and Minority Ethnic 'communities' ?**
The Census shows that diversity is a rural reality, but in particular it demonstrates that rural Black and Minority Ethnic demography has some distinctive features.  The primary feature of rural diversity in Devon, is the absence of large co-ethnic, geographically localised communities, such as found more typically in major urban areas where key points in history and politics have provided a centrifugal force around a number of locations in the UK.  This research indicates that by contrast to this particular characteristic of urban demography, individuals are attracted to Devon for individual as opposed to communal reasons. This pattern and motivation for the growth of the Black and Minority Ethnic population gives rise to a diverse range of ethnic identities in the population, scattered throughout the rural landscape. The Black and Minority Ethnic population in any one area in the rural districts is typified by diversity of ethnicity rather than single co-ethnic gatherings.

This diversity is illuminated with a cluster analysis:
Out of the 183 rural District wards, only 23% have clusters of any one ethnic group of a size greater than 10 people.  This would typically represent two families or a small Minority Ethnic business with tied accommodation.  When does a cluster constitute a community?  It's difficult to enumerate this and complex to analyse. For example, a handful of families of the same ethnicity living in a large market or seaside town would not have the characteristics of community unless they happened to live in a similar neighbourhood and/or were related, had developed friendships or social networks.  In those 48 wards that included co-ethnic clusters of more than 10 people, the average cluster size was 20.  The majority of these wards are larger seaside and market towns, where it is usual to find at least a couple of Black and Minority Ethnic restaurants serving the community.  Interestingly, there were neither clusters greater than 10 of  Asian/ Asian British Pakistani  people nor of people described under the Census category Asian/ Asian British 'Other',  in any of the rural wards.

There were however notable clusters in 3 wards in Teignbridge district, with numbers of the Chinese population being higher than 40.  There is also

---

a cluster in a Torridge ward of a Chinese population of more than 70 people.

The cluster analysis of the 48 wards is shown below in Table 3.21.

The concept of 'community' is often also referred to in Devon in relation to discussion about the Black and Minority Ethnic population as a whole.  In this sense community may be a simple way for people to talk about the Black and Minority Ethnic population, but it does not reflect an analysis of whether the links that form the basis of a community, are active among this population.  Chapters 5 and 9 look in detail at the degree to which some people have created informal networks of co-ethnic, co-lingual and co-religious interest.  However, the analysis of the research in chapter 5 also indicates that the majority of people have neither co-ethnic friends or family relations in the District.  It also describes the rural factors that inhibit inter-ethnic networking.  When we look at the disparate dispersion of the Black and Minority Ethnic population over 183 rural wards, with many people living as individuals or nuclear families in remote areas, there is not much to link people in common or even to catalyse networking among them.

**Devon's own appeal in shaping the nature of the Black and Minority Ethnic demography.**
A key factor which shapes this diversity and hence the limitation on the formation of 'communities', is the basis on which people are drawn to Devon.
Table 3.18 below illustrates the individual reasoning behind people's choices to relocate in Devon, indicating the life-choice forces that are shaping the profile and diversely individualistic nature of the Black and Minority Ethnic population in Devon.

**Table 3.18**

| Reason for coming to present location in Devon  'n' = 137 | % | Reason for coming to present location in Devon | % |
|---|---|---|---|
| Business /job opportunities (To see the range of jobs in which the participants were employed, see chapter 7) | 18 | Escape from abuse (racist and domestic) | 4 |
| Study | 18 | To live rurally / escape city life | 4 |
| To be near family | 12 | To join White female partner | 3 |
| To join White male partner | 9 | Adopted/fostered into White family in Devon | 3 |

| | | | |
|---|---|---|---|
| Asylum (escape from war and political persecution) | 7 | Residents in housing for Chinese elderly(inc. people from rural Devon) | 2 |
| Quality of life (often observed during holidays in Devon) | 6 | With Armed forces | 1 |
| To join BME male partner | 5 | Born in Devon | 1 |
| Good place to bring up children | 5 | Other: Prisoner; Traveller base site; Cheaper cost of living | 2 |

Most people described multiple reasons for choosing to live in Devon.  The main factor given was used in the calculations above.

Hence we can see that the majority of our participants were young or middle aged immigrants to the UK, who had come to Devon primarily through job relocation; to set up businesses; to join partners based in Devon; for study or as refugees.

When asked what was the best thing about life in Devon, 44 participants described the great pleasure they derive from the countryside and seaside, and many noted it as an ancillary factor in their decision to move to Devon.

> 🗨 *We were really prepared to be attacked in London - we had everything under the bed - a baseball bat and an axe and towels at the windows.  People down here don't understand the effect it had on us.*
>
> 🗨 *After 1 year had enough of the city and wanted to go somewhere quieter.  I had lived mostly in rural areas  - I'm not a city person. I came to Devon.*

The peace and quiet of Devon may well play an increasing part in people's decisions to move away from urban centers where the cost of living is also relatively high and where the impact of current turbulence in world affairs has a rapid impact on community relations.  As the Black and Minority Ethnic population grows, more friends and family will come to the area and observe its attractions.  Our sample shows that many will come to join family members already living in the county.  A characteristic of the contemporary national workforce is mobility; and as the professional employment profile of the Black and Minority Ethnic diversifies among the younger generations, and more people are attracted from overseas in this global economy, more people are likely to be attracted to Devon in connection with their work.

**Black and Minority Ethnic population growth in Devon**
The Office for National Statistics' comparisons between the 1991 and 2001
Census demonstrated that the national Black and Minority Ethnic
population increased from 6 – 9 % of the total population in England.
By contrast, comparison of the 1991 and 2001 Census statistics for the 7
rural Districts of Devon shows that the rural Black and Minority Ethnic
population doubled, namely increased by 100% over the last 10 years.

The analysis of the research sample also showed that 53% of our
participants had come to Devon after the 1991 Census, which correlates
with the 2001 Census indication of 100% growth.

The average number of years that participants in the research had lived in
Devon was 8 years ('n' = 135)

**Table 3.19**

| No. of years (2002) | < 1 | 1 to 5 | 6 to 10 | 11 to 15 | 16 to 20 | 21 to 25 | 26 to 30 | 31 to 35 | 36 to 40 | 41 to 45 | 45 to 50 |
|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|
| % of people ('n'= 135) | 20 | 36 | 15 | 13 | 6 | 4 | 1 | 2 | 2 | 0 | 1 |

The significant increase in the sample in the last 5 years indicates that a
much greater increase of the Black and Minority Ethnic population can be
expected by the next Census in 2011, if the trend of attraction to Devon
continues.

75% of the sample ('n' = 148) were born outside the UK (14% within the
EU and 61% elsewhere). Further detail on Place of Birth within the sample
can be seen chapter 4. We found that many people within the sample had
moved directly to Devon from overseas, but slightly more people had
relocated from other parts of the UK:

**Table 3.20a**

| Location last lived in before present location | Overseas | Elsewhere in UK | Elsewhere in Devon |
|---|---|---|---|
| % of participants. ('n' =130) | 37% | 43% | 20% |

The sample immigration pattern should be contextualised against Census
2001 data relating to immigration and ethnicity in Devon. The Census data
shows that the Black and Minority Ethnic population in Devon derives

equally from people born in the UK and from people who have migrated to the UK. Moreover, it should also be noted that White people with British nationality who were born overseas, are the largest group in Devon immigrating to the UK from their place of birth outside the UK, followed by people from Europe and the Irish Republic. The Black and Minority Ethnic immigrant population forms only 13.6% of the immigrant population in Devon or 0.56% of the population as a whole.

(Of the population in Devon who have immigrated to the UK, 52.1% are of White British ethnic origin, 34.3% are European and Irish and 13.6% are Black and Minority Ethnic.)

**Table 3.20 b** (derived from Census 2001)

| % of total pop'n in Devon who were born in ⇨ & and have ⇩ethnic origin | UK | Republic of Ireland or Europe | Elsewhere |
|---|---|---|---|
| **White British** | 95.85 | 0.85 | 1.30 |
| **Irish /European** | 0.47 | 0.97 | 0.45 |
| **Black / Minority Ethnic** | 0.55 | 0.02 | 0.54 |

Information about the skills that the Black and Minority Ethnic population bring to Devon and their contribution to the local economy can be found in chapter 7.

A final note:

A sobering comment from one of the participants makes the point that maintaining within the County all the benefits that a richly diverse population brings, includes sustaining the attraction for Black and Minority Ethnic residents in the county by keeping racism out of Devon:

> 🗨 *This incident really soured things for me. I really like living here in a small place but this ruins it.*

More information on experiences of racism can be found in chapters 6,7,8 and 9.

This handbook and supporting tools ⚒ can be accessed at www.DevonREC.org

**Table 3.21**

**Ward level Co-ethnic cluster analysis (clusters greater than 10) based on Census 2001 data**

| | Mixed | | | | Asian or Asian British | | Black or Black British | | | | | | | |
|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|
| | White & Black Caribbean | White & Black African | White & Asian | Other Mixed | Indian | Bangladeshi | Black Caribbean | Black African | Other Black | Chinese | Other Ethnic Group | Total BME Excl. Irish & European | Tot BME inc. Irish & European | Max no. of any one group |
| **East Devon** | | | | | | | | | | | | | | |
| Broadclyst | >10 | | | >10 | | | | | | | | 56 | 56 | 16 |
| Exmouth Brixington | | | | | | | | | | >10 | | 52 | 52 | >10 |
| Exmouth Littleham | | | >10 | | | | | | | >10 | | 64 | 64 | >10 |
| Exmouth Town | | | | | | | | | | >10 | | 85 | 85 | 18 |
| Exmouth Withycombe Raleigh | | | | | | | | | | >10 | | 37 | 37 | >10 |
| Honiton St Michael's | >10 | | | | | | | | | | | 67 | 67 | >10 |
| Honiton St Paul's | >10 | | | | | | | | | >10 | | 44 | 44 | 12 |

| | | | | | | | | | |
|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|
| Ottery St Mary Town | | >10 | | | | | 48 | 48 | >10 |
| Seaton | | >10 | | | | | 48 | 48 | >10 |
| Sidmouth Sidford | >10 | | | | | | 28 | 28 | >10 |
| Sidmouth Town | | | | | >20 | >10 | 52 | 52 | >20 |
| **Mid Devon** | | | | | | | | | |
| Castle | | | | | >10 | | 41 | 41 | >10 |
| Cranmore | | | | | >10 | | 42 | 42 | >10 |
| Cullompton South | | | | | >10 | | 31 | 31 | >10 |
| Lawrence | | | | | >10 | | 45 | 45 | 12 |
| Upper Culm | >10 | | | | | >10 | 23 | 23 | >10 |
| Westexe | | >10 | | | >10 | | 42 | 42 | >10 |
| **North Devon** | | | | | | | | | |
| Bickington and Roundswell | | | >10 | | >10 | | 60 | 60 | 16 |
| Braunton West | | >10 | | | | | 27 | 27 | >10 |
| Central Town | | | | >10 | | | 64 | 64 | >10 |
| Forches and Whiddon Valley | >10 | | | | | | 42 | 42 | >10 |
| Fremington | | | | | >10 | | 31 | 31 | >10 |

| Area | | | | | | | | | |
|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|
| Landkey Swimbridge and Taw | | | | | | >10 | 34 | 34 | >10 |
| Pilton | | | | | | >10 | 59 | 59 | >10 |
| Yeo Valley | >10 | | | >20 | | | 63 | 63 | >20 |
| **South Hams** | | | | | | | | | |
| Bickleigh and Shaugh | >10 | >10 | >10 | | >10 | >10 | 91 | 91 | 20 |
| Erme Valley | | | >10 | >10 | | | 44 | 44 | >10 |
| Totnes Town | | >10 | >10 | | >10 | | 78 | 78 | 17 |
| **Teignbridge** | | | | | | | | | |
| Ashburton and Buckfastleigh | >10 | >10 | >10 | >10 | >10 | >10 | 73 | 73 | 15 |
| Bradley | | | | | >30 | >30 | 68 | 68 | >30 |
| Buckland and Milber | >20 | | | | | | 60 | 60 | >20 |
| Bushell | | | | | >40 | | 85 | 85 | >40 |
| College | >10 | | >10 | | | >10 | 83 | 83 | 18 |
| Dawlish Central and North East | >30 | | >10 | | >10 | | 85 | 85 | >30 |
| Dawlish South West | | | >10 | | | | 39 | 39 | >10 |

| | | | | | | | | | |
|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|
| Kenn Valley | >10 | >10 | | | | | 68 | 68 | 17 |
| Kingsteignton West | | | | | >30 | | 63 | 63 | >30 |
| Teign Valley | | >10 | | | | | 27 | 27 | >10 |
| Teignmouth Central | | | | | >40 | | 77 | 77 | >40 |
| Teignmouth East | | | | | >10 | | 40 | 40 | >10 |
| Teignmouth West | | >10 | | | | | 51 | 51 | >10 |
| Torridge | | | | | | | | | |
| Bideford East | | >10 | | | | | 44 | 44 | >10 |
| Bideford North | | | | | >60 | | 121 | 121 | >60 |
| Bideford South | >10 | | | | >30 | | 82 | 82 | >30 |
| Shebbear and Langtree | | | | | >30 | | 36 | 36 | >30 |
| Torrington | | >10 | | | | | 45 | 45 | >10 |
| West Devon | | | | | | | | | |
| Lydford | >10 | | | >10 | | | 58 | 58 | 20 |
| Tavistock South | | >10 | | >30 | >10 | | 99 | 99 | >30 |

# Chapter 4
# IDENTITY & ETHNICITY

## Themes in this chapter

- An overview of the profile of the Black and Minority Ethnic participant sample in this research, including:
  - ➢ Age and Sex
  - ➢ Ethnic group
  - ➢ Religion
  - ➢ Family status
  - ➢ Country of birth
  - ➢ Languages spoken
- Describing ethnicity and identity – a look at some of the pros and cons of self-definition and prescribed categories
  - ➢ Free-form definition or prescribed categories?
  - ➢ Identity and vulnerability to racism
  - ➢ Identity and Children
  - ➢ Ethnicity record keeping and monitoring
  - ➢ Participants' definitions of ethnic identity.

## An overview of the profile of the Black and Minority Ethnic participant sample in this research

The research sample encompassed the full range of age, ethnicity, religion and language skills among the Black and Minority Ethnic population and was split almost equally between women and men.  It reflected the population breakdown indicated by the 2001 Census in terms of gender, population growth and rural dispersion.  The research has included Europeans within its brief, but the proportion of visibly Black and Minority Ethnic people in the sample is higher than the European proportion.  The 2001 Census data shows by contrast, that the Irish and European part of the population in Devon is greater than the visibly Black and Minority Ethnic population.  The 2001 Census data also shows that 53% of the European and visibly Black and Minority Ethnic population is Christian, but the research sample focuses more on other faiths, with only 36% coming from a Christian background.  A few people with Traveller backgrounds are also included in this research, but due to the weight of research and development work already done on Traveller issues in the UK and Devon, Travellers form a minority of the research sample.  In-depth information about the situation of Travellers can be found by reference to the Travellers

Education Service and the County Gypsy Liaison Officer.  Contact details are in the resources list at the end of this book.

**Age profiles**

Table 4.1 shows that the research sample included people of all ages, with a concentration of working age adults.

**Table 4.1**

| Age | Women | Men | Sex not stated | Totals |
|---|---|---|---|---|
| 10 – 12 | 4 | | | 4 |
| 13 –19 | 2 | 2 | | 4 |
| Young adult | 3 | | | 3 |
| 20s | 14 | 12 | | 26 |
| 30s | 25 | 17 | | 42 |
| 40s | 15 | 19 | | 34 |
| 50 | 9 | 9 | | 18 |
| Middle aged | 9 | 5 | | 14 |
| 60s | 3 | 6 | | 9 |
| 70s | 1 | 2 | 1 | 4 |
| 80s | 1 | | | 1 |
| Elderly | 1 | | 1 | 2 |
| Not stated | 2 | 5 | 2 | 9 |
| | 89 | 77 | 4 | 170 |

**Distribution of sample across ethnic groups.**

The distribution of the sample across the range of ethnic groups differs from the distribution indicated by the Census for the whole of Devon's Black and Minority Ethnic population, in that the research sample centres more on the visible Black and Minority Ethnic population, and less on the White Minority Ethnic population.

| Table 4.2 | White Irish | White Other | Mixed | Asian/ Asian British | Black/ Black British | Chinese | Other |
|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|
| sample | 0 % | 19% | 8% | 24% | 19% | 18% | 5% |
| Devon BME pop'n | 18% | 48% | 15% | 5% | 5% | 6% | 3% |

Table Notes:
- sample = % of research sample
- Devon BME pop'n = % of Black and Minority Ethnic population (inc. Irish & European) in Devon's 7 rural districts in  census 2001
- In addition, 7% of our sample comprised White parents of Mixed Heritage children.

**Religion**

Analysis of the religious background of the participants shows that the research study has collated the views of people from a range of faith backgrounds and none. The largest faith group in the sample was Christian. However, comparison of the religious backgrounds of the sample with the 2001 Census data on religion and ethnicity, shows that the sample's proportion of faiths other than Christian, is higher than it would have been if the sample had matched the breakdown of religion indicated by the Census.

The data from the sample shows that some people have a sense of spirituality bridging more than one religious tradition, that others have a faith identity more cultural than religious, that some have lapsed or chosen not to practice the faith of their family tradition.  We also see that a significant number of people do not ascribe to any faith denomination. More information on the participants' views about faith and religion can also be found in chapter 9.

**Table 4.3**

| Religion – comparison of sample with Census 2001 | Totals | % of total | C.f % for whole of Devon in 2001 |
|---|---|---|---|
| **Buddhist** | **4** | 2.4 | 2.5 |
| **Chinese** | **5** | 2.9 | |
| **Christian** | **36**   14 | 21 | 53.2 |
| Anglican | 1 | | |
| Protestant | 3 | | |
| Church of England | 3 | | |
| Roman Catholic | 13 | | |
| Roman Catholic by Baptism but non-believer | 1 | | |
| Armenian Church | 1 | | |

| | | | | |
|---|---|---|---|---|
| **Hindu** | 3 | | 2.4 | 1.6 |
| Hindu but happy to go to Church or Mosque | 1 | | | |
| **Jewish** | 6 | 4 | 3.5 | 0.6 |
| Atheist but culturally Jewish | | 1 | | |
| Jewish –secular | | 1 | | |
| **Jehovah's Witness** | 3 | | 1.8 | |
| **Muslim** | 17 | 16 | 10 | 7 |
| Muslim – not practicing | | 1 | | |
| **Rastafarian** | 1 | | 0.6 | |
| **Sikh** | 4 | | 2.4 | 0.7 |
| Sikh and Buddhist | 1 | | 0.6 | |
| Not stated | **59** | | 34.7 | 10.1 |
| None | **30** | | 17.6 | 23.2 |
| Other  faiths | | | 5.9 | 1.1 |

**Family status**

The participant sample covered a range of family and household profiles, including people living alone, young, middle aged and retired couples, single parent families, and of 'nuclear' or extended families. The research usually recorded the participation of one family representative, although where children were interviewed, an adult was also present and participated in the research.

The research sample included a number of people of Mixed Heritage identity (namely a person whose mother's ethnic identity is different to the father's) and parents of Mixed Heritage children.  In fact the largest group of participants belonged to Mixed Heritage families (38%). (See table 4.4) This group was followed by 24% of participants who belonged to co-ethnic families. The number of children in a family was typically two.

Given that the proportion Mixed Heritage families is greater than the number of Mixed Heritage participants in the sample (i.e. 38% of people belonging to Mixed Heritage families vs. 8% Mixed Heritage participants), we can deduce that the percentage of the Mixed Heritage population is likely to increase with the next generation.  This is also indicated by the Census 2001 figures in chapter 3, which also shows that the Mixed Heritage population in rural Devon is already the largest Black and Minority Ethnic group, second to White Non-British.  This indicates that the increasing trend within Black and Minority Ethnic families in Devon is towards a majority of Mixed Heritage.  This in itself is likely to have an

effect on the way that people approach issues of integration and identity formation, and indicates that the demand for Mixed Heritage family support network groups, such as the 'Planet Rainbow' project in Exeter, will increase across Devon and especially in rural areas.

**Table 4.4**

**Family status profiles**
- ♦ 24% live with family members of the same ethnicity (i.e. 40 people, of which 3 were heads of single-parent families)
- ♦ 38% are members of Mixed Heritage families (i.e. 65 people, of which 6 were heads of single-parent families)
- ♦ 13% live alone
- ♦ 19% live in a hostel/ student digs/ with a host family
- ♦ 6% not known

**Size of family households**
- ♦ 18% lived with a partner only
- ♦ 8% lived with a partner and one child
- ♦ 25% lived with a partner and two or more children
- ♦ 5% were single parent families with between 1 and 6 children.
- ♦ 3% were extended families including grandparents.

**Country of Birth**

Our sample also serves to illustrate the extent of immigration and the consequent great diversity of ethnic backgrounds in Devon, with the majority of the sample coming from nearly 50 different countries around the world. The proportion of participants born overseas (75% of the sample) is higher than the proportion of Black of Minority Ethnic people in Devon who were born overseas, according to Census 2001 data. The Black and Minority Ethnic population in Devon is split 50/ 50 between people born in the UK and overseas.

**Table 4.5: Place of birth**

| Country | No. of Women | No. of Men | No. Sex not stated | Total Nos. |
|---|---|---|---|---|
| UK | 6 | 5 | | 11 |
| UK  Ashton Upon Lyme | 1 | | | 1 |
| UK Bucks | 1 | | | 1 |
| UK Devon | 5 | 1 | | 6 |
| UK Doncaster | 1 | | | 1 |
| UK Coventry | 1 | | | 1 |

| | | | | |
|---|---|---|---|---|
| UK Leicester | 1 | | | 1 |
| UK Liverpool | 1 | | | 1 |
| UK London | 9 | 4 | | 13 |
| UK Manchester | | 2 | | 2 |
| **Total born in UK** | **26** | **12** | | **38** |
| Armenia | | 1 | | 1 |
| Bangladesh | 2 | 2 | 1 | 5 |
| Bosnia | | 1 | | 1 |
| Brazil | 2 | | | 2 |
| Canada | 1 | | | 1 |
| Caribbean | 1 | 1 | | 2 |
| China | 10 | 10 | | 20 |
| Congo | | 1 | | 1 |
| Congo-Brazaville | | 2 | | 2 |
| Cyprus | | 1 | | 1 |
| Egypt | 1 | | | 1 |
| France | 1 | | | 1 |
| Germany | 3 | | | 3 |
| Ghana | 2 | | | 2 |
| Greece | 1 | 1 | | 2 |
| Holland | 1 | | | 1 |
| Hong Kong | 3 | 4 | 1 | 8 |
| Hungary | 1 | | | 1 |
| India | 3 | 5 | | 8 |
| Iran | 1 | 1 | | 2 |
| Iraq | | 1 | | 1 |
| Italy | 2 | 1 | | 3 |
| Jamaica | | 1 | | 1 |
| Kenya | 2 | | | 2 |
| Lithuania | 1 | | | 1 |
| Malawi | | 1 | | 1 |
| Malaysia | 1 | 1 | | 2 |
| Middle East | | 1 | | 1 |
| Mozambique | | 2 | | 2 |
| Nigeria | 1 | 1 | | 2 |
| North Africa | | 1 | | 1 |
| Pakistan | 1 | 3 | | 4 |
| Palestine | 1 | | | 1 |
| Philippines | 1 | | | 1 |
| Poland | 1 | | 1 | 2 |

| | | | | |
|---|---|---|---|---|
| Portugal | | 1 | | 1 |
| Romania | 1 | | | 1 |
| Sierra Leone | | 3 | | 3 |
| Singapore | 3 | | | 3 |
| Sri Lanka | | 1 | | 1 |
| St Helena | | 1 | | 1 |
| Sweden | 1 | | | 1 |
| Tanzania | 1 | 1 | | 2 |
| Thailand | 1 | | | 1 |
| Turkey | | 2 | | 2 |
| Uganda | | 1 | | 1 |
| USA | | 1 | | 1 |
| Zimbabwe | 2 | | | 2 |
| **Born outside UK (49 countries/regions)** | **53** | **52** | **5** | **110** |
| Not stated/ known | 10 | 12 | | 22 |
| Totals | 89 | 76 | 5 | 170 |

**Languages spoken**

The diversity of place of birth also brings a plethora of language skills to rural Devon.

Amongst the research sample, 39% spoke English plus another language. A further 23% had skills in 3 or more languages. Chapter 5 looks in greater detail at English language skills among the sample, and finds that 19% spoke English that was described as 'poor'. The largest language classification for spoken English amongst the participants was 'fluent'.

54 languages other than English were spoken by the participants. 39 of these were spoken as first languages, and 33 as second languages. Chinese was the most widely spoken language group among the sample. The diversity of the languages spoken among the participant sample, and the Census 2001 ethnicity data, indicate that other than Chinese there is no one dominant foreign language spoken among the Black and Minority Ethnic population. This presents a problem for agencies wanting to communicate through translated written media and to make expedient decisions about use of resources. For this reason, chapters 2, 5 and 12 make the argument that communication outreach would be much better achieved through oral communication, both in English and other languages, by establishing Black and Minority Ethnic rural networks. By using facilitated networks as

settings for oral communication the chances are that the dialogue, even in English, will have far greater success in communicating information and establishing dialogue.

The participants' comments in Tables 4.9 and 4.10 below also indicate that that their speaking, reading and writing skills in each language are not necessarily similar.  In chapters 2 and 5 the impact that the variations in these skills has on the value of translated written materials is further discussed. The comments below serve to highlight that oral language skills are likely to be much better than writing and reading skills.  Some participants also described how the limited opportunities for many people to practice the speech of their mother tongue can lead to some deterioration in first language skills, and that limitations on opportunities for practice also has particular impact on the bi-lingual opportunities for children of Mixed Heritage families. This in turn is likely to have an impact on the bias to which one parent's culture has an influence on the child's developing sense of ethnic identity. The research suggested that this can also produce tensions in some families, especially those where one parent speaks one language only.

Table 4.6

| Study sample in Rural Devon | No. languages spoken including English | | | | | | | |
|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|
| | 6 | 5 | 4 | 3 | 2 | English only | English 1st language, any others not stated. | Not known |
| No. of people | 3 | 6 | 12 | 17 | 66 | 8 | 35 | 23 |
| % of sample | 2 | 4 | 7 | 10 | 39 | 5 | 20 | 13 |

Table 4.7

| English language skills among the research sample | | | | | |
|---|---|---|---|---|---|
| 'n' = 170 | 1st | fluent | good | Poor | Unknown |
| No. | 6 | 79 | 42 | 32 | 9 |
| % | 4 | 46 | 25 | 19 | 5 |

**Table 4.8**

| Language spoken | No. of people for whom this is a | |
| --- | --- | --- |
| | 1<sup>st</sup> language | 2<sup>nd</sup> language |
| Arabic | 2 | 5 |
| Armenian | 1 | |
| Bengali | 4 | |
| Bosnian | 1 | |
| Chagga | | 1 |
| Chichewa | 1 | |
| Chinese  (unspecified) | 27 | 2 |
| Chinese Cantonese | 1 | 1 |
| Chinese Mandarin | 2 | |
| Creole | 1 | |
| Danish | | 2 |
| Dutch | 1 | |
| Ebu | 1 | 1 |
| Fante | 1 | |
| Farsi | 2 | 1 |
| Filipino | 1 | |
| French | 5 | 11 |
| German | 3 | 7 |
| Greek | 1 | 1 |
| Gujerati | 2 | 3 |
| Hausa | | 1 |
| Hebrew | | 1 |
| Hindi | 1 | 9 |
| Hungarian | 1 | |
| Italian | 4 | 3 |
| Jamaican | | 1 |
| Japanese | | 2 |
| Kituba | 1 | |
| Korean | | 1 |
| Kusuba | | 1 |
| Lingala | 2 | |
| Lithuanian | 1 | |
| Malay | 1 | 1 |
| Malayalam | 1 | |
| Marati | | 1 |
| Mbushi | 1 | |
| Mulukutubaya | 1 | |

| | | |
|---|---|---|
| *Norwegian* | | *1* |
| *Oseri* | | *1* |
| *Polish* | *2* | |
| *Portuguese* | *4* | *2* |
| *Provic* | | *1* |
| *Punjabi* | *4* | *4* |
| *Romanian* | *1* | |
| *Russian* | | *3* |
| *Shona* | *2* | |
| *Spanish* | *1* | *3* |
| *Swahili* | *2* | *1* |
| *Swedish* | *1* | |
| *Tamil* | | *2* |
| *Thai* | *1* | |
| *Turkish* | *2* | *1* |
| *Urdu* | *2* | *6* |
| *Vietnamese* | | *1* |
| Totals | 39 | 33 |
| 54 languages spoken in total | | |

**Table 4.9**

| Participants comments about their 1st language: 🗨 *I speak*……. |
|---|
| 🗨 *Punjabi.  But don't write it.* |
| 🗨 *Italian -speak well and write quite well* |
| 🗨 *Shona.  But my husband who is White doesn't think my sister and I should speak it at home.* |
| 🗨 *Chinese.  We don't speak Chinese at home because my husband's Chinese is too much like orders - he not good at learning language. Our son doesn't speak much Chinese. There was a Chinese language class for kids but my son didn't go.  My husband didn't like me teaching our son Chinese because he felt threatened and it caused conflict.  So I stopped teaching my son Chinese.* |

**Table 4.10**

| Participants comments about their 2nd language: 🗨 *I speak*……. |
|---|
| 2nd language comments |
| 🗨 *English, Hindi, Urdu and a very little Provic.* |
| 🗨 *Malay - there's no-one here to talk with but I still get by in Malay.  I also speak Tamil.  I'm on the hospital language list.* |
| 🗨 *Danish, English, Norwegian, French, Arabic.  I'm on the hospital language register and they've used me.* |

- 💬 *Dad: I'm so busy working I rarely see the kids and also I read that if kids are brought up bi-lingual they won't do well at school. But now I'm not sure about that. Children: We would like to learn Arabic but it's too hard. So our Mum is learning with Linguaphone and then will help us. I wish we'd been brought up bi-lingually like our cousin who lives in Dubai ( he was born in Scotland). I like French. I would like to be bilingual so that we can join in with Dad when we go on holiday to Dubai and to Leicester for his medical reunion. Mum: It would also help put the kids in touch with their background and get closer to their family and grandparents.*
- 💬 *Greek - getting a bit rusty.*
- 💬 *English - don't speak good enough, write excellently. Speak and write Japanese and Korean a little bit*
- 💬 *Chinese – so-so in speaking and writing*
- 💬 *Hausa - very well speaking and writing, French fair at speaking and writing.*
- 💬 *Punjabi and Hindi - not so fluent now because can't practice often. Can write a little. French GCSE*
- 💬 *Some Russian and Farsi. My mother spoke 7 languages but my father wouldn't allow her to teach me because 'British is best and English is all you need'.*
- 💬 *Also fluent in spoken Gujerati which is spoken at home, but I get self-conscious and prefer to speak English.*
- 💬 *Urdu, Punjabi, Gujerati. Arabic - just to read and pray - not for conversation.*
- 💬 *English - quite well, Russian - speak not very well, good writing, German - not very good.*
- 💬 *Punjabi - speak very well but can't write or read.*
- 💬 *Urdu - moderate speaking but basic writing skills. Rudimentary Arabic - reading and writing.*
- 💬 *Punjabi - can speak very well and read, but can't write. Also speak Hindi well but can't write.*

## Describing ethnicity and cultural identity - self-definition vs. prescribed categories and a need to rethink?

This research indicated that participants had a variety of outlooks on the way that they defined their sense of ethnic identity. The participants were able to express their sense of ethnic identity freely, whether in the research interviews, during the workshops, or through the questionnaires.

Participants were not asked to confine themselves to prescribed categories or headings. The outcomes of this part of the research can be summarised as the following:

- When given the option, many people don't choose census categories to define their sense of ethnic identity, or use these categories in unconventional ways.
- Most people are specific and refer to their country of origin (N.B. the majority of the rural Black and Minority Ethnic population is indicated by the research and the Census to have been born overseas).
- Religious identity forms an integral part of ethnic and cultural identity for many people.
- Ethnic identities are often complex, and people feel the need to express the fullness of the way they perceive them.
- The category 'Other' – obscures a plenitude of diversity.
- The 'Chinese' and 'Other ethnic group' categories are combined under one heading in the Census format and this seems irrational.
- Political terminology influenced the way some people described their identity, but the result can be the obscuration of ethnicity.
- Some people do not recognise their identities as lying neatly under the Continental headings that define the Census categories (for example people with ethnic origins that combine Asian and Chinese roots in the Far East).
- Many people would prefer not to use categories at all.
- Ethnicity may figure less in identity, for those who have not encountered racism.
- Children's perceptions of ethnicity are influenced less by formal terminology and political concepts and more by relationships.
- Attitudes to Ethnicity Keeping and Monitoring (ERKM) are influenced by the question 'what is it for?' – a good question! In other words, people are nervous about giving out information about ethnic identity.

A list of the way in which participants described themselves is provided in Table 4.11 at the end of the chapter.

**Free-form definition or prescribed categories?**

We decided to conduct an exercise in assessing how easy it would be to enable people to describe their identity as they wished, without

prescription, and to judge the benefits of this against the difficulty of collapsing the individual definitions into broad categories. We found that one the one hand, the free-form approach enabled people to provide on the whole much more information about themselves, which was both informative for the observer and satisfying for the participants. But by contrast, we also found that a few individuals did not provide enough information in their descriptions to enable collation under a census category. In several of these instances we were able to do the categorisation nevertheless, using information the participants shared with us about their place of birth and parental origins. The overall outcome was that freeform definition alone would be unwieldy to process on a large scale. However, it was also clear that many people did not like the idea the usual system of prescribed categories.

> *Italian. I prefer to describe myself as Inter-national person.*
> *We think of ourselves as world citizens.*
> *I'm like anybody – we're all the same.*

Asylum seekers especially wanted to make this point, as a consequence of the experience of persecution both in their home country and here in the UK.

We also heard from participants whose religion played a great part in their sense of ethnic identity, but who felt that they could not express this within the Census categories.

> *I'm English but I want to put Jewish somewhere on the forms.*

However, some participants found that politics and religious issues create a sense of discomfort for them when describing ethnicity:

> *Turkey is very nationalistic and I don't like it. Your background is important. For example I am not a Muslim. I would say my nationality is Turkish but that this is not my main point of reference.*

By contrast, some used political terminology to define their identity. Whilst this revealed their political experience of being a Minority, is did not describe much about the individual themselves. It could possibly also lead to mis-classification of a person's identity under prescribed categories.

> *Indian [Australian Citizenship]. I self define as Black. I can't pretend to be White so by exclusion I am Black. I am what I am – no different to White people.*

Several people found that their complex ethnic heritages made it difficult for them to identify neatly within a single category. Some participants' national identity fell on the cusp between different continental categories, e.g. Asian and Chinese. For example Malaysian participants described

themselves under both these headings. Other participants found they often had to use the 'Other' category on forms, which they felt was meaningless:

> *I put 'other' on the forms. Really I am native Indian and Black slave and 100% Brazilian.*

We noted too that the 'White Other' category rather un-informatively encompasses the largest of rural Devon's minority Ethnic groups – Eastern and Western Europeans.

We also noted that the Chinese population is the largest of the visible Black and Minority Ethnic groups in rural Devon, and that to combine in as one category with 'Other Ethnic Groups' seems odd.

We know that people frequently opt out of responding to ethnicity monitoring forms, and the research indicates that diffidence about squeezing a person's sense of self into an impersonal prescribed box is a part of the problem. In the course of the research, we came across a suggestion of compromise which would enable individuals to describe their identity as they felt it, and which would allow easy analysis and aggregation. One participant was keen on the idea:

> *I don't mind ethnicity monitoring but I would rather say I'm Malaysian rather then Indian or Asian. It would be best to have a tick box plus your own definition.*

The concept of setting out Census category headings each with a tick box and a space, would allow the respondent to identify a category and then provide a description of identity underneath or alongside, that is both relevant and informative for the respondent and to the data processor. A model format for improved success in ethnicity monitoring processes is laid out in table 4.12 at the end of this chapter.

The participant's feelings about ethnicity monitoring can be illuminated with a closer look at some of the features of the way they described themselves  (the original self-descriptions are included in Table 4.11 below):

**White**
Among those participants whose descriptions fell under the Census category '**White British'**, there were:
  ➢ some people who automatically  used the category verbatim to describe themselves

- others who felt satisfied with using the category to describe their identity, but who also wanted to talk about their ethnic identity in terms of heritage, sometimes complex
- some who used other terms such as 'Scottish' and would recognize their identity as falling within the category
- and those who also pointed out the relevance of their Black and Minority Ethnic children/ partners to their sense of identity.

Amongst those whose descriptions fell under the term **'White Other'** were a great variety of people, mostly from West and Eastern Europe many of whom had distinct religious, cultural and linguistic components to their identity. A number of refugees also formed part of this section of the research sample.  The Census 2001 data tells us that the Other White group is by far and away the largest of the Minority Ethnic categories in rural Devon.  As such it is a category that obscures much and reveals little.

**Mixed**

None of the people whose descriptions were collated under the '**White and Black Caribbean, White & Black African** and **White & Asian'** categories used those terms to describe themselves. Two of these participants' self-descriptions as 'British' and 'Black British Mixed Heritage' would not have enabled allocation of their descriptions to a category without the benefit of additional information.

**Asian / Asian British**

- Under the **Indian** category, most people specifically referred to themselves as Indian, but for many this reflected family ethnicity rather than the country where they were born or had been brought up, such as the person who described a combined sense of African and Asian identity.
- Some people with **Pakistani** origins wanted to focus on their British identity.
- Most people of **Bangladeshi** origins described their identity as such.
- Under the **Other** category, we collated descriptions from several people who described themselves as Asian, but about whom no other ethnic background was known. This also included people of Southeast Asian origins, who also had national peers who had defined themselves as Chinese.  The 'Asian Other' category also included an Iraqi participant and a participant whose family heritage was Asian but who had roots in Africa.

**Black/ Black British**

- Some people of **Caribbean** origin focussed on their Black British identity and others on their Afro-Carribean roots.

- Most people of **African** origin referred to either their continental or national identity. We also collated under this heading some people who preferred not to give their identity an ethnic label, but whom we knew to be born in Africa of African parents.
- Under the **'Other'** category, we collated people who had not made any specific references to national or continental origins either out of choice, or because they did not know of these origins themselves, and about whom we knew no further details.

**Chinese or other ethnic group**
- Under the **Chinese** heading we collated several people who described themselves as Chinese, and some who described themselves as Asian, although other personal data they provided identified them as Chinese.
- Under the **'Other'** category, we collated the people who made no reference in their descriptions to continental or sub-continental origins, which included people from South America and Southwest and Southeast Asia.

**Identity and vulnerability to racism**

For some, ethnic identity as a point of distinctiveness and differentiation hardly impacted at all upon the way they thought about themselves. This correlated with absence of experience of racism and the factors which appeared to provide a buffer against it (see chapter 6); of the 18 participants who stated they did not have any experience of racism in Devon

- All but one spoke English as their first language or very well.
- 13 lived with white family members.
- All were professionals or students in the Education and Health sectors or their partners were, or were retired or business owners.
- None of these respondents practised a faith at a place of worship other than a Church.

> *Never considered myself as a minority – I know what I am because of my face but have never considered that to be a problem or myself to be different to you or any one else. When I came to Bristol there were no other Indians about so I had a kind of cultural detachment.*

**Identity and Children**

The way in which children talked about ethnicity in the research raised some interesting points.

The issue of identity was a concern for trans-racially adopted children in the research, whose parents had not enabled their adoptive children to come to terms with their ethnic identity or to the reactions they experienced to their minority status at school and in public. (Also see chapter 10 which looks at some child welfare issues).

> ☏*I used to help out with babysitting my white friend's kids. One kid asked me 'do you think you're Black?' I said 'whether I think I am or not, I am'. He hadn't seen me as Black before. I haven't got a sense of identity. [Black British. Adopted]*

We also found that children do not always express their identity in ways that politically sensitized adults would consider 'correct'. We also noted that children's self perceptions can also depend on the way that they wish to construct their identity in terms of their identification with parents, whose ethnic identity may not be the same as theirs. The following quotes illustrate these points, and the convolution of questions and phrases that children digest when thinking about their parents' and their own identities:

> ☏*At one point my son didn't know what colour he was because his father is White and his mother is Black. So for a while he thought he was White with short hair, but has now decided that his identity is brown with curly hair.*
>
> ☏*My daughter said 'Mum you're brown and Daddy's pink and the teacher says I'm orange.' I said 'No you're olive skinned' and my daughter decided she was light brown. Otherwise my daughter has never bothered about colour. Both the kids have blue eyes and people are struck by that. My son is browner than my daughter. He's not bothered by colour and thinks he's just normal.*
>
> ☏*Indian (born in UK). At the end of the day I will never be English because I was only born here and my family's culture that surrounds me is Indian. The culture is completely different. My Mum also says to me that I am Indian. As I grow up I understand the differences of the English and Indian culture. I see other foreign friends and feel justified in being proud of India. I have no plans to live in India. I've visited 4 or 5 times and couldn't live there.*
>
> ☏*I thought of myself as spotty and don't say I'm Black. I'm the same as everyone else but I recognise I have something in common with my [Black] friend. I'd say my ethnic identity is half-caste. Half-caste means a mix of Black and White - it shows my Mum is white - I'm not all Black. It tells the truth.* [Mixed race White & Black British – Afro Caribbean]

Similarly, some adults may also adopt such non-conformist ways of talking about identity and their own identity issues can affect the way they approach ethnicity with their children.

> *I describe myself as half-caste. I'm half Scottish and half African. Like me our daughter is out and out British. I would rather my daughter didn't know about ethnicity. Trying to categorise people into ethnic boxes causes bad feelings – look at South Africa. I see people as human beings. There's an old lady here of 81. She calls me 'my chocolate man'. I like it.*

Participant's comments have also suggested that if they have not had support in the process of identity development in relation to ethnicity then some children could experience a sense of uncertainty about identity or even a feeling of threat when the issue is raised. The support factors upon which this can depend appear to be:

- the opportunity to discuss with their parents how their identity may be perceived externally

- the support to understand why how and when their ethnicity might be raised as an issue, for example in ethnicity monitoring

- the support to reconcile the tensions between independent identity formation and loyalty to the different elements of family identities and heritage

**Ethnicity record keeping and monitoring**

This chapter has illustrated how defining ethnicity is a personal and often complex matter. When it comes to putting a person's sense of identity into words, it is usually because someone else has a purpose in asking about it and in their prescribed terms without reference to the subject's own way of expressing his or her identity.

A definition of ethnicity illustrates why ethnicity is a complex issue which, when artificially simplified, loses the substance of what it is meant to describe:

> **Ethnicity:** ethnic character, background or affiliation
> **Ethnic**: Of or relating to sizeable groups of people, sharing common and distinctive racial, national, religious, linguistic and cultural heritage.

Given that the trend in Devon appears to be towards a predominantly Mixed Heritage Black and Minority Ethnic population in rural Devon (see chapter 3 ), this means that ethnicity will increasingly be increasingly

complex for many people. However, the norm in Ethnicity Keeping and Monitoring is to use systems based on the broad categories of the Census.

According to the service providers who spoke to us about ethnicity record keeping and monitoring (ERKM), difficulties were experienced on a number of counts with the existing systems. In summary these are:

- Staff feel uncomfortable about asking people which ethnic category they match

- Staff feel uncomfortable about the classification systems including those that put White British as 'A1' with other categories descending afterwards, and the cultural dominance they felt it implied.

- Staff often found that the census classifications were too broad to be helpful in their planning of service delivery.

- Classification systems had been developed and adapted by different agencies in order to acquire the varying levels of information that they needed. These different systems however were reported often not to be mergeable or comparable when agencies wanted to compare or combine their data.

- Agencies and organisations are worried about self-definition of ethnicity because of the difficulties in analyzing it.

- Staff often felt that White British people also objected to ERKM for a variety of reasons, including the wish to describe their sense of ethnicity in more detailed terms (for example 'Welsh' and 'Scottish').

- Agencies often struggled to get a good response rate to ethnicity keeping and monitoring.

The compromise solution proposed earlier in this chapter (and set out in table 4.12) would help to overcome most of these problems. It provides the option of accessing detailed levels of information which will help far more constructively with planning, it can be used commonly between agencies who need different levels of information, and it enables respondents to feel that they are thought of as people and not as boxes. It does however rely on data administrators or computer scanners recording phrases as opposed to check boxes – which can be more laborious if the information is collected on paper.

One other key recommendation was highlighted in the research, as crucial to success in ERKM: giving a good explanation of the purpose of ERKM. Many of the participants were unhappy about ethnicity monitoring, suspicious about the way information would be used, and unconvinced that

it would be to their benefit.  The case of a participant who felt that ERKM had lead to discrimination in her search for jobs, is an example:

> **Case study:**  *C  is worried about Ethnicity Monitoring forms and that by filling them in she will prejudice people against her when making job applications: she wants to be judged on her own merits, not for or against her colour.  She's worried about negative discrimination and also about positive discrimination causing people to be chosen in order to fill quotas. She's not confident that just because organisations are doing ERKM that they are using the data constructively.  She also feels that tick boxes are very impersonal and stereotypical.  C notes that on the occasions she has completed a monitoring  form, she has not been called to interview.*

Some other participants however had been happier about ERKM, having been given reassurance of its purpose:

> *I was only asked [officially] about ethnicity when I did the college course.  I felt OK about that so that they could understand the background and help me make most of the education and do things right.*

The work we did with service providers suggests that there are a several reasons for this lack of explanation by agencies doing ERKM:

- The staff collecting the data are themselves unsure about the purpose of ERKM
- They often have not thought through how the data will be used, and are collecting it because it is the 'done thing'.
- Often, the 'Monitoring' section is left out of ERKM and hence nothing is done with the data collected.
- Consequently people responding to ERKM don't see the fruits of the process.
- Staff do not have an insight into the fears that Black and Minority Ethnic people have about discrimination, and potential abuse of data.
- Agencies don't act to provide assurances to allay those fears.
- Agencies haven't thought of ways to demonstrate safe handling of the data in the process (e.g. providing separate envelopes for the return of ERKM and application forms; detailing who will confidentially handle ERKM forms separately from the selection process).

The Black and Minority Ethnic participants in the research also highlighted service provider's poor ERKM handling, and recommended that that agencies should provide a clear explanation with ERKM forms about :

- Why the information is needed
- How it will be processed
- How it will bring benefits
- How it will ensure equality and inhibit discrimination
- How personal data will be protected

Chapter 12 provides more details about this recommendation.

**Table 4.11: Participants' definitions of ethnic identity.**

| **Ethnicity** |
| The responses below were given in answer to the question '*how do you describe your sense of ethnic identity?'*.<br>Information in brackets [ ]provides additional identity background derived from other data fields (e.g. parentage).<br>Number of people whose descriptions would fall under the 2001 Census definitions indicated in the header box are in the right hand corner of each box. |
| White – British                                                      12 |

- *"WASP" local to Devon.* Mother of dual heritage Black African and White children.
- *British.*
- *British* [has African in-laws and dual heritage grandchildren.]
- *British. I feel British - just a useful way of self- description. When you have lived around the world with roots in so many countries, nationality is not important. It's very nice to be international.* [Born in Iran. Mother half Assyrian half German but identified as Russian, father Scottish]
- *Scottish* with Jamaican partner ( with dual heritage children)
- *Scottish* with  Peruvian wife ( with dual heritage child)
- *White*  [with Black husband and dual heritage  White and Black Caribbean daughter]
- *White British*
- *White British* (Black spouse)
- *White British [My mother had Russian Jewish ancestry and my father originated in Cornwall with some French and pirate ancestry].* Mother of Black Mixed Heritage children.

- *White British single Mum of Mixed race kids.  The kids don't really think about themselves as being coloured.*
- *White*. Mother of Mixed Heritage children

| White Other | 32 |
|---|---|

- *5th generation American.  ¼ Sioux, ¾ American. When I get naturalised I will be an American British citizen – I feel proud of both the USA and the UK.*
- *Anglo-German. Jewish.  I'm English and German and a little bit Jewish. …Only now after 60 years of living everywhere have I psychologically realised the enormity of the event of being thrown out of Germany, because I was totally identified with being a German girl.  The in the UK I was totally identified with being a WAAF (Women's Auxiliary Air Force).  But as time went on I became less and less identified with any of the places that I lived in….. I need friendship with individuals with whom I have something in common to feel a sense of identity in a place.*
- *Armenian.  I respect every nationality.  In my room I shut the door and I am completely Armenian.  Outside I meet people half way. You must respect your own history and heritage to respect others. Only my body is in England.  My head is in Armenia.*
- *Canadian/Jewish*
- *Greek*
- *Greek Cypriot.  But I have British Citizenship and a British passport.*
- *Greek Mediterranean origin*
- *I think of myself as Jewish and English. I don't feel most of the time as part of a minority because I don't look Jewish and I don't know much about  my culture.  I feel my Jewishness through my family. Everyone feels they want to belong to something.  I have lots of choices about the way I see myself because my father was a Christian.  I like feeling part of my family, so I chose to feel Jewish. My identity is more important to me now as an adult.  A friend of mine said I'm a typical kitchen Jew - based on food.*
- *I'm English but I want to put Jewish somewhere on the forms.  I'm more Jewish culturally than religiously.  I'm Jewish because of the distress and behaviour patterns passed on from my Mother's experiences as a German Jewess.*
- *Italian.* 2 people.

- *Italian. I prefer to describe myself as International person.*
- *Jewish. I married out very successfully.*
- *Turkish. We think of ourselves as world citizens. Turkey is very nationalistic and I don't like it. Your background is important. For example I am not a Muslim. I would say my nationality is Turkish but that this is not my main point of reference.*
- *Portuguese*
- *Representative - Ilford Park Polish Home*
- *Romanian.*
- *Scandanavian [Swedish]*
- *Show-woman (Fairground Traveller) – married in.*
- *Turkish*
- *White British Ex-Traveller. My situation has pushed me into seeking recourse to help from a Race Relations angle, and I wouldn't have normally viewed myself as an Ethnic Minority.*
- *White European*
- *White European [Hungarian]*
- *White European [Italian]*
- *White European [Lithuanian]*
- *White European [Polish]*
- *White- non British.*
- *German / British-ish*
- *French*
- *German White*
- *Mediterranean*
- *White [Dutch]*

| Mixed – White and Black Caribbean | 6 |
| --- | --- |

- *Afro Caribbean/ White.*
- *Jamaican and British*
- *Mixed parentage - White Afro-Caribbean.*
- *I describe myself as 5'3", half caste with brown blonde curly hair, chubby with brown eyes. Half caste means half brown and half white.* [Mixed race White & Black British – Afro Caribbean].

---

- *I thought of myself as spotty and don't say I'm Black. I'm the same as everyone else but I recognise I have something in common with my [Black] friend. I'd say my ethnic identity is half caste. Half caste means a mix of Black and White - it shows my Mum is white - I'm not all Black. It tells the truth.* [Mixed race White & Black British – Afro Caribbean]
- *Jamaican/Irish*

| Mixed – White & Black African | 2 |
| --- | --- |

- *I describe myself as half-caste. I'm half Scottish and half African. Like me our daughter is out and out British. I would rather my daughter didn't know about ethnicity. Trying to categorise people into ethnic boxes causes bad feelings – look at South Africa. I see people as human beings. There's an old lady here of 81. She calls me 'my chocolate man'. I like it.*
- *Black British. Mixed Heritage*

| Mixed – White & Asian | 3 |
| --- | --- |

- *Anglo-Indian*
- *I've never been asked about my ethnicity. I would say I was British if I was asked.*
- *White/Indian. All the family are Christian, and this is a strong feature of the family's identity and sense of upper class/caste status in Bangladesh.*

| Mixed – Other | 2 |
| --- | --- |

- *British with a sense of Middle Eastern background – I don't really know. I like the middle East. I'd like to go to Iraq and see where my Dad lived. I'm interested in the news but don't really understand it.*
- *British but Middle Eastern as well but not as much. We went to Dubai and Jordan. It's relevant when we go on holidays. I'd like to go to Iraq and see where my Dad lived.*

| Asian/ Asian British – Indian | 13 |
| --- | --- |

- *Indian.* 5 people.
- *British Asian*
- *African-Indian.*

- *Indian  [Australian Citizenship].  I self define as Black.  I can't pretend to be White so by exclusion I am Black.  I am what I am – no different to White people.*

- *Indian (Born in Mozambique).  I was only asked [officially] about ethnicity when I did the college course.  I felt OK about that so that they could understand the background and help me make most of the education and do things right.*

- *Indian (born in UK).  At the end of the day I will never be English because I was only born here and my family's culture that surrounds me is Indian. The culture is completely different.  My Mum also says to me that I am Indian.  As I grow up I understand the differences of the English and Indian culture.  I see other foreign friends and feel justified in being proud of India.  I have no plans to live in India.  I've visited 4 or 5 times and couldn't live there.*

- *Indian (Hindu).  But believe in the validity of all faiths and take part in Christmas dos and happy to go to Church*

- *Never considered myself as a minority – I know what I am because of my face but have never considered that to be a problem or myself to be different to you or any one else.  When I came to Bristol there were no other Indians about so I had a kind of cultural detachment.*

- *You know, the younger generation are unsure why they are asked to identify their ethnicity.*

| Asian/ Asian British – Pakistani | 5 |
|---|---|

- *British (Pakistani)  Pakistan and my parents at that time were very British.  My Father gave me a pluralistic education in world faiths to demonstrate need for good relations among all people.*

- *British [Pakistani].  My sense of ethnicity is coming out now. I am English, not Asian.  But I am becoming more Asian as I am getting older – more religious, I don't want my kids to be clubbing and pubbing. ....The house now looks more Asian or Islamic because of the pictures of Mecca and the entrance hall.*

- *Pakistani. 3 people.*

| Asian/ Asian British – Bangladeshi | 6 |
|---|---|

- *Bangladeshi. 5 people*
- *Bangladeshi.  I feel half Bangladeshi and half English.*

| Asian/ Asian British – Other | 16 |
|---|---|

- *Burga = ethnic mix in Ceylon. I'm Ceylonese. I now say I'm Sri Lankan.*

- Not stated

- *Asian.* 8 people.

- *Asian [Thai]*

- *Asian British*

- *British Asian - Iraqi.*

- *British East African Asian.*

- *I describe myself as Asian. I don't have great feelings towards Asia or Kenya or India etc. I probably wouldn't self- identify at all - I see myself as just me. I remember very little of Kenya. [British citizen, Asian parents, and born in Kenya.]*

- *Malaysian. My nationality is British. I had problems because I wanted to keep my Malaysian passport in case anything happened to my husband. But it turned out the Malaysian government requires people to say if they get married. So I changed to a British passport. I couldn't have dual nationality. But I still consider myself Malaysian. I don't mind ethnicity monitoring but I would rather say I'm Malaysian rather then Indian or Asian. It would be best to have a tick box plus your own definition.*

| Black/ Black British – Caribbean | 4 |
|---|---|

- *Black or Black British I'm not offended by description as coloured or brown, but prefer Black, although I don't often think in these terms. (Jamaican ancestry).*

- *Black English Woman (of Afro Caribbean parentage). At one point my son didn't know what colour he was because his father is White and his mother is Black. So for a while he thought he was White with short hair, but has now decided that his identity is brown with curly hair.*

- *Afro Caribbean.* 2 people.

| Black/ Black British – African | 19 |
|---|---|

- *First of all I am a human being. Life is possible in any place you meet people.*

- *A person [Tanzanian]*

- *African [Ghanaian]*
- *African [Malawian]*
- *African [Sierra Leonian]*
- *African Arab.*
- *African.  I like everybody.  I like everybody who likes me.*
- *Black African [Nigerian]*
- *Black African British*
- *British/Ghanaian.   Half-Ghanaian*
- *British/Mauritian*
- *I'm like anybody – we're all the same.*
- *Kenyan*
- *Moroccan*
- *Mozambican*
- *Nigerian.* 2 people.
- *Sierra Leonian*
- *Zimbabwean*

| Black/ Black British – Other | 11 |
|---|---|

- *Black*
- *Black British.* 7 people.
- *Black other.* 2 people
- *I used to help out with babysitting my white friend's kids. One kid asked me 'do you think you're Black?' I said 'whether I think I am or not, I am'.  He hadn't seen me as Black before.  I haven't got a sense of identity.  [Black British. Adopted]*

| Chinese or other ethnic group – Chinese | 32 |
|---|---|

- *Chinese.* 21 people
- *Han*. 5 people
- *Chinese (Hong Kong).* 2 people
- *Asian [Chinese]*
- *Asian [Hong Kong]*
- *Chinese [Singaporean]*

| Chinese or other ethnic group – Other | 8 |
|---|---|

- *First of all I am a human being. Second I am Iranian – it is necessary to introduce your nationality to people because of your cultural background and history.*
- *Brazilian*
- *I put 'other' on the forms. Really I am native Indian and Black slave and 100% Brazilian.*
- *Iraqi*
- *Middle Eastern*
- *Palestinian*
- *Filipino*
- *Malaysian*

**Table 4.12 Ethnicity monitoring: combining categories and free-form**

| Please select and tick heading below and describe your ethnic identity as you wish, alongside it: | | | |
|---|---|---|---|
| | ✓ | | Your own description: |
| White | | British | |
| | | Irish | |
| | | Other white | |
| Mixed | | White and Black Caribbean | |
| | | White and Black African | |
| | | White and Asian | |
| | | Other mixed | |
| Asian or Asian British | | Indian | |
| | | Pakistani | |
| | | Bangladeshi | |
| | | Other Asian | |
| Black or Black British | | Caribbean | |
| | | African | |
| | | Other Black | |
| Chinese | | Chinese | |
| Other | | Other ethnic group | |

This handbook and supporting tools �֍ can be accessed at
www.DevonREC.org

___

# Chapter 5
## ISOLATION & BELONGING

### Themes in this chapter

- Multiple isolation index
- Relationships and support within the Black and Minority Ethnic population
- Membership of organisations
- Participation in community life
- English Language issues
- Inclusive measures

### Introduction:  Isolation & belonging – factors in cohesion and exclusion

In this chapter we look at the multiple, compounding layers of isolation affecting Black and Minority Ethnic people living rurally.  We consider how this affects individuals' ability to take part in community life and become members of organisations, bringing for them a sense of social stability and inclusion and providing the means to contribute their skills to local welfare. We also consider how the issues of isolation and belonging affect social cohesion in terms of race relations.

### Indices of isolation – an analysis of multiple layers of isolation linked to rural ethnicity.

A key question for the research was the extent to which isolation impacts on rural Black and Minority Ethnic people. Key elements of this question were:

- Do we have minority 'communities' centred on particular areas?
- How rurally do people live – in towns or in rural, remote parishes?
- Do people live alone, co-ethnically, or as Mixed Heritage families?
- What access do people have to co-ethnic and co-lingual support?
- In what way do people keep in touch with cultural roots?
- What part do individuals play in community life?
- What organisations do people participate in?
- What reactions to their ethnic identity do individuals experience from others in their local communities?
- What language barriers are there?
- What access do people have to advice and support?

The first part of the analysis in this chapter describes key factors contributing to isolation.  The responses to the research questions above and the patterns arising from a research process based on naturalistic inquiry (see chapter 2 for details of methodology ) have emerged as indices of isolation.  Those indices are set out in Table 5.1 below.  The relevance of these indices as factors having a bearing on ethnicity, is noted in the Table.  The indices do not mean that if a person has a minority ethnic identity they will experience each of the indices de facto.  What the factors do mean if they are experienced however, is that they have a directly linked, compounding effect on a person's isolation as a minority ethnic member of society.

The results from our sample show that many people do experience these isolating factors.  Table 5.2 shows the degree to which each person experiences multiple layers of isolation.  The average score is 4.3 layers of isolation, the most frequent score being 5 for women and 3 for men, and the highest isolation score being 10.  The indices do not include a score for ethnicity in itself – in this way the index does not presume that isolation is an unavoidable aspect of minority ethnicity.  The scores show however, that for all but 4 of our participants, isolating factors are in play, and for 150 of our 170 participants, multiple layers of isolation apply.

**Table 5.1: Indices of isolation – key statistics from our sample**

| Indices of Minority Ethnic Rural Isolation (14 indicators) | Relevance as an isolating factor bearing on ethnicity – notes: | % of people (Total is 170 unless 'n' stated otherwise) | |
|---|---|---|---|
| | | **%** | **'n' =** |
| English language ability | English language skills are a function of place of birth and parentage. | | |
| Poor | | 20 % | 160 |
| Negative experiences of life in Devon | Negative experiences arising from racial prejudice/ discrimination and from culture shock, (compounding sense of isolation.) | | |
| People who have had experience of racism in Devon | | 73% | 153 |
| People who found the experience of settling into their rural community difficult | | 52% | 93 |
| Rurality | Isolation from other BME people partially a function of rural demography (see Census 2001 analysis, chapter 3.) | | |
| People who live in a village/ hamlet/ in a remote locality. | | 31% | |
| Friendship and family | Ability to source support a function of : | | |
| People who don't have any co-ethnic friends in the same District | ● proximity of co-ethnic family and friends | 61% | 108 |
| People who don't have any non-co-ethnic friends in the same District | ● ability to find co-ethnic friends | 37% | 108 |
| People who do not have any co-ethnic family living in Devon (other than partner or children at home) | ● ability to establish local friendship cross-culturally | 76% | 127 |
| People with low awareness of presence of other minorities locally or in Devon | ● ability to share negative experiences with a partner | 15% | 128 |

| | | % | n |
|---|---|---|---|
| People living with no other adults (of whom 13 were women – including 8 single mothers – 5 were men) | | 12% | 153 |
| **Participation in community life** | Participation in community organisations an indicator of acceptance in community, access to social networks and support, and individual confidence levels. | | |
| People who do not participate in the local community | | 35% | 86 |
| People who are not members of any organisation | | 41% | 81 |
| People who do not attend a place of worship in Devon but have a faith identity | | 29% | 110 |
| **Women and elderly** | Evaluation of sense of ethnic identity and consequent impact on relationships and needs, in greater state of flux among young people and those growing old. Gender and Ethnicity intersect to increase the isolation of women (see Comment below). | | |
| Under 20 or over 60 | | 17% | |
| Women | | 52% | |

**Notes on construction of the analysis.**

The data was analysed to find out how many indices of isolation were experienced by each of the participants, illustrating the multiple layers of exclusion that Black and Minority Ethnic people encounter. This analysis is shown in the table below. A rating of 1 was applied to each person's score for each indicator experienced. Since there were some participants for whom not all the data relevant to isolation was available (see 'n' sample size above and see chapter 2 for participant types), the figures shown below are a minimum, and in practice, higher levels of isolation may well be the case.

**Gender issues and social isolation.**

A rating score of 1 was also applied to all women. It can be argued that gender impacts on women from all cultures to varying degrees, and need not be necessarily applied to an analysis of Minority Ethnic isolation. However, this argument is

robustly discounted in international development work where gender, disability, and sexuality are given specific attention in relation to the cultural impact upon a person's experience of these statuses. The argument is also debated in the national context, where ethnicity and culture is ever more complex in contemporary diverse society. What may be true for a woman of one culture may not be true for a woman of another (ref. CRE Fact sheet *Ethnic Minority Women*). However, research such NCVO's *Staring at Invisible Women* makes the case that 'race and gender intersect in a rural context' and that 'women's needs and situations are distinct from men's in that they tend to have major responsibility for caring within the family, less mobility, and less access to family and other resources'.

Table 5.2 below indicates that even when a weighting score for women is removed, women are more likely to experience higher multiple levels of social isolation than men. The research also indicated that in our sample, women were twice as likely to be unemployed or working below their skills level than men (see chapter 7), and were more likely than men, to have no resource to information and support apart from family and friends. Concerns were also noted from participant data and from Health Professionals about levels of isolation experienced by many immigrant women who had come to the UK to be with their partners. (Two thirds of our female participants were born overseas. See chapter 3 for reasons for coming to UK.) On balance, we felt that it was relevant to weight women's isolation score with an additional point.

**Table 5.2**

| Score | 0 | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | 5 | 6 | 7 | 8 | 9 | 10 | 11 | 12 | 13 | 14 | Av |
|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|
| **A. Frequency overall** ($= B+C$) | 4 | 16 | 15 | 32 | 27 | 26 | 19 | 14 | 9 | 7 | 1 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | **4.3** |
| **B. Frequency in men & for sex not stated** | 4 | 16 | 9 | 17 | 11 | 8 | 8 | 2 | 4 | 2 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | **3.5** |
| **C. Frequency in women (weighted)** | 0 | 0 | 6 | 15 | 16 | 18 | 11 | 12 | 5 | 5 | 1 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | **5.1** |
| **D. Frequency in women Score unweighted** | 0 | 6 | 15 | 16 | 18 | 11 | 12 | 5 | 5 | 1 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | **4.1** |
| **E. = D – B** | 4 | - 10 | 6 | -1 | 6 | 3 | 4 | 3 | 1 | -1 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | |

There are 6 themes which feature in the isolation index in Table 5.1 above:
1.  Language issues
2.  Negative experiences of life in Devon
3.  Rurality
4.  Friendship and family support
5.  Level of participation in community life
6.  Women and the elderly person.

Negative experience of life in Devon is examined in chapters 6,7,8,and 9 (looking at experience of discrimination and prejudice), and issues of rurality and family support are covered in chapter 3 (looking at demography). Gender and age profiles are summarised in chapter 2.

Issues of language, friendship, rurality and participation in community life are explored in further detail within this chapter on isolation and belonging.


**<u>Relationships and support within the Minority Ethnic population</u>**

In this section we explore some key factors affecting Minority Ethnic relationships in rural areas, including:
➢  Demography
➢  Co-ethnic relationships (same ethnic identity) and Inter-minority-ethnic relationships (relationships between people of different Minority Ethnic identities).
➢  Networking
➢  Co-lingual support

**Demography**

In chapter 3 the Census data shows that the majority of Devon's Black and Minority Ethnic population live in the rural Districts – i.e. outside Exeter.
**Table 5.3**

| Black & Minority Ethnic population | Devon | Rural Districts combined | Exeter | Exeter & Torbay |
|---|---|---|---|---|
| Incl. European & Irish. Number | 21,346 | 15,403 | 5,865 | 9,990 |
| % | 100% | 72% | 28% | N/a |
| Excl. European & Irish | 7,961 | 5,260 | 2,644 | 4,265 |
| % | 100% | 66% | 33% | N/a |

Even when the figures of Torbay (a separate Unitary Authority to Devon County) are combined with Devon to give an urban picture, the figures show that the majority of the population are based in the rural Districts. This remains true whether Europeans and Irish people are included in the Minority Ethnic figures, or not.

The Census figures also show that the Black and Minority Ethnic (BME) population is distributed across all the rural region.

**Table 5.4**

| BME District distribution | Incl. European & Irish | % of Devon BME population | Excl. European & Irish | % of Devon BME population |
|---|---|---|---|---|
| Teignbridge | 3314 | 16 | 1210 | 15 |
| East Devon | 3125 | 15 | 891 | 11 |
| South Hams | 2415 | 11 | 745 | 9 |
| North Devon | 2126 | 10 | 840 | 11 |
| Mid Devon | 1696 | 8 | 551 | 7 |
| Torridge | 1403 | 7 | 584 | 7 |
| West Devon | 1324 | 6 | 440 | 6 |

The consequence of the distribution of the majority of the Black and Minority Ethnic population around the rural Districts - Devon being one of the largest counties in the UK  - is that people are dispersed from one another over large distances.

Chapter 3 describes the demography of the sample of people who live or work in the 7 rural Districts of Devon and sets out an analysis of the data provided by the 2001 Census. It demonstrates that there are not 'communities' of Black and Minority Ethnic people living in co-ethnic clusters, and that due to the extent of diversity of place of birth, most Minority Ethnic people have little in common with one another in terms of ethnic identity.

**Social Relationships: Co and Inter Minority Ethnic.**

As a consequence of the above, it is inherently difficult for Black and Minority Ethnic people to find co-ethnic peers outside of the family and establish social relationships.  The diversity of the rural Minority Ethnic population, and the absence of co-ethnic clusters of people, has the effect of reducing the overall visibility of rural diversity.  Recognition of diversity must result instead from the acknowledgment of individuals' ethnic identity.  This renders the Minority Ethnic person still vulnerable to

encounters of racism from prejudiced individuals, but less visible to co-ethnic peers who look out at a society that has no discernable markers of Minority Ethnic presence. So it is difficult for people to find peers co-ethnically or indeed of other Minority Ethnicities, and the desire to look can be thwarted for some by the assumption that there's nothing to look for.

Some quotes from the participants illustrate the effects:

| Feeling alone as a minority |
| --- |
| 🗨 *One of the bad things about life in Devon is there are hardly any minority like me in the area.* |
| 🗨 *Even in Plymouth Black people don't get together. Your first problem is to find people in rural areas. You could wait for hours at a rural supermarket before a Black person turns up. There are several Black families for e.g. in Liskeard but they don't know about each other. This is because people are generally not welcomed so they keep their heads down and therefore don't find each other.* |
| 🗨 *I look out for people but don't know any one.* [Didn't know about other Asian/British couple in the village]. |
| 🗨 *None - don't know any. I was shocked and very excited to hear from your project there was another Mixed race family in the village.* |

Several of the participants described other factors that impede the searching out or building of social relationships with Minority Ethnic peers. The reasons given included:

- Preference not to focus on co-ethnic relationships
- Lack of things in common with people of other Minority Ethnicities, except minority status
- Difficulty of meeting people without sense of obligation to get involved with them or their families
- Concern about having to take on other people's burdens
- Concern not to be perceived as showing favouritism in the workplace
- Reserve about catching a stranger's attention or introducing oneself
- Reluctance to talk with non-family about home life
- Reluctance to intrude on other people's privacy
- Inter-ethnic prejudice and White peer pressure

- Intra-ethnic tensions and differences in attitude towards race and identity
- Fear of becoming more vulnerable to discrimination by revealing non-visible ethnic identity.
- Restrictions placed on some women

We found that whilst 64% of our 170 participants had described knowledge of or acquaintance with other Black and Minority Ethnic individuals in Devon, this had only translated into local co-ethnic friendships described by 24% of the participants. And 59% of the 34 participants whose English skills were described as 'poor', either stated they had no co-ethnic friends or had left their response to that question blank.

| Friendship among minorities |
| --- |

🗨 *I don't socialise with other Indians - just because I see them doesn't mean we become friends. I'm just concerned with doing my job.*

🗨 A Black African participant explained reservations about striking up relationships with minority ethnic customers –'*I don't have special customers – that's where trouble starts, it's best to treat everyone the same'.*

🗨 *I feel that the Turkish woman we know is desperate to introduce us to all the Turkish people she knows - it's not quite our scene. It would be easier to meet people through a network setting because there'd be less obligation to get involved with people.*

🗨 *I don't see these women socially, except work social occasions. Their kids are a bit rowdy - it's not good for my son. Also their husbands are like mine – very forthright biased views. If I could meet the women without the husbands and their kids, it would be OK!*

🗨 [Pakistani participant] *Bengali are people very closed- they only want to talk to other Bengalis. My Bengali friend won't talk about home life to me. We see each other at the shop. She has no other friends. She's Muslim. We have a shop so we're more aware of the range of ethnicities. I met my Bengali friend in the shop. I couldn't easily have gone up to her in the street. Most Asian people don't want to catch my eye.*

● *There are some Travellers but no-one likes them because they insult everyone and think they're hard.*

● Mother: *There's an Iranian mother of kids at my daughter's school. She latched onto me when she saw I had Mixed race kids. But when she appeared my kids started having trouble……. he was beaten up everyday at school.……*

● Son: *When I was 10 an Iranian boy called me nigger. So I gave him a nose bleed. He set his big brother on me and assulted me and my sister. I kicked him in the balls. I went mad with anger. Since then people aren't racist. I taped one of the Iranian kids having a go at me. I was then able to prove to his Mum what he was doing.*

● *I've got another Black friend who was adopted by a white woman who had no other kids. She doesn't mix with White people because people put her down and so she doesn't put herself in the best of situations which is a vicious circle. People mix me up with her and make comments about me thinking I'm my friend. People think Black people are all the same. I tried to help my friend but she throws it all back in my face. She has 3 kids but isn't helping herself. She and another Black girl I know feel there is a big Black community, but Black people have a lot of problems with one another in Exeter. I met one other Black person in my last village and we got in really well. The girls I know in Exeter think the Black community should be helping each other but they're all getting at each other. I don't want to be part of it. I'm worried about being sucked into a group that has a lot of tension around it and attracting bad publicity - for example two of the women I know shouting at each other in the shops. Black people have real chips on their shoulders about identity and how the Black community should relate internally and externally. One of the girls said I'm an 'evil emotional satanist'. I feel they claim they know things about each other when they don't. I haven't got a clue who the 'Black community' of Exeter is but these girls expect me to be a spokesperson for the community. They're trying to drag me into it.*

● *My wife tried to help the [other Asian] women do other activities but they weren't interested, so my wife stopped because it felt like intruding.*

● *Lots of people keep their heads down and don't want to be identified as a Jew. Most people I know are struggling but don't want to make*

> *that public…many people don't feel safe to be identified as Jewish.*
>
> 🗨 [Asian Male] *Many Asian women feel like prisoners in Britain. It's not like Bangladesh. Their husbands don't let them have any freedom.*
>
> 🗨 *I don't see these [other Chinese] women socially, except work social occasions. Their kids are a bit rowdy - it's not good for my son. Also their [White] husbands are like mine - very forthright biased views. If I could meet the women without the husbands and their kids, it would be OK!*

## Networking

Some people did however describe attempts to bring Black and Minority Ethnic people together.

A number of participants described how introductions had been facilitated for them by the following:

- Health visitors and midwives
- Classes in English as an Additional Language for adults
- Mosques in Exeter, southern Devon and North Devon
- The Devon & Exeter Racial Equality Council
- An informal network of Brazillian friends and a Portuguese language teacher
- Indian Restaurateurs.

We also spoke to some of the people who have organised informal networks and events about their experience of doing so. Some described the difficulties in extending Exeter or regionally-based outreach into rural areas.

The Black Networking Group is a group that has its origins in a gathering of Black professionals in the Social Services Department. A member described how it was still striving to determine the extent of rural race issues and had spent much of its energy making the case for support and action in the Southwest as a region beyond Bristol, let alone in the rural hinterland. The membership was described as coming largely from the urban areas, and the difficulties in recruiting a wide membership was cited as a key problem in expanding the capacity of the organisation:

🗨 *There's a funding paradox: The statutory sector says there's loads of funds but no Black and Minority Ethnic groups to take it up. The voluntary BME sector (like us) says it can't find any funds. It's partly*

*because the BME sector needs help in bid writing and because Management Committees are usually not diverse enough because of lack of numbers.*

Members of the Sikh community and Islamic Centre for the South West described the problems of knowing where members of their faith community were in rural areas, and difficulties in keeping close contact with known members. In chapter 9 we look at participants' views about practicing their faith and the limitations on the distances people will travel to attend a place of worship.

The issue of distances that people will travel to access a service is a phenomenon that is understood well in Devon and illustrated with Devon based research on 'Travel To Work' areas and 'Natural Communities', which are both smaller than District sizes (ref. Devon County Council). Hence, where networking does spontaneously take place, it tends to happen in clustered areas rather than across Devon, and relies on locally based organisers. This is evident in the separate development of Muslim communities in Exeter, Torbay and northern Devon, and in Jewish activities centred on both mid and southern Devon.

The successful networking that has occurred in rural Devon, tends to be based on gathering for events - social and religious. As one participant put it:

🗨 *The boys are always able to make eye contact or say hello to Black people they see. I'm also able to open conversation with Black people - but it's easier if I can offer something - like an event they'll be interested in.*

Events attracting sizeable numbers up to 100 people were described by members of the Jewish and Asian communities in mid and northern Devon. Adverts in University premises, and publicity through faith networks and word of mouth were helpful in attracting interest. One participant however described how public advertising can be personally hazardous, especially if the contact details are for a private, rather than organisational address:

🗨 *We set up a [group] and put an ad in a free magazine. We got lots of abuse over the phone organised by the National Front. It was really nasty. We got phone calls all day and night. It was through the post and people driving by the door.*

Another participant described the results that can successfully be achieved through networking, but the limitations on the extent of informal word of mouth outreach.

🗨 *2 years ago I nursed a Muslim guy and got chatting. He said that every year the Indian community have a function with food and music*

*- they hire a hall and so on and the Indian shopkeepers and doctors are there. It's brilliant. At the Divali festival we all meet up around that time. It's so nice. 30 or 40 people come. Most people at the yearly function are consultants and professional people - one is a tax officer. It was organised by one of the doctor's wives this year. Last year a shop owner did it. We all pay for tickets. We also did it for Eid this year. I arrived in North Devon in 1985, but I only got to know other minority ethnic people because I nursed the man who invited me to the function [2000]. These networks depend on chance.*

Nationally, Trade Unions have been instrumental in supporting the networking and self-organisation of Black and Minority Ethnic members. In the course if this research, we approached a number of Unions to see if we could reach out to Black and Minority Ethnic members in this region. The Unions we approached had no county-based Black and Minority Ethnic member groups, and less than a handful of Black and Minority Ethnic members from Devon attending regional meetings. The problem for Unions was one of identifying members through ethnicity monitoring. The nature of the problem was described variously as:

- lack of ethnicity monitoring and record keeping (ERKM)systems in place
- low response to ERKM initiatives
- low engagement of stewards as advocates of ERKM processes and as recruiters of Black and Minority Ethnic members
- general problems with recruitment

A Black Trade Union member described part of the problem:

🗨 *If ERKM is not recorded when members originally applied, it's very difficult to get the info. Some don't want to respond to the update info and some don't want to answer the ERKM registration box. The constitution says that each branch should have a Black members self-organised group if they wish to have one. But there is no data to catalyse such a group……………There was a poor response [to invitation that was extended to set up a Union Black members group] as generally people don't contact us unless there's a problem we can address!*

Overall, only 15 of the 170 research participants were members of race or ethnicity-related organisations/ initiatives and only 3 were Trade Union members.

By contrast, when we asked people what would help to promote cultural diversity and good race relations, 31 people made suggestions relating to facilitation of networks and events, as the best way forward. This recommendation ranked second in the participants' list of next steps for cultural diversity work in Devon. Detail about this and a summary of existing network activity is described in chapter 12.

The difficulties in the way of spontaneous networking described so far in this chapter – are:

- rural distances
- diversity of minority ethnic demography
- absence of communities as markers on the demographic landscape
- lack of things in common to catalyse relationships
- diffidence about formation of relationships and the consequences of seeking out peer relationships
- absence of rurally based Black and Minority Ethnic sector infrastructure
- ERKM difficulties

These implications suggest that the need for community based outreach – following the model of this research - and facilitated networking, is evident as an important counterbalance to the isolation indices described at the beginning of this chapter. The way in which participants felt this work should be set in place is also described in chapter 12.

**Membership of organisations and participation in community life**

The extent to which Minority Ethnic people are networked into wider community life is also a factor determining the experience of isolation or belonging.

| Table 5.5 People who said they: | Yes | No (or left the space in the questionnaire blank) | Sample size* |
|---|---|---|---|
| Are members of organisations | 35% | 65% | 134 |
| Participate in community life | 41% | 59% | 134 |

* Information not available regarding complainant aid cases.

This analysis demonstrates that a significant part of our sample and, by indication, of the Black and Minority Ethnic population, feel detached,

marginalised or excluded from society. Given the absence of peer structures and opportunity for minority ethnic friendship described above, the ability to develop links within a person's local community is important, not only as a matter of social cohesion, but in order to overcome personal isolation and the knock-on effects that can result (loneliness, detachment from information and access to services etc.).

Moreover, the lack of participation in community life and structures represents the failure of society to both embrace diversity or to value the skills and potential within the Black and Minority Ethnic population.

Those who are involved in community life and organisations contribute to a great breadth of social life and welfare. The table below sets out the group-based activities that the participants were involved in:

**Table 5.6**

| |
|---|
| • **Arts and leisure:** Arts Society; Canoeing clubs; Football club; Golf Clubs; Keep fit club; Line dancing; Skittles Club; Surfing Club; Yoga Club |
| • **Business/ Professional:** Professional Institute: Professional Federation; Institute of Advanced Motoring; Tropical Agriculture Association; Business Association; Business Forum; Tourism Association; Hotelier's Group; Chamber of Commerce; Trade Unions. |
| • **Race & ethnicity related:** Black Networking Group; Chinese School; Chinese Society; Racial Equality Council; Devon & Cornwall Refugee Support Council; Polish Eagles Club |
| • **Community:** Community Association; Britain in Bloom; Community Development Trusts; Friend of a General Practice; Wives Group; Village Hall; Social Services organised groups; Hospital Volunteers |
| • **Political:** Liberal clubs; Local Council; Stop The War Campaign; European Movement |
| • **Education:** Parents Associations; School Clubs organiser; School Govenor; Girl Guides |
| • **Advice Agencies:** CABx; Victim Support |
| • **Faith:** Church committee; Islamic Centre for the South West |
| • **Agency Forums:** Race Priority Action Teams; Public Body advisory panels; Agency and Regeneration advisory panels |
| • **Charitable/ fund raising:** Hope UK; Overseas Aid Charities; Soroptemists; Lions Clubs |

Other forms of leisure not necessarily involving membership were also described. 14 people said they use local pubs and restaurants, and a further 76 described leisure activities involving a huge range of sports and outdoor pursuits, entertainment at casinos, the theatre and cinema, and interests in bird-watching, skittles and bridge (a total of 68% of people had leisure interests – 'n' = 134). 12 people were unhappy about the lack of activities available in the more remote rural areas.

Most participants' descriptions of the way in which they participate in community life was based on the above memberships. However, people also described ways in which they become part of community life, in other terms too:

**Table 5.7**

| Sport | Football teams and coaching; basket ball; cycling; walking; jogging; swimming; badminton; golf; dance; running a pony club. |
|---|---|
| Social | 💬 *Visiting pubs and chatting to people we meet.*<br>💬 *Talking to our customers, talking to our neighbours.*<br>💬 *We live in a cul-de-sac and used to have get-togethers, tea parties and a tenant's committee. But this finished in the last 3 years because some of the members fell out. I play skittles every week and go to the pubs…Our sons are very popular in the community and are always out. The phone is always ringing for them. They're friends with everyone in the town. They go to the local pub and watch football matches and play snooker.*<br>Taking part in community barbecues; pub quizzes and games; coffee mornings. |
| Village & market town life. | Attending Parish Council meetings; getting involved in local initiatives and community planning; regeneration initiatives; using local shops and post offices; attending Church services.<br>💬 *Hectic participation in community life – church, choir, gardening club.*<br>💬 [Young person] *I'm on the committee about the park in the village. We were given a piece of land by people doing a housing development but it's not very big. The committee wants it to be for the whole village not just the kids and wants to put in a gazebo and football and swings. The committee is a sub-committee of the parish council. The local shop keeper said I had to be on the committee. I represent my age group with one other* |

| | |
|---|---|
| | *friend. It's a nice community -everyone knows each other and are friendly.* |
| | 🗨 *Unfortunately I don't participate much in the Village I live in, as both my husband and I work, but I do try and participate in fund raising for the school where my children attend. I mainly spend time with my family, going for walks around the village and participating in my children's activities and socialising.* |
| Education & youth | Several people described their contribution to the community as volunteer youth workers, fundraising for schools. |
| Care work | 🗨 *I do hospital visiting - for all people.  I picked this up from my Dad in Tanzania who visited people in Hospital.* |
| | Baby sitting; caring for the elderly. |
| Advice | 🗨 *I assist with any problems individuals may have, audit local accounts of community groups.  I try and keep work and social activity separate, although I can assist people with a lot of info - or where they can find info.* |
| Voluntary | Charity shop volunteers |
| | 🗨 *I did voluntary work with a charity shop in town for 7 years – so I got to know people.  I can walk down the street and people know me.* |
| | 🗨 *My wife has also done translation for the local community linking Charity.* |
| Fund raising | 🗨 *The company sponsors local clubs.* |
| | 🗨 *I get involved in fundraising activities for the village, for example the roof for the church or the village hall in the neighbouring village.* |
| | 🗨 *We - as my business partners - raise money for charity and like to do anything that helps the community.* |
| Work & business. | Many people saw their business or work as a means of contributing to community life: |
| | 🗨 [Show woman] *Fairs!* |
| | 🗨 *I work for a voluntary sector transport charity so I know lots of people - I feel part of the community.* |
| | 🗨 *My work partner and I are like social workers - lots of people have problems and talk to us at the market.  Lots of older people need someone to talk to - there are lots of lonely people and people with learning disabilities. People feel better because they're being listened to.  I'm* |

| | *not involved in the community - I was brought up like that. 'We look after ourselves and we don't attack other people ' - it's a famous saying.* |
| :--- | :--- |
| | 🗨 *I provide a restaurant takeaway which serves good food to people.* |
| | 🗨 *I meet people through the business. I'm not involved in other groups.* |
| | 🗨 *[Via youth-work] – I'm too busy with this to be involved in other activities.* |
| | We also spoke to 4 clergy members/ leaders of different faiths, who also expressed their participation in community life in terms of their work. |

Participants also provided a number of indications about the things that can prevent or impede participation in local groups and activities. In summary, those pointers include:

- Lack of participation in democratic structures.
- Dislike of committees/ bureaucracy.
- Experiences in other cultural settings leading to generally preconceived reservations about participating in organisations.
- Exclusion by virtue of village life being intertwined with Church life.
- Lack of time.
- Negative experiences of settling into the community, including racism, and the impact on feeling at home in the community.
- Shyness and fear of cultural and linguistic problems.

Some of the participants' comments help to illustrate these factors:

> 🗨 *Voter apathy is another problem – people think Parish Councils are like church council on the Vicar of Dibley. But District Councils have all the power – power needs devolution to parish/town councils if they are to be effective. Minorities need more encouragement to get involved in democratic structures. This happens more in big cities where Black and Ethnic Minority people are accepted and higher profile.*
> 🗨 *I haven't joined any Parties at all.* [Chinese]
> 🗨 *I don't like committees - lots of waffle and no action. I prefer concrete things to do.*

- *I know about the local arts society but I didn't join because I would be under them - no more me.*
- *My life is work and home - I tend to be a home person. It's the same for my husband too. We tend not to socialise.*
- *There are lots of local activities based around the church - the local Guilds-women, the Mother's Union, the Women's Institute, but I can't join because I'm Jewish.*
- *No time to socialise.*
- *No. Too busy running the restaurant.*
- *There's no time to be involved in the community – I would like to but have 2 jobs (to pay off the student loan and because of low wages).*
- *I'm not involved in other activities. I work 12 hour shifts and I'm too tired to do anything else except look after our daughter.*
- *I haven't got involved in village life because work has kept us busy. I joined the karate club but got hassled by young lads on the way to training sessions. We'll probably get to know more parents through toddlers groups. I'd like to get the village involved in a community environment project. But it will take a while.*
- *Asians 'are backwards in coming forwards', but this is because memories of Enoch Powell etc stick in people's minds.*
- *Black people are very suspicious of any approaches to them because of isolation.*
- *Devon's beautiful, but there's nothing here- you can't live on a view. It's a total desert. When my children are here on holiday I wouldn't have a single person to ring for help or a cup of sugar. It's not for want of trying. I've joined the U3A - utterly useless - nobody ever spoke to us. It was very cliquey. I would love to play bridge - I've joined 2 or 3 groups but people are always standoffish and rude.*
- *I can't get involved in the community because I'm not confident - I'm shy- and because of language and I'm worried about offending people. I'm very easy going but I don't want to hurt people* [ref. worries about making social faux pas because of cultural differences on 'polite' behaviour]. *I don't want to be more social. I want to stay at home. I like to invite people here for food and I like to entertain.*
- *People in restaurants don't get involved in the community. Even in Hong Kong. Even in Hong Kong they don't get involved in campaigns. Don't care about politics or maybe scared. For many people the worst thing about life here is that there is no time - they are too busy working 10am till 12 midnight 7 days a week. They don't even have time to play golf. Their leisure is TV and video and horse racing -*

---

*they go to the betting shop.  Lots of people gamble in Hong Kong. Restaurant people have family in London.  The restaurant people in town say hello to each other but they are competitors so they don't get to know each other.  Also they're all busy.  Lots of young people want to get out of the restaurant trade because of the long hours.  They only do this if they do well at school.*

🗩 *When I decided to stay in the UK I didn't realise the difficulty of getting to know English people - you invite them into your home but they don't invite you back.  I also feel that the real locals are also feeling discriminated against by incomers like retired colonels and so on. One of the worst things about Devon is the 'them and us' attitude of the 'Colonel' incomers and the conflict it produces in communities. Recent incomers try and pull rank over me.*

🗩 *To settle in is to have a job I like to do.  It's if I can talk to everyone and have made friends with local people - becoming part of the community.  I feel settled in town but I didn't in the villages. People in the villages are not so open minded. So I didn't get involved in things.*

🗩 *I feel it took many years to be accepted into the community as one of the few brown faces around here! I had to work hard to be accepted and felt a lack of confidence about myself.  People are friendly once they know and trust you. My definition of feeling at home is:  Having a good support network, local people being friendly, being involved.  It took 7 years to feel this way.*

🗩 *Parochial attitudes one of the bad things about living here.  They're not very welcoming to an outsider and especially a foreign one.  My definition of feeling at home is feeling very comfortable and welcome – I still don't feel this way after 25 years!*

🗩 *My definition of being at home is not worrying about the windows being smashed in at night - I still don't feel at home.*

## Levels of ability in English language: a factor in isolation ?

Assessing language capabilities is a subjective business unless measured against standardized tests.  However, the majority of the participants were known to the researcher or to case-workers who could add observation notes to participants' own description of their language skills.  The written questionnaire responses also provided a means of assessing language skills (since most of the responses were narrative).

The description 'good' usually indicated the ability to be able to hold extensive conversations on a range of issues.  'Poor' tended to describe participants who struggled severely with reading and writing and with

making themselves understood except for within limited social conversation or vocabulary sets, or spoke no English.

The participant data shows that for those people who do not have a strong command of English, language can be a factor in causing isolation and impeding connections into the local community.

**Table 5.8**

| People who were isolated by poor ability to communicate in English and stated that they: | No. of people | % of total no. of people whose standard of English was described as 'poor'. |
|---|---|---|
| Did not participate in community life (or left that section of questionnaire blank) | 22 | 69% |
| Were not members of organisations (or left that section of the questionnaire blank) | 19 | 60% |
| Did not have any non-co-ethnic friends (or left that section of the questionnaire blank) | 24 | 75% |

Conversely, these figures also indicate that a significant portion of people whose English was described as poor, do manage to participate in some community activity.

Whilst the participant data confirms that poor English does have a compounding impact on social isolation, it also demonstrates that the majority of our participant sample did in fact have good English speaking abilities. This result should be contrasted with other key data in chapter 4 - for example, the fact that the great majority of our sample were born overseas, and English is spoken as a first language by just a small minority of the participants.

**Table 5.9**

| 'n' = 170 | 1st | fluent | good | Poor | Unknown | Accent (where known) |
|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|
| No. | 6 | 79 | 42 | 32 | 9 | (58) |
| % | 4 | 46 | 25 | 19 | 5 | (34) |

The data indicates that the majority of participants had fluent or good English skills. The data also suggested that accents figured in the way

English was spoken across the range of competencies - several fluent speakers spoke with accented English.

A range of outreach methods was used during the research to engage the participation of English as an Additional Language (EAL) speakers (see chapter 2). Of these, successful outreach routes included:

- contacting Further and Higher Education institutions that recruit from overseas
- working through the County EAL Adult Education Co-ordinators
- sending out translated questionnaires to foreign food restaurants
- enlisting the help of a Chinese Housing Association providing a scheme for Chinese elderly including those who had moved from rural Devon.

However, the full gamut of language skills was found across nearly all our participant sources.

When we examined the experience of people whose English language skills were described as 'poor', the analysis in the following table emerged:

**Table 5.10**

| Isolation Index Score | Frequency for whole sample | Frequency among people with English described as 'poor'. | |
|---|---|---|---|
| 0 | 4 | | **Notes:** |
| 1 | 16 | | The portion of our sample |
| 2 | 15 | 3 | who spoke poor English |
| 3 | 32 | 8 | had a multiple-isolation- |
| 4 | 27 | 6 | score profile roughly |
| 5 | 26 | 7 | similar to the distribution |
| 6 | 19 | 3 | across the whole sample. |
| 7 | 14 | 3 | Their average score was |
| 8 | 9 | 1 | just over 1.5 points higher |
| 9 | 7 | 1 | than the total sample |
| 10 | 1 | | individual average (of |
| 11 | 0 | | which one point is |
| 12 | 0 | | accounted for in the 'poor |
| 13 | 0 | | English language ability' |
| 14 | 0 | | score). |
| Average | 4.3 | 5.8 | |

So we identified that, for those with difficulties in speaking English, the multiple isolation score is amplified only marginally above the average, but

that most of these participants experienced at least two ayers of isolation in addition to language difficulties.

This suggests that whilst information support such as interpretation, translated materials and in particular, English language tuition is an important and valuable measure in addressing isolation experienced by people whose English language skills are limited, the other factors that bring about isolation need to be addressed simultaneously.  (See below).

With respect to provision of written and translated information, the experience of conducting the research threw up some interesting points. Advice picked up from members of the foreign food industry, from the Devon & Cornwall Chinese Association and Tung Sing Housing Association flagged up the problem that many of the people with whom they work:

a) won't pay much attention to written information and

b) sometimes struggle to read it, not only in English but also in a mother tongue.

We certainly found that it was only the minority of the respondents (33%, excluding case-work related data) who participated in response to written information.  Moreover, significant effort had been invested in contacting most of these participants individually on the phone or in person before distributing questionnaires, to explain the research purpose and build interest.  Also, questionnaires were translated into Bengali and Chinese and made available to all participants potentially familiar with those languages. However, only 2 people used this facility and responded in their mother tongue. Whilst some others did use translated questionnaires, they chose to write their responses in English. The majority of the participants chose to participate in person, rather than to make a written response.

A number of reasons for the reluctance to engage with written material were suggested:

- Speaking, writing, reading and understanding are distinct skills in all languages and competency in one does not necessarily correlate to the other.

- People who speak several languages may well speak well in one language, and write better in another or sometimes not at all.

- Immigrants who have lived in Britain for a long time may well have lost some country of origin language skills and strengthened in English competency.

- Many people who have limited English skills may not have had access to English as an Additional Language education.

- Reference to written material may not be a strong cultural norm for many immigrant families in the way that paper based information is a function of daily consumerism in the UK.

- Written information may be perceived as coming from an authority and regarded with suspicion.

- Many people are too busy to read written information that they have not solicited.

- In Britain - a country awash with written media - it can be difficult for people who do not speak English as a first language, to scan and pick out relevant information.

- People feel more confident to engage with people they know through a face to face relationship rather than through written media.

As a consequence, translated information is likely to be useful mostly when it is information to which an individual has been sign-posted as relevant, and when the provider is sure that a person has reading and writing skills in the translated language. Sign-posting through oral communication therefore becomes a key issue. There is a heavy predominance in British culture to make services and choice available through written information. This in itself can be a barrier, affecting in particular people who have limited English skills (especially elderly immigrants, recent immigrants working in low pay employment e.g factories, restaurants, and women who have come from overseas to live with UK based partners), some members of the Travelling community, and those with limited literacy skills in their first language.

To reach these people, a change in information culture is needed, based on providing different communication routes. A key to this is to have networks designed to reach out to isolated people, through which information can be communicated orally. Another key measure is to emphasize to public servants in the community that provision of interpreters and extra help in coping with written material is needed.

🗨 [Asian participant] *I have some Asian Mozambican employees - their father doesn't speak any English and they don't speak much - they speak Portuguese. They have a housing problem. I help people fill in forms - they're horrendous especially for people who don't speak good English. They should be easy to fill in like passport forms. Agencies need too much information and it's too complicated - people get them every 6 months!*

Further issues relating to language and communication are covered in chapter 8 that looks at education for adults and children for whom English is an additional language. Further recommendations about access to information and services are also made directly by the participants in chapter 12.

**Summary: isolating factors, inclusion measures.**

There were 6 themes contained within the isolation index in this chapter, all of which correspond with social inclusion measures, summarised in Table 5.11 below.   For more detail on the way in which participants recommended that these measures should be addressed, see chapter 12.

**Table 5.11**

|   | Theme | Measures |
|---|-------|----------|
| 1 | Language | **Change in information culture**<br>• Information sharing based on rural outreach Black and Minority Ethnic networks<br>• Provision of one to one support by public administrators<br>• Sign-posting to appropriately provided translated materials<br>• Provision of interpreters where needed (without inappropriate reliance on family members)<br>• Better understanding of language needs<br>• Recognition that translated material is not the 'be all and end all' of outreach to the Black and Minority Ethnic population. |
| 2 | Negative experiences of life in Devon | **Counter racism measures**<br>• Race equality and cultural awareness staff training<br>• Public awareness raising<br>• Opportunities for deconstruction of stereotypes and building of one-to-one relationships |
| 3 | Rurality | **Rural outreach**<br>• Commitment on the part of agencies and inclusion initiatives to extend work into rural areas.<br>• Means by which people can engage with agencies safely – e.g. through rural networks. |

| 4 | Friendship and family | **Peer support/ networks**<br>● Increased opportunities for Black and Minority Ethnic people to establish co-ethnic and non-co-ethnic social relationships. |
|---|---|---|
| 5 | Participation in community life | **Membership**<br>● Efforts on the parts of community organisations to make their activities welcoming towards Black and Minority Ethnic people. |
| 6 | Women and Elderly | **Multiple Minority Status**<br>● Culturally appropriate initiatives that reach out specifically to women and elderly people. |

This handbook and supporting tools �֎ can be accessed at
www.DevonREC.org

# Chapter 6
## EXPERIENCING & COPING WITH RACISM

### Themes in this chapter
- Racism: extent and locations of vulnerability
- Racism within the general public
- Racist attitudes among neighbours
- Attitudes to racism among service providers
- Policing and reporting to the police
- Coping with racism: self reliance versus reporting
- Building confidence in reporting
- Impact or intent – where should appraisal begin?

### Experiences of racism – an overview of extent and locations of vulnerability

65% of the sample described experiences of discrimination and prejudice stemming from other people's negative and unwelcome reactions to their ethnicity.

**Table 6.1**

| The number of people who…. | …described experience of discrimination and prejudice | …had had no experience of racism | ….didn't comment on experience of racism. |
|---|---|---|---|
| | 111 | 18 | 41 |
| % (of total sample 'n' = 170) | 65% | 11% | 24% |

Most of the participants described experiences relating to unwelcome behaviour from the general public, or experiences of prejudice and discrimination centred on a single location. However, 29% of these participants, reported negative experiences in more than one location.

**Table 6.2**

| Number of locations | 4 | 3 | 2 | 1 |
|---|---|---|---|---|
| Number of people | 1 | 6 | 25 | 79 |

The sources of perceived racism were as follows:

**Table 6.3**

| Encounters of prejudice and discrimination described by 111 participants, were experienced in the following locations: | |
|---|---|
| **Location/ sector** | **Number of people** |
| From members of the general public | 55 |
| Education | 28 (of which 9 FE/HE) |
| At Work (as employees) | 23 |
| Neighbours | 18 (of which 7 were social housing locations) |
| Local Council | 7 |
| Health | 6 |
| Leisure | 4 |
| Police | 3 |
| Social Services | 3 |
| Voluntary | 3 |
| Prisons | 1 |

In the sections to come in this chapter, these experiences will be illustrated with many quotes and further discussion. Experiences of racism at work however, are described separately in detail within chapter 7, which looks at Black and Minority Ethnic working lives, and racism in education settings is discussed in chapter 8.

In addition to the participants' reports of their own experience, 17 people also described incidents that they believed other Black and Minority Ethnic people they knew to have experienced at work, and a further 28 described concerns about prejudice experienced by peers in other settings. In other words, in addition to the negative experience of 65% of the participants, at least 27% had their fears about racism confirmed and reinforced by awareness of similar experiences among peers.

This chapter also brings together an analysis of the way that people cope with their experiences, their attitudes to agency intervention and some of the factors that inhibit people from reporting incidents to third party agencies and employers.

**Participants reporting no experience of racism**

Firstly, we should also examine at the circumstances where participants did not report negative experience:

---

| **Participants who stated they had <u>no</u> experience of prejudice or racism.** |
|---|

Of the 18 who stated they did not have any experience of racism in Devon

- All but one spoke English as their 1st language or very well.

- 13 lived with white family members.

- All were professionals or students in the Education and Health sectors or their partners were, or were retired or business owners.

- None of these respondents practised a faith at a place of worship other than a Church.

…and 11 later qualified their experience with the following comments:

💬 *Local community quite broad minded. But need to get rid of prejudices of some of the older people.*

💬 *I find it hard to make English friends.*

💬 *I'm concerned how any kids we would have would fit in. We'll cross that bridge when we come to it. We'll see how nice people are.*

💬 *When I came to [the UK] there were no other Indians about so I had a kind of cultural detachment…. I chose to be here. So when in Rome do as the Roman do. It's very important to integrate in the host society. But personally I don't want to be assimilated so that I lose my identity. I consider myself as an English man as much as anyone else, but I am still an Indian*

💬 *The UK is more human and accepting of cultures and interested and friendly than in Denmark. I have been in Denmark for 18 years and can't get a job because I look different and my name is different.*

💬 *I don't get remarks because I don't look Arabic.*

💬 *I don't meet problems as much as when I was younger. You look and behave a certain way when you're older.*

💬 *Racism more of a problem in Hospitals than in the Practice.*

💬 *Being a nurse means that elderly people tend to rely on me and call on me for help.*

💬 *I'm German born and Jewish but I'm very anglicised - so it doesn't show. So I assume the rudeness is just general…. There are no reactions to my ethnic identity because I don't know anyone and so they don't know I'm Jewish.*

💬 *No reactions to ethnicity – I blend in perfectly…and don't mention the war!*

Whilst they had not had direct experience of racism, these participants made tangential references to racism regarding:

- the invisibility of their ethnicity,
- the evasive/adaptive action they had taken,
- the relativisation of current experience to previous worse experience,
- and worry about the future

These references indicate that concern about discrimination and prejudice was nevertheless present for them to some degree.

Their correlating personal circumstances as

- professionals
- fluent speakers of English
- attendants at a Christian place of worship or none
- and as people who lived with White family members

also appear to have combined to provide some buffer against encounters with racism. One couple's comments illustrate this buffer:

> 🗩 *I think [my husband's] life is easy because people feel relaxed with him as soon as they see he speaks English. English is a huge advantage. Also being married to an English woman makes life easy because your partner will help provide a direct link into the community. Two foreign people would feel uncomfortable.*

**The 40 who <u>didn't comment</u> on what experience they had had of racism comprise of:**

- 12 who were recently arrived international students at an HE college
- 10 who were English as an Additional Language students whose tutors decided not to conduct the second session in which issues relating to personal experience of discrimination were covered.
- 5 were Black and Minority Ethnic participants who focussed on discussing their observations of other Black and Minority Ethnic people's experience, from their standpoint as community support activists
- 5 participants took part in unstructured discussions and focussed on other issues of interest to them.
- 2 Chinese restaurateurs who spoke none or very little English.
- 2 elderly members of an urban sheltered housing scheme who have moved from rural areas to the scheme

- 1 who does '*not yet participate in community life and fears other people's reactions to ethnicity and hides this fear'*.

- Another who talked about dealing '*with reactions to ethnicity by explaining about own culture'.*

- Case-work records of a person for whom the police have sought support from DEREC because of fears about persecution from the complainant's family.

- A Bangladeshi restaurant owner.

These comments indicate that among these participants were those who had had no concern about racism, but there were many with whom further discussion would have ascertained the extent of any negative experiences. With this in mind, we can expect that there is a strong possibility that more than the 111 participants who reported prejudice and discrimination, had experienced it.

Let's examine the variety of settings in which racism was experienced:
1. Public Forum
2. Neighbourhood/ Community
3. Institutional / Organisational settings
4. Within the context of Leisure/ Tourism

## 1.   Within the Public Forum

Unwelcome/negative experiences from members of the public were a common feature of life for over half of the people who described experiences of discrimination and prejudice.  An insidious aspect of prejudice coming from among members of the public is that it's impossible to protect oneself against it. Take for example the case of an Asian woman, newly arrived in North Devon, who came back to her car in the supermarket car-park, to find a vicious, racist note on her windscreen threatening '*we know who you are, we know where you live….'*.  The case studies and quotes that follow in this Chapter illustrate how incidents like this one come out of the blue and without warning from all kinds of directions and in many forms.  They undermine self-confidence and are typically impossible or difficult to respond to.  Identifiable evidence of motive or even of the perpetrators is often absent.  The ability to decisively counter prejudice and discrimination is often impeded by the subtle form in which it is made felt.  Individuals on the receiving end of prejudice become insecure with feelings of self-doubt, and guardedness creeps into the way

that relationships with service providers, colleagues and acquaintances are encountered.

Chapter 7 also examines the difficulty of evidencing the roots of discrimination and prejudice as racist, with the undermining effect on the victim. It also examines the McPherson definition of a racist incident (emerging from the Stephen Lawrence murder case), institutional racism, and at the emphasis of the new law under the Race Relations Amendment Act (2000) on *impact* rather than intent.

Despite the exposure to poor behaviour and negative reactions amongst the public, many participants were at pains to emphasise that these adverse experiences did not negate their appreciation of the mostly good relationships they had with the people in their local communities. Several participants described how they felt that the only way to change public attitudes was through their own endeavours to make one to one relationships and gradually transform individual attitudes. However, others were keen for a wider-spread means of challenging and changing public attitudes to race and diversity, and making life feel safer. The issue of prejudice among the public and the effect it can have, sheds an interesting light on 'community safety' work done through District Race Priority Action Teams under Crime and Disorder Partnerships. In this light, there is a need for such Partnerships to tackle the conceptually big, but necessary task of public awareness raising and attitude change, as well as responses to reported incidents, in order to help Black and Minority Ethnic people to feel safe in the community.

In the box below, there are a number of quotes from participants, illustrating the types of reactions they have experienced from the public. The issue of addressing public attitude change is discussed further in chapter 12 where it is put forward by the participants as a key recommendation for further action.

| **Reactions from the public – examples of experience** |
|---|
| 🗨 *Here because there are fewer Black and Minority Ethnic people, people stare at you like an alien and don't accept you because you don't speak English. Here people are so unused to dealing with foreigners they don't get used to dealing with other languages - it's not necessary because they are racist. But in Brazil we always try to help foreigners - it's not so much like this in the UK. Lots of people think you just come to England because it's very poor in your own country and you come here to beg.* |

💬 *Racism is shoved under the carpet in this area…. One of the bad things about living in Devon is the lack of knowledge about diversity and the 'backward' ways! I feel it took many years to be accepted into the community as one of the few brown faces around here! I had to work hard to be accepted and felt a lack of confidence about myself. Some people in the shops have been unfriendly, I've felt very uncomfortable picking up my children from school and some pubs here don't welcome outsiders. Racism in rural towns is usually very subtle.*

💬 *I was invited to lunch with a retired head-teacher neighbour who had another friend there too who said ' why are you married to a Pakistani? Aren't English men good enough for you?'*

💬 *There are lots of posh old people [here]. They didn't want to mix with me – they didn't sit near me or respond to 'hello'. I can see the dislike on their faces.*

💬 *Going out with my [adoptive family] was worst because people would look and Mum didn't understand how I felt. Mum said 'well at least you're not disabled'. I was the only Black person in [the town] until I was 17 years old so I'm very paranoid and insecure. My daughter experienced her first incident in [..] where she was told by a boy that she wasn't allowed to play outside.*

💬 *I haven't had any racial experience, but some people peep through the windows and look. My sister met another little girl who came to the house and was frightened to see me and wouldn't come back to the house because I was Black.*

💬 *Sometimes I'd rather not talk because the truth is not good. It's a problem that could not stop overnight because there are particular people (not all) who have no mercy for us because we are Black. It is quite a shock for me because when I was little I was caned by my guardians not because I was Black but because I had done something wrong. Some people cause me grief because I am Black. I am shocked and worried by this and ask myself what have I done. Some people it is the way they are - you can't change them. Even those who are OK now you can't guarantee they'll be the same for ever. Some people are using the police to suppress me when they have done me wrong. They do bad things to me then call the police and tell on me even when they are in the wrong. Some people make offensive comments when I busk.*

● *Before I thought remarks were just because they didn't like me.  I didn't think of myself as Asian - I now do.*

● *Get questioned all the time about where you are from and asked 'why's your hair like that'.  Perception that I'm a Black expert is annoying. The frustration of living here is that people just don't get it that we should respect each other and are all living together…The instant anonymity you get when shopping in larger areas like Exeter Bristol and London is a relief.*

● *I have great difficulties in dealing with the innate xenophobia of Devon people - without realising they're doing it.  Their manners and so on.  They see me as a 'spy' when I reveal I'm foreign.  Devonians have very little contact with the outside world except through tourists so they're very unfamiliar - they can't cope.  We were ordering a sofa and the person saw our name and said 'oh, you deal in olive oil'.  My wife was called by a gas company saying 'we're entering you in a competition for the most interesting name' - we found out there was no such competition.*

● *I'm not getting on with people because I'm always in the house because people don't welcome me nicely.  I'm worried about having the same experiences as my husband.  We stick to ourselves.  But when people come to Africa we welcome them nicely.  But when we come here they treat us as though we were not human.  I feel it's better to go back to Africa because of the way people treat Blacks here.  It's difficult for a Black man to move on in a white man's country.  The worst thing about Devon is the reason why Black people are not welcomed in houses in Devon and not treated as brothers and sisters when we haven't done anything wrong.*

● *When we first arrived here there were no other Asians.  Everyone drew breath when they saw us, and stopped and gathered and stared. I realised I was something unusual like the lion had come into the town. People went white when they saw me they said 'he's coming' with fingers in their mouths.  You could see all the women coming out to watch and gossip and decide what to do.*

● *The village is dispersed - not many people live in the centre.  I didn't meet anyone for a month and then went to a coffee morning. The silence and staring when I walked in was un-nerving.  If you take part in things and join in you get to know people, but I don't feel close to*

---

*people. 20 years ago people weren't used to incomers - people were all related. Now it's changed. 20 years later I haven't got much closer to the villagers - most of my friends are incomers. It's a shame.*

🗩 *People don't look at me and think I'm Jewish. People make racist comments not realising that I am a minority. Some customers came into the office and made comments about poor hospitals in Oxford going down hill because all the cleaners can't speak English. There's lots of low level stuff. People here make racist jokes as part of their culture of humour - it's not necessarily meant with malice, but I wish they wouldn't say it. At a wedding a friend said 'what are all these bloody Jews doing here?'.*

🗩 *People in the street call me a gold digger and baboon - this is very common. Consequently I don't allow the children to go shopping without an adult because they get depressed and it's dangerous.*

🗩 *People did look at us with suspicion, perhaps because of my headscarf.*

🗩 *I was verbally abused by old ladies in the street –'oh my God not another monkey' they said.*

🗩 *My daughter was blue-white when she was born and I wouldn't take her out because people thought I'd stolen my daughter - it was awful.*

🗩 *During the Iran Iraq war people were very supportive. But sometimes people were rude saying our surname in a funny way. It makes me annoyed.*

🗩 *Everyone always asks "Why are you here?" Some do understand. People here get to know you are a refugee because they always ask you. Some people are nice. Other people smile at you but inside they don't like you. People say "your country is good – why are you here?" They think we left home because of poverty. People don't know what war is like. In a big city at least you could met people from your own country. People here don't know that the war in Congo was caused by France and their business interests in the country. People say "go home, our government will give you food"!! Do they think we are here for lack of food, for the fish and chips?!? My country has food! I didn't need for food there!*

🗩 *I'm uncomfortable about exploring Devon because of looks and*

---

*glances and comments – it doesn't feel safe because of the lack of welcome.*

🗨 *In London I didn't have to explain myself. Devon is more subtly racist but I've managed to become OK here about being British.*

🗨 *When out in town people are negative towards me. People move away from me. It makes me feel uncomfortable. People suspect me. People ignore me if I ask for something.*

🗨 *Youth shouting at me in town is one of the bad things about living here.*

🗨 *We were shouted at whilst waiting for a bus and forced to speak English*

🗨 *Bad things about life here include being verbally abused sometimes in my own street and being called Osama Bin Laden and the generally ignorant attitude of some people. I feel like a stranger in my own street. Hassle from lads on way to sports centre. Other kids have also been harassing me in the High Street. A girl told a lad off for being a racist thug - it was really good to hear her pull the lad up. There's lots of verbal abuse since September 11th. ....I had an allotment but one of the holders objected to one of the wardens about a Black person (i.e. me) having an allotment. The warden pulled him up and said 'Indians have fought for us'. I was really glad he stood up for me. My father was in the British army in World War II. Lots of people make rude comments about my turban, ignore me in the shops and are rude when I'm getting on a train - a chap blocked my way onto the train.*

🗨 *Last week I was waiting at 11.30pm for the London bus, and a drunk man with a bulldog confronted me, wanting to know "are you local". He kept asking me this. He wanted a fight. There were no police around to help. He used the F word every other word. I just kept quiet. Fortunately the bus arrived. But if he had fought me, I couldn't have defended myself – the police would give me problems because of my refugee status. It makes me suffer to feel I can't stand up for myself.*

🗨 *I got stared at by White people here at first - I had blonde hair then, a London fashion. I also used to wear combat clothing and bright*

*clothes. That's probably why people stared at me. Devon is quite ignorant of other cultures, especially out in the sticks. A neighbour said 'I'm so fascinated by you, you're so pretty'. She was worried too that her kids would be rude but they weren't. Older Indian women started at me in New Look - possibly because I was with my White English husband and my mixed race kids. Sometimes I do feel that I have to explain how come I have such a broad London accent and where my folks are from/what nationality. I don't like people making assumptions that I'm from Pakistan etc. I get very annoyed with this. I would rather people asked me what my background is. In London, especially after September 11th, people of colour assumed I was the same and wanted to know why I was married to a white guy and disapproved of it. I used to hang around with people of all ethnicities but this met with disapproval. Colour stays with colour – whether you're Asian or not, according to them. Prejudiced attitudes are not so much in your face in London though. BME people don't state the case in your face, nor English people. People here didn't cast any judgement on us - maybe because they think 'she seems a normal kind of girl and speaks and looks normal'. But I could see people wondering if I spoke English and that they were so relieved to find I could.*

💬 *People wouldn't come near my partner because of the Black baby. So we don't go out now. We get stared at when we go out.*

Participant concern for the experiences of Black and Minority Ethnic peers:

💬 *Some local Black and Minority Ethnic people have said that they don't feel comfortable at local post office.*

💬 *Over the recent years there's suddenly more Black people around - the Indian restaurant, my Black brother-in-law, mixed race kids. The changes in community makeup have been accompanied by an increase in racism.*

💬 *I know less than 5 other local Black and Minority Ethnic people but their situation is easy as they were born here. But I heard people making racist comments though.*

## 2.  Neighbourhood/ Community

After public, education and employment settings, a person's home neigbourhood was the fouth most likely environment in which our

participants would experience racist attitudes. Experiences ranged from name calling, campaigns of intimidation including petitions for eviction to fire bombing. A feature of the impact in this setting, is that the home, (a place that most people take for granted as a daily retreat from the pressures of the outside world and a key source of a personal sense of security,) becomes a place of threat and anxiety. Victims often feel left with the only recourse being to move from the setting of abuse - the ultimate 'achievement' for perpetrators of abuse. However, we also heard of situations in which the abuse featured a double bind in which victims were rendered unable to move, either because of the failure of social housing agencies to respond to the problem adequately, or because the abuse had made a person's home unsaleable.

Some examples give some insight into the problems faced by families:

| Neighbours - examples of experience |
|---|
| **Case notes:** |
| Family racially abused - things through letter box, father abused in street, things thrown at him by White people….. Family has also been fire-bombed. |
| 🗩 *Neighbour's 5 dogs roaming over and fouling property. He parked on our property, treating our private land as his own. ...Pieces of meat, a deer leg and other bones strewn in our pond area....We decided to talk to [the neighbour] about mis-uses of our property and to request that he kept to the letter of both of our deeds. He became abusive. He subjected my wife to racial abuse saying 'you haven't been here five minutes and you are trying to tell me what to do. Go back to where you came from you Black bitch. Get off my land. F off you black bitch......If you want trouble I'll give you trouble you Black cow.' He kicked a bucket at us hitting my husband on the leg. On advice from the previous owner we phoned the police. After the police involvement [they warned him of charge if further trouble] he has been careful not to racially abuse us but has threatened us by saying that he will make us wish we had not come here and he will make our property worthless. He has carried out acts to do this by continuing to do the above 3 things and littering our drive with one burnt out butcher's van, a derelict caravan, 3 large metal butcher's trolleys, plastic and other rubbish strewn everywhere, pallets left all over the place, meat trays just inside his yard visible to us. He and his brother come here late at night, after midnight, make lots of noise, driving fast, radio blaring and other noises, to keep us awake.....He has tried* |

*to cause damage to our buildings by towing galvanised cattle feeders at speed through the right of way so that they fly about. He has demolished part of our wall by our gateway.... He is attracting rats and flies into our ground by leaving dog meat and bones at the boundary with our property and not tidying up after feeding his dogs...Rats have now taken up residence about our boundary walls...... He washes the dog mess, hoses the dog sheds out straight into our pond. [Saw neighbour trespassing one night and called the police. Neighbour phoned complainants twice threatening them. ' Why don't you F off you nigger'. Police came to take a statement].*

🗨 *In Devon in the past my kids have had lots of racial abuse from local people - name calling and threats of physical violence. The kids were both born in Devon so I'm very angry they're getting this racist abuse. It mostly happens from neighbours to the extent that my son was afraid to go outside. My son used to sleep with a hammer next to his bed. Fortunately they moved, but we'd had no help in the situation from anyone. The worst was 11 years ago. But my son still sleeps with the light on - he's 18. They had an extended family who all got involved in the abuse. We bought the house with double glazing already in. These neighbours complained to the council that we'd put it in illegally in a conservation area. Then their kids starting throwing stones. Then we put up a fence to stop the neighbours throwing rubbish into our garden, then the council said it was 1½ inches too high….*

Participant concern for the experiences of Black and Minority Ethnic peers:

🗨 *We had a Nigerian neighbour who has moved to another estate. Her son had racism - the kids at school wouldn't play with him because he was Black. The neighbours wanted her to leave the estate. Her husband is a professor at the University.*

🗨 *I'm aware of some Black and Minority Ethnic people through our work and have heard some stories of racial abuse against 3 families - for example crap through people's letter boxes, graffiti and cars driven at people.*

🗨 *I heard that some people have been attacked and rubbish put in front of their doors……*

We also noted that in many instances of neighbour abuse, where victim families had children the abuse was sometimes aimed specifically at children or used as a means of undermining the whole family through

---

targeting the children.  We also noted that perpetrators often involved their children in their campaigns of harassment. In the light of this and line with the findings described in chapters 8 and 10 it seems wise to advocate that all cases should involve distinct impact assessments of the likely effects of abuse on children, including those children who are being used as vehicles of abuse. Whilst the result of this impact assessment should lead to the involvement of those parties who can support children, such as schools or social services, the ability to conduct impact assessment should exist within the services who are first called upon to respond to abuse.  Furthermore, if child vulnerability is flagged up in a case, additional priority should be given to case resolution.

## 3.  Institutional / Organisational settings

Several cases reported in the research demonstrated the poor ability of agency staff to understand the nature of racist abuse and to conduct an impact assessment and engage in effective support.  An aspect of concern that runs as a theme throughout this research, is both participants' and agencies' preoccupations with the evidence of racist motivation in their response to a case, rather than on victim support that addresses the impact upon a victim.  We have already clearly seen in the case of neighbour abuse above that antagonists can perpetrate their racist abuse through subtle but forceful means and without the use of racist language.  These are issues with which agencies, in particular those acting as social landlords, need to contend.

---

**Local Council - examples of experience**

**Case notes:**
Neighbour abuse case, involving stalking, staring through windows, verbal abuse and threats of violence:  Victim has asked to be moved to other accommodation, even though she feels that she should not be the one to be chased out.  However, the council has said that because of the nature of her tenancy, she cannot move for several months. An enforcement order has failed to stop the abuse. Housing officer came back from leave (during which victim had been keeping diary sheets as instructed) and won't act or correspond with victim unless the victim reports to the police first.  Victim feels*: 'do I have to wait for him to bash me up before I can get the police involved?*  She has spoken to a policeman who said *'I can't see it ending - where do you want to move?'*  The PC said he would speak to the Council again about relocation.  Victim feels the housing officer ' *has led me up the garden path asking me to keep in contact and writing diary sheets.  Is she*

---

*jeering at me?'* Victim cannot prove racist intent, and knows previous tenants have also been driven out by the aggressor, but feels that the perpetrator is working on her sense of vulnerability as a Minority and her ease of identification (- perpetrator has picked her out for abuse in other towns). Victim feels that the council has not understood the impact of the harassment.

🗩 *I'm not sure if it's because [of my Minority Ethnic identity] - but I can't prove it. It's underground – not in your face. If you talk to politicians and the police they say it [racism] doesn't exist. I'm the only Minority Ethnic person in this work in this area - this is why it makes me feel that racism is the reason why we're the only [provider to be excluded from local planning]. My name stands out. A Councillor has had a vendetta against me for the last 4 years. It started when we were in another building. He tried to close the building down so it could be used by a housing association for development land. We had been there for 4 years. ...[complainant put proposals for accommodating their service to the council which were rejected]…… The Council wrote to us saying sorry we can't re-house you. We moved to a property owned by a private landlord. 4 years later the landlord wants to sell to [an organisation] on which the same Councillor sits. He's been using his position in [these organisations] to see our confidential files and use them in his [other capacities] - possibly illegal. I think he was trying to find things against us in the files, but there isn't any anyway. He's never met me. I've seen him in council meetings. He's never personally responded to any of our letters to him. He won't respond to our requests for direct communication. ……..The problems with the neighhbours [previous case of overt racial harassment] make me think the problems with the Council are racially motivated but I can't prove it. It's such a feeling of powerlessness especially because I'm not dealing with just an individual but with institutions who have political might. I know they'll say it's all my fault and that they've tried to help. The Councillor has effectively denied that we exist whilst covertly undermining us. I'm afraid to involve other people for fear they'll get the same treatment*

**Case notes:**
Campaign of intimidation by leading members of village establishment against a settled traveller family trying to establish a home on their

---

privately owned secluded land. Planning officer has been helpful but placed in a difficult position because of local animosity. Planning Committee member believed to be influenced by the antagonists – one was seen embracing him after a committee session in which the member opposed the application and in which a delegation of villagers attended to heckle and lobby the committee to reject the application. Midwife also involved in harassment, and complainant believes midwife was using her professional status to provide information for the harassment campaign at its worst period during complainant's pregnancy. When the couple first bought the site a member of the Parish Council tried to get an enforcement order served to prohibit them from settling. Complainant went to see the woman to try and reconcile the situation but the woman rejected this. Anonymous signatories used the tactic of signing evidence forms to claim that a footpath ran along the complainant's land. This was judged unfounded and dismissed by the investigating officer as "a stick to beat your neigbour's back". Most letters of complaint to the planning office are written carefully making it difficult to describe any one in isolation as hate mail. In addition to letter writing campaign, harassment has also included verbal abuse, local incitement and defamation of character, and provocation attempts with the intent of capturing an angry response from the complainant on concealed tape recorders. Harassment has also taken place at son's school.

## Health – examples of experience

A Muslim participant described repeated instances of prejudicial comments from surgery staff:

🗩 *An incident (twice) in my local GP surgery insisting that my son should have a CHRISTIAN NAME - what sort of a Father am I not giving a child a CHRISTIAN NAME. Then went on to look via surname, which naturally indicated FIRST NAME then the penny dropped. Upon complaining, the GP & staff were reassuring that it will be brought up at the next meeting. But it happened again by another staff. PCT need to be informed to set up some means of training for race relations*

**Case notes:**

Case of European patient in hospital. In neighbouring bed, patient had a visitor who realised she was German and verbally abused her while she was own her own. She couldn't do anything about it, but told her husband who immediately reported it to the nurses who said they'd keep the visitor away from her but they failed to do this and visitor has abused her again.

**Case notes:**
Case about Black elderly patient's treatment whilst in hospital.  Wife went into ward to visit him and curtain was around him - he was asleep with two string beans pushed up his nostrils - the staff said he did it himself.  Case investigation unable to establish for sure what happened.  The wife felt her husband generally wasn't being looked after, because she'd complained.

## 4.  Within the context of Leisure/ Tourism

In chapter 5 we examine the participants' sense of inclusion and belonging in the local community.  Most people who described their sense of belonging talked about it in terms of their participation in local activities and leisure pursuits.  However, the number of people with leisure time interests outstripped the number of people taking part in organised or group activities.  The chapter examines some of the factors that prevent people getting involved.  Chapter 7 also looks at the importance of attracting the Black and Minority Ethnic customers to Devon's leisure and tourism economy. One of the factors that can exclude people from these facilities is the experience of racism in leisure settings, and the examples below illustrate that experience.

A number of cases were reported of Black and Minority Ethnic women and men suffering racial attack in night-clubs, with abuse sometimes coming from staff as well as customers.  One Minority Ethnic participant, once a bouncer himself, described the usual context:

**Leisure**

🗨 *Foreign males get picked on by locals more than foreign girls, and usually when the local men are drunk.  I also saw a mixed race man who is the manager of the local sports shop getting attacked and beaten up one night a year ago at the night-club. The man tried to stand up for himself and it got worse.*

🗨 *My partner played semi-pro standard football in Turkey.  He wanted to play for the local club but the manager wasn't interested and said he should play for another town first.  So he did that but they put him in the reserve team.  He offered to play in the local training group and the manager said he wasn't interested and his experience didn't count for anything.*

> 🗨 *I saw a Black family being sent to other accommodation because they were Black in one village. I could see it from the facial expressions.*

## Policing and reporting to the police

Most of the instances in which we heard about police involvement were in cases handled by the Racial Equality Council. On the whole, police intervention was positive, and we'll look at successful measures to follow.

In some instances, however, police incident appraisals and attitudes were described as unhelpful. In some cases, complainants felt that incidents that had been reported as racist were not treated as such. We also heard from some police officers themselves, about their dissatisfaction with the level of training they had had on race equality matters, in spite of a wide training program in place as standard now within the Devon & Cornwall Constabulary. One Black participant described a key problem being the different ways in which different police districts within the constabulary appoint officers to deal specifically with racist incidents. In some areas, he felt that there was too high a turnover of the officers who were appointed to race related designations, with the effect that Black and Minority Ethnic people had no time in which to build up relationships of trust, and officers had no time in which to gain experience and develop understanding. It was also pointed out by a police officer that officers with no specialist interest or training in race equality were being given a specialist role for a short time, without being the right person for the job. The benefits of trying to mainstream police ability to deal with racist incidents by giving as many officers as possible experience of race issues can be argued, but for the participants who raised the issue, the outcome did not provide the effects they required. The way in which specialist designations are organised and appointed varies between districts, and new measures have also been introduced to appoint civilian equality officers to deal with all the themes of diversity. The benefits of the various new arrangements have yet to be seen, and a factor that all of them will have to address is the willingness of victims of incidents to report them.

Reluctance to report is a key problem faced by the police and support agencies. The research indicates that the problem hinges around the way that incidents are seen and appraised by both the victims and police.

Three cases illustrate the way in which incident assessments involved a focus on the perpetrators' interests or a victim's response to provocation, at

the expense of dealing with the victim's original experience of racism or the impact on family.

---

**Case notes**
One case involved a complainant who had a criminal record, but whose family was experiencing racial harassment. The complainant's partner's diary describes a police focus on the aggressive behaviour of the complainant in response to local hostilities and in response to his dissatisfaction with the police response to the impact of the community harassment on his family. As described in education cases in chapter 8, this case demonstrates how behaviour in response to racial harassment - often more easily identified than the harassment itself - can lead to the issue of racism and its impact being obscured in the analysis of the prima faci scene of the victim's response. In this case, the analysis lead to a heavy handed police reaction to the complainant, an increase in frustrations, which in turn lead to compounded impact upon the child of the family who was suffering intense mental distress as a result of the community harassment. A better informed and enlightened impact analysis would have placed the child's interests at the centre of the case with agency responses wrapped around concern for the child and resolution of the community harassment case.

**Case notes**
In another case, reliance on evidential facts resulted in the prosecution of a victim of a night's worth of racial harassment. The victim had complained to bouncers in the nightclub who did nothing about the harassment. In the final provocation, the victim responded with a punch that was recorded on CCTV. The CCTV had not recorded the night's verbal harassment.

**Case notes**
A focus on the perpetrator rather than the victim's interests in one case involved a police officer who knew the perpetrators and, in discussions with them, breached confidentiality with the victim. The officer, whom the victim felt was biased towards the perpetrators, was later removed from the case and action was taken against the neighbours for breach of the peace.

---

Whilst police have to deal with any incidents of aggression displayed by victims, failure to assess racist incidents in terms of impact upon the victim can lead to an increase in frustration and provocation of inadvisable responses by the victim. Lack of resolution for victims can lead to negative effects even into the future. We heard of one young adult who was known by a case-worker to have experienced a history of racial abuse in his

---

childhood.  As a young adult, his frustration was provoked again in an incident in which he was arrested for 'reverse racism'.  The case-worker account indicates that the provocation and his history were not explored in the police case.

Failure to address the impact of racist incidents on victims, or ignoring the identification of an incident as racist result in lack of trust in the police to deal with racism, preventing future reporting and lack of confidence among peers of the victim.  One participant described how he saw an incident experienced by an elderly Black lady but, based on his past experience of police having failed to take a case of his own seriously, he did not report the incident to police because he judged they would not act upon it.

By contrast we heard of some successful police interventions that built victim confidence in the service and provided case resolution.  But given that intervention is often successful, why is reporting still so low?

### Building confidence in reporting

One of the factors which participants described as inhibiting reporting is the fear that intervention might in fact exacerbate and attract unwelcome attention to a problem.  For example, the victims of the neighbour fire-bombing case did not want the police involved.  In another case, the involvement of a Minority Ethnic case worker was valued by the complainants in overcoming language barriers, but her presence in itself was felt to run the risk of adding to their sense of exposure in a hostile neighbourhood.  They also felt that the harassment might have a negative impact on their business and wanted any intervention to be as low key as possible. A participant who described harassment at work explained that he hadn't involved a Union because he wasn't a Union member any longer.  He had let his membership lapse because he hadn't perceived his Union to be doing anything of supportive value.  Perhaps a lesson from these observations is that to raise public confidence in the reporting process, the public has to be informed about successful intervention and thereby convinced of benefits that it can bring (without compromising confidentiality).

Let's look at examples of successful interventions by the police and other agencies, shared by the participants:

## Responses to racism– successful third party interventions

🗨 *The police have to deal with me because the staff don't speak English. The Police did then bring in an interpreter. The staff felt much more comfortable and could say everything which gave clarity - a good thing. We had lots of support from local people.      [In another incident] everyone was loaded into the van and the police sorted out the perpetrators from the victims in the station.  That's OK if there are weapons and violence.  If it's verbal abuse it's best to sort it out on the spot.*

🗨 *I sought help from the local police who would warn or remove the offenders – the police were very helpful - I wouldn't still be here if it wasn't for the police.*

🗨 *The supervisor supported me by telling staff that she could understand me and could 'interpret' for people.  She also always said things to boost my confidence and was always on my side.*

**Case notes:**  Neighbour abuse case.  Police put pressure on council to take action and police installed CCTV.  The abuse stopped and harassers moved out.

**Case notes:**  Neighbour harassment case.   Racial Equality Council Complainant-aid process pursued neighbour's breach of tenancy agreement to 'allow neighbours quiet enjoyment of their property'.  Consequently, offensive neighbour was evicted as breach of tenancy agreement.

**Case notes:**  Neighbour abuse case.  Complainant had lost faith in agency intervention because of poor handling of the case by police and the local council. When complainant approached the council, officers said they only had other worse estates and that this was the best place for them, although they agreed to put the complainant on housing priority list, and subsequently offered relocation for the family to a flat.  Complainants were also told that action could not be taken without witness evidence with which to take harassers to court.  Complainant contacted the Racial Equality Council who lobbied for priority action and got things moving. Complainant review of the REC help stated*:   'I found the support and advice received from the REC invaluable.  It was extremely beneficial for me to be able to speak openly with someone who fully understands the ordeal my family and especially my daughter was being put through.  And to have someone voice our complaints and be heard.  The knowledge and expertise of the REC advisors are needed here in Devon and Exeter as racial intolerance is widespread and the need to have confidence in*

---

*representation is of the utmost importance when dealing with racism. Too many times I felt that my complaints were being brushed under the carpet. Now that I have the REC representing my family, results are being achieved and my daughter is aware that there are people out there other than her family who have her well-being at heart.'*

The following case study illustrates how a victim's confidence in seeking external support was gradually built with positive action from the police:

**Case notes:**

Victim was harassed repeatedly by young people in his village.

🗨 *I didn't report it because I wasn't hurt. The police want people to report but what can they do? I need to know how reporting will help before I do it……...*

*My wife said I shouldn't complain about the abuse as I'd get thumped. She doesn't want to deal with it but has to especially now we have a daughter. Even my daughter's name will attract attention. We will need to think how to deal with this. I hope things will improve in the future……*

*At first I tried to reason with the lads but they hurled verbal abuse of a racist nature at me. A group of 10 kids did the same thing again. I told my wife and said I was worried because my father (70 years old) was coming to visit. On the 5th incident it got worse and I went to the police…….*

*They were very good and recorded it as a racist incident and asked for descriptions of the ring leader. They offered to drive with me to Karate to find the lad on the way. We went to the disco place and I identified him from the police car. The officers took me to the karate club and went to speak to the lad. They said he had an attitude problem. They tried to talk to his parents and the lad denied everything. After the second visit from the police he admitted the abuse. Police asked me if I wanted an apology from the boy but I said there was no point. I wanted the lad to change his attitude......*

*But the incident with the kids in the street worries me - is that kid scarred for life because I took him to the police? I did that to nip it in the bud before he got violent in the future.*

## Coping with racism: self reliance versus reporting

In this last case study we can see that, despite having been under attack in his own street, the victim worried about the impact that a police record

might have on the young ring leader and questioned whether he should have resorted to police help after the 5<sup>th</sup> incident.

It seems that a common feature of victims' and agencies' analysis of how incidents should be handled, is a focus on the source of the racism to the exclusion of its impact. The natural consequence of this is that support for the victim is relegated to the bottom of the procedural list for appraisal of an incident – often by victims as well as agencies. In the case we've just heard, the victim even put the perpetrator's interests before his own.

As mentioned already in this chapter, problems usually begin with the appraisal of incidents in the light of intent (i.e. whether the incident was specifically racist or not) rather than impact on the Minority Ethnic victim. The Stephen Lawrence inquiry resulted in some points of clarification about what constitutes a racist incident and the factors that cause a racist impact, including unwitting factors within institutions (see chapter 7). However, these messages do not seem to have been heard or grasped by victims themselves or by agency staff, including some police officers.

Typically, participants have described experiences in which they cannot evidence racist intent because of the absence of racist language or because, whilst the total picture of an experience adds up for the victim to exclusion, discrimination and harassment, its component parts are judged insufficient to make a case. We also found that for many participants, previous experiences of racism set the background against which participants made their own evaluations of future experiences. However, participants are aware that this sensitization to patterns of discriminatory behaviour informs them, but not external onlookers, who often only have sight of part of the picture and typically focus on hard, easily verified facts as opposed to process and experience. In turn, participants are reluctant to pursue their case for fear that they will be judged as over-sensitive or neurotic, and for fear that agencies will be unable to respond to their situation. In the face of the prospect of having one's vulnerability exposed and picked apart, dismissed or mishandled, participants often opt to cope on their own, absorb the impact, and put incidents down to experience.

In fact when we asked where participants would go for support, or had gone for support when they needed it, we found that 59% either didn't know, had found no help, or would depend entirely on family or friends. 41% described recourse to a number of third party sources, and several of these people had turned to the Racial Equality Council or had had police involvement. But many of the people whose cases had experienced third

party intervention from non-race equality specialists were unhappy with the outcome of the intervention, or had had their cases referred onto the Racial Equality Council (REC). Specialist workers in the REC and the National Association of CABx 's Rural Race Equality Project, also described how complaints found third party intervention problematic, either because of the lack of local race equality specialists, or because agencies whose action was needed to resolve a case took too long to respond to the advice of case-workers.

| Table 6.4 | Participants' information and support sources. | | | |
|---|---|---|---|---|
| | Family or friends | Source other than family or friends | Participant didn't know/ state | None when needed |
| Women | 13 | 28 | 39 | 9 |
| Men | 3 | 41 | 25 | 8 |
| Sex unknown | 1 | | 2 | 1 |

## Impact on individuals and their coping strategies

When we analysed participants' ways of coping with incidents, a number of other factors also emerged as having an impact on low reporting rates or the way that intervention is perceived:

- The health impact of incidents inhibit pursuance of cases because of victims' worry about effect of further stress
- The belief that the case will not be heard because it will be seen as 'not just a problem for Black people'.
- The problems experienced having reported an incident: failure of agency/employer to take action or to respond to case-work intervention.
- Legal loopholes making racism difficult to prosecute.
- Unawareness that incidents can be reported to someone or that specialist support is available.

Some comments and case notes below illustrate the issues.  Further examples of the factors inhibiting reporting are also covered in chapters 7 and 8 which look at racism in Workplace and Education settings:  These relate to participants' worries that the people who have responsibility for dealing with racism in their organisation will be resistant /unable to make

an appropriate response to reported concerns, or that reporting will lead to increased vulnerability in the setting.

| |
|---|
| Unaware of sources of specialist support: |
| 🗨 *I feel it is their problem but it can be upsetting. People are very subtle. I tell people then I forget it. I was not aware, until very recently, that you can report racist incidents. If I need help I'll turn to Dorset /[Devon] REC - before I wouldn't have had a clue who to turn to.* |
| 🗨 *I wish had known about the Racial Equality Council at the time of the [incident] – then I wouldn't have had to resolve the situation without support.* |
| 🗨 *I went to the CAB to get advice after I got dismissed. They asked if it was racially motivated but I couldn't provide any evidence. They set out my rights and gave good advice. But they didn't tell me about the Racial Equality Council. This interview is the first time I heard about it. I'm surprised to hear it existed.* |
| Fear of health impact of reporting: |
| 🗨 *I wasn't well - I'd had a heart attack, so I didn't push it.....My wife is also seriously ill……I would fight if there were less personal pressures to cope with and if I was younger…… I cope with all these problems by just getting my head down at work* |
| 'It could have happened to anybody else': |
| **Case notes** neigbour abuse case:<br>Involved estate with lots of general neighbour problems. Perpetrator had mental illness and was problem for other neighbours too. Complainant didn't want to take further action on that case, but just wanted reassurance, due to isolation and feeling that she could be a target for racism, that the police would attend if further problems arose. |
| Problematic experience of response to reported incidents: |
| 🗨 *I talked to my Line manager at [the factory] about the racism, but the manager didn't care and didn't take the matter further.* |
| 🗨 *I tried taking it to various senior staff and no-one would help. People think 'oh well it's your problem' and won't challenge offensive behaviour* |
| 🗨 *I talked to the REC once but the person I spoke to didn't feel the REC was a vehicle to deal with the harassment I was suffering. I regret that now.* (White Jewish participant. Note: REC is now addressing |

issue of assuring support to victims of persecution linked to religious identity.)

**Case notes:**
University refused to communicate with complainant in response to her complaint. She contacted DEREC and we have contacted hospitals and university asking for a meeting, but they have dragged their heels/ 'playing games' and are procrastinating.

**Case notes:**
Police have interviewed other people on estate who have confirmed that the abuse is going on.  Police are visiting regularly to show support. Meanwhile Housing Association has now offered another property but near the housing estate where the abuse is taking place- so no good.  Housing Association haven't paid family a visit and have ignored Case-worker phone calls and letter and told her it is not a priority case. Family want to move but without getting high profile because of their business.

Racism 'within the law'

**Case notes** (unfair dismissal – language ability cited as grounds ):
Firm won't communicate. Firm has acted within the law: There is no way to resolve this because of the probationary period.  He is clearly very skilled, and discrimination definitely appears to be at work.

Because of participants' fear that their experience will be challenged or dismissed by onlookers who are insensitive to a victim's perspective, many participants also adopted self-reliant coping strategies:

- Coping strategies of absorbing incidents and ignoring perpetrators
- Coping strategy of keeping 'low key' to avoid escalation
- Coping strategy of integration into the community to evade negative reactions

These last three strategies also, by their evasive nature, also preclude reporting. With the options boiling down to fight or flight, most victims are unconvinced that fight will provide protection. Moreover the figures above indicate that many people have no idea that support is available for their case.

Some case notes and participants' answers to the question *what is the way in which you deal with people's negative reactions to your ethnicity?* illustrate the extent to which self-reliant strategies are dominant in people's response to experience of racism:

| Absorbing and ignoring incidents: |
|---|

🗨 *Still to be who I am.*

🗨 *But you can't change people. You just have to change yourself.*

🗨 *Cope with racism by ignoring it.*

🗨 *We ignored them.*

🗨 *Deal with it by ignoring reactions to ethnicity.*

🗨 *I'm not bothered now. I ignore it as much as possible, if there is a reaction.*

🗨 *Try to ignore it but talk about it if they are interested.*

🗨 *But if someone is rude I will ignore them*

🗨 *Accept it - I just left it to experience. An information access office would help to make life better.*

🗨 *There was no way to counteract the lunch date attack because it was so vicious.*

🗨 *I let it pass.*

🗨 *You learn to accept things as part of everyday life. To ignore it.*

🗨 *I cope with rudeness by thinking to myself that one day they'll realise that I'm the same as anyone and I can do the job.*

🗨 *When problems happened and people picked fights, I had to cope by shutting my ears to it. But as a student I would hit back. My advice to other kids is just ignore it - if you talk about it, it creates more of a problem. People can only shout so much for example 20 times, but they have to cool down eventually.*

🗨 *I have suffered a few racist incidents but have trained myself to ignore them. Having lived here for many years, I have learnt to ignore prejudice.*

🗨 *When I get depressed and worried about people's reactions I cope by thinking how it would be for a white person in Zimbabwe, which makes me think that's how it's supposed to be - that's part of life.*

🗨 *I look at them and ignore them - I don't get too concerned. Even in Hong Kong people get abuse - for example English people in Hong Kong get it. I don't say anything back because if I do it gets worse.*

🗨 *My sons cope with prejudice by ignoring it. The boys handle it well and usually never get into fights. You can't control people but you can ignore them. The boys are also very popular and are the leaders in their team of friends. We cope by avoiding abusive people. On the*

🗨 *whole it's good here, otherwise we wouldn't have stayed for 28 years. We believe its better to make friends with everyone.*

🗨 *Meeting nice people is what makes life bearable. So you have to put incidents in context of all the good things that happen, to cope. But then I'm a secure middle class person with no language problems. I'm not someone getting abused daily in a factory.*

🗨 *We tried to talk to the parents but they were aggressive and said it was my son's fault which led to shouting matches. None of the abuse was directly made to me - my younger son suffered most. I'm very resilient so I brush minor incidents off. I ignore it when the neighbours say "go back to your own country" and "everyone used to talk to each other before you came here" because they're only one family.*

🗨 *I'm a positive person so despite the bad feeling I don't let it affect my performance. My faith helps me very much to keep positive.*

🗨 *I rely on my Christian faith not to allow people to upset me*

Keeping a low key:

🗨 *I won't do anything about it now because if I do I'll be identified as a rebel.*

🗨 *I think people have to be fairly low key and be seen to be respectable.*

Neighbour abuse case notes:
Didn't want to get police involved. Don't want to stick their heads up, esp. since daughter is local teacher and aggressors who are young people still at large. Last year went away in the summer to avoid hot spot trouble with young people in summer holidays. Daughter wanted to play everything down too. She felt that she and her brother can look after father and told him not to go out too much. Suspect that someone in their street is also a perpetrator.

Neighbour abuse case notes:
*Complainant won't allow DEREC to report to Police. Caseworker has been to visit. Caused lots of local comment because caseworker is Black – caseworker offered to speak to neighbours but the family didn't want this. They said they would consider mediation. Caseworker got mediation service involved. They set up meetings. Case resolved now according to complainant.*

| Integration: |
| --- |

🗨 *I know 2 other women from Hong Kong.  But they're both professional and integrated - which means they have the different ability to cope.*

🗨 *Because of this I became self-conscious and more aware of the contrast with the way people in town look.  Now my clothing has changed - 1 month later I dyed my hair brown so they didn't think I was insane and wanted to lock me up.  I wanted to blend in and not look so different.  Young kids at the college wear grungy clothes , but here there's an age group for everything - you can't show what you feel like inside in the way you look all through your life.*

🗨 *I don't wear Islamic clothing.  If you present yourself as different you will definitely meet discrimination.*

🗨 *I think there's less racism in the countryside because people are less stereotyped and because people get to know each other in rural areas and integrate because the numbers are fewer and because people are literally in the minority people don't feel threatened by the minorities.*

🗨 *Integrating is the important thing – you have to integrate at least 50% to fit in, in any country.  This wasn't difficult for me  because of my Indian -British heritage.*

🗨 *Acceptance takes some time.*

🗨 *I know less than 5 other BME people in the community, and for whom life has not been easy although much depends on their willingness to integrate.*

🗨 *Racism depends on how individuals integrate into the local community. People have to be resourceful and cope and integrate into the local community to cope in a mixed race marriage. You have to have curiosity to find out what's available and overcome shyness.  I can see how people could take offence and become a 'secret sufferer', but I don't so I cope better. If you do suffer you have to take responsibility to make people aware they're hurting you.*

🗨 *You need to blend into the community.  You shouldn't stick out.*

🗨 *All minorities here have to fit in. Pushing for improvements puts peoples' backs up.  When in Rome live as the Romans – you can't get mad if people don't understand your culture.*

> 💬 *I chose to be here.  So when in Rome do as the Roman do.  It's very important to integrate in the host society.  But personally I don't want to be assimilated so that I lose my identity.  I consider myself as an English man as much as anyone else, but I am still an Indian.  At the end of the day you're an individual.*

> 💬 *When I first started work for the organisation prejudice came from colleagues and so I didn't talk much because I was frightened.  People thought I didn't talk English I was so quiet.  But I gradually joined in things and got accepted to the point where people said 'you're just like us'!*

In addition to the strategies of playing an incident down or taking measures to avoid the line of fire or attracting prejudicial attention, participants also described a number of other self-reliant strategies as their response to racism.  Most of the responses can be typified under the following headings:

1. Defusion (often with humour)
2. Confrontation
3. Encouraging explanation and discussion about the offensive incident
4. Education
5. Building a positive personal profile in the community
6. Helping people to be honest but sensitive in their inquisitiveness

Participants' self reliant strategies and advice:

> 💬 *I'm still called the N word and black bastard - it makes me feel bad and angry and violent, but now my [Black] friend stops me being violent.  And now I just ignore it or <u>say "I'm proud of it mate".  It diffuses the situation because they can't say nothing back</u>.  I picked this up from my[Black]  friend when he said this to a boy who was picking a fight at a disco.  These fights are usually because their girlfriends fancy me.*

> 💬 *My sister wouldn't live in Devon because she feels she'd stick out like a sore thumb.  My attitude is <u>if they're looking let them look.  The way you feel depends very much on your attitude.  My father walked across [the local] bridge saying good morning to everyone - he was very popular.  .........you learn to respond with humour or  make them feel uncomfortable.</u>  Your reaction depends on how it comes over.  For example someone last week said 'you've got to come over to a do we're having' - it was for the elections.....they said 'You add a bit of*

---

*colour to the place' - I didn't know if they were being sarcastic or whether they mean my personality, you know.  It depends on you as to how you receive that.  <u>You have to weigh up who it's coming from and see what they're meaning and decide whether to shrug it off.</u>  So sometimes you find same person who made the comment, maybe in a meeting, will make another later.  <u>Let the first one pass and be ready for the next.  You get an instinct for how to deal with it</u>.  In a meeting then you can kind of glean from what's on the next meeting agenda if something is likely to come up.  You know their weak points by then and you can get back at them through these.  You can make the comment right back across the table. 9 times out of 10 it works.  Sometimes you get backlash.  Or you could bring up a complete discussion - you can say 'Chair why are you allowing this to happen'.  What doesn't work is if you make a big issue out of something if you haven't yet got the facts about.  <u>Think things through and establish the facts first. Then get the Chair to deal with the person - 'this was said' - especially if you're not confident</u>   Sometimes I say <u>'I feel this way about what you've said...'</u>  or sometimes I make them feel uncomfortable - it depends on the situation.*

💬 *My way of reacting to the 'baboon'  incident was to <u>smile and laugh and say hi.</u>  This enables me to set up a relationship.  Ultimately it leads to friendship.  <u>Body language can help</u>.  I deflated one situation by walking sturdily through a group of youths who were behaving aggressively.*

💬 *I stood in the Karate position and the kids ran away.*

💬 *I had a meeting with the staff to talk about ways of not escalating the problem.   We take each day by day.  I am aware it could happen to me myself but I'm not aggressive and would <u>deflate a situation with nice words</u>.  It's a small community so we see the perpetrators next day and if nothing more is said we know it has stopped<u>. My advice is try to deal with people in a soft way.  It's the best way to deal with people with hot tempers.</u>*

💬 *I tell parents to tell their kids that my daughter looks like people where Jesus comes from.  I also told school to 'do something about it or else'.  To kids at school where I teach I explain that I have been here for 26 years and am British in all but name and don't approve of Bin Laden despite being Arab.  My response to discrimination is  <u>"tell me why you've just said that"</u> and pursue the dialogue and explain why they're*

---

*<u>wrong</u>. ……people who have the most entrenched point of view are people from very disadvantaged backgrounds and want to blame it on someone – the Sun readers and people vulnerable to Sun propaganda. Also middle class people who don't want asylum seekers and refugees to lower the tone of their street.*

💬 *I used to say 'I'm from my mother's womb' in reply to people asking 'where are you from?'. Due to my involvement with the REC <u>I have woken up to what racism is about.</u> Before people assumed I was educated about race relations but I wasn't. Asian people don't know about race relations and rights. I am more aware of racism. Before I thought remarks were just because they didn't like me.*

💬 *To a man who verbally abused me at the station….. I said <u>'what have I done to you'.</u>*

💬 *I follow my solicitor's advice: <u>I always try to be polite either in person or in the letters in response to the correspondence sent to me, despite provocation from the locals.</u>*

💬 *I don't  mind being called a <u>WOG – this means Westernised Oriental Gentleman and I am  happy to tell this to people who call me WOG – it shuts them up.</u> An old TV series also helped me to develop coping mechanisms – 'Love thy neighbour' was a series about a Black and a White family that would now be un-PC, but which taught me loads of useful <u>civilised, disarming retorts</u>*

💬 *<u>I sometimes respond, depending on who I'm with.</u> If people say something about Jewish people - it's usually to do with money and tightness – for example a person at work commented on the Tesco's car parking charges saying 'oh well they're Jews'. I let it pass but I could have said 'I'm Jewish and my family isn't mean'. At a party I heard people making racist remarks. I said <u>'I'm finding this conversation really offensive. Am I the only person who feels like that?'</u> It took courage to say it though. I feel strongly about prejudice and sweeping statements and assumptions. People like having someone to blame. People don't stop and think. You can't say something everywhere because it becomes too much of an issue - my friends think I'm a left wing odd ball. I don't want to get on a crusade. People down here are quite conservative. There's lots of prejudice down here. Not  many people feel like me down here.*

---

💬 *I deal with reactions to my ethnicity by <u>explaining about my own culture.</u>*

💬 *<u>By making well relationship</u>*

💬 *<u>By explaining where I come from and introduce them to the background of my ethnicity.</u>*

💬 *You have to <u>indulge their ignorance by educating them.</u>* (Ref: racism in older people)

💬 *It made me feel I have to be very careful what I do and say - even now. <u>I coped with reactions in the community by helping to post letters and change light bulbs during my community visits - I always kept one step ahead </u>to the point where people were in tears when I left that job.*

💬 *I can't reply with anger back on the phone to bolshy clients because of my accent - people will pick me out.  Other staff can give gyp back. But  I have to be more careful than the other staff about what I say and do and about where I go.  It makes you feel on edge.  Other staff can fight back.  I can't. <u>Each word I say has to be to the point and carefully placed.  But this is also what leads to success in delivering a good service.</u>*

💬 *The family group conferencing modus operandi would be a good method for working with BME cultures.  The professionals are invited to the conferences to offer info on support services.  But the families and friends are the decision makers.*

💬 *I think it's best if people are just blunt and come out with it when they want to know about ethnicity.  They could say 'I'm really curious, I just wanted to know/ am fascinated to know where you're from'.  It's the way they put it across that's important. And it may be easier for people to <u>ask where your family is from.</u>*

Most of these response strategies involve the participants in weighing up whether to engage someone who has been offensive in conversation.  In many cases, participants will judge the situation as a lost cause. Some participants also described how the ferocity or blatant prejudice of the attack left them speechless and unable to respond.  This was also a feature of the experience of many White service-providing staff who told us that they were so confounded by racist comments when they heard them, either

because of their ferocity or because of their subtly couched terms, that they felt unable to take a stand. Hence one participant's recommendations to: wait to make a response; think the issues through and prepare what to say; and then be ready for any future repetition of the incident, or purposefully raise it as an issue when ready; and get the support of someone else to help with airing the incident.

## To report or not to report, that is the question?

What are the connotations of complaint (which is after all, what reporting an incident involves)?  The dictionary and thesaurus give a handy reference:

| To complain |
| --- |
| **Dictionary:** To express feelings of pain, dissatisfaction or resentment; To make a formal accusation or make a formal charge. |
| **Thesaurus:**  Murmur, whine, grumble, grouch. |

The connotations are not positive in nature.  They involve exposing vulnerability, pain and discomfort.  In addition they indicate that complaint runs the risk of upping the ante and being seen yourself as a pain, an inconvenience, a problem, having revealed your own pain to others.

To see reporting in a positive light involves a focus on a successful outcome, on the quality of life being improved post reporting and on reporting itself being a positive experience.  However, this research indicates that five key points act against the positive image of reporting, or even preclude reporting as a question to be considered at all:

1.  Victims and agencies tend to focus their analysis of prejudice and discrimination, and the decision whether to report, on the incident itself and on appraising how hard the evidence of intent is, rather than the impact on the victim.  The image of a successful reporting process does not enter the picture in this analysis.
2.  Many people do not know that the opportunity to report and get support exists.
3.  Often support is unavailable to people where they need it
4.  People often experience the reporting process as a negative or even get knocked back, which reinforces the impact of the primary incident.
5.  People don't know about the things that *do* make reporting a successful experience.

In the absence of positive marketing of successful experiences of reporting and case resolution, and without race equality support specialists being readily available to victims, it is not surprising that Black and Minority Ethnic people are so reliant on their own coping strategies - in particular on keeping low key and taking the impact. The consequence is that racism goes unchecked in society, and layers of unresolved experience compound themselves in Black and Minority Ethnic experience. Chapter 5 looks at the multiple layers of isolation experienced by rural Black and Minority Ethnic people. If experience of racism is one of those layers and it has not been satisfactorily redressed, the potency of that experience can heighten the sense of isolation overall.

The descriptions of experience we have heard in this research, indicate that tackling racism requires a preventative approach but also effective support which Black and Minority Ethnic people know they can access with confidence. Confidence building requires good experiences and good marketing underpinned by the existence of good, accessible support.

## Creating an environment for safe and accessible reporting

The foundation stone for building a people's confidence in the process is to provide them with place of safety through which to engage with it. A person who has reached a point of crisis sufficient to provoke them into seeking out a relationship with a source of support is a person who already feels unsafe and will feel less confident about exposing their vulnerability to an unknown. By contrast, if a person already has a good relationship with a support- source for purposes other than complainant aid, the opportunity to open up and raise concerns is made easier and safer. This is reflected in some of the participants' feedback, in which they said they would like some means of getting together with other rural Black and Minority Ethnic people to share experience, celebrate culture freely, get information and find support. The idea of rural networks emerged as a key recommendation in this research, and is discussed in detail in chapter 12. The facilitation of networks, and provision of access to specialist support through them, is a suggestion that could make a real difference to the promotion and uptake of reporting and support services.

> 🗨 *I would be interested in a DEREC network - sharing experiences could help to restore my confidence.*

At the same time, if reporting is to increase, the system has to be ready to provide effective support.  This means that:

- all service providers need better training in responding to complaints from Black and Minority Ethnic people

- service providers and support workers need training in appraising the impact of incidents and the vulnerability of victims and co-victims (especially children)

- Police need to deal effectively with racist crime and make sure that incidents reported as racist, but which can't be prosecuted as crimes are also referred to specialist support agencies.

- Resources need to be put into making sure that specialist case workers, with good understanding of the law and of impact assessment, are readily and easily accessible to complainants.

We'll end this chapter with a reminder of the effects of racism, with extracts of some of participants' cases from the subtle, drip-drip and unwitting end of the spectrum through to in-your-face, unabashed bigotry.

**Table 6.5**

| Impact | Effect of case on quality of life – case notes and quotes |
|---|---|
| Distress | Complainant was distressed. She was well integrated in the community - well heeled middle class family. This incident really shook her. |
| Isolation<br>Anxiety | She was feeling isolated and anxious anyway - husband often away from the house because of work, she was left with small children and felt very vulnerable esp. with the aggressor around. |
| Family problems<br>Loss of faith in services<br>Sleep problems<br>Eating disorder | Has knocked confidence in terms of new start and career change. Has lost all faith in health authority because of no support. Has created difficulties at home because family unsure how to deal with the frustration caused. Symptoms of difficulty eating and sleeping. |
| Unemployment | Very angry and out of a job. |
| Isolation<br>Distress<br>Fear of crime | Very upset and distressed. Fearful of repeated attack. Won't go out now. |
| Isolation | Fell very isolated. Family feel barricaded indoors except for running the business. |
| Isolation | Not letting daughters out. So don't make friends except for at school. |
| Health impact<br>Income impact | Fear of raising issues in the organisation. Added pressure to pressure of health problems. Salary is lower than it should be. |
| Impact on work relations<br>Withdrawal from community work | *A sense of wariness among my colleagues at work, and I'm stepping back from prominent community work.* |
| Frustration | *I've been given the message 'you've made your point, it will be dealt with'. 14 months later and there's no action. That sort of thing gets you. I feel like I've been banging my head against a ceiling because I'm raising the issues..* |

| Categories | Narrative |
|---|---|
| Income impact<br>Loss of opportunity to pursue profession | *I coped with it my leaving my professional promotion behind. My wife's career in her profession went down the pan - she's very highly qualified with a degree from Oxford...... I've had to go through all sorts of unpleasant things to get where I got now and I wish I didn't have to go through that. ......I don't want my grandchildren to face the same problems. My own children can laugh now but it was not funny being bullied, it was not funny being discriminated against in jobs and it was not funny being ostracized.* |
| Anxiety | *When the kids were getting the racist trouble at school you thought it was going to last for ever. It was hell. Now it seems like a lifetime ago and we don't really think about it.* |
| Reduced employment opportunities<br>Income impact | Her experience of troubles with applying for jobs she knows she's qualified for and her concerns around ethnicity monitoring means that she now doesn't apply for a job if she suspects the employer doesn't want a Black person. She's also worried about applying for management jobs because she is worried about how employers will feel about having a Black person in a position of authority. |
| Loss of job<br>Income impact | Seeing other people get attacked such as the mixed-race manager of the sports shop makes the couple worry for the children when they grow up. The husband's experience of hearing racism at work means that he feels he has to tell prospective employers that his wife is Black in order to prevent having to hear racist jokes. He ended up leaving his factory job because of the constant racist comments from other employees about himself and his wife. |
| Anxiety<br>Desire to move away | Had bad effect on her - she was anxious and wanted husband to give up job and move. He was determined to stick it out. |

| | |
|---|---|
| Depression<br>Fear of using local schools<br>Health risks | Son does not go to the local school because of antagonism coming from one of the local school assistants.  A recent incident with one of the antagonists at the school her son does attend has made her afraid for her son.  She is distressed and angry at the lengths that local people will go to, to oust the family, whilst remaining shrouded in anonymity. Case caused extreme stress, especially during time of pregnancy. |
| Loss of confidence<br>Health impact<br>Anxiety<br>Isolation<br>Child impact | *Loss of confidence. Normally I don't think of myself as Chinese, but now I'm much more self-conscious.  I've begun to worry and have doubts and think 'is this because of my race? These threats and intimidation mean that I'm not sure of my own mind - normally I wouldn't have such insecure thoughts about being Chinese……  But now the way that I look at people looking at me is changing…I don't feel confident anymore. Harassment has taken place over a number of  months.  Toward the end of the case, complainant felt she couldn't bear it any longer.  This is very painful.  It's bad for my health.  I'm afraid to answer the door.  I don't feel safe anywhere. I had no idea I could feel like this.* Daughter has been very affected by the case. |
| Impact on career progression<br>Income impact<br>Desire to move away | *I'm not applying for promotion because I feel I won't get support from the boss even though I'm at the top of my grade.  The [organisation] pays lip service to discrimination.  It bugs me that in the UK some people, especially those in authority are so two-faced.  They say one thing but don't act on it.  There is one member of staff I really can trust, but it's not the boss.  I might ultimately go back overseas.* |
| Anxiety<br>Inability to trust | *Now I'm very cautious about people and who I trust.  Now I won't tell anyone anything personal.  I'm scared about meeting any of the staff in the street for fear of abuse. I shouldn't have to feel like that. I won't now trust anyone I work with. It's taught me how to handle people and approach people you don't click with, differently - i.e. you make sure not to show if you disagree with them on anything because it will have repercussions for the work.  People broke trust and confidence two times at that job.  I have learnt to be more discretionary about people.* |

| | |
|---|---|
| Child impact<br>Isolation | Depression for children, and limitations on their freedom - parents don't allow children out on their own and children have stopped going swimming because of intimidation. |
| Fear of provocation | He was more worried about his own response that the harassment might provoke. |
| Child impact<br>Anti-social behaviour<br>Insecurity | Child's problems started with trans-racial adoption into white adoption family with alcoholic father and with rare, intermittent access to birth parents tantalisingly allowed. Now as a teenager, child has history of disruptive anti-social behaviour and insecurity. |
| Child impact<br>Anti-social behaviour | Behavioural problems since experience of racism as a child [of white adoptive parents]. |
| Depression<br>Loss of value of property | *All this harassment continues and nobody seems able to do anything to help us. We seem to be trapped here. Even the best efforts of the police have had no effect. We would like to move but it is unlikely that we will be able to sell the property under these circumstances. We have laws regarding racial harassment, he is racially harassing us, but the police and laws don't seem able to protect us, especially when it's done this way: when it's not overt. If we were tenants, council or private, we would be better protected than we are just because we own our property. The only thing we did wrong was to buy the wrong property and we are being punished for it. We have tried reasoning with him but it is useless. He refuses to see our side of anything. The bottom line is he is enjoying harassing us and knows there is little anyone can do about it. We feel trapped and in despair…. Since [the 12 month conditional discharge sentence for racially aggravated public order offence] he does not seem to appreciate the gravity of the order on him, treats it as a 'let off' and has begun to act as though he can begin to bully us again…. He is still carrying on in exactly the way he did before the court appearance and the guilty plea.* |

This handbook and supporting tools �֎ can be accessed at <u>www.DevonREC.org</u>

# Chapter 7
# WORKING LIVES

## Themes in this chapter

- Employment profile
- Recruitment
- Recognition/ progression
- Equality initiatives
- Reporting discrimination
- Handling discrimination
- Changing behaviour
- Promoting Black and Minority Ethnic business
- Institutional racism

## Introduction

In this chapter, we look at Black and Minority Ethnic working lives.

The employment profile in this chapter illustrates the breadth of skills and experience that the participants contribute to the services that are provided in Devon and to its economy. No stereotype can be drawn from this profile. It indicates that matters of equality of opportunity and good race relations are relevant to all employers – not just one sector.

The accounts of experience of prejudice and discrimination in the work place raise issues of concern for employers to reflect and act upon, in order to promote good practice.
Problems experienced by business proprietors are also relevant to the Police and to Authorities responsible for promoting the business economy. The accounts in this chapter will also be of interest to isolated individuals experiencing discrimination. All too often, without the confidence that their experience is not an isolated anomaly, people feel alone and reluctant to pursue the issue with their employers. It also raises issues for management of race equality initiatives in organisations and Black and Minority Ethnic staff participation in them.

**Table 6.1  Employment profile of the participants in this research**

| Employment status | No. of people | Including…… | |
|---|---|---|---|
| *Senior/ Professional* | 35 | • Accountants and finance managers.<br>• Civil engineer<br>• Doctors<br>• Finance Manager.<br>• Health manager<br>• Religious leaders / clerics<br>• Lecturers | • Management Consultant<br>• Nurses<br>• Opthamologist<br>• Pharmacist<br>• Social workers<br>• Teachers<br>• Voluntary sector organisation managers |
| *Student* | 31 | School/FE/HE | |
| *Skilled* | 18 | • Housing advice officer.<br>• Artist<br>• Dance teacher.<br>• Electrician.<br>• Finance officers.<br>• Local authority officer.<br>• Mechanics | • Musician<br>• Personnel Administration Assistant.<br>• Post mistress<br>• Travel sales consultant<br>• Union workers<br>• Youth Workers |
| *Restaurateur* | 16 | | |

| Category | Count | Notes |
|---|---|---|
| *Unskilled* | 12 | • Au pair<br>• Care assistant<br>• Checkout worker<br>• Meat factory workers<br>• Inmate<br>• Learning support assistant in school.<br>• MacDonalds worker<br>• Stall holder<br>• Waitress and chamber maid. |
| *Retired* | 13 | Including WWII WAAF Engine Fitter. |
| *Housewife/ Mum* | 11 | |
| *Business owner* | 8 | |
| *Asylum Seeker* | 6 | |
| *Unemployed* | 5 | |
| *Inmate* | 1 | |
| *Traveller* | 1 | |
| *Not stated* | 13 | |

When we compared skills and qualifications with present employment, we found that 16 women and 10 men were either unemployed or working well below their skills level. A further 3 women had given up skilled or professional posts and were Mothers at home  (i.e. a total of 18.5% not using work skills 'n'=157.)

Of the 26 people not working at their skills level, 12 speak English fluently or as their first language, 11 have good English skills and 3 have a poor command of English.  This raises a number of points of concern about Black and Minority Ethnic equality in getting experience, skills and qualifications recognised in the workplace.  Factors involved include: difficulty in getting experience, skills and qualifications recognised in the UK; lack of familiarity with UK procedures for applying for jobs and for interviewing; the effects of discrimination.

## Experience of discrimination and prejudice in the workplace

31 people described experience of prejudice and discrimination in their work setting. 23 of these were employees.

The Participants drew attention to some key issues arising out of their experience, relating to:

- Recruitment
- Difficulties in proving discrimination and its racial premise.
- Poor handling of reported discrimination
- Appropriate recognition/ career progression
- Taking part in equality initiatives

The following accounts illustrate those themes in the boxes below. Each theme is followed by a commentary.

---

**Box 1  Recruitment**

🗨 *I feel that when my husband and I go for jobs we don't get as far as our qualifications  [PhDs]  deserve. Our names work against us. We expect discrimination because of the effect of top-down politics which lead to entrenched discrimination in the system.  So you can expect your own chances to be affected. We accept it rather than moan about it.  Other friends have been really badly abused.*

🗨 *The Chief Exec is keen on awareness about discrimination in general but no-one is able to deal with actual cases.  For example, a job application was refused for consideration by a manager, because he "didn't want that sort of person working for us".  This allegation was made by someone from outside the organisation.  All three of my sons got discriminated against because of their surname.   Two of them have worked for the organisation and yet been refused interviews on the basis that they might be related to me! My wife was also turned down 5 times for jobs in the organisation despite being overqualified. The fact that she had been originally employed by them before she was married to me is what makes me wonder.*

🗨 *I was turned down three times from a Justice of the Peace application.  Pathetic excuses. The particular clerk of court had particular racial bias.  I'll apply again. The Magistrates service is now calling out for BME people but I had wanted to do it under my own merit.  It's a shame.*

---

● *The job market is not mobile – people tend to stay in jobs because they are afraid of not getting another job. Businesses here have the upper hand over workers over pay and welfare. The worst thing is getting jobs – you have to struggle to get any job worth keeping. Who you know in local government employment is more important than your abilities – people here especially opt for their own.*

● *My youngest son got passed over from interview by an aeronautics company in the South West because of his name. He only got taken on when a local politician encouraged them to give him a job. The middle child also had a big problem in getting interviews because people assumed his English was inadequate. That's what the employment agencies said. Despite his degree at Oxford!*

● *People who are clever may not be able to express themselves properly in English, especially at interview.*

**Case Study**
A Black British woman and her growing family moved to Devon to live in the countryside. In London she had been working for a Public Body as a finance officer, a post for which she was fully qualified and experienced. After the move, she got a temporary job within a Public Body and then applied for two, more senior, permanent positions within the organisation– the same seniority as her post in London. In neither situation was she invited to interview. In both cases, she observed that less qualified people were offered the posts. A friend felt that the participant had been discriminated against and suggested that she should make a complaint. The participant herself also felt that discrimination may have been at play but felt she had no hard proof. However, she noted that people in the organisation would have known that she would have been making an application for a permanent position. She also has no way of knowing whether the ethnicity monitoring form she filled in was processed alongside her application. When she applied for her temporary post, she did not fill in an ethnicity monitoring form. Despite many reasons for doubting the fairness of the selection process, the participant did not complain. She felt to have done so would have jeopardised her temporary position and made her working relationships within the organisation difficult, especially as a complaint would have related to the appointing officers, one of whom is a senior colleague in her temporary job. Near the end of her contract she was later asked by the same appointing officer to apply for the same job as she had been rejected for, in another area.

## Comment

These cases illustrate some of the difficulties people can experience before they even get into a job. A particular problem is the difficulty in proving discrimination. Common features of problems in relation to recruitment were:

- Suspicion of ethnicity monitoring processes and concern that personal data may be mis-used.

- Concern that a person's name will render them vulnerable to prejudice, regardless of ethnicity monitoring.

- Poor communication on the part of employers about the function and transparency of the equal opportunity process in selection, arising from poor employer understanding of the principles of ethnicity monitoring and race equality.

- Applicant's exclusion from privilege to the very information about selection decision making which would independently establish whether perceived discrimination was real, except through redress to the courts.

- Applicants' heightened sensitivity to discrimination based on previous experience of prejudice (either within or external to the workplace) in contrast to poor employer awareness of the mechanisms of prejudice and inability to identify institutional racism.

- Reluctance to raise suspected discrimination with an employer due to the belief that short of re-dress to the courts, appointments will not be reviewed.

- Perception that employers are reluctant to employ people who are 'different' or 'outsiders', and often prefer to recruit internally from their [White British] workforce.

When we asked participants about the best way of promoting race equality and good race relations, 14 comments were raised in relation to employment. These comments ranged from the general need to eliminate racism in employment and to improve recognition of merit in terms of access to jobs and promotion, to more specific recommendations relating to recruitment:

| **Box 2**   Promoting equality in recruitment | |
|---|---|
| ➢ Positive action on recruitment, e.g **welcome statements** and guidance for employers on how to phrase and use them.<br><br>(The example opposite has been sounded with Living Options and with the Intercom Trust.) | E.g "This organisation sets equality of opportunity at the heart of its values, is working to address this in its functions and to reflect diversity in its workforce, and welcomes appropriately skilled candidates of any background, from all ages and religious, ability, sexual orientation and gender identity." |
| ➢ Separation of **ethnicity monitoring** forms from job applications (separate envelopes and removal of all personal details from application form )<br><br>➢ **Explaining to applicants** how ERKM (ethnicity record keeping & monitoring) is handled and why it is done. | 💬 *The main problem is we can't tell why there are problems with job applications.  So it would be best to de-personalise all personal details from application forms.*<br>💬 *There should be separate ERKM envelopes which are not opened until **after** the interview - that's a good idea.* |
| ➢ Allowing people to **describe their ethnicity in their own terms** on ethnicity monitoring forms. | (For more details on ethnicity and identity see chapter 4) |
| ➢ Setting targets for **proportional workforces** – for nationally advertised jobs, national census proportions should be used rather than local percentages. | 💬 *Under the Race Relations Amendment Act it states that public bodies must be representative of the <u>British</u> community and in all levels of management structure. This doesn't mean representative of the <u>local</u> community.* |
| ➢ **Supporting Black and Minority Ethnic people in finding work**. | 💬 *I was naive at first and didn't know the ways of the west.  I applied for loads of jobs and didn't get them.  I had no experience of job applications.* |

💬 *It costs lots of money to translate your own qualification papers and CVs into English. People need help with this and need a way of getting translated certificates certified.*

💬 *I am a surveyor. But I can't get a professional job here – they don't recognise my diploma. They think I stole my diploma.*

💬 *[My friend's] mother is a doctor but had difficulties getting a job because of her European qualifications not being recognised.*

💬 *Now I'm getting into music and would like to get into performance and I need someone to assist me to find a way to work everyday. I want to do a one day exhibition of my paintings. I went to the arts centre for advice in Exeter as to how to establish my talent but they said go do it yourself. So I just play in the street and do fire dancing. It's difficult to sell myself in English. We need assistance and an advocate to establish us. Someone who will really promote us.*

## Comment

Improved recruitment was also seen by several participants as a long-term means of promoting good race relations in Devon society in general, by virtue of the inherent familiarization with difference that an increased Black & Minority Ethnic workforce would bring about:

💬 *Race relations will improve if more Black & Ethnic Minority people are encouraged to come to Devon and thereby White people will become more accustomed to Black people: people may be indoctrinated from birth but will change as a result of one to one relationships. However racism in job opportunities will have to be overcome to achieve this.*

💬 *Attitudes change e.g. when a white person finds themselves in position of having to depend on a Black person's help.*

But in addition to the problems of discrimination in recruitment, participants identified other factors that work against the retention and attraction of skilled workers to the area:

💬 *The worst thing about life in Devon is that job pay is poor for most people. I earn 3 times more than my husband who is a teacher. Things would be better if we were more of a meritocracy.*

💬 *Improving the pay scales would make life in Devon better. I can't live here even on one and a half jobs. I can't save anything and there's no spare time. More job opportunities with interesting roles would help. There's too much admin in the jobs and not enough challenge. It's very difficult to further your career here. You need to attract more young people to work here through good jobs. I only see young holiday-makers in the summer. Devon is classed as cheap labour so young people won't move here. The area is classified as a holiday area, not a good place to work.*

| Box 3 | Appropriate recognition/ career progression |
|---|---|

**Case study**

💬 *Now I work with 4 or 5 thousand [customers]. It's a difficult job. I had to push for progress and promotion but it hasn't been given to me. I had to ask and argue for recognition. This didn't happen to other staff. I tried to create hell about it a number of years ago when I got to the point were I felt that if I lost the job, what the hell. My senior manager discriminated against me. He then moved to another job. In the last couple of years I've raised the issue again with my Line Manager who approved the idea of re-grading me. Many extra duties had been put on me. Other officers in the past who'd been given extra duties got extra pay. I applied for this but was told no, I was not eligible…..I took the re-grade issue to the Head of Team via my Line Manager, but the Head of Team said I could pursue it if I wanted to but that it wouldn't get past committee level. No written justification was given for this decision.*
This participant noted that his own experience was set within a wider lack of commitment in the organisation to race equality. 💬*Colleagues have said "what do we need a Race Equality Scheme for – we're not racist", when info about the RES arrives on the computer. People don't want to go into it. It's a fact that people in [the organisation] are discriminated against. The atmosphere is even that the White Brits from the North of the UK get told why don't they go back to the North - I heard this in the office. I have heard so many people complain about incomers.*

**Case Study**
One participant worked as a Manager for a company, but left because of the combined effects of prejudice and poor senior management – the branch was run down when she arrived, and the chain had just sacked previous manager there. However, management colleagues at the branch didn't like

the fact that the participant, a Black woman, arrived with ideas for improving the business.  The local colleagues clashed with her and called in Regional Management.  ☛ *When people look down on you it doesn't bring out the best in your performance. No matter what I did, and even despite doubling turnover, the company wouldn't recognise my abilities. Their attitude was due to incompetence and prejudice.*  By contrast, the participant has had a positive experience at her subsequent, more senior post at another business where her employer was familiar with the country in which she had been born.  She described how the respect and understanding her new employer shows towards her has restored her confidence.

## Comment

Another Specific Duty under the Race Relations Amendment Act (2000) is the Employment Duty to monitor by ethnicity a number of key indicators including:

- The numbers of staff in post
- Applicants for employment
- Applicants for training
- Applicants for promotion.

Where Public Bodies employ 150 or more full time staff, they must also monitor by ethnicity the number of staff who :

- Receive training
- Benefit or suffer detriment as a result of performance assessments
- Are involved in grievance procedures
- Are subject to disciplinary procedures
- Cease employment

These indicators demonstrate the requirement to ensure that Black and Minority Ethnic Staff are getting the recognition they deserve.  Some organisations are trying to increase the level of Black and Minority Ethnic applications by enabling candidates to talk to existing Black and Minority Ethnic staff.  This could work to the detriment of an organisation's objective if staff feelings about the organisation is that they are undervalued and their concerns sidelined.

The Duty under the Race Relations Amendment Act (2000) to produce a Race Equality Scheme has recently thrown many Public Bodies into consternation and many have turned to their Black and Minority Ethnic employees for help in meeting their obligations. This puts Black and

Minority Ethnic staff into difficult positions if their own experience has never been discussed or addressed. This research indicates that many people do experience discrimination or insufficient professional recognition as employees, have concerns about race equality in the workplace and that most experience some form of prejudice in their lives. Such an invitation to sit on Corporate Race Equality Steering Groups may therefore expect many Black and Minority Ethnic staff to put themselves under a spotlight and speak from experience to an audience which they may feel is ill prepared to listen sensitively or receptively. A further problem is that in the absence of Black and Minority Ethnic self-organised representation in rural areas (see chapters 5 & 12 relating to networks) individuals find themselves uncomfortably labelled as race equality experts by virtue of their ethnicity. Chapters 3 & 5 illustrate the huge diversity of ethnicity, experience and outlooks in rural Devon. A clear consequence of this is that no individual can speak with authority on behalf of the Black and Minority Ethnic population – especially of there has been no mechanism for them to consult with a wide range of other Black and Minority Ethnic rural dwellers. However, individuals can provide insight into what it is like to be a minority member of staff, based on their own experience. Black and Minority Ethnic staff will already have made their own informal assessment of the preparedness of their organisation to promote race equality and will be wary about whether their ideas and concerns will be taken seriously. Employers need to work hard to demonstrate their own commitment to addressing discrimination and awareness in their organisations in order to gain the trust and full participation of Black and Minority Ethnic members of employer equality initiatives.

---

**Box 4     Participation in employers' race equality initiatives**

🗩 *I think the Chief Exec. is keen to get things done but I think the organisation prefers to see national legislation before writing its own schemes - so it follows, not leads…… they're not dealing with the surrounding issues or the big issues. It's very hit and miss. There's lots of political correctness - people have to be seen to be doing the right thing. But the group set up to look at race in the organisation was cut off in mid air….. meetings went on with select staff behind closed doors and big or difficult issues were not dealt with…… bits of paper are being produced just to pass the assessment, meaning that laws are made but there is no implementation. I said this to the inspectors saying that much more consultation with staff needs to take place and more two-way dialogue.*

---

🗨 *I don't like standing out here and that people think I am a race expert. I don't like it that everyone recognises you here and being questioned. People don't realise that minority ethnic people are not homogeneous.*

🗨 *I think the duty to assess impact will hit the problem of 'we don't need this'. If this attitude proves to exist I'll feel very lost…. It's especially a problem as most of them who are senior won't have had experience of work in multicultural areas. They'll probably get their ideas from the telly.*

One participant described being worried about opening up….and being considered too controversial. 🗨 *I'm worried I'll be sacked for being too difficult. But I'd like to open up for the sake of my children and others.*

## Tackling the invisible problem

The research indicates that those who have felt discrimination in their working lives will not have raised a complaint of racial discrimination with their employers. A notable feature of participants' experiences of discrimination at work and in finding work was the reservation about applying a racist label to the discrimination they described.

**Box 5    Difficulties in proving discrimination and it's racial premise.**

🗨 *I didn't like the [factory] job because people were very rude. I didn't speak very much English. Maybe because I was foreign people looked at me differently, and made rude jokes, and insisted I should tell them about my private life and sex life. Maybe they were just having fun or maybe they were making these jokes just because I am a foreigner – they didn't say these things to other British workers. Maybe because English people would have the answers to shut them up.*

🗨 *Life here has its moments - I had a big office but the boss wanted it for 'multiple occupancy' but it is still vacant 4 months later. I got moved very suddenly to a small office while I was on leave. I complained. I think the boss is 'showing the Black fellow – who is only a lecturer- who the boss is'. A colleague wrote to the boss saying she thought it was unreasonable treatment. I didn't want to make a big issue of it. I'm not sure if it's race related but past experience shows people have all sorts of hidden agendas which influence their attitudes.*

*It only started again [after childhood] when I started work - you know, the hidden racism - not being put forward, having to fight for every decision is a little bit harder, maybe also because I'm a woman.*

🗨 *Most people are welcoming to me, for example ladies at the job centre and social services who help disabled people like me. I went for an interview with the District Council as a clerk but didn't get it. I think it was because my speed typing and English are not good enough. They also wanted someone who could drive - and I can't because I am disabled, I don't own a car and can't drive. I also went for a job at the local hotel. But there were too many more highly qualified people. Also the toilet wasn't suitable for disabled access and I couldn't go to the loo. I have applied to the High School library but didn't get an interview. I also applied for a receptionist job at the hospital but got no reply. I also applied to a local farmer for fruit pickers but was unsuccessful. I also got a rejection letter from the local travel agent. I applied to the surgery but there were too many applicants. So I'm feeling depressed. I don't know if I'm being rejected because I'm Black or because I'm disabled.*

🗨 *In the job I moved to for career progression I left after one year because I fell out with a female colleague who made life hell for me…The company took the woman's side. I had worked very hard for them. They didn't want to hear my side of the story. I feel real resentment. It was a small firm - very cliquey. All the others were there since the inception of the firm. They didn't like it that I was proud of being Indian. I got very depressed with this. I didn't want to leave that way – they dismissed me. They were very sly. The problem I had at the job could be racism - they just didn't like me being different. I heard that the woman I fell out with had trouble with the previous 2 other staff.*

🗨 *Institutional racism exists… At first I wasn't acknowledged at meetings - I was the only Black person.*

🗨 *In Cornwall I applied for 200 jobs and lots came back saying I was over qualified… lots of organisations are going through the equal opportunities motions only. I couldn't prove racial discrimination but they would tell from my middle name - it shows I'm Chinese. I saw a programme to enable NHS women staff to become more confident. I went to the interview to become a coach. I didn't get selected because the NHS said they were 'worried' about me not being covered in the practice. Discrimination also might have been a part of their decision to refuse me.*

One Asian male, an accountant with years of experience, tried for years to find a position when he moved to Devon, but without success. He assumes that employers here have discriminated against him as a single parent.

## Comment

Far from 'playing the race card', the participants' comments above illustrate the background to their reluctance to report or demand thorough investigation. The experience that most participants reported in the research was typically non-overt discrimination and therefore by its nature hard to evidence or to prove as racially aggravated. This was a cause for real frustration and shattering self-doubt for many participants. The effects of their experience notwithstanding, many participants evidently felt that in order to deal with the non-overt character of the oppression they experienced they were obliged to engage in a specious argument about its validity, centring on the question **'was there intent to be racist?'** - this question taking an unhelpful precedent over the more relevant analysis of **'what is the specific nature of the impact on this Black/Minority Ethnic Person?'**

The diffidence about identifying discrimination as racist, is partly a consequence of the subtle nature of racism and a function of second-guessing on the part of victims about the unsympathetic reaction they would expect from their employers; It is partly a consequence of a poor understanding of the mechanisms of institutional racism, by both employers and Black and Minority Ethnic employees.

In the face of the difficulty of evidencing perceived discrimination and furthermore labelling it as racist and getting employer support, most participants find other self-reliant strategies of coping with the situation. Some leave their jobs, some try to ignore the problem, others just keep trying to find work or to gain acceptance at work. Chapter 6 describes some of the typical responses to experience of racism and the ways that people adopt to cope. One European fluent English speaker described the extraordinary lengths he was expected to go to, to overcome discrimination:
☛ *People were disconcerted that a foreigner was in a position of influence to tell them what to do……… people were even suggesting I should change my name.*

The self-reliant strategies are not without cost. Participants described the personal consequences in terms of negative impact on health and mental well being, low income, inability to use skills, sense of isolation, and for some, the decision to move away from the area or loss of a job and income.

One of the comments often made about experience of discrimination is the notion that a non-Black and Minority Ethnic person might also have experienced discrimination from the same perpetrator in the same setting.

While this notion is valid and often true there is a dangerous assumption which often accompanies it: the notion that 'this situation could well affect someone else too' is often translated into the notion that 'therefore it doesn't matter that it happens to me [to a Black person]'. The fact that a perpetrator of discrimination may not reserve his or her negative attention exclusively for Black or Minority Ethnic people does not discount its effect. For example, a homophobe may well be a racist too or a person who has little awareness of the experience of disabled people might well also be ignorant about that of ethnic minorities.

If the burden of proof relies upon evidencing that racist thoughts were operating in a person's head or on an organisation's unspoken values, very few cases of racism will ever be successfully tackled. As one participant cautioned:

> ☛ *It's the stuff you can't prove that's the real problem.*

When both employers and those who experience discrimination, focus on **intent**, the outcome is that, where discrimination does exist, it is unlikely to be reported or addressed.

Under the Race Relations Amendment Act (2000), the law does not look for **intent**. It looks for **impact**. This is an important concept in tackling inequality and it is also at the heart of the concept of Institutional Racism. It has big implications for the way that employers have to think about discrimination. The concept of focusing on Impact Assessment is enshrined in law as a Specific Duty on Public Bodies under the Race Relations Amendment Act (2000). The shift away from relying on evidence of intent is also a key outcome of the McPherson report of the inquiry into the murder of Stephen Lawrence. The report recommends that a Racist Incident should be defined as stated follows:

---

**Box 6      Racist Incident: The McPherson Definition**

'A racist incident is any incident which is perceived to be racist by the victim or any other person.' (Rec.12)

'The term *racist incident* must be understood to include crime and non-crime in policing terms. Both must be reported, recorded and investigated with equal commitment.' (Rec. 13)

'This definition should be universally adopted by the police, local government and other relevant agencies.' (Rec.14)

---

McPherson also set out the definition and mechanisms of Institutional Racism and is provided together with a discussion paper about it as a tool in Box 10 at the end of this chapter.

The diffidence on the part of those experiencing discrimination underlines the necessity for employers to *encourage* identification of problems, with a focus on the impact a person is experiencing and to *be open to being found wanting as an institution*. Employers who see complaints and Impact Assessment procedures as being means for disproving perceptions rather than acknowledging them will be unable to begin honest assessment or promotion of organisational race relations.

| Box 7    Poor handling of reported discrimination |
|---|
| **Case study**. |
| 🖝 *I applied for the job after several years work with another organisation, for promotion and more pay - it was a bad move. I wish I'd stayed with the other job. They didn't want me to leave - and tried to keep me but couldn't because they couldn't match the money. It was nice to feel valued [by the previous employer]. The organisation [present employer] is now restructuring. I have done many years of service [in this sector]. Relations at work were always good until my boss started treating people badly, especially me. A senior member of staff said that he'd been on interview panels where people had not been appointed because of race. I have to work twice as hard for promotion as do other BME staff…. I was told by my boss that I had to take early redundancy…… I proposed a means of saving hundreds of thousands of pounds to prevent early redundancies and the boss passed it off as his own idea…… I don't enjoy work now because of the relationship with my boss….There's been a long history between us and it's still not resolved. I think he's racially prejudiced against me. I wrote to the Chief Exec' when my boss proposed redundancy He wrote back saying it wasn't compulsory and their choice of me for redundancy was not based on my boss' prejudice. He said " I don't like people playing the race card but in this instance I don't think you have". This response makes it impossible for me to allege racism! ……My boss gives me the hardest tasks - he's trying to set me up to fail. He's always trying to test and fault me. He behaves like a head-teacher and treats his colleagues like schoolchildren. Racists don't see themselves as such and even if they did they wouldn't admit it, especially to a senior. Attitude surveys are no good - the proof of this is that when the CE asked my boss if his decision was based on prejudice of course he said "no"! Now why are the BME numbers of staff in the organisation so low!!! Everyone in the* |

*department who feels victimised by the boss is looking to me to take the issue up with senior management - they reckon I've got nothing to lose because I have other forms of income! But I don't want to rock the boat because I feel I'll be forced to take early redundancy.*

**Case Study**
One participant described how he would like to see his organisation improving on its race equality performance but that he experiences difficulty in getting his views taken on board. He's also recently been rejected for promotion – unfairly he feels - and is also aware that another BME colleague's family members feel they have experienced discrimination in applying for work with the organisation.

🕮 *Some people find it difficult to talk to me and so cut me out of decision making processes because I say controversial things. The organisation is keen on general awareness about discrimination but no one is able to deal with actual cases. The sole objective for the organisation seems to be to get things right on paper, but it's very hit and miss what gets dealt with in practice. You raise a point and get told 'you've made your point, it will be dealt with' and then no action gets taken. I feel like I'm banging my head against a glass ceiling – with the issues and professionally - because I'm raising the issues, because they don't want to hear the issues, and because I'm Black. Black and Minority Ethnic people get labelled as trouble-makers irrespective of their skills. I'm passionate about these things because I don't want my kids to go through the sort of things I've experienced.*

## Comment

We have demonstrated how many people will not be able to get over the first hurdle of finding enough confidence to take up a case of discrimination with their employer, especially when it is not overt. These case studies illustrate a second hurdle, that of not being taken seriously, or being dismissed, when a case is raised. People who make the decision at the first hurdle that their case will not be heard are not being neurotic.

Poor handling of a reported incident is a guaranteed way of breaking the trust and confidence of Black and Minority Ethnic staff. Moreover, if the expectation is conveyed that no more should be heard on the subject, it is a muzzling of staff for the present and the future. That is an act of institutional racism in itself.

The problems of under reporting of racist incidents to the police are well documented.  Chapter 6 looks at the way in which people tend to cope with racism and some of the background to under-reporting.  Most of the participants had not made formal reports of their experience.  The problem of under-reporting is also an issue for employers, and one that can only be addressed if employers:

a.  Accept that if there has been no meaningful training and development in issues of equality and diversity in an organisation and, its systems and norms are born out of the dominant culture of a White workforce, a review of whether unidentified and institutionally discriminatory practices are at work, is needed.
b.  Learn more about the way in which institutional racism operates
c.  Set in place advocates who are able to gain the trust of staff and take tangible action to address their experience.
d.  Let staff know that diversity is valued, through a change in behaviour in its management and workforce, supported by training.

---

**Box 8    Inappropriate behaviour and language**

One Black participant described how, whilst senior officers are supportive, there has been a generally awkward atmosphere among his peer colleagues when using language that refers to ethnicity. This wariness among staff has made things uncomfortable, and he feels this could have been avoided if colleagues were more confident and relaxed about working with staff of different ethnicities.   An example of lack of confidence in using race equality language was during an in-house training session that he attended in which the training officer clearly felt very uncomfortable using the phrase 'Black person'.  On another occasion, when looking at staff rostas, a staff member was commenting on the problem of finding someone to cover a shift.  At that point the participant came into the office and the staff member announced "ah, here's a nigger among the woodpile". He immediately challenged the staff member, who apologised and backed down. The participant felt that the staff member concerned must have confused his arrival in the office with the fact that the officer couldn't 'see the *wood* for the trees' on the rosta –  *"a mental blip".*  The scenario had been overheard and was brought up for discussion at the participant's appraisal, but he wanted the matter closed.  Nevertheless, whilst the staff member concerned is now " as nice as pie" the participant remains wary after this and other events.

A minority ethnic council worker told us:
🗩  *Prejudice also affects staff who suffer abuse from the public.  I saw a*

---

*colleague [Asian] directing road work in Exeter on Saturday - I saw 5 comments of racial abuse being made by the public.*

A participant described concern for a friend who had confided in him:
🗨 *A friend working for the health service was told to go back to her country - she's a receptionist.*

🗨 *My wife has only experienced one incident, on September the 11th - the following day she went on site and a woman approached her at a bus stop and said 'It's bad taste for your employers to send you out at this time'. Her employer came and told the woman that she was racist.*

A White European participant with an excellent command of English told us:
🗨 *I sometimes get a reaction because English is not my first language. It's enough to pronounce one word wrong and people who don't speak other languages laugh at me. The Brits have very little tolerance of staff with accents. They make lots of jokes about my pronunciation and spelling- it's silly of them. They don't understand that we're trying. I cope by making a joke out of it, but it can really get to me. I have 1000 people to co- ordinate. If there are several comments a day it can really bring a person down.*

## **Comment**

This chapter has illustrated the situations in which people have experienced prejudice and discrimination. The incidents which involve overt racist language are less common and are more easily dealt with if organisations are committed to:

- Providing good training
- Ensuring managers take professional responsibility for confronting bad language and behaviour
- Prepare colleagues and managers to take action to back up staff who experience prejudice from the public

Subtle and institutional channels of discrimination are far harder for victims to fight. Prevention is much better than cure. This is why the work of promoting race equality in institutions, with an understanding of the concept of institutional racism, is so important.

In this chapter we have heard about work settings as diverse as trades, factories, uniformed services, public bodies, shops, educational and health establishments.

Another setting in which racist abuse was reported was small, proprietor-run businesses:

| Box 9 | Proprietor experience of discrimination and prejudice in the workplace |
| --- | --- |

**Case notes**

A snack bar owner experienced harassment, with the problems arising usually after pub chucking-out. In particular a very abusive guy - well known to police, had been in custody -persistently harassed the snack bar owner. The snack bar owner has suffered taunting with a screwdriver and verbal abuse. The police became acutely aware of the problem and allocated the snack bar an incident reporting 'Red Flag' so that calls from the bar would be handled immediately. Ultimately the key offender was taken to court.

**Case notes**

A taxi cab driver was assaulted by a customer who poured curry all over him in response to the events of September 11th. To halt the abuse police installed a surveillance camera in the taxi.

**Case notes**

A Kebab take-away owner experienced all-night harassment from Marine who was persistently abusive and roamed around the shop and into the property in attempts to intimidate and provoke the proprietor.

A Chinese restaurateur felt:

🗨 *We are being looked down on, people think they can walk over us.*

🗨 *One or two staff have had problems with groups of local young trouble makers - there are some people who are causing trouble for everyone. There was verbal abuse towards the staff outside the restaurant. The police got involved. I've also seen lots of fights in town because the restaurant was next door to the nightclub.*

🗨 *I know a Greek chap who owns the kebab shop by the nightclub - he gets lots of abuse from drunks*

🗨 *My reception here was terrible - lots of racism. People looked at me differently – there were only two Asian families. There was lots of swearing and pushing around at the restaurant, breaking windows and banging doors, 'why don't you go back to India'. National Front very active. But now society is very American. Very mutli-cultural. People know that and are more accepting. The changes in attitude have happened since 1985.*

One Asylum Seeker participant expressed concern for a friend:
🗨 *There is an Iranian here with a pizza/kebab shop. He's been here for 22 years but he still gets treated the same as us. Local people don't respect him - especially the young. He had to change his car three times because of vandalism motivated by people's prejudice about his accent. He gets lots of insults. If I were him I would not do business here. In London it would be OK to do business because even the English are foreigners there!*

Vulnerability in a person's own business not only threatens a person's own livelihood, but that of staff too. Proprietors of 'open-to-the-public' businesses have no idea where the next attack will come from. Foreign food businesses account for both the majority of Black and Minority Ethnic businesses and the businesses open in rural areas alongside pubs and nightclubs. They are especially vulnerable to uninhibited expressions of prejudice from the public. This adds weight to the argument made by participants in chapter 12 for measures to raise awareness and change attitudes and behaviour in society. As chapter 12 describes, this is an issue which many public bodies can affect, and is a particular opportunity for proactive race equality initiatives by Community Safety Partnerships.

🗨 *The UK is accepting culture in terms of food - curry is the number 1 food in UK food consumption! But they're not accepting the way people live. Don't take it for granted that you have an Indian restaurant and that you can get the food and that's it. There's more to it than that.*

The value of Black and Minority Ethnic businesses in Devon is described in the Prosper report *'Mapping Ethnic Minority Owned Businesses in Devon & Cornwall'*. The report found that financial turnover in Devon and Cornwall of Black and Minority Ethnic businesses amounted to £50.7 million in 1999. Foreign food outlets in particular accounted for the majority of the businesses that Prosper identified, and provide a central service to leisure and tourism consumption. But 1 in 5 of the businesses surveyed by Prosper reported incidents of racial harassment, and it was also

noted that a number of businesses perceived institutional racism from organisations who were in a position of power to impede their business development.  The report also found that strikingly few businesses were active in business membership organisations or received business support. For some types of businesses this is due to the working hours which make evening meetings difficult to attend: other isolating factors include mistrust, lack of familiarity with the systems involved, and language access problems on the part of some older proprietors. It also follows that, if businesses feel under attack from the general public, much confidence building needs to be done by public and community-business organisations to gain the trust and participation of Black and Minority Ethnic proprietors and staff.

Black and Minority Ethnic businesses are part of the economic engine in Devon and an important service and asset – whether local foreign food restaurants or major micro-technology manufacturers.  The Prosper report recommends that business support and economic development agencies should act on 8 points:

1. Raise the profile of Black and Minority Ethnic business
2. Emphasize the role of the Black and Minority Ethnic business population in the modern image and marketing of Devon
3. Develop a business support strategy that promotes Black and Minority Ethnic food and culture businesses in tourism and gains their participation in promoting the tourist sector
4. Support and develop networking initiatives for Black and Minority Ethnic businesses. (See chapter 12 to look at the variety of benefits of establishing rural networks)
5. Improve ethnic monitoring of business support
6. Ethnic awareness training for business support agencies and advisors
7. Improve communication and outreach to Black and Minority Ethnic businesses with more face to face contact and multi lingual materials

As well as recognizing the economic value of Black and Minority Ethnic businesses, specifically as a driver in tourism and leisure, Black and Minority Ethnic tourists and visitors should also be considered a part of the economy.  In the course of the research we heard of a very direct link between Black and Minority Ethnic businesses and customers in the form of a hotel owned by a Black proprietor, who marketed directly to Black urban dwellers through the Black press.  In chapter 3 we also look at how Black and Minority Ethnic people have moved to Devon, bringing their skills and finance, having been impressed during holidays here.  However,

we also heard of an example of urban Black and Minority Ethnic fear of rural racism:

> 🗨 *I had a friend [Black male 28 years old] come to visit from London. He was very frightened that he would be attacked in "redneck farmer Devon" - he found he'd lost our phone number when he arrived at the bus station and was so afraid he made straight for the police station.*

Examples like this raise the importance of positive marketing of race equality in Devon, both to attract Black and Minority Ethnic tourism and to ensure that tourists' experience is good, by working hard to change attitudes among the public by promoting cultural diversity and tackling racism.

---

### Box 10    Institutional Racism– useful definitions and background

**Key Components of Institutional Racism**

The Report of the Commission on the Future of Multi-Ethnic Britain (The Runnymede Trust, 2000 p.74) identified interacting components of "institutional racism" and these provide a useful template for any analysis:

**Indirect discrimination:** Members of the Black and Minority Ethnic communities do not receive their fair share of the benefits and resources available from an organisation and do not receive a professional, responsive and high quality service. They do receive more than their fair share of penalties and disadvantages.

**Employment practices:** Members of the Black and Minority Ethnic communities are not recruited to the extent that could be reasonably expected, or having been recruited, receive less than their fair share of promotion, training and career development opportunities.

**Occupational culture:** Racist arguments, stereotypes and assumptions go unchallenged in everyday conversation and affect how the organisation treats members of the public. There is cynicism about so-called political correctness and little or no emphasis on reducing inequalities and valuing diversity. Black and Minority Ethnic staff feel that they do not really belong in the culture of the workplace. Their world views, culture and experiences of racism are not acknowledged.

**Staffing structure:** Senior management positions are disproportionately held by White people.

**Lack of positive action:** Few or no efforts have been made to recruit black

---

and Minority Ethnic staff to senior positions or to involve them in major decision making.

**Management and leadership:** The task of addressing institutional racism is not regarded as a high priority for leaders and managers, either personally or professionally, and is seldom or never considered in mainstream decision making.

**Professional expertise:** Few members of an organisation's staff have skills in intercultural understanding and communication and in handling and defusing situations of actual or potential conflict and tension.

**Training:** Few staff have received relevant high quality training. They do not understand the concept of institutional racism and do not know what they themselves can do to address it.

**Consultation:** Organisations do not listen to, let alone seek out, the views and perceptions of Black and Minority Ethnic communities.

**Lack of information:** Organisations do not systematically examine the impact of their policies and practices in order to judge whether or not they have a negative impact on Black and Minority Ethnic communities.

### MacPherson Working Definition

MacPherson defined Institutional Racism as, "*The collective failure of an organisation to provide an appropriate and professional service for people because of their colour, culture or ethnic origin. It can be seen and detected in processes, attitudes and behaviour, which amount to discrimination through unwitting prejudice, ignorance, thoughtlessness and racist stereotyping, which disadvantages minority ethnic people.*" (Report into the Murder of Stephen Lawrence, 1999)

Two distinct strands can be identified in the definition of institutational racism. The first, by direct allusion to "the collective failure of an organisation to provide an appropriate and professional service", along with the later reference to "processes", identifies what may be termed "systemic" factors which, in their result, produce outcomes in terms of service delivery and employment which are less favourable to one ethnic group than another. The second strand, contained in the reference to *"unwitting prejudice, ignorance, thoughtlessness and racist stereotyping"* refers to pervasive, unconscious discrimination on grounds of race.

These strands are closely inter-linked, both leading to the less favourable treatment of ethnic minorities. It is almost certain that an organisation that fails to institute good race equality practices may also be an organisation in which unconscious discrimination persists. This conclusion does not provide any grounds for assuming that all (or indeed any) of the staff of a

public body is "racist" in the everyday sense of the word. What is essential is that the concept of "institutional racism" is properly and fully understood so that its manifestations may be identified and corrected. Some may find it difficult to accept that both strands of "institutional racism" might exist in an organisation made up entirely of individuals who genuinely believe that they are not racist in any way.

Ref:  Chris Taylor, Granard Associates.

This handbook and supporting tools � can be accessed at
www.DevonREC.org

## Chapter 8
## EDUCATION

### Themes in this chapter

- Racism and equality in schools
- Private schools – a note
- Curriculum as a driver for future good race relations
- Parental feedback on school and curriculum
- Minority Ethnic learning support services
  - ➢ Parental involvement
  - ➢ Support for adults
  - ➢ Support for children
- Racism and equality in Further and Higher Education

This chapter looks at how racism affects children and adults in the education sector, and also considers some of the things that need to be taken into account, in the curriculum and through good school management practice, to tackle and prevent racism. It also considers other ways in which education services can address some Black and Minority Ethnic support needs and reduce isolation.

### Racism and equality in schools

The largest topic of concern in the participant feed-back about education was related to experience of racist bullying at school and poor school preparedness to tackle racism and cope with diversity.

The issue of school bullying is a huge arena of concern. The effects are known to be gravely serious for many victims, and often hidden. Bullying is manifested in many forms and selects themes through which it is perpetrated and by which a victim can be isolated and made vulnerable. The fact that racist bullying is one form amongst many, or that a 'general' bully may pick on all sorts of victims, does not nullify the seriousness of racist bullying or the importance of paying specific attention to its compounding effect on the isolation of Black and Minority Ethnic children. In chapter 5 we looked at the multiple layers of isolation affecting many Black and Minority Ethnic people. Multiple isolation affects children too. The combination of this with experience of racist bullying in school – a setting from which there is no easy escape – can provide a cocktail of misery for victims. As described in the introduction to this book, it's

important that individual incidents are also examined in the light of the victim's vulnerability. The impact of incidents should be monitored in terms not only of how an incident is experienced in itself, but in terms of its effect on a victim's outlook on relationships, future, and the setting in which it occurred. This background information can only be obtained where schools have already developed staff's ability to understand and examine the issues and where they have gained the trust of their Black and Minority Ethnic children and parents in the school's commitment to addressing race equality and sensitive resolution of incidents of racist bullying.

The participants' provided a number of insights into the factors that can impede school action on racism and parental reporting of incidents, including :

- Lack of expertise in appraising incidents and the vulnerability profiles of victims.
- Lack of early intervention giving rise to behaviour obscuring the original problem of racism.
- Instances of failure to track the cause of such incidents and/or of poor Black and Minority Ethnic pupil behaviour to racist bullying or to vulnerability either inside or outside the school.
- Reluctance to identify bullying as racist when it has been couched in subtle terms. (Also see chapters 6 and 7.)
- Lack of training and planning about supporting Black and Minority Ethnic Pupils, promotion of diversity, and cultural sensitivity.
- Reliance upon victims to report incidents and the effects themselves, as opposed to school observation.
- Poor school response to reporting of problems.
- Loss of faith in a school's commitment to race equality, as a result of racist bullying.
- Parents' own poor experience of school-life (as children themselves or as parents).
- Parental concern about being seen to make a fuss and 'sticking out'.
- Parental and staff indecision over whether incidents are serious or not.
- Fear that school intervention will involve antagonists' parents and escalate the problem.
- The hope that bullying will go away.

A few recommendations from experience were also offered by participants as good practice including:

- One to one relationship-building between ring-leaders and victims facilitated by skilled teachers.
- Clear positions on racism and diversity taken by schools and made understood by all pupils [and parents].
- Confidence building work with new pupils [and parents], explaining how they will be valued and supported.

A number of participants, both parents and children, illustrated their sense of the presence of racism within their schools, with descriptions of incidents of bullying:

💬 *At primary school, me, a girl from Slough and a White girl from Scotland were all picked on because we were different and we planned to run away.*

💬 *Being called nigger at school. People don't call me nigger now because I'm older than them and taller. But one friend [recently] called me names when we fell out.*

💬 *My daughter has experienced one or two problems " poo face go back to where you came from". She looks more Italian than dark. The main bullying problems come from a group of kids aged 6 & 7 and came from boy who was a general bully and has a disturbed background - adopted. My daughter was shocked - she never knew she was 'abnormal'.*

💬 *We thought about coming to Devon earlier when my daughter was still at primary school. We thought about a school in Sidmouth when she was 10 and she tried it for 1 day but didn't go because the kids called her racist names. So we stayed in Cambridge.*

💬 *There were three main incidents at school. In the first year a girl from London stood on the desk in class and proposed that the school kids should get a collective together to send me back to London. I ran at her and let go at her. The teacher split us up but nothing was done about it. Harassment by this girl at the school gate continued for 2 months. She never got into trouble with the teachers. But she realised she wasn't getting anywhere because people were standing up for me. The second incident, 2 blokes and 10 girls in the toilets at school were smoking. The dinner lady came in and told me off for 'swinging on the door like a monkey' but didn't say anything to my friend who was*

> *doing the same.  I was sent to the headmaster and I tried to say I was always singled out for being told off and he did nothing but gave me a detention.  The third incident was when I was 14 and had my hair plaited for the first time with coloured beads.  The headmaster said 'what do you think you're doing walking around like a bloody Christmas tree' and I got sent home to take them out. My Mum went to school to say it's part of my religion (which it wasn't) and they have to stay in.  The head accepted. It was the first time I'd had plaits because my [adoptive ] parents never used to know what to do about my hair, so it had always been cut short.*

> 🗨 *I asked our relatives' kids how college is like regarding racism.  They said OK apart from the Head teacher who was sacked because of racism three years ago.*

We also heard of instances in which the absence of early positive intervention in racist bullying had the consequence of drawing victims into the aggression in frustrated retaliation. These cases highlighted the risk that as a result, the racist nature and implications of the source of the aggression – the racist bullying - becomes obscured, especially if witnesses or authorities only become involved at the point of retaliation.  In this way, without early intervention the experience of racism remains unresolved and its victims can be left unsupported and resentful.
Two cases illustrate how incidents can escalate:

> 🗨 *There was one incident at school involving friends of the family - one of whom hit my son with another boy and said they'd cut him to see if he had brown blood.  I told him to defend his corner and that his blood is the same as anyone else's and to hit back if necessary.  Then they were playing at our house and they hit my son and he hit one of them back with a shovel.*

An adopted participant told us:
> 🗨 *There was a 4th incident at school with a girl who called me names like 'fucking nigger' on the school stairs.  She had had a kid at the age of 14 and had had it adopted.  I said ' at least I haven't had a kid etc..' and it caused a fight. The teacher came out and the girl started crying and told on me. The Head made me apologize to the girl and refused to make her apologize to me.*

A dual heritage child recounted concern about an incident involving another child:

> 🗨 *Yesterday a boy got bullied because his parents live in Germany and he gets called Nazi and he gets very upset and he exploded yesterday and started fighting everyone. He normally just takes it quietly but this time he exploded with violence. He stood on the throat of one of the boys who tried to get involved to stop the fighting who stopped breathing and they had to call an ambulance. The teachers came in and asked what had happened and the German boy grabbed a hockey stick and hit a teacher - he was going mad. The teachers tried to restrain him. He escaped and ran away but they caught up with him. He gave one a nosebleed. I hope he won't get suspended. One teacher has been trained to deal with bullying. They've been asking other pupils what happened.*

Reported within the study were cases in which young-people's behavioural problems had not been appraised in the light of their vulnerability and isolation in the family and community setting. In these situations the schools had not taken the lead in making sure that these problems were fully understood and supported, at least at school. In one complex case a child was excluded from school. We heard of several cases in which behavioural issues manifesting from problematic trans-racial adoptions had arisen. We also heard of cases in which abuse experienced by the family in the community was impacting on children's school life and in which adult pressure was being put upon youngsters, including Minority Ethnic children, to get involved in perpetration of campaigns of racial harassment.

The expertise needed to identify race related aspects of cases is also required in the cases that don't involve racist language or which involve levels of behaviour that aren't marked out as serious enough to be considered 'incidents'. This presents a problem for both parents and school staff in assessing how positive school life is for their children, and to understand where children's exploration of issues of ethnicity and identity stops and where bullying starts:

A parent told us
> 🗨 *My kids won't say what their experience of life is like. They're making and breaking friends all the time as usual. I ask if they're getting bullied. The little one is only 7. But they're both very happy at school. The little one said 'someone called me Brownie - why?'.*

and a Minority Ethnic learning assistant noted:
> 🗨 *There are forms in schools to fill in if you feel there is racial abuse and the teachers are aware. I am aware of a little bit of abuse e.g. girls asking boy Sikhs why they have long hair, but they're not racists.*

---

In addition to the difficulty in assessing the continuum between inquisitive ignorance and victimisation, a parent also had difficulty in knowing when to intervene and make a point with a school:

> 💬 *My son had a problem at school - a state school where he was from 4 to 7 yrs old. The class size of infant school had been 16. At primary school they have 32 students - it was a shock. At break time he was circled by kids chanting 'funny Chinese'. I didn't do much because I felt it was because he had just changed school. But it happened 3 times a day by December and my son was crying and was being bullied with chanting, teasing, and looking through his work.*

For many parents, diffidence about approaching the school with their concerns, related to anxiety about being seen as difficult or 'sticking out' themselves. English as an Additional Language Advisory Teachers employed by Devon LEA confirmed the low profile of the Black and Minority Ethnic parents of their pupils at school, describing the difficulty of making contact with parents because they rarely attended Parents' Meetings or picked their children up at the School Gates. One parent described her reason for keeping a low profile around school:

> 💬 *I have felt very uncomfortable picking my children up because of reactions to my ethnicity.*

A parent of Traveller origins even described how a campaign of harassment had involved a member of school staff who took the opportunity of antagonising her at the school gates. Another parent described how a campaign of bullying against her son stopped when her White husband was made redundant and started to take their son to school.

The lack of contact between Black and Minority Ethnic parents and schools can lead to a parent-school failure to deal with racist bullying. One parent described the delay in dealing effectively with a bullying problem that was culminating in mental health impact on the child. The delay began with the parent's assumption that any problem would be automatically observed, appraised and dealt with at the school, and because the school failed to take the problem seriously enough and communicate effectively with the parents:

> 💬 *My son has been racially attacked at school. I noticed he was suffering depression - the problem had not been picked up properly in the parent/school contact book..... at first we were not keen to talk to the school - we hoped the teachers would resolve it. Then I consulted the school and governing board and logged a complaint. The school dealt with it. After the first complaint we hoped it would go away -*

> *we thought that if it wasn't deliberate bullying it would pass. By the third complaint we had seen that the effects on our child were serious. The seriousness of the problem had not been picked up in the parent/teacher contact book. We spoke to the teacher and got our son to speak to the teacher too to make the teacher aware. The teacher said our son hadn't opened up. They called in the parents of the antagonists…… I have also stopped taking my son swimming because of harassment from the boys from school……*

This example illustrates the problem of the expectation by either parents or school staff, that a victimised child should take on the responsibility of assessing, reporting, and opening up about their experience.

Another factor in parental diffidence in getting schools involved is the concern that the school might bring in the parents of the antagonist, often perceived by the victim's parents as being the source of the prejudice. Parents' worries included the fear that the school might not be able to handle the antagonists' parents, and that their involvement might lead to an escalation of the problem for the child in the school and for the whole family outside of school.

> 🗨 *At first school didn't intervene. The school wanted to bring in the parents but I felt that the kids should sort it out and find out who were friends and not and to be left to get on with it without the parents exerting their bad influence.*

> 🗨 *I find it hardest when the kids are targeted with anti-Semitism. [My youngest daughter has] had most of the racism……my daughter had anti-Semitism because the kids got it from their parents ( one of the antagonists said so). The parents told the school that they didn't want Judaism covered in the curriculum. It feels really unsafe………… and we're involved in the school so everyone knows we're Jewish. My daughter is very unnerved by the racist bullying. She says her friends won't come to the house because of the food and she wants to be 'normal'. She feels socially isolated…… I spoke to the head who wanted to drag in the parents but I felt it would make things worse…*

The lack of confidence on the part of parents that schools would be competent in dealing with racism and multi-culturalism was also a matter of concern for parents, who described instances in which their children had been treated poorly or insensitively:

💬 *[My daughter] doesn't really see herself as mixed-race. She's very clued up, popular, mature and on the School Council. However, she had an uncomfortable experience when hauled up at school assembly when an African person was visiting the School. He asked her where her father came from and she didn't know – she was very embarrassed*

💬 *All three [of my children] identify strongly as being Jewish. The youngest is the most up front Jew of the three. But she has also had more of our community history. …[..she's had most of the racism]…..the staff dismiss it saying 'well it didn't happen to your two other kids' so they blame her for it*

💬 *My 3 kids had problems at 2 schools…… The first had difficulties because at 8 years old he was told he was educationally subnormal because of a lack of English because of being taught Italian at home! But in fact he had no problem with Italian but was dyslexic in English. Consequently he didn't get taught Maths. Now he's a very successful government lawyer. Had we not been able to stand up for him the issue would have been judged as down to an Italian problem.*

💬 *[My son] then went to the nearby grammar school. It was very high cache and he didn't fit in and didn't fulfill his academic potential. He was great at basket ball and won a national hotspot competition but the school never honoured his success. The school didn't know how to handle his dynamism. They had no strategies in place for kids of ethnic backgrounds. My niece also went there and had the same problems.*

Lack of competence through lack of practice in dealing with race equality may perhaps be argued to arise because of the small Black and Minority Ethnic population size. However, the low numbers of Black and Minority Ethnic children in any one school is all the more reason to ensure that isolated pupils are supported not only reactively but proactively. Moreover, in spite of the relatively small size of the Black and Minority Ethnic pupil population, there is in fact no Academic Council in Devon which does not include Black and Minority Ethnic pupils. 67% of Devon schools do have Black and Minority Ethnic pupils and the increase in population between the 1991 and 2001 was 100%. (See chapter 3 for more demographic and schools data).

Lack of experience in dealing with incidents may also have more to do with reluctance of parents and children to report incidents to schools and the

reluctance of schools to encourage it. We've already seen some of the reasons why parents are diffident about coming forward. Reporting can also be impeded by the lack of school planning on race equality or the failure to communicate positive messages about how diversity is valued in school, how the school is ready and able to deal with racism sensitively and effectively, and that children and parents will be supported.

---

A Minority Ethnic parent told us:

🗩 *I'm a school Governor. The school is good at dealing with incidents but isn't clear in general about saying that incidents will not be tolerated - it's reactive rather than proactive. There's lots of under-reporting by kids because they hear abuse but don't always know who's said it and are afraid to be seen as 'crying wolf' too many times. I nearly resigned because the school was too frightened about having a race equality policy (which it has to have under the Race Relations Amendment Act). Staff were worried about making an issue bigger by making a fuss over it. But this is a white perspective, not a Black perspective. The school needs to know that anyone, staff or pupil who sees abuse must report it. A cleaning staff member didn't report that he was being racially abused because he didn't know how fairly he'd be treated if he complained.*

🗩 *Racist incident reporting in schools - schools don't know what to do about it - they hush it up so that they don't get labelled as racist schools.*

---

The ultimate expression of poor school-parent liaison in dealing with incidents and in poor school management of incidents or promotion of diversity, is that some parents resort to finding other schools for their children. Several parents described the hope that in city, private and other schools, with other Black and Minority Ethnic Children their children would at least find some peer support.

---

🗩 *[My son] was bullied at primary school because he was coloured and beautiful. He was the only coloured kid at school. He did make 3 or 4 lasting friends but the bullying lasted 2 years. The prejudice in the kids comes from the parents. Then he moved to another local primary school and there were 2 other Black kids there- hence the decision to move him. They have stuck together like glue.*

🗩 *We thought about changing schools and the school said they'd keep an eye on my son. I don't want them to fuss about it because I prefer to*

---

> *think positively. We looked at a local private school and my son will start there in April …. There are lots of kids of different nationalities there and the class sizes are smaller - so it's a better environment. At his old school the teachers shout all day. At the new school everyone is polite. The problem in state schools is also due to the social issues at home - some parents are not so conscientious. I would have felt happier if the old school had proposed a positive plan of action.*

By contrast, problems can be ameliorated with effective action. Some participants described incidents indicating the types of approaches that they felt were good practice:

Mum:
- 🗩 *The school checked that [my son] was OK at breaks and that he came to school. Then the kids were taken in 1 by 1 at the school without the parents, to talk to the kids about the situation. Since then things have improved. Even in one week there was a big difference. After the boys apologised to [my son], he ended up comforting them - a role reversal!*

Son:
- 🗩 *My advice to other Black kids is first tell your teacher. Don't worry if the bullies say "don't tell anyone because I'll beat you up" - you can say "if you do you're in worse trouble". Get in a room with the teachers and the kids and ask them why they're calling you names and try to get on with them. Try and get one of the group to see you're OK and they'll tell the rest of the gang or find the ringleaders and talk.*

- 🗩 *My son went to a private primary school. He got abuse from the kids. It was solved by the Headmaster doing an assembly on racism and zero tolerance. It worked well. It wouldn't work in a secondary school though.*

- 🗩 *The headmaster talked to me before I started school and it gave me a good feeling.*

- 🗩 *I would like teachers to warn bullies of the serious consequences. If I was bullied I would tell a teacher. But I don't really know what I would do as I haven't thought about it. We have a PHSE lesson that looks at peer pressure and bullying and says we should tell a teacher, nurse or counsellor confidentially. I think bullies who say things need to be told what the effect is by the teachers so they know to stop.*

One participant had questions about how race equality in Devon schools would impact on her life once she started a family:

🗨 *I would be reassured or not by the school or playgroup's reaction to me myself. I would get people's opinions and talk about the issues and see how they would respond and what's in place to deal with any eventuality. I would talk to the Head and ask 'what would happen if...' and they would need more that just something on paper. I'd need to see how people are and if they will care - not just the standard 'we have a policy and we'll follow it'. I would hope that the school wouldn't address it with the kids by a talk at assembly. I hope they would only deal with it with other kids if an incident occurred.*

## Private schools – a note

We have noted that private schools may be an option of choice for those who can afford it, influenced by the higher number of Minority Ethnic pupils that attend them and the peer-support-opportunity that offers. One of the reasons why private school Minority Ethnic populations are higher is because they attract overseas and international families. We note that more research could be done into issues affecting this section of the Black and Minority Ethnic population, partly because

a) of the presence of  Black and Minority Ethnic young people in an area having an effect upon the extent to which diversity is appreciated as visible in an area
b) of the likelihood that, if these pupils' experience is good, they will maintain an input in the area as tourists or as professionals,
c) as boarders, overseas children experience isolation from family and home culture, in addition to any other isolating factors
d) racism can affect all schools, including private schools
e) Devon has a number of private schools contributing to the prestige, employment and facilities of their locale. The investment that Black and Minority Ethnic parents and alumni contribute to these schools is by extension an asset to the local economy and infrastructure.

## Race and equality in the curriculum

### Curriculum as a driver for future good race relations

Twenty nine participants put forward suggestions about the ways in which race equality and cultural diversity could be promoted in Devon through schools. These focussed around the belief that education could start children off with positive attitudes, bringing about good race relations in

future generations.  See chapter 12 for the detail of these recommendations under 'awareness-raising in schools'.

Two of the participants' feedback helps to illustrate the importance attached to the need for race equality initiatives in the curriculum:

> 🗩 *Kids miss out here all the time because they're all white Christian and consequently they lose out and are very sheltered in education because diversity is not around them. Most kids haven't seen black children.  As a teacher I try to include multi-cultural links from the point of view of multi-ethnic Britain.  It's difficult to bring mutli-culture into education because of lack of resources and time and money.   I'd like to have an exchange - but where is the nearest multi cultural school - would just like the kids to have intercultural play.  There could be intercultural visits - a proper school-to-school link, not just a one-off session.  This would alleviate ignorance and racism in parents and in the children's heads.  Kids here never use racist language but I suspect that due to lack of exposure parents may be racist due to ignorance.  Lots of kids have never even been to the beach or to restaurants or eaten other sorts of foods.*
>
> 🗩 *The school is good but C of E.  All schools should have many topics of discussion about other religions and cultures, otherwise children will get the shock of their lives when they eventually leave Devon!*

One of the means which participants' took part in the research was workshops.  In these sessions, groups of participants had the opportunity to debate what they saw as the key inhibitor of good race relations in Devon and to formulate a strategy for addressing it.  The process involved drawing up a 'problem tree' to describe the inhibitor, its causes and effects, and then to transform the problem analysis into a solution, its inputs and outcomes. In one workshop racial abuse in schools and from the public were seen as a single concept, and a combined response from schools, the media, employment strategies, individuals' own efforts and religious support were seen as the solution.  Please refer to the web-based Appendix to this chapter (www.DevonREC.org) to look at the problem and solution analyses associated with Education, and to note the part of schools in them.

**Parental feedback on school and curriculum**

One group of participants focussed on education and the curriculum itself as their prime concern in their 'Objective Oriented Planning', (as the technique is called – the method is described in the web-based to chapter 11 www.DevonREC.org).  Their strategy shown in their analysis tree in the

web-based Appendix to this chapter (www.DevonREC.org), involves the key inputs of:

- Recruitment and selection of teachers to include race equality competencies
- Curriculum support materials designed for and used by teachers
- INSET training for teachers on use of curriculum materials and in dealing with race equality in the classroom
- Mainstreaming of race equality throughout the curriculum
- A whole-school approach to planning the promotion of race equality

The participants had clear ideas about education-related issues and were keen to express their views with the researcher. However, we have already seen in this chapter that there are a number of factors causing parental diffidence in coming forward to raise issues of concern with schools. This also applies to raising issues and making suggestions about how they can be addressed in the curriculum. One Minority Ethnic parent's comments illustrated this diffidence:

> 🗩 *My son keeps coming home talking about Jesus all the time which is a bit worrying. I don't want him to be sucked into church life. My kids say they're not being taught about other religions - they did cover Divali, but the kids didn't come back talking about it so I don't think they covered it in much detail. I haven't spoken to the school because I don't think I can approach them because I don't want to upset them - I don't have a sense of that kind of authority especially because I'm an outsider from London. Maybe I'll say something this year. I don't think I can raise it at a parents' meeting because they're more about teachers telling you how the kids have been doing.*

### Minority Ethnic learning support services

**Parental involvement in children's learning**

Given the importance that the participants have attached to the promotion of race equality in society through schools, the role of good parent-school liaison is a key factor in success for all the reasons outlined above. To build relationships the confidence and trust of parents needs to be proactively established as soon as a child joins a school, and built upon with good communication. Encouraged by the learning from this research, it is hoped that a home-school liaison post will be established under the

Devon Children's Fund in partnership with the Devon Local Education Authority's English as an Additional Language Service. The strategic objective of this post would be to enable Black and Minority Ethnic children, young people and families to be supported in improving educational achievement and social inclusion.

Based on this research, DEREC has also advocated the further support of Black and Minority Ethnic children and parents through the joint working of the English as an Additional Language (EAL) Service in schools and the Adult and Community Learning Service, who have responsibility for Black and Minority Ethnic child and adult learning respectively. These services both suffer the frustration of limited resources for their work on Black and Minority education. However, with the mutual means of extending each other's outreach to children and parents and as a key means of supporting some of the most isolated of the Black and Minority Ethnic population, their work with families and individuals deserves priority support. Projects designed to jointly meet parents and children's English as an Additional Language needs are also an important vehicle for extending the impact of the EAL and ACL services.

**Learning support for children**

The Census demographics outlined in chapter 3 show that 50% of the Black and Minority Ethnic population in Devon have migrated from overseas to the UK. This highlights the importance of the English as an Additional Language service provided in schools, through Devon County Council, for children of families migrating from overseas. The mission of the service is to provide a co-ordinated, quality service which supports schools and enables mainstream class/subject teachers and teaching assistants to identify and respond to the needs of minority ethnic pupils and those for whom English is an Additional Language (EAL). As well as supporting EAL pupils, the service also has a role of addressing school factors affecting the ability of Black and Minority Ethnic pupils to take full advantage of school life, and also looks at the educational best interests of bi-lingual pupils.

In this global village that is the world, language skills are an important asset, worth fostering for the interests of the future economy. Language is also one of the vehicles of culture and, by extension, valuing diversity means valuing language. Multi-culture and multilingual abilities are also an obvious factor in family cohesion for dual heritage families, who are becoming an increasingly important part of the local Minority Ethnic

demography (30% of the Black and Minority Ethnic population in Devon – excluding Irish and European families).

One participant described how the valuing of diversity through language was a feature of education in her home country that she would like to see extended in the UK:

> 🗨 *Life in Devon would be better if the children could have the option to have their native language taught at school for a minimum of 2 hours a week. We have that option in Sweden, so why not here? It makes it so much easier for the kids to grow up bi-lingual.*

The EAL Service in schools is making the most of limited funding to find targeted and innovative ways to address the support needs of Black and Minority Ethnic pupils. It is worth noting here some of the research and development work that the service is undertaking, taken from a recent report:

| Initiatives to support isolated bilingual learners and promote opportunities for networking |
|---|
| • Development of dual language web pages, initially Chinese. |
| • Development of dual language multimedia resources for use by children/teachers. |
| • Development of links with statistical neighbours to identify successful strategies for raising achievement of isolated learners. Project with Gloucester to link Chinese speaking children using ICT and video conferencing.  The target group is gifted and talented EAL learners.  Exchange activities in each school include:<br>- Year 3 pupils making a school video<br>- Developing multimedia resources<br>- Video conferencing |
| • Liaison with other agencies to support pupils e.g. Connexions, the Children's Fund. |
| • Development of Standing Advisory Council on Religious Education (SACRE) publication on Islam, including section on supporting Muslim children in Devon schools.  Compiled in collaboration with SACRE/ Devon Curriculum Services and the Islamic Centre, Exeter. |
| • Proposed publication, 'Stories from the Quran' - for use with Key Stage One & Two pupils/teachers. |
| • Chinese community project undertaken in Exeter with support from a Learning and Skills Council grant.  It is hoped that this activity will be developed into a family literacy project with partners e.g. Islamic |

| | |
|---|---|
| | Centre, Exeter. |
| ● | Participation in a national project to understand the lives and concerns of bi-lingual children who participate in language brokering. |
| **Whole school approach to develop home/school liaison and inclusion** | |
| ● | Family literacy project with Minority Ethnic families, 'Keeping up with the children' in partnership with Adult Basic Skills Agency. Piloted at Stoke Hill First and extended to Stoke Hill Middle school. Proposed development to include parents from other schools in liaison with the University of Exeter. |
| ● | Small scale Collaborative Action Research project at an Exeter school undertaken by Head of Service and the University of Exeter, 'Promoting Learning in a multi-ethnic school'. This project focused on aspects of the educational experience for a group of year 1 children.  The findings provided a number of useful and interesting insights.  In general the findings revealed that the parents and children interviewed were happy with most of the school experience.  In addition, parents and children seemed pleased that the school was interested in seeking their opinions. A number of themes emerged from analysis of the data.  These centred on:<br>-    assumptions about appropriate educational practice<br>-    identity and voice<br>-    home-school liaison<br>-    parents/children's suggestions for improving the educational experience of children with EAL in the school |
| ● | Development of small scale, collaborative research project: 'Effective teaching and learning across the curriculum, to focus on the improvement of written work of Minority Ethnic /EAL pupils in History, Religious Education and Science at Key Stage 2'. Good practice will be highlighted and areas for improvement identified.  This collaborative project involves 3 EAL service Advisory Teachers, Devon Advisors in History, RE and Science, English Consultants and the University of Exeter.  To date a pilot project has been undertaken at KS3.  Data is currently being analysed.  Suggested support strategies will be disseminated to all Devon schools. |
| ● | The Head of Service, EAL is undertaking qualitative research supported by Devon LEA and the University of Exeter concerning 'The experiences of isolated bilingual learners in Devon schools'. Initial findings have highlighted a number of themes, some positive |

e.g. inclusion of pupils, peer support.  However, others are a cause for concern e.g.:

➢ The research highlights that there appears to be an underlying tendency to fit bilingual children into the 'existing norm' of the dominant school culture.  This may be a subtle, possibly subconscious attitude by teachers.  Nonetheless, it promotes institutional relations of power in which discrimination may occur against pupils whose cultural, economic and or linguistic background are not the same as the dominant group.

➢ In addition, whilst racism in an overt manner may not be evident at school, negative peer attitudes may be experienced due to "differences" portrayed by bilingual children.  At one end of the continuum there are clear racist comments, but at the other end there are more subtle remarks or actions, such as 'being laughed at'. We wonder how far some of these more subtle actions are in fact being seen as part of school life, experienced by all children: Therefore perhaps they are being condoned by teachers in Devon.

➢ Bilingual children, especially EAL children in predominantly all white Devon schools may conform in order to be accepted within a school setting.  This raises several questions which need to be considered at school level:

- How far must pupils relinquish their 'natal' identity… in order to acquire/negotiate a more appropriate identity and be accepted?
- How far is the process of identity shift likely to lead to conflicts for a child
- How can teachers make this process easy and comfortable for pupils?
- How can teachers ensure that all children have opportunities to reflect their own identities and be valued as individuals?  This approach acknowledges the need for the individual needs of all pupils to be identified and supported.

The EAL schools service's own research and development is clearly an important asset in Devon, and the findings described in this book make a strong case for further funding of the service's work to ensure that its initiatives can have impact across the whole of Devon.  Many of the questions that the EAL research raises confirm that training for schools on the promotion of diversity and on dealing with racist incidents and culture is an important vehicle for helping staff to recognize, raise and develop strategies for addressing these questions with pupils and families.  The 'whole person' approach that this Handbook advocates as the basis for supporting Black and Minority Ethnic people also addresses some of the

questions raised, chapters 4 & 6 also provide useful background on the way that our participants felt about ethnicity, identity and racism.

**Learning support for adults**

Chapter 5 examined factors affecting isolation and belonging among rural Black and Minority Ethnic people. The participant data demonstrates that, for the majority of those participants whose English was described as 'poor' the effect was social exclusion from circles of friendship, participation in community life and in organised activities. 68% of the participants had leisure interests spanning a great range of outdoor and indoor leisure interests. But only 35% described being members of organisations and only 41% described taking part in community life. Membership of organisations and participation in community life, where it existed, often coincided with leisure interest.

This data indicates that there is wide opportunity for attracting Black and Minority Ethnic people to adult education and leisure activities organised through local colleges. However, the participants described a number of factors that prevent them from taking part in activities, including:

- Lack of time.
- Negative experiences of reception in the community, including racism.
- Shyness and fear of cultural and linguistic problems.

For those people whose English was described as 'poor', access to information about educational and leisure activities would also be a factor, as well as the problem of understanding and being understood.

The demographic data also indicates that with 50% of the Black and Minority Ethnic population in Devon migrating from outside the UK English language learning support is potentially a key need for many. Although we found that the majority of our participants, whilst mostly born overseas and speaking English as an Additional Language, spoke English well, many professionals within this group needed access to education for skills recognition and advancement through qualifications. And although the research indicated that the proportion of the Black and Minority Ethnic population with poor English skills is small, it noted that language support is critical for this group.

Adult English as Additional Language classes are provided and managed through a complex funding system, and delivered through FE and Community Colleges and learning centres. These classes are invaluable in supporting their students to take part in work and society. However, some

providers described difficulty in providing EAL tutors for adults in remote areas, where Adult Basis Skills classes might be used instead as a fall-back resource, in which EAL adult learners would learn with White British literacy students whose education needs are different. Alternatively some EAL adult learners have to travel prohibitive distances to access EAL classes. Providers also described the lengths which are sometimes gone to in order to make potential learners aware of the service, for example visiting newly opened restaurants and by word of mouth, when they had the time. They were also aware of less accessible potential learners working in low pay industries, like restaurants and factories.

Chapter 7 describes how the research found that 18.5% of the participants were not using work-related skills in employment. Whilst half of these spoke English fluently or as their first language, the other half had English skills described as 'good' with a fraction having a poor command of English. The research raises a number of points about the influence of English as an Additional Language in accessing the jobs market. Firstly it suggests that people who have 'good' conversational abilities still need help with language skills to the point that they can sell themselves and operate in professional and skilled work with confidence. For some this will involve:

- the development of vocabulary specific to a particular work environment
- help with translating CVs and qualification papers into forms and/or language that succeed in demonstrating skills transferability to the UK market
- practice in the UK process and culture of job application writing
- practice in interviewing for jobs.
- driving

The research also found that a number of the participants were dependent on public transport, usually because they had never learnt to drive, or had not passed a UK test and struggled with UK driver examination requirements. Chapter 1 refers to the importance of the ability to drive in rural Devon, not only to access services but also for employment, and described the difficulties involved in passing a UK driving test. Adult EAL classes could be an opportunity to provide driving-focussed vocabulary and aural practice, providing confidence and access to a key skill that can help in overcoming isolation.

Providers of the EAL Service for adults also described the difficulties that many of their students face in dealing with everyday welfare and

bureaucratic systems.  They described how in addition to teaching, they become frequently drawn beyond their remit and expertise into providing an informal welfare support service to students, helping with form filling and advocacy, and have nowhere to refer on the burden.  The Racial Equality Council aims to address this problem by seeking funding to employ community development workers who would facilitate and support networks of rural Black and Minority Ethnic people, providing referral links to specialist services, and helping service providers to be more responsive to the needs of Black and Minority Ethnic clients.  The community workers would link with EAL services in schools and adult settings to provide access to network support.  The networks would also be a means through which potential EAL adult learners could be informed of the EAL service.

Adult EAL services themselves could however address some welfare problems by ensuring that the curriculum is welfare-oriented in design.  By orienting language support towards students' employment (current and aspired), social, family and welfare concerns, the impact of language support on student's lives can be magnified.  Whilst this does infer 'tailoring' of curricula to individual student needs, the difficulty of this could be reduced by having menus of supported learning sets, pitched at different skill levels, from which students could chose.  Such materials and menus would also have to deal with the challenge of merging with the nationally prescribed EAL strand of the Adult Basic Skills curriculum.

Design of such learning sets should ideally involve students, to identify the concerns they face in engaging in English speaking life and how these would translate into curriculum support needs.  However, much is already known about student needs through their tutors, and an information partnership between tutors who have been fulfilling welfare support roles and welfare agencies who construct the language and terminology and systems that adult EAL learners contend with could be a forum for identifying curriculum content and materials.

In the course of the research we also noted a number of other learning factors requiring responsive EAL provision for adult learners:
- Some students come from backgrounds where education has not been an empowering experience.
- Many are contending with emotional and work factors that leave them mentally exhausted in addition to the strain of thinking in another language (we noted several cases of chronic depression among participants).

- Some need help with motivation to see the point of improving their English and ultimately their life chances.
- Some people have poor literacy not only in English, but also in their first language.
- Other students already speak several languages and may be skilled in learning new ones.
- Some students are be constrained/inhibited in their ability to attend classes by working hours, by temporary residence in an area (many unskilled restaurant workers stay in one place for only up to 6 – 9 months, making little contact with local services), or by rural isolation and lack of transport.
- Many students do not have the time or mental energies to take on home-work study on top of classes, and make better progress instead in supported learning settings
- Some students have British partners who are unfamiliar with what it is like to speak another language, and would benefit if their partners could be trained by the EAL adult service as 'learning assistants' to support them at home and in class.
- Some learners need creche facilities for children.

To address these factors and the life-circumstance-oriented learning objectives of students does imply 'student-centred' curricula. It also requires attention to choice of settings, class times, child care, transport and the home learning environment. The 'marketing' of EAL services also involves addressing the perceptions and concerns that potential students have about engaging with the service.

To help tutors cope with the one- to-one components of student-centred curricula and tailored conversation practice, DEREC has advocated the use of volunteer schemes in partnership with local Volunteer Bureaux. To address rural and transport exclusion from services, courses with different language objectives could also be IT based, backed up with peripatetic tutorial support on an occasional basis, and supported by local volunteers who can sit with the student and follow the IT package instructions verbally. IT packages could be available for people to run on their own P.C.s or at libraries, schools, colleges and village/town IT centres. The advantage of an IT package is that it could be provided with instructions in a variety of languages (but would only be appropriate for first-language-reading-literate and IT literate students).

The research recognizes however, that the ability of the Service to address such recommendations however, is constrained by government prescriptions on curriculum, and therefore that whilst innovation in the voluntary sector to address language support is an option, higher level debate is needed about statutory sector curriculum.

The acclaimed Olive Tree project in Exeter, which began by providing welfare-oriented EAL support to women, demonstrates the value of providing an EAL service in a setting and manner tailored to specific learner groups, such as women, especially Muslim women. There is much to learn from this project for rural applications, including the importance of using learning venues which students feel are safe and familiar, and the benefits of grouping people who have aspects of identity in common. The Olive Tree project has also expanded to provide access for its members to other forms of welfare, leisure and health services.

Similarly, the Adult EAL service could also be used as the springboard for identifying students' other learning interests, advertising and providing introductions to other Adult and Community Learning services and working in partnership with these services to make sure that they are socially inclusive and accessible.

The Racial Equality Council has also advocated that the welfare support and sign-posting burdens upon Adult EAL staff could be minimized by providing tutors with a reference/sign-posting pack in various languages which they could use to advise students and provide to students to take home (especially if it is available in appropriate languages). Such a pack could have information that is relevant pan-Devon, and also district and town/parish specific information. It could also be made available from District Councils, GPs, churches etc, and from Community Development Workers, thereby helping to improve advertising of the EAL & ACL services too. We have also noted that Councils have information about foreign national households through Council Tax and Electoral Roll registration systems. This could be an opportunity in principle to distribute multi-lingual welcome packs. However, current data protection regulations require that personal information such as this should only be used for the purpose for which it has been stated and permission obtained from the data subject. Hence some means of complying with these regulations would need to be found to enable the address information arising from these registrations to be used to distribute welcome packs.

The use of a welcome pack by Adult EAL tutors could also be supported by having occasional forum meetings between the EAL tutors, their co-

ordinators and with the key support agencies (DEREC, CABx, Social Services, Victim Support, Benefits Agency etc.) who are sign-posted in the pack. Such Forum meetings could enable the tutors to identify further issues which need to be covered in the pack, and would enable the agencies to brief the tutors on the services which the pack describes. Amendments and new editions of the packs could also be distributed through such forum. The pack would be useful for EAL tutors of both adult and school students.

Issues of widening the participation in education opportunities were raised in particular regarding the needs of potential learners who do not even imagine that the opportunity of adult education could be open to them. Devon is home to many Black and Minority Ethnic people working in low pay industries, without access to the opportunity of moving into more financially secure or skilled work. From participants and service providers we heard how many of these people are servicing the local leisure (restaurants) and food industries (meat, vegetable and fruit factories and farms) but are unsure of their entitlement to education opportunities, and remain locked into low incomes. We heard from participants about the insecurity that this provides especially for restaurant workers:

> 🗨 *The other Bengali staff at the restaurants didn't have a clue about outside studies. Most of the staff work for 6 -9 months in an area then move on. Opportunities for Indian restaurant staff depend partly on the staff and their motivation - some are only here for a short time.*

Concern was raised about the needs of non-family workers in larger restaurants who are essentially a mobile population within the UK, and who consequently don't have access to the facilities that the settled population have and don't establish families. Issues were raised about their lack of engagement with services external to the business, their dependence on their English speaking bosses for contact with the world outside the restaurant, and their dependence on the job for housing. Concerns were also raised for these workers as a future generation of elderly people, with limited English and without family support. Access to English language support and skills training in a format that could engage with them through their place of work, yet without threatening the interest of employers, would clearly address some problems otherwise looming in the future.

An Asian restaurateur explained:
> 🗨 *Most Indian restaurant staff work 6 - 9 months then move on, often for more comfort or pay or atmosphere or accommodation. After a few years most want their own business - so they need lots of experience.*

> *Moving is a way of getting promotion.  People also move for better accommodation because there is mostly 2 or 3 people per room.  Some bosses are tight and don't put on the central heating - so lots of people move on for central heating and hot water.  New businesses have learnt from the past and now provide TV etc. and treat staff better.  There are also bonuses.  Staff eat in the kitchen restaurant.  Staff move so often they can't make local friends.  So they form friendships with other staff and follow each other to jobs.   My staff don't speak English. Most businesses only have 1 or 2 waiters who speak good English.  People who speak good English won't be kitchen assistants.  I encourage staff to learn English.  My cousin is the chef and goes to Exeter college once a week.  I set up the course for him….*

A Chinese participant also gave some insight into the situation of other Chinese restaurant workers:

> 💬 *There are many types of Chinese: (but Peking and Shanghai don't come to the UK).  Malaysian, Hong Kong new territories (mostly takeaway people); China mainland (refugees).  They have hard life and some arrive illegally.  They keep very quiet.  They have to pay lots to the gangs and send money back to China to help the family pay for their transport.  They come because education is very poor in China and they think the UK is heaven and there is chance to have better life.  But in practice life in the UK for them is very hard.  The snake heads could be government officer in China and in UK snake heads could be English or Chinese. People in the restaurant might think I'm government and don't want anything in black and white.  They're worried I'll tell things about them to other people.  Chinese restaurant people usually work as a family.  Their friends and family move around restaurants for more money.  Family are kept on for longer periods.  They also have accommodation for staff but it is very crowded.  Some of the itinerant workers go to English classes.  Lots don't want to go to English though.  They hear about it by word of mouth.  Most people are not religious.  People are satisfied if they have a job - it's much better than China where there's so much unemployment. They have freedom here - you can even shout 'Tony Blair is rubbish'.*

A housing development worker working with the Chinese population in Manchester and Plymouth confirmed these issues and also described concerns for the future elderly generation of many people who currently run small family businesses and rely on their British born children for

communication with the world outside the restaurant. The worker described how the offspring in these families are now typically encouraged to pursue careers outside the restaurant trade, with the inevitable movement away from the family home and business, and breakdown in close knit family ties. The worker described how many of these ageing people are beginning to find the prospect of old age a challenge because of language isolation, and because life up until the point of retirement has been consumed by work to the exclusion of forming supportive links in the local community. The worker also described how older people are preferring to stay in the South of the UK, rather than rejoining larger communities in the North. A housing project in Plymouth has been established to meet some of these needs of retired Chinese elderly.

Hence language support and skills development is in principle an unmet need for many members of the restaurant community. In particular it raises issues for education initiatives for itinerant workers and the elderly, and preventative action to mitigate problems for future elderly. However, the nature of restaurant employee status and the self-containment among family businesses (many of whom do not even network between themselves because of business competition) pose challenges to outreach and inclusion. Experience elsewhere in the UK suggests that outreach success is improved with the support of co-lingual outreach and development workers, but that success of this can be impeded by the strength of feeling about privacy and culturally rooted fear of government and authority.

## Racism and equality in Further and Higher Education (FE & HE)

Three areas of concern were flagged up by adult students participating in the research, and education providers:
- Difficulties faced by students recruited to FE and HE courses from overseas .
- Racism experienced by staff and students, from other students and from institutions of education.

Devon has a number of HE and FE courses attracting students from overseas to rural colleges. Education institutions have a number of motives in attracting overseas students, among them some relating to the international interests a college has in its field of expertise, and some relating to the institutions' own economic interests. Most institutions have international officers looking after the interests of overseas students. However, we heard from some staff about the difficulty they had in interesting students in social activities they organised. At the same time,

we heard from many students about feelings of loneliness, culture shock and feelings of alienation from the mainstream student culture.

Several students described the financial commitment they had made to covering the cost of study in the UK and their surprise at the cost of living on top of that. They also described other factors that added to their difficulty of coping with study in a foreign culture and language, including:

- degrees of fear and concern about the level of drunken behaviour among British students
- having to 'explain who they are' to other students in response to reactions to their ethnicity
- the burden of operating in another language not only for study but for all aspects of everyday life
- finding their way around everyday services and transport
- lack of familiar cultural leisure activity
- difficulty in making friends
- loneliness away from friends and family (the usual sources of support) in their home country
- prohibitive costs involved in returning home for holidays
- overall pressure of study

> 🎤 *Bad things about living here include high pressure of study. Things that would improve life at the college would include language support and more information of the life in Devon.*

In one workshop with students, the group selected loneliness as their main concern and the impact it had on their studies. For them, help with maintaining contact with family, especially those students with limited financial means, and provision of opportunities to make friends and reduce loneliness during vacations were unmet needs.

The challenge of study is an onerous one for foreign students for all the above reasons. Some students indicated that life was made easier if they lived with supportive host families rather than on campus. However a student support officer at one college described the difficulty the college experienced in finding enough hosts.

The varied language ability of some students was also clearly an important factor in the level of isolation and the burden of study they experienced. A number of students selected translated questionnaires (as opposed to English ones) although they responded in written English, and others struggled with conversation in workshops.

Given that any level of English speaking skill other than fluency will put a strain on any student, it follows that language support must be a key part of the education package in recruitment from overseas.  Similarly, just as thinking in English creates tiredness inhibitors to study (as well as varied degrees of difficulty in understanding) other mental welfare factors also have a major impact on ability to study and need support.

> 🗨 *Most of the students here are from farms and not used to foreign people and don't make friends with us - I try to make friends but they don't respond.  This is the main problem here.*

Isolation, vulnerability and depression are also consequences of the experience of racial prejudice, to which overseas students are especially vulnerable.  Moreover, overseas students whose English may not stretch to colloquial interpretation and who feel themselves outsiders, are less likely to report experiences of prejudice, general hostility and unwelcome reactions from other students.  We heard of student experience of prejudice ranging from rude and rowdy behaviour, to the feeling that British students were not interested in friendship with foreign students, to the extreme of vicious campaigns of overt racist intimidation.  One Minority Ethnic staff member described how one case had been effectively dealt with by the student Union, but also described how Black and Minority Ethnic tutors had felt unable to make much difference to another case of serious student racism and the institutional frustrations it threw up for them:

> 🗨 *This is the first time [i.e. as a result of the research] that my[ BME] colleague and I have talked about race matters – whether our own experiences or those of our students.  The Tutor system prevents us from dealing with students who are tutees of other staff.  Staff have also been told by the University not to take action on student's behalf or counsel them because we are not professionally trained for this.  The University has a race equality policy but no one is willing to stick their neck out enough to implement it when it comes to a case.*

When study is made open to foreign national students, it follows that pastoral planning should be part of the deal:  Students bring their commitment to learning and their cash, education establishments provide the teaching and a supportive learning environment.  An imbalance in that compact is a formula for setting students up for failure.  The factors described above demonstrate the student needs that a supportive learning environment should meet.  Broadly speaking these elements fall under the headings of language support, emotional wellbeing and anti-racism

measures.  An understanding of institutional racism (see chapter 7) is also critical to ensuring that these three areas are effectively addressed.

The argument for providing language support to students recruited from overseas, also applies to resident EAL speakers.  Chapter 3 demonstrates that half of the Black and Minority Ethnic population in Devon have migrated from overseas.  If this is the case, language is bound to be a study support issue, even if a person's ability to speak conversational English is 'good'.  The language skills involved in study extend beyond the skills required of one-to-one conversation which is more responsive to both parties' communication needs.  Study involves extended listening and speed writing skills, use of technical jargon, and ability to work with peers and staff who will use colloquial English, often with varied regional accents. Hence language support needs should be checked for resident students too.

A case-worker described the frustration of one student who suffered career and financial setbacks as the result of a University's failure to assess language needs:

> 🗩 *They failed her in January.  We think she failed because they didn't support her/ didn't give her a chance - so she's off the course.  English ability was cited as a problem [with the University], but no-one ever raised this with the student until she was failed.  The student has paid for the course out of her own money.*

The language and cultural diversity that is part of Britain's multi-ethnic demography and economy inevitably shapes the profile of the student population.  Services, including education, that don't make provision for diversity can effectively exclude potential learners or set them up to fail.  We heard of one case of a college's resistance to widening participation described by a case-worker:

> *She applied to do a computer course.  She filled in the application form, was interviewed and told that she wasn't accepted on course because she 'wouldn't fit in' (not because there was a waiting list, which was main official reason later given).*

We heard from several students who indeed felt they didn't fit into mainstream culture among their peers, which serves to underline the importance of education establishments' Duty under the Race Relations Amendment Act (2000) to promote race equality in the learning environment, among staff and students.

## **Appendicies**

This handbook and supporting tools � can be accessed at
www.DevonREC.org

The Appendix to this Chapter is web-based and includes the Participants'
problem analyses and recommendations for:

- Racism on the street and in school
- The impact of loneliness and isolation for overseas students
- Promoting race equality in education

# Chapter 9
# FAITH & RELIGION

## Themes in this chapter

- Minority Ethnic access to places of communal prayer/worship and education and Faith-based communities, of all Faiths
- Factors of age and rural ethnic isolation making religious identity and heritage an issue of heightened importance
- Fear of racist prejudice and religious intolerance having impact on community relations and expression of identity
- Impact of Christianity on the religious culture of rural life, education and institutions
- Inter-faith tensions
- Role of Faith centres in addressing the support needs of isolated people

In the course of this research, we have talked to participants from a number of Faiths and religious denominations. We compiled an extensive list of Faith organisations in Devon, and made efforts to contact all of them. The table below shows that the majority of those who responded to the question about religion ascribed to a Faith. Many of these, however, stated their religious identity more in cultural terms or described their involvement with their Faith group as 'lapsed'. We'll look at some of the reasons for this within the discussion below. Issues of religion and identity are also revealed in the participants' descriptions of the way they define their ethnic identity, in chapter 4.

Faith and religion were raised as a point of concern by around 35% of the participants (excluding complainant aid cases), from a number of perspectives. The points raised ranged over a number of issues, around which the structure for the contents of this chapter was formed.

**Table 9.1**

| The religious background of the research participants | | | | |
|---|---|---|---|---|
| **Religion** | **Women** | **Men** | **Sex not stated** | **Totals** |
| **Buddhist** | 3 | 1 | 0 | **4** |
| **Chinese** | 2 | 2 | 1 | **5** |
| **Christian** | | | | **36** |
| | 6 | 8 | 0 | 14 |
| Anglican | 1 | 0 | 0 | 1 |
| Protestant | 2 | 1 | 0 | 3 |
| Church of England | 1 | 2 | 0 | 3 |
| Roman Catholic | 8 | 5 | 0 | 13 |
| Roman Catholic by Baptism but non-believer | 1 | 0 | 0 | 1 |
| Armenian Church | 0 | 1 | 0 | 1 |
| **Hindu** | 1 | 2 | 0 | **3** |
| Hindu but happy to go to Church or Mosque | 0 | 1 | 0 | **1** |
| **Jewish** | | | | **6** |
| | 3 | 1 | 0 | 4 |
| Aethist but culturally Jewish | 1 | 0 | 0 | 1 |
| Jewish –secular | 1 | 0 | 0 | 1 |
| **Jehovah's Witness** | 3 | 0 | 0 | **3** |
| **Muslim** | | | | **16** |
| | 6 | 8 | 1 | 15 |
| Muslim – not practicing | 0 | 1 | 0 | 1 |
| **Rastafarian** | 0 | 1 | 0 | **1** |
| **Sikh** | 1 | 3 | 0 | **4** |
| Sikh and Buddhist | 1 | 0 | 0 | **1** |
| Not stated | 30 | 29 | 2 | **59** |
| None | 18 | 10 | 0 | **30** |

| Table 9.2 Devon County Religion by Ethnicity. | All People | Christian | Buddhist | Hindu | Jewish | Muslim | Sikh | Any other religion | No religion | Not stated |
|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|
| ALL PEOPLE | 704486 | 527209 | 1693 | 335 | 650 | 1496 | 173 | 2808 | 114498 | 55624 |
| White | 696587 | 523988 | 1324 | 62 | 631 | 472 | 48 | 2732 | 112540 | 54790 |
| British | 683236 | 515041 | 1229 | 54 | 544 | 236 | 45 | 2571 | 109995 | 53521 |
| Irish | 3383 | 2659 | 25 | - | 3 | 9 | 3 | 33 | 358 | 293 |
| Other White | 9968 | 6288 | 70 | 8 | 84 | 227 | - | 128 | 2187 | 976 |
| Mixed | 3350 | 1758 | 33 | 10 | 13 | 193 | 6 | 32 | 883 | 422 |
| White & Black Caribbean | 818 | 496 | - | 3 | 3 | 5 | - | 7 | 202 | 102 |
| White & Black African | 359 | 204 | 4 | - | - | 29 | - | 3 | 86 | 33 |
| White & Asian | 1206 | 611 | 16 | 7 | 4 | 75 | 6 | 12 | 331 | 144 |
| Other Mixed | 967 | 447 | 13 | - | 6 | 84 | - | 10 | 264 | 143 |
| Asian | 1548 | 278 | 32 | 255 | - | 619 | 116 | 19 | 124 | 105 |
| Indian | 655 | 131 | 6 | 232 | - | 51 | 116 | 10 | 64 | 45 |
| Pakistani | 176 | 47 | - | - | - | 110 | - | - | 3 | 16 |
| Bangladeshi | 281 | 13 | - | - | - | 247 | - | - | 9 | 12 |
| Other Asian | 436 | 87 | 26 | 23 | - | 211 | - | 9 | 48 | 32 |
| Black or Black British | 824 | 549 | 6 | 4 | 3 | 65 | - | 7 | 76 | 114 |
| Black Caribbean | 285 | 187 | 3 | 4 | - | 12 | - | 4 | 39 | 36 |
| Black African | 398 | 292 | - | - | 3 | 42 | - | - | 20 | 41 |
| Other Black | 141 | 70 | 3 | - | - | 11 | - | 3 | 17 | 37 |
| Chinese | 1328 | 291 | 146 | - | - | - | - | 7 | 753 | 131 |
| Other Ethnic Group | 849 | 345 | 152 | 4 | 3 | 147 | 3 | 11 | 122 | 62 |

The 2001 Census figures show that religion plays a key part in the identity of 67% of the Black and Minority Ethnic population (including Europeans).

## Minority Ethnic access to places of communal prayer/worship and to Faith-based communities

For some Faith groups, the ability to establish rural centres has been a function of their ability to network and of the presence of a critical mass of local people sufficient to establish a formal and accessible religious centre and to afford staffing and administration.

Muslims in northern Devon and southern Devon, have been successful in networking, partly because of the ability to find each other either through 'Indian' restaurants (as owners, employees and customers) and partly because of their proximity as employees in a specific service – for example at North Devon hospital. However, their ability to establish Mosques and to afford the ministry of an Imam is limited by the funds that they are able to raise from their own pockets and from Islamic benefactors/foundations. The difficulty in providing a communal space has an impact on the number of people who can physically come together for prayer, on the accessibility of the centre for women and on the education service that can be provided for children. It also has an impact on the ability of people to enjoy cultural as well as religious communal celebration of key events in the religious calendar which in turn, impact on individuals' sense of cultural expression and identity, and a particular impact on the religious education of children.

Some Ahmadiyya Muslims have established a network in south Devon, attracting a small group of individuals from around the region, with support from the Ahmadiyya network around the UK.

In central and southern Devon, volunteers of the Jewish community have been successful in networking through public advertising – sometimes at risk to personal safety in the face of Anti-Semitism - and through the Synagogue, and have attracted particular interest from secular Jews wishing to explore their Jewish identity.

The Baha'is, by virtue of their organisational structure, have networks and rural representatives around Devon, and their community includes Minority Ethnic people from around the world, including people whose family background reflect the Faith's Persian origins as well as White British members of the Faith.

The small Sikh community in Exeter has had links with rural Sikhs, but some of these contacts have dissolved because of distance and because of assimilation being used as a strategy for coping with community relations in rural areas. The small size and profile of the community has also limited its ability to reach Sikhs newly arriving in rural Devon.

There are a number of Buddhist communities in Devon attracting people inside and outside Devon.  However, the communities that we succeeded in speaking to attracted mostly White British Buddhists rather than Minority Ethnic local people.

The Eastern Orthodox Church in Exeter described how it was aware that there are many Eastern Europeans in Devon and the representative noted that whilst the Church is a key support service for religious Eastern Europeans, the Church and it's people have trouble finding each other.

Participants of other world Faiths also noted the absence of places of communal gathering, and spoke about the way in which they practice their Faith at home: some spoke of pursuing their spirituality through participation in other Faiths' activities.

Table 9.2 above shows that 41% of Devon's Black and Minority Ethnic population (not including Irish and European people) are Christian.  (Of those Black and Minority Ethnic people who stated a religious identity two thirds were Christian.)  This indicates that the Christian Churches have a significant role to play in addressing the pastoral and spiritual concerns of a majority of the religious Black and Minority Ethnic population, and in providing a link with the community.  However, as we will see later in this chapter (in the section *Role of Faith centres in addressing the support needs of isolated people,)* this research indicates that many people may feel excluded from or on the margins of their Christian community.  This is also indicated by the experience this research had in reaching out to Black and Minority Ethnic people through the Churches.  Every church under the membership of the Council of Churches Together in Devon was sent information about the research and asked to distribute contact information to Black and Minority Ethnic parishioners.  We had only one successful line of contact through this outreach, and had several replies from clergy who indicated that they didn't think there were many Black and Minority Ethnic people in Devon congregations.

---

**The need for local centres in rural Districts for prayer and for religious education for Muslim children.**

🗩 *At the Mosque we would like to know more about the extent of the Muslim population in the rural areas.*

🗩 *When moved in with relatives in south Devon I taught the kids Koran and Arabic as there was no Mosque in the area.  I want to set up a mosque here in [the District].  Teaching the Koran changed me to be a better person - I stopped clubbing and discoing.  Parents can't*

---

*teach their own kids religion. They need a religious teacher. I'd like a Mosque for the children*

🗨 *Exeter has a Mosque. It started with a small house then joined several houses together then they built the main Mosque…. But there is a crisis for local Muslims who need to pray. Last year local staff at restaurants paid for an Imam from London to cover the big Eid month. We need someone for Friday prayer. At present a person from [North Devon] is acting as Imam. We are using a house… - we use the lounge as the prayer room. There isn't enough space. A Mosque would solve the problem. I and other Muslims and business people would help to fund it, but we need extra money and planning permission from the Council. Each person would contribute £1000 but that's not enough together, and some can't pay. I spoke to a local Arab Doctor to get some more money from Saudi Arabia. The Council seem to like the idea but nothing's official……. The difficulty is knowing which steps to take and who to approach and then you can negotiate. The Council would be delighted to pass planning permission but how do we get a grant?*

🗨 *50 or 60 people pray together in Barnstaple. In total there are around 150 Muslim people here including women and children. In Ilfracombe there are about 30 - 40 praying and 30 - 40 in Bideford. The women pray at home, but if we had the facilities here we could see them praying too. I would like the kids to get a Muslim education.*

🗨 *There are no places for worship here as we are a minority [Muslim].*

🗨 *I am a Muslim but pray at home – I do not attend Mosque. This is because Exeter is too far.*

🗨 *The previous owner of my business wanted to move to London because he wanted his kids to follow the Muslim religion and Exeter was too far to go.*

🗨 *Life would be better if we had a Mosque built here - lots of Muslim peoples live here.*

🗨 *It's hard to be a Muslim here because you're supposed to pray 5 times a day and that's not accommodated for ……*

🗨 *In rural areas it's a disadvantage because of language and religion. We can't celebrate Eid on our own just being the family -it's not the same - no Mosque no prayer. I'm missing the process of discipline to worship…..*

🗨 *Isolation in rural areas means it's impossible to sow seeds in the kids minds of importance of religion. But it may be OK just that they're brought up to respect religion.*

- **Denominational and cultural issues affecting access to Faith communities.**

The denominational issue also cut across several Faiths and is predicated on the fact that the diversity of traditions and denominations *within* Faiths among the Black and Minority Ethnic population is wider than the diversity of the religious facilities existing in a rural area. The consequence is that some people feel that their Faith needs are not accommodated, or that their particular religious identity would be compromised by involvement with another tradition. Others also were unsure of the welcome that would be extended to them by other denominations of their Faith community. For example, we heard from Shia and Sunni Muslims and from Muslims of different nationalities and with different cultural outlooks who felt that these differences affected their decisions about whether they could comfortably feel part of a Faith community. We also heard from Jewish participants about the distances that some people would have to travel outside of Devon in order to attend a reform synagogue. We also heard from Christians of various traditions from Eastern and Northern Europe about their sense of distance from opportunities to worship within their denominational tradition, and their lack of identity with Protestant or Catholic traditions in Britain. And we heard from Christians who felt that the culture of Christian worship in their denominational churches in Devon was so far removed from the culture of worship they experienced in their countries of origin, or in more culturally diverse parts of the UK, that they felt alienated.

**Issues of diversity and conformity**

🗨 *I am a Muslim but pray at home – I do not attend Mosque. This is because Exeter is too far. It's also because I feel more British than Asian because of my upbringing – I am not a typical Asian. I was treated as British in Pakistan. I would prefer a Mosque nearby.. But I have one fear: that people might set me apart because people would feel that I'm not part of them. I'm worried about prejudice*

*against the children.  And I'm worried that attendance at Mosque may put pressure on the girls to change their way of life – the girls have to live their lives <u>here</u>.  I am worried about Mullahs misinterpreting things for political purposes.*

🗨 *My social training comes from my Islamic culture.  Violence is not Islam.  The principle is all about concern for others and concern for neighbours.  The war on terrorism affects me.  Most people in Exeter are Sunni.  I am Shia. As soon as I say that everyone - even the Sunni Muslims relate me to Iran. I even feel that the Sunni people in Exeter link me to Hammass.  I have to educate my fellow Muslims.*

🗨 *People can compromise on dress now.  You can wear skirts as long as you are covered properly*

🗨 *I'm worried people think I'm not a proper Muslim because I don't wear Hijab.  For example I went to the Exeter Mosque in a dress and a scarf.  A woman and her daughter said I wasn't Muslim because I was not in Hijab. I don't feel comfortable with Arabs.  They say I shouldn't wear make-up.  Hijab is cultural.  I pray at home but I don't show off my religion.  My husband asked me to go to an Islamic Centre with him in London.  I wasn't wearing a long, long dress.  The other women were in total coverage.  Everyone looked at me like a total alien.  It made me very nervous.  I was so glad to get out of the Mosque.  It was very frightening.*

🗨 *The culture of Mosque depends on the members.*

---

**Issues to be addressed for Protestants from other countries**

🗨 *I have my faith but I don't attend church.  But there is a Swedish Church in London and they do annual visits to Devon.  They came to [town]  in June.*

🗨 *I am Protestant.  I don't know if there is any Protestant church here. [Didn't know that Church of England is Protestant.]*

**Diversity of Jewish traditions**

🗨 *Exeter Synagogue very small – only 53 families – more women than men.  Most people go to Bournemouth Reformed Synagogue but it's far away.*

---

**Factors of age and ethnic isolation making religious identity and heritage an issue of heightened importance.**

Some participants described how for them and their parents, cultural and religious identity was becoming more important with age. Issues around illness, death and burial were natural causes for concentrating the mind on religious needs in old age. Similarly, the birth of children and rites of passage were also important for people in cultural and/or religious terms. The issues of occupation in retirement and the lack of a business or job to take up one's time also present a challenge in terms of deciding what next to do with life: a decision in which the questions 'who am I?' and 'who do I want to spend my time with?' play a part for most people. We also know from work with the elderly in reminiscence therapy of the natural need in old age to reflect on the past and re-establish symbolic markers in life. The degree to which conversation is of particular importance both as a pastime and a factor in emotional wellbeing, indicates the need for opportunities to share life experience and outlook (both of which are culturally shaped) as basis for satisfying dialogue. The issue of age is relevant to the Minority Ethnic population who will grow old here, and to the elderly and newly retired who are coming here to be closer to younger family members, (who may not share the religious heritage of the parents). With religion being a key marker in many people's ethnic identity, the role of religion and religious communities in addressing the needs of children and the elderly is central.

Jewish and Muslim participants in particular, reported how the impact of being surrounded by the markers of Christian influence in British rural culture served to provide a heightened self awareness of their own religious identity and/or cultural heritage. Some participants noted how this sensitisation was a function of the lack of cultural diversity in rural areas and the cultural dominance of the Church in rural infrastructure.

---

**Secular needs among people of Jewish identity**

🗩 *We need a deli that stocks Jewish food and social and cultural support for the secular Jewish community.*

🗩 *I've joined the synagogue just so that I can be buried according to Jewish law. I went once to the Synagogue but I felt uncomfortable because I'm not religious.*

---

**Age, rurality and religious isolation acting to define ethnic identity in religious terms**

● *My parents were orthodox but I very rarely went to synagogue. There was no pressure to get involved religiously. Here in Devon we created our own Jewish environment. It was very liberating and exciting….. When I go to London I enjoy the food and the cultural events but I feel my sense of Jewishness is more meaningful in Devon. Lots of Jews in London keep moving from synagogue to synagogue without settling. You don't get orthodox Jews in Devon because the people who come here want to be more open minded. People are triggered to feel more Jewish when they're here because of death, children's births and schooling and because you're surrounded by this sea of Protestantism. The synagogue is very old – the second oldest Ashkenazi synagogue in the UK - it's a focus for the Devon Jewish community - the community wouldn't exist without it. We met a Jew who had kids with a non Jew - which was the trigger for his Jewishness and then it attracted 'fringe' Jews (artists and all sorts). This lead to the creation of a Jewish community of those from the religious fringes. The group decided to become public and advertised an event at the University through posters but we were unexpectedly over-run by many many Jews who came out of the woodwork (well over 50 people). ….We can attract up to 100 people - lots of whom have non Jewish partners. The Minister for small communities says there's a Jew in each village. There were 8 Jewish kids at a local secondary school at one time.*

● *I'm English and German and a little bit Jewish. …Only now after 60 years of living everywhere have I psychologically realised the enormity of the event of being thrown out of Germany, because I was totally identified with being a German girl. The in the UK I was totally identified with being a WAAF (Women's Auxiliary Air Force). But as time went on I became less and less identified with any of the places that I lived in….. I need friendship with individuals with whom I have something in common to feel a sense of identity in a place.*

● *My sense of ethnicity is coming out now. I am English, not Asian. But I am becoming more Asian as I am getting older – more religious….The house now looks more Asian or Islamic because of the pictures of Mecca and because of the entrance hall.*

---

## Impact of Christianity on the religious culture of rural life and institutions

In particular, the extent to which Christianity is intertwined with rural primary schooling and village activities was described as a source of exclusion from community life and a cause for concern in the education and religious development of children. The dominance of Anglicised Christianity as a cultural and moral point of reference in education, youth and community facilities may not be experienced as overt by many secular people or by people within the Churches. But it was seen as pervasive by several participants, who felt excluded by it from participation in village life or from becoming part of the community identity.

---

**Church influence on rural life and education, and impact on people of other Faiths**

🗨 *Less emphasis on the church - i.e C of E and Methodist Church and C of E school - would help to improve life.* [Jewish participant]

🗨 *The school is good but C of E.* [Muslim participant]

🗨 *There are lots of local activities based around the church – the local Guildswomen, the Mother's Union, the Women's Institute, but I can't join because I'm Jewish.*

🗨 *I don't feel like I've been accepted in the community in the sheltered housing. I have made it plain that I'm Jewish to stop Anti-Semitism. I don't feel part of the community because I moved here late in life and I don't have anything in common with the residents - there's nothing to talk about. All the people talk about is illness. The conversation in the lounge is all about the Methodist Church and I feel really out of it.*

🗨 *My son keeps coming home talking about Jesus all the time which is a bit worrying. I don't want him to be sucked into church life. My kids say they're not being taught about other religions - they did cover Divali, but the kids didn't come back talking about it so I don't think they covered it in much detail.* [Asian British participant, no Faith group]

🗨 *Pictures of Jesus are too Europeanized* [Arab participant]

---

## Fear of racist prejudice and religious intolerance having impact on community relations and expression of identity

The sense of ethnic and religious isolation and exposure in rural communities is confirmed and increased for those people who experienced racism and prejudice within their own local community, and whose ethnic identity was very much shaped by religious identity. In chapter 6 we see that the majority of participants were subject to hostility in particular in public, neighbourhood and education settings. Some Jewish participants talked about responding to this experience and to awareness of religiously intolerant attitudes by keeping their religious identity concealed, with the attendant feeling of having identity driven underground. In chapter 6 we also see how many people cope with racism by trying to conform to cultural norms and codes in order to be seen to fit in, and not as 'different'. For some participants the outcome is also the need not to be seen to practice a religion and not to attend a place of worship for fear of attracting animosity - A kind of attempt to lose colour in the public eye by losing the cultural markers of religion.

---

**Racial prejudice experienced from Churches**

🗨 *I once went to church in [the village] but during all the service the priest stared at me as if to say 'who is this stranger'. I worried I smelled or had a dirty mouth - I was very embarrassed. The Priest didn't come and talk to me. It made me feel very uncomfortable. It put me off going top church ever again.*

🗨 *A licensed preacher refuses to use our names, and accused us at a local community function of "being professional scroungers".*

**Impact of prejudice on expression of identity**

🗨 *Practicing my Faith [Jewish] is demanding because of reactions to it. I rarely tell people about my being Jewish. Anti-Semitism is alive and well in Devon.*

🗨 *I would not reveal my religion to my neighbours who I believe are racist/ Anti-Semitic and they do tend to be keen church goers!!*

---

## Inter- and intra- faith tensions

We have already noted that tensions that were experienced by participants living in villages whose infrastructure was perceived as exclusively Christian in religious outlook, and by people experiencing inter-cultural friction within their Faith groups.  In addition, the research also picked up on inter-faith tensions and attitudes of inter-religious intolerance.  The way in which people interpreted the conflict in the Middle East was a source of this tension, as were understandings of religious texts such as the Bible and the Koran.  One participant also described the sense of cultural assault experienced by a friend when Christians attempted to use a process of interfaith dialogue as an opportunity for making conversions.

The comments which flagged inter-religious prejudice up, most of which are not printed here, raise questions for all Faith organisations – in terms of developing good race relations among people of different cultures *within* their Faith community, and in terms of building good race relations *between* people of different Faiths.  Some participants also commented on the difficulty of overcoming inter-religious tensions, and their fear of challenging religious peers when they hear intolerant or inflammatory comments, because of their fear of having their commitment to their cultural identity challenged.

Race relations work within Faiths is also an important ingredient for the overall external promotion of race equality in wider society:

- As argued in chapter 12 most race equality work needs to happen through multi-cultural networks if it is to be viable.  This work will therefore depend on such networks being able to cope with religious diversity within the group dynamic.

- Although it is unreasonable, the Minority Ethnic population is often popularly perceived as a single entity and, in the face of much insensitivity to race equality in Devon, the Minority Ethnic population needs to be able to work harmoniously in order to engage service providers' positive attention.

- With a large captive audience, the Christian Churches in the UK have an important opportunity to convey the values and principles of racial equality and cultural diversity to their congregations.  The impact they could have on changing and leading public attitudes could be immense. However, the issues touched upon in this research indicate the need for Churches to examine the unwitting messages that their cultural roles in the community communicate.

**Interfaith tensions and relationships**

💬 *I used to be Muslim. It was a big argument at the time of my marriage that my husband was Christian. So we both decided to give up our religions. Religion is the biggest argument worldwide. We didn't want our kids to be given a one-sided religion because it would lead to one side of the family being ignored. So we chose no religion. But the kids explore religion in school and we explore them together. People hide behind religion now for good and bad reasons. When we dropped it my Mum didn't accept the decision. She keeps giving me the Koran and so on to take home. My husband's Mum gives him the Bible. We put them safely away. Both sets of parents tried to argue over our kids' religion. My parents think I live in a hippy commune in Devon. My family rely on religion as a way of life. But I can still turn to them for support.*

💬 *The Koran says trust Christians but not Jews.*

💬 *Some say there's no anti-Semitism and that's because people are doing their Judaism in 'safe places' - the synagogue or at the parties. This shows just how unsafe being a Jew is in Devon. There was a church that joined the Council of Christians and Jews with the agenda to convert the Jews. One friend was lured into a meeting where the Christians tried to convert her. It really upset her……*

💬 *I couldn't say what I think about the behaviour of Israel at the moment in front of my mother's family because they're very pro Israeli. I'm worried that the Middle East situation could get much worse and also the situation for Muslims is terrible too - they're seen as mad extremists.*

## Role of Faith centres in addressing the support needs of isolated people.

Faiths were also revealed in the research as being important sources of support and connection with the external community. In chapters 5 & 6 we look at the layers of isolation affecting many Black and Minority Ethnic people, and at the sources of support people have recourse to, to overcome isolation. With the role of Faith being so intertwined with identity, spiritual and emotional fortitude and with pastoral concern, Faiths are critically positioned to be a first port of call for support - provided that Faith

communities are perceived as accessible by those who need them. Just as health practitioners also deal with people at critical points in their lives and provide opportunity for confidential discussion (see chapter 10), Faith workers also have privilege to relationships in this way, and provide a potentially unique opportunity for a person in crisis to expose vulnerability and seek help. Without being aware of this role, and without proactively developing relationships with Black and Minority Ethnic people, Faith workers run the risk of cutting off a crucial avenue of support.

---

**Role of Church (met and unmet) as a source of support**

🗨 *Support from the Church was thing that helped me stay [here]. You need to make sure that all churches provide that kind of affection and support.*

🗨 *I used to blame God for why I can't do things – reading and running. I stopped blaming him when I went back to [Africa] but I still didn't find happiness inside until I went to a Spring Harvest festival and heard a preacher who did a stunt asking people if they wanted a £20 note and kept asking them if they wanted it even when he had made it dirty and ripped it to bits. He said God still wants you whatever you've been through or whether you're Black or White. It made me start to think. Then when I moved to Devon and went to the [Christian Community] Church in [town] with my aunt, I saw very happy young people there and Christianity began to hit home personally.* [Disabled participant]

🗨 *I was a good Christian but I don't go to church now because I have the court access visits to my daughter on Sundays. My mother is Protestant. I don't go to church for the congregation. I just go for the inspiration of the service. Some people are friendly. But the world has been turned upside down - I've been battered here and there and there's no stabilizing force.*

🗨 *It was very difficult to settle in the town. The only point of contact was the church*

---

**Diffidence about opting in from the outside/ feeling on the outside**

🗩 *I thought of going to a Catholic church in town but I heard it has a bad reputation. But I feel it's important to be able to go to Church when you have kids.*

🗩 *We go to church but don't get involved. We're very busy and don't like to get involved with organisations. I would like to help with Church bazaars and the elderly if I had time.*

🗩 *People at Church reacted badly when I tried to improve Church porch – I tried to get involved too soon.*

🗩 *I went one or two times to church here. I am Catholic, but the service is in English and my bible is in French. So it's no good*

🗩 *I am Catholic. But I also don't understand the service in English. I just stand up and sit down with everyone else.*

🗩 *I was born Catholic but don't go to church - I find it too stressful because my husband doesn't - I have to do things on my own. I pray in my own time and talk to my son about God. The school is Faith-based. We go at Christmas time to the village Church. Where you worship is shaped by human intervention. Religious unity means it doesn't matter where you worship. I had a feeling of alienation from the Church from my upbringing at convent school. So I don't want to be involved in religion.*

🗩 *I'm Catholic but don't often go to church now after we had a bad experience with the parish priest because he was drunk when he did our son's baptism. We were hoping for vibrancy at Church, but here the local Catholic church is very boring. Church and education should be a celebration – not boring. The Church tends to lock you down. We both have a very spiritual outlook and need to do something about finding a Faith outlet.*

🗩 *I'm scared of churches because I'm scared of death. The other day I thought about going into one but I was too afraid. [You need social events/networks] to learn about where the churches are that cater for cultural sensitivity.*

**Access to Jewish community for elderly and rurally isolated Jews**

🗨 *Even the synagogue in Exeter ……is very lacking. I have emailed suggestions but they don't encompass people outside the Exeter area. I can't drive to Exeter because there's nowhere to park [disability access] and in the evening it's too dark. The social activities are very limited and only apply to Exeter. I have offered to host coffee mornings or bridge parties and asked them to advertise this, but the synagogue hasn't done anything.*

🗨 *I don't attend synagogue. I'm not religious but I am proud of the Jewish Faith and I tell everyone. I did get a contact for a Jewish family in a neighbouring town from the Synagogue and rang them to ask for a lift to Synagogue but they never rang me back - young people are not interested in the elderly.*

This handbook and supporting tools ✖ can be accessed at
www.DevonREC.org

<div align="center">

**Chapter 10**
**HEALTH & SOCIAL WELFARE**

</div>

**Themes in this chapter**

- Interpretation and translation
- Training and information resources
- Medical/diagnostic/assessment tools
- Supporting Black, Minority Ethnic and Foreign National Staff
- Working with other services
- Partnership working between race equality and health services
- Social welfare

**Listening to Health Staff**

In this chapter we look at health issues and the role that Health and Social Services have to play in addressing race equality and reducing isolation. During the research, we worked with a wide range of professionals from service-providing organisations to look at their ability to address race equality.

In particular, we worked with 32 community health workers: among them Consultants, Midwives, GPs, Health Visitors, Reablement Nurses, Heads of Hospital Services, Team Managers, School Nurses. 11 of them were Black and Minority Ethnic staff. We focussed on three lines of enquiry:

- We heard from Black and Minority Ethnic staff about their personal experience and about their professional observations about race equality within the Health Service
- We heard from community health workers about their concerns for Black and Minority Ethnic patients with whom they'd worked
- We explored the role and readiness of the Health Service to address rural Black and Minority Health needs and to provide a link to other services.

The importance of the Health Services in addressing race equality was illustrated by one participant who reflected, as a patient, that health workers among all the supporting agencies have a particular opportunity to support the needs of Black and Minority Ethnic people. This is her story:

| Case study: |
| --- |
| A young black woman was suffering severe depression, a few weeks after having given birth.  The only contact she had with supportive agencies were her visits from midwives and health visitors and to the doctor. They assumed she was suffering post-natal depression. They failed to notice that she was being beaten by her partner on a regular basis and was in fact covered in bruises, and that this was the cause of her depression, and that she and her child were at risk. The woman does not know if the bruising on her face was not noticed for lack of training or because of a fear on the part of staff about how to raise the question with a Black person. The woman was too depressed and vulnerable to open up herself without encouragement. The consequence of the violent abuse has been mental health problems, relationship difficulties with her daughter and later, homelessness.  All of these consequences could have been addressed by referral to other services, had the issues been uncovered by health workers when they had the opportunity. |

Nearly everyone will use the health services, and often at the time of greatest need in their lives. Health staff have a unique position of trust, and opportunity of confidential time with patients, in which to encourage them to open up, and can provide access to relevant services when there is a need. The woman reflected that health service workers provide a window into the outside world for vulnerable, isolated people. When vulnerability and isolation is experienced by Black and Minority Ethnic people it is a double disadvantage.  When it is experienced by women it is a multiple disadvantage. (For multiple isolation indices see chapter 5.)  However not all health workers recognise how crucial and singular a role they can play in uncovering and addressing need and in providing access to wider support for Black and Minority Ethnic patients.  Many staff need support to deliver this role in a way which addresses inequality in access to services, removes discrimination and builds good race relations.

The research work with health staff was carried out through questionnaires, workshops and interviews.  A number of concerns were raised, but many *ideas* were generated for practical action which would help in shaping Trusts' Race Equality Scheme Action Plans and that could be undertaken by Trusts to support staff.

## Interpretation & translation

**Aspects of concern:**

The issue of Interpretation and Translation emerged as a major concern for health staff – for themselves and on the behalf of many of their Black and Minority Ethnic patients. The following comments from the research workshops illustrate the depth of concern:

🗨 *Because of **language barriers**, it's difficult to give the same quality of care. In fact sometimes it means that despite our best intentions, patients get an appalling service. Patients and parents can't pick up the phone and ask for help or get access to services like other patients can. Patients also just don't get the same level of information as English speakers. For example they don't get information on immunisation and contraception. There are life and health consequences of this e.g. un-immunised children at school, birth control problems, vulnerability during health interventions e.g. childbirth. One couple with little English went back to Northern Ireland to deliver their baby because they knew they'd get a better service there. They were even given the child's Red-book in Chinese.*

🗨 *We usually rely on **family members to translate.** But you just can't be sure that they're translating what you, or your patient is saying. We're also putting people in embarrassing and inappropriate situations – for example children used as interpreters for all kinds of medical topics. There was one case of a very embarrassed daughter, expected by the family, to act as translator when her father needed a catheter fitted.*

🗨 *We're also making **decisions** about people's lives that **they don't understand**: In one case, a family's decision to look after their disabled children at home without access to education was considered by Social Services to be child abuse. The Mum, who had very little English, had to attend a child protection meeting on her own with no interpreter. Also, in many cases, women are being given information in English about antenatal screening, and we have no idea if they really understand the decisions they're being asked to make.'*

And as one Minority Ethnic doctor summed it up

🗨 *'BME patients are more vulnerable in Devon than elsewhere because there are less resources for interpreters'.*

The situation described by health staff called for a number of responses:

- It's important that Trusts act to ensure that language services are in place so that family members are *not* used as interpreters – whether on home visits, at the GP surgery, or for hospital in- and out-patients.

- Women should be given language support so that they can communicate fully with midwives. Staff shouldn't be in danger of mis-diagnosis in the absence of information: one hospital case was reported in which a patient was admitted who spoke no English. Reports from third parties were leading health staff in the direction of a very serious diagnosis and intervention, until a member of staff was found to interpret who revealed that the condition was not serious at all.

- Staff wanted Trusts to support their access to interpreters and language services by ensuring:
  - ➔ that staff are fully aware of language services
  - ➔ that the services available address combinations of language skills and can cope with dialects
  - ➔ that services are quickly and readily accessible to all health delivery settings, including those in the community.

The Health staff described how their problem wasn't that language services are non-existent among Trusts, but far more to do with awareness of what is available (for example Language Line, and staff with Language skills), and with difficulties in accessing it. Aspects of their current service which staff felt also needed to addressed included:
- ➔ Skill banks and in-house interpretation
- ➔ Matching language need with language resource
- ➔ Ability to assess language needs
- ➔ Ability of the language service to respond fast enough

**Skill banks and in-house interpretation**

- For example, some staff in one Trust were aware that a register existed of colleagues with language skills, who could be called upon for interpretation. However they noted that as the list was 10 years out of date, success in using it was limited, time consuming and frustrating. They also complained that using the in-house list depended entirely on a colleague's availability and that this led to delays and future reluctance to use the service. These health workers also noted that the in-house service depends on staff having independent transport to get to a patient, which isn't always the case. The overall feeling was that staff needed interpretation services to be quickly and readily accessible to all health delivery settings, including those in the community.

**Matching language need with language resource**

- Staff also pointed out that matching interpreter skills or translated resources with patients' needs is often a complex business: For example a patient may speak in Gujerati as his first language but be illiterate in it, and have basic literacy in Urdu but not able to speak it fluently. Staff also talked about difficulties in accessing interpreters for speakers of minority dialects. These complexities also mean that the interpretation and translation facilities provided must be flexible, appropriate and comprehensive.

**Ability to assess language needs**

- Not all staff are aware that they need to consider these complexities when asking patients about language - a problem that needed to be overcome with training and with carefully designed patient assessment processes.

**Ability of the language service to respond fast enough**

- Staff described how in many situations it would take too long to arrange for available services to attend a patient case:

> 🗨 *The huge time commitment involved in bringing in interpreters is a deterrent for doing so. It slows down the whole process…*

This is particularly the case in emergency settings, but also because assessment of patient needs is not done until a patient is booked in on admission.

**Staff suggestions for improving language support**

Staff had a number of suggestions for improving the problems of meeting language needs:
- ➔ **Clarity about access to Language Line**
- ➔ **Up to date in-house language audit registers**
- ➔ **Community Midwifery/Health Attendants**
- ➔ **Provision of a single *accessible* portal through Intra-net for downloadable translated information**

**Clarity about access to Language Line**

- Staff were very uncertain about the availability of Language Line to them. Some didn't know about it at all, some thought it had been deemed too expensive for the budget. Staff wanted to be made fully

aware of the service that their Trust wants them to use, the extent to which it can be used, and how to use it.  They indicated that low use of existing services shouldn't be taken as an indication of lack of need, but rather of the problems associated in using them.  They pointed out that to generate good use of language services, a staff member's first use of the service has to be an experience of accessibility and success in order to breed confidence and sustain take up.

## Up to date in-house language audit registers

- Staff were also keen to see better use made of in-house language skills, but felt both that they needed to be kept up to date and that participating staff needed to be supported so that their involvement in the scheme could be effective.

## Community Midwifery/Health Attendants

- The idea also emerged for the training and employment of Black and Minority Ethnic women who have language skills and traveller women as Community Midwifery Attendants to work alongside Midwives. (This has a precedent in primary health care in developing countries). Attendants could be trained to understand the medical and care concepts involved in Midwifery, race equality and cultural awareness good practice, and in the protocols of the Attendant role, and then used as translators.  Staff noted however that Attendants would need to be police checked and commented on the length of time police checking involves at present. Midwives also noted the importance of overcoming the obstacle of women not wanting someone they do not know involved.  A benefit of the Attendant idea is that women could get to know Attendants just as they get to know their Midwives.  Attendants could also help women develop birth plans, covering cultural and religious needs, naming issues and family involvement issues. Conceivably, Attendants could also be used to support the Health Visitor service to provide continuity.

## Provision of a single *accessible* portal through Intra-net for downloadable translated information

- Staff also made a plea that accessing information in appropriate languages must be simple and not time-consuming. They wanted a single reference point for information and to be appraised of what's available– they didn't want to have to hunt.  (Some staff reported having to ask friends in other parts of the UK to find them information.) The health workers suggested that translated leaflets should be

available from the Intranet, in *all* languages and on all topics. However, whilst accessing information from the Intra-net was considered a good idea in principle, in practice access to computer terminals was currently a real problem for many staff.  Many have to share terminals with others or have no access at all and, where staff had to go through an administrator to use Intranet, there was insufficient admin time available.   Other Intra-net access deterrents include navigation and search problems, lack of time to use the terminals and lack of GP surgery connection to the Intra-net.

## Training and information resources

Training and information resources were another key area of concern for the Health Staff participants.

The staff described their level of appraisal of race equality issues:
Only 2 of the 32 health workers had received training in cultural awareness or promotion of race equality.  One staff member reported getting knocked back from trying to get involved with race equality when she was told at a national conference workshop on race equality issues that she was not welcome as she was White and 'wouldn't understand the issues'. Another health worker raised the concern that, whilst she felt Nurses were more likely to ask for advice if they have gaps in their knowledge, Doctors would be less likely to expose information gaps, and that training for them should also be a priority.  Another staff member said that all training in her Trust had stopped because of lack of funds.

Only 1 staff member of the 32 had read a Policy.  And only a further 2 were aware that a Policy of some sort existed.  The research workshop with Heads of Service found that none of them were aware of their Trust's Race Equality Scheme.  One staff member reported asking her Trust if there was any form of anti-discrimination policy governing staff and patient relations.  She was told that "*no policy existed because there was no problem here*".

In particular, staff identified the need for training on racism, institutional racism and tackling racism, in addition to cultural awareness.  Many staff were uncertain about the concept of institutional racism, and were concerned about the concept of 'unwitting institutional racism'.  They pointed out that 'you don't know what you don't know' and felt that training was needed for many colleagues to alert them to what they need to know about.  Staff confided that they often don't know *when* to ask patients about pertinent issues or *what* to ask, or *how* to ask questions. They also

warned that if Trusts were to take the initiative of providing staff with more race equality support services, staff might not take these services up because of lack of awareness that such support *should* be accessed in the first place.

In addition and by contrast to their acknowledgement that they were poorly briefed on matters of race equality in institutional terms, staff were acutely aware of their training needs in relation to cultural awareness.
Based on the difficulties they had experienced in providing care to Black and Minority Ethnic patients, this was an area about which staff were much clearer in their ideas about the knowledge gaps that affected their patient care and about the training and information they needed. Their list included:

| Training needs analysis – cultural awareness | |
|---|---|
| Country- and ethnicity-specific information | Staff wanted training to begin with better cultural awareness and understanding cultural norms. They were insistent that information needs to be country specific, rather than broad continental generalisations, to be practically useful in health care delivery. |
| Childcare and protection | Staff wanted more information to help them appraise what is 'normal' childcare in different countries. They wanted to be better equipped to identify what is and isn't child abuse and to define acceptable boundaries between discipline and abuse. In particular they needed advice on how to overcome difficulties in communication about child protection issues and decision-making and help in making sure that decisions and communication are properly understood. One staff member produced a copy of the child protection handbook her team used which had only two pages on Black and Minority Ethnic issues. She felt this was inadequate. Staff in one workshop confided that due to lack of knowledge and training…..<br><br>🗩 *Health Visitors may feel less confident about involving Social Services if an abuse or social problem is suspected, for fear of being accused of discrimination.* |
| Integration | Staff also expressed worries about knowing when it is appropriate to *"push integration"* as they put it. They reported helping people to use services e.g. family |

| | |
|---|---|
| | support and services for Mums, but felt worried about the intrusion and push to integrate that this involves. |
| Food | A big issues was the need for better knowledge about the culture of food with respect to four things:<br>I)     knowing the nutritional value of different food styles. Most nutrition guidance staff use is based on traditional English 'cuisine'.<br>II)     knowing about different cultural approaches to weaning and how to give the best advice that will synthesise standard good practice and different cultural traditions.<br>III)     knowing about cultural rules around food and health, especially at key points of intervention e.g. after childbirth, and knowledge about how to deal with conflicts between standard medical advice and customs and to discuss the issues with patients.<br>IV)     More awareness in hospitals about religious food requirements. Staff cited an example in which a Muslim Doctor was offered ham during Ramadan. Another reported that….<br>🗩 *Food is always a problem, but families overcome it by bringing their own food in for the patient.* |
| Sleep | Staff wanted better knowledge about culture around sleep and sleeping arrangements, especially with respect to advice for parents of young children. |
| Pain management | They raised the need for better understanding of cultural concepts around pain management. For example the different cultural attitudes to experience of pain in childbirth and expectations about the way pain should be managed. |
| Contraception | Training is needed regarding how to approach issues of contraception. Staff also found this especially difficult where language barrier exists. |
| Women's Health | Similarly staff need information to know how to deal with issues of women's health – what can and cannot be mentioned. |
| Gender issues | In the same way, Health workers described difficulties around knowing the protocols of who may and may not speak with whom. Knowing what to speak about to whom (e.g. midwives and doctors talking about whether |

| | |
|---|---|
| | a baby's testicles have descended and taboos about discussing this with Mums). Knowing whose permission in a family is necessary for what. How to work with women patients when men in the family interfere or bar access. (One staff member reported a case where it seemed that a woman was unable to communicate in English and that all discussion was done through the husband. It later transpired that the woman spoke English fluently but was not permitted to speak by her husband). School nurses wanted to know how to advise Asian girls at school e.g. about what to wear for Physical Education. |
| Privacy | Staff felt that colleagues needed training on making sure that appropriate respect is paid to cultural and religious needs regarding personal privacy. An example was given of an Arab woman feeling angry, exposed and vulnerable when the curtain around her bed was consistently drawn back by hospital staff, especially when men were present on the ward. |
| Religious dates | Staff noted that provision of basic resources like a yearly directory of important religious dates would be helpful. (E.g. SHAP calendar) |
| Family involvement | Staff wanted training about cultural attitudes to family involvement in health care and how to manage this in terms of family involvement on hospital wards, in terms of self-help at home and in terms of decision making about the care plan for a patient. |
| Language & communication training | Staff wanted this aspect of training and information to cover: <br> ➢ Basic words in other languages <br> ➢ Using the right race equality terminology in culturally sensitive communication. <br> ➢ Knowing how to get people to open up. Getting over language and cultural and family barriers so that real dialogue can take place and issues can be properly discussed. <br> ➢ Knowing *how* to ask questions and which questions to ask - They suggested a checklist of race equality and cultural issues to be alert to. <br> As one Minority Ethnic doctor described her experience of work in the community: |

| | |
|---|---|
| | 🗨 *BME women patients especially won't tell you they're unhappy. They need you to ask the questions.* |
| Names and valuing identity | A senior hospital staff member reported that Black and Minority Ethnic Staff (and patients) often find that they are given or have to adopt Anglicised names because other staff and patients find names difficult to pronounce. The senior staff member worried that her staff may be giving the impression that patients' and colleagues' identity is not valued. |
| Traveller health | Staff identified the need for better preparation for working with Traveller families and patients, coping with cross-cultural suspicion, and protocols for working on Traveller sites. Midwives gave the example of cross-cultural suspicion when working with Traveller communities resulting in very limited communication between patient and Midwife, added to which is the difficulty of Midwives finding they are often unable to work in pairs in caravans. In the course of the research we also came across a case of abuse in which a Traveller family described how one health professional had been a life-line of support whilst another had been sucked into a local campaign of intimidation against the family including a pregnant Mum, with a mental health impact on the patient. |

Staff also had some practical suggestions about the way training and information should be provided for best results, which covered:

- **Cross-cultural experience**
➔ Secondment/visits
➔ Buddy systems

- **Training delivery settings**
➔ Statutory training through Team Meetings
➔ Community Professional Forums - non NHS nursing
➔ Patient Management Teams

- **On the job training and advice**
  → External community reference workers
  → Internal sharing of good practice through Teams and Learning Sets
  → Up to date in-house cross-cultural medicine audit registers

- For **cross-cultural experience**, staff suggested short (maybe week-long) secondment to areas of the UK where staff can get practical experience of diversity. They also favoured the idea of Buddy systems with professionals in urban, diverse areas, through which staff could contact their Buddy on the phone for advice.

- **Training delivery settings**
  ➢ Staff felt that training on race and equalities policies should form part of their _statutory_ training. They also felt that training would be better delivered by specialist Trainers coming to scheduled _Team_ meetings rather than staff having to go away on study days. They felt that training at Team meetings was the best way to ensure maximum coverage and to get messages conveyed. They also recommended that comprehensive access to Teams could be facilitated systematically by a person in a Trust who knows about all the Teams in existence.
  ➢ One staff member also suggested that _the Community Professional Forum_ in her area should also be a training route as it involves nursing services delivered in nursing homes. Staff were particularly concerned about the provision of care to Black and Minority Ethnic patients in nursing care settings for the elderly.
  ➢ Another staff member suggested that in hospitals, _the patient management teams_ should be the priority for receiving training, and that they should be supplied with a detailed trans-cultural medicine resource. The PMT could then support relevant staff on particular patient cases and could also supply relevant information to all staff via email.

- **On the job training and advice**
  ➢ Staff advocated the need for an identified race equality/ cultural diversity specialist or cultural access unit to refer to – either on the phone or someone who can come on joint community visits or meet staff on the ward. This reference person does not necessarily have to be a health professional but does need to be a specialist diversity and equality community worker. This person would:

- Provide advice and information on culture/language/religious points, pertinent to a particular patient's care, where necessary
- Work jointly with staff and with other services to help bring about or negotiate intervention/change where health assessment identifies it's needed

➢ Staff also suggested having a system through which they can access good practice information via annual Team sessions. Staff suggested that a Trust cascade system should be organised to feed external information and good practice examples from other Teams into each other so that information can be shared about:

- Knowledge and experience from within the Team gained during the course of the year
- Good practice information collated from external sources
- Staff also suggested that new Learning Sets are currently being introduced in Trust localities for Health Visitors, School Nurses and Students could be an opportunity for sharing and learning best practice

➢ Similarly staff wanted to have better use made of in-house knowledge through:

- the creation or updating of lists of colleagues with experience of cross-cultural practice who could be referred to for advice. Staff suggested such a list could be communicated through Trust magazines and Intranet. This list could be compiled along-side a list of staff with language skills. We noted that in carrying out a skills audit to compile such lists Trusts would also do well to check other useful skills such as mentoring, coaching, leadership and staff development skills and qualifications. These could be useful in setting up any Black and Minority Ethnic staff peer support systems.

## Medical/diagnostic/assessment tools

Staff also had a number of suggestions about appropriate medical/diagnostic/assessment tools that could help to address a number of

the factors that impede equality of service delivery to Black and Minority Ethnic patients.

Among these ideas were:

- Admissions assessment/ booking-in/ transfer-in and CARDEX
- Ethnicity record keeping - self identification
- Country-sensitive growth charts
- Tropical disease and disease/ethnicity prevalence
- Birth plans

**Assessment tools**

- Staff identified the need to develop and devise an assessment process so that patients needs are appropriately discussed and assessed, and so that arrangements for meeting needs are agreed once and not over and over again. As mentioned before staff wanted help in asking open questions and eliciting information. A Reablement Nurse suggested that there could be much to learn from the rehabilitation initial assessment interview which takes approx. 1 hour but is time well spent in saving time later in the process - this reablement system could be used to inform the development of a Black and Minority Ethnic patient-needs assessment process.
  Another staff member suggested that in hospitals, the cultural- and faith-needs assessment process should be done by the admissions medical assessment unit and that the CARDEX system should be developed to encompass this, so that the information would be easily passed on to all other staff interacting with the patient. A similar process could be applied to booking-in of Midwifery patients. Introduction of such systems, staff advised, would need to be accompanied by staff training, to make sure they are properly introduced and sustained in use.

**Ethnicity Record Keeping**

- Staff suggested that the assessment process should also enable patients to _self-identify_ ethnicity so that it is specific enough to be useful. As one midwife put it:

> 🗨 *it's the complexity of each person's identity that affects the values, morals and culture around birth with which you have to work….*

It was suggested that ethnicity monitoring could be addressed at the booking-in or admissions assessment points. However some staff suggested it would be better if ethnicity was addressed when patients register with a GP and that this information should then be forwarded with patient records for all professionals dealing with a patient. Certainly, primary level ethnicity monitoring would transform the way that demographic planning on race equality issues could be informed, and provide much-needed data in between Census intervals. Hence this suggestion has benefits not only for individual health cases but for wider Healthier Communities planning.

**Country-sensitive growth charts and disease information**

- Staff also identified needs for such items as generation-linked growth charts relevant to different country-origins, and staff reported the need for better training in the diagnosis of tropical and other illnesses. A case was reported in which Bilharzia went undiagnosed in a woman throughout her pregnancy. Her son also had the infestation and was not diagnosed. Staff also wanted better awareness of illnesses associated with different ethnic groups. e.g. blood pressure, diabetes, sickle cell anaemia, thallaessemia etc… and easy access to information about them.

**Birth plans**

- It was also suggested that Minority Ethnic women could be given more power over their care during pregnancy and child-birth, and more information could be made available to staff if language workers (such as the Attendants mentioned earlier) or specialist community development workers could help Mothers develop bi-lingual birth plans.

**<u>Supporting Black and Minority Ethnic Staff</u>**

Particular points of concern were raised regarding support for Black and Minority Ethnic and Foreign National Staff regarding:

- **Certification/validation**
- **Ethnicity record keeping - self identification**
- **Co-ethnic patient/staff expectations**
- **Foreign national staff and families**
- **Experience of racism**

**Certification/validation**

- One staff member pointed out that whilst Trusts depend on a significant foreign national workforce, there are heavy costs and bureaucratic difficulties incurred upon individuals in the recruitment process: applicants have to get qualifications, certificates, and papers and CVs translated into English and recognised by the English system employers. The staff member suggested that the speed and ease of the process could be improved if Trusts could help with certification/validation of translated certificates and the costs involved.

**Ethnicity record keeping - self identification**

- Staff also suggested that workforce Ethnicity record-keeping needs to allow for people to self-identify. It was suggested that individuals could tick a general heading and then write a more specific definition under it. Identity is specific to the individual, and general continental headings were seen as too broad. Staff also felt this should apply to ERKM of patients. Specific information would also help with in-house language and cultural skills audits.

**Co-ethnic patient/staff expectations**

- One Minority Ethnic staff member also highlighted the burden that can be felt by staff when co-ethnic patients place too high expectations on them.

> 🗨 *There is a danger that co-ethnic patient expectations can be too high and that family members can expect too much attention.*

**Foreign national staff & families**

- Health staff confided that they were often especially unable to provide health service to those foreign national doctors' wives who speak little English because they rely on the husbands for interpretation who are not available because of their long working hours as doctors. Colleagues were worried about poor standards and size of housing for families, and the isolation of women, often with children, who rarely see their husbands because of working hours and who have little social contact outside the house. Colleagues observed that foreign national staff are often in posts short-term, and hence families move frequently without opportunity to develop networks and roots in the community. Staff also raised concerns about the lack of play space for children in NHS-provided accommodation.

**Experience of racism**

- Staff also had concern about the way that Black and Minority Ethnic colleagues might feel about racism, but were on the whole unsure about what their experience might be. One Minority Ethnic staff member however illustrated the effects of little incidents which in themselves probably went unnoticed by others but, for her, amounted to a wearing-down form of prejudice:

> 🗩 *People here have very little tolerance of staff with accents. They make lots of jokes about pronunciation and spelling which is silly. They don't understand that we're trying. How many Brits speak another language? I cope with it by making a joke of it but it can really get to me. I have several thousand people to co-ordinate. If there are several comments a day it can really bring a person down.*

**Working with other agencies & services**

During the work with health providers we also looked at how staff were able to address Black and Minority Ethnic patients' needs by working with other agencies and services. The key issues that arose concerned

- Referral systems: navigation for staff and patients
- Mental health services

**Referral systems**

- Most staff expressed a lack of knowledge about who to turn to if families need extra support. To make referral possible, staff felt there should be one place to go to find out what support services might be available to a patient: another agency or voluntary sector organisations for non-medical advice; patient groups; race relations organisations and cultural support opportunities. Staff also felt that there was a need for specialist race equality community workers to help facilitate referral and provide continuity.

- Similarly, staff identified the need for specialist workers to whom they could turn for advice about rights to benefits and services depending on a patient's immigration status etc.

- Very few staff knew whether other agencies were being accessed by their patients, and only a few had provided links to non-health service support – usually language classes. Only the Re-hab service was referring on, by virtue of its nature. Lack of confidence in other

services to address Black and Minority Ethnic patients' needs was also noted as a problem in referral. On example was given of an Asian woman who needed co-ethnic social-work support - or at least the support of a worker who understood Asian culture. The health professional was unable to arrange such a referral.

- Staff also raised the problem that they did not know how, or where, to refer on specialist needs – for example, at present there is no point of referral in Devon for circumcision.

- Health workers also noted that their inability to access referral services was all the more serious, because of many Black and Minority Ethnic patients' inability to access services for themselves.

- In particular, staff were especially concerned for many immigrants who do not understand how the health/social service and benefits systems work. Participants described how patients frequently do not know their rights, what services are available to them in the first place, what to expect from a service, how to navigate it and its systems, and the struggle with form filling. Staff noted that some families are not registering with GPs and that there is a preference among many families to try and deal with health problems within the family and without medical help. There's also a lack of understanding about the different roles and services in the system – e.g. Health Visitors, Midwives. A foreign national health professional told us of the difficulties that *even she* experienced in trying to understand what the system provided and how to access it*:*

> 🗩 *At home we don't have health visitors etc.. Everything here is different and you're not told what's what, and if you ask people they don't know – they're born into the system*

This participant suggested that there should be a Welcome Pack when a person arrives in the UK or in an area explaining how to register with, and use, services and benefits.

**Mental health services**

- Staff also reported difficulties in dealing with depression and working with the mental health services. They had particular concerns about cases of women in unhappy or abusive relationships. In the course of the research a number of Black and Minority Ethnic participants, especially women, also described the impact of depression in their lives. We were concerned for the usually un-appraised mental health impact on children of cases of racism experienced by families.

- Within the discussion with health workers, staff raised concerns about not knowing how to deal with depression in the context of different cultural understandings of the illness.
- They reported that they had been unable to refer cases of vulnerable isolated women to mental health services if the illness or depression-state did not involve psychosis.
- Staff also reported that GP waiting lists for GP-sourced counselling were so long, and availability so thinly spread that they were effectively unable to refer women for counselling support. Nurses and GPs alike complained about this problem.
- A re-ablement nurse raised serious concerns about the impact of un-addressed depression on general health status and patient recovery after illness. The re-ablement service, being very person-centred, has the capacity to spend sufficient time with patients to pick up on wider and attendant social, psycological and health problems. Other health workers complained that they can not afford the contact time to build up trust and identify underlying and aggravating problems with patients.

## **Partnership working between race equality and health services**

The key outcomes from this element of the research demonstrated the need for a specialist race equality organisation to which people can turn for support. We heard how both Black and Minority Ethnic employees and patients need someone to turn to when they experience inequality; and we heard how professionals needed a source from which to seek general and case-by-case advice on the best way to support patients.

The support functions required of a race equality service by health providers broke down into the following areas:

- **Specialist advice**
- **Referral support**
- **Consultation**
- **Staff & Patient complainant aid**
- **Policy advice**
- **Training**

In addition, our wider research also demonstrated the need for a single consultation portal, through which the Black and Minority Ethnic

population could continue to raise issues of concern on an ongoing basis, and feed them into the relevant service-provider and partnership organisations for action. 61% of Black and Minority Ethnic participants expressed an interest in having future involvement and voice on race equality issues. Many of them identified specific areas of interest and expertise where they were keen to help shape services. At the same time, the demand from the huge number of service-providing agencies and forums threatened to overwhelm the willingness of individuals to contribute. Hence it became clear that agencies' consultation needs, and the willingness of Black and Minority Ethnic people to participate, needed to be co-ordinated and facilitated in a manner that provided individuals with protection from consultation overload. Moreover, whilst this research has shown that its participants were clear about what mattered to them and what they wanted to discuss, service providers wanted to consult on a plethora of issues. It was recognised that, by networking of Black and Minority Ethnic people in their localities, individuals could themselves rationalise the consultation priorities, thereby setting them from a user (rather than provider) perspective. It was also clear that the status quo for consultation relied on unreasonable expectations upon a few known Black and Minority Ethnic individuals to speak on the behalf of the Black and Minority Ethnic population in all its diversity. Networking was recognised as a means for bringing many more voices together to raise concerns and feed them forward.

In chapter 12 we see that networks were put forward by Black and Minority Ethnic participants as a key recommendation. The primary function of these networks would be to provide an opportunity for celebrating culture, drawing peer support and accessing information. However, with the high interest expressed in having a voice, these networks could also provide the safe, facilitated and informal space in which to raise issues and make them available to service planners.

With all the above in mind, the Devon & Exeter Racial Equality Council therefore proposed work in rural areas which would, among its functions, offer (subject to funding) five key support functions to health staff and patients:

| Support functions | |
|---|---|
| Consultation | A single consultation portal, facilitated by community development workers with various sectoral specialisms, including health, who could provide a permanent, efficient interface between Black and Minority Ethnic staff, BME patients and the Trusts. The consultation gateway would allow Trusts and other service-providing organisations to access a breadth and depth of local information hitherto unobtainable. |
| Policy advice | This consultation data would be available through the staff of the Racial Equality Council (REC) and through 'community contributors' as policy advice to strategic forums, and as a policy development (Race Equality Scheme) consultancy service to individual organisations. This advice would also help Trusts keep one step ahead of Audit and Inspectorate requirements and to meet their legal duties. |
| Staff & Patient complainant aid<br><br>Policy advice | The advice that would be provided would also be informed by monitoring the case-loads coming through the REC's independent complainant aid service. This service supports individuals in resolving cases of discrimination, and the learning from this work also provides intelligence through which the REC can help Health Care Trusts to take action to prevent repetition or escalation of complaints. |
| Specialist advice Referral support | The proposed community development workers would also be available to provide a reference service for staff and their patients when external advice is needed on dealing with cases where cultural and referral issues needed to be addressed. |
| Training | The REC also has a training service through which bespoke training is available to Trusts to raise in-house competency to deal with race equality in service provision and employment. |

The Racial Equality Council's proposals are designed to address the needs raised by participants in the research, and to provide optimum benefit for Black and Minority Ethnic Patients and Staff, and for the Trusts and agencies who need help to meet their race equality duties. The proposals form part of the REC's Business and Service Plan which was put forward to Devon's Health Trusts with a request for funding, in spring 2003.

## Social welfare

In addition to health issues, the research also picked up on a few other areas of concern relating to social welfare, in particular:

- **Growing older**
- **Children's services**
- **Welfare systems administration**

### Growing older

Issues concerning old age were raised by a number of the Black and Minority Ethnic participants in the research (see chapter 9).  Their concerns reflected the in-migrant status of most of the participants who still had family links overseas.  The concern divided into two areas.

On the one hand, younger middle-aged participants had concerns for their parents overseas, some of whom had consequently come to the UK (or moved from elsewhere in the UK) to join them.  (12% of our sample had come to Devon to be nearer family.)

> 🗨 *My [Asian] in-laws came [here] from Nairobi because of the increase in violence and their own children had left the country.*

On the other hand, older middle-aged participants raised concerns about whether rural Devon would be a suitable place for them in old age.  Factors influencing these concerns included:

- Worry about whether care for the elderly would be culturally sensitive
- Health concerns and the hope that overseas climates would provide a better environment
- The need to have cultural and family support in old age

> 🗨 *My Dad is back in Bangladesh to be with the family for retirement.  I don't know where the family will settle when we retire.  We might go to London where the family are or similarly Exeter - I have a business there and my wife likes it because there are more other Asian women and it's a bigger city and there's better education for the kids.  The dampness in winter is one of the worst things about life here.  This is why my parents went home because of the arthritis.*

> 🗩 *A person's origins become more significant as a person becomes older and age raises issues of identity once again.*

> 🗩 *Are dietary needs met for older people? Is it offered? - surely to do so would be common courtesy*

> 🗩 *You very seldom have elderly in restaurants. Elderly go back to Malaysia to be with relatives and for warm weather. Traditionally young people look after the elderly. If they can't the young people will find you for help. I think the Chinese Housing Association idea is a good one. But when I am old I would prefer to be on my own or with English people.*

> 🗩 *I wouldn't stay here if I retired. It's a nice place but not near enough to family. We would need support and understanding of culture.*

In chapter 8 the issue of learning support needs, in particular English language support, are also considered as a need for ageing generations of restaurant workers.


**Children and services**

We heard of four cases of problematic trans-racial adoption/fostering in the course of the research. Aspects of concern described among these cases included:

- Placement of children in families that were unprepared to deal with a child's ethnic identity
- Placement of children in unstable or un-supportive environments
- In three of the cases, the issue of adoption was considered a root factor in adult mental health problems, destructive life-choices, or anti-social behaviour.

Whilst this research did not pursue investigation issues of trans-racial adoption/fostering specifically with social service providers, it has been recognised by Racial Equality Council workers and by the Exeter based project Planet Rainbow as an important issue needing further work. Taking the isolation indices described in chapter 5 into account, the placement of Black and Minority Ethnic Children in White families in predominantly White areas, without reference to ethnic roots, raises further need for research on this topic.

🗨 *White people should not foster Black kids.  I hated big family gatherings - I was very quiet and didn't say how I felt because they said I was making a fuss over nothing. So I couldn't join in and felt like a spectator.  I felt anger towards my biological parents who had 5 kids, because they had 2 kids after who got kept together and adopted by a Black family and the third child got taken on by my Mother's family.  It made me feel I was the only one who had no contact with the family…….. I don't understand why my [adoptive] parents had me..... I can't remember ever being cuddled. Now I feel my own 7 year old is too old to be cuddled and it's difficult for me to show affection……. I have sickle cell trait and have problems with my eyes.  It made me scared.  I told Mum who told me not to whinge, but as soon as Dad appeared she got more sympathetic.  He cuddles me and Mum hates it.  She won't touch me even if I'm crying.  It really annoys me. Now I don't trust anyone at all and certainly not with my feelings….the social workers just reported on me being very quiet.  They didn't understand why I was unhappy.  I haven't got any trust in them. They talked about everything else with my family but me.  I just used to sit and spectate.  They didn't try to get to the bottom of things…… they didn't interact with me or try to work at the problems with my Mum…….*

We also noted that in many cases of racial abuse covered during the research, that the impact of cases on children were not fully assessed or identified.  In some cases, the reporting of incidents touched on the situation of children caught up in abuse directly or indirectly, but that children's issues often became lost beneath other issues of concern raised by adults about the way that other agencies were failing to respond to incidents.  The point flagged up by this observation, and by the issues discussed in chapters 6 & 8 (about children's experience of racist bullying), is that any case in which children are involved or connected in any way should prompt service providers to conduct specific investigations on the impact upon children.

However, as one Minority Ethnic social worker indicated, welfare agency staff do not receive sufficient training or information to examine the levels of vulnerability of Black and Minority Ethnic children:

🗨 *Social workers are not geared up to mixed race issues.  They need briefings in what's on offer to help them - not just a list of telephone numbers.*

Another Minority Ethnic welfare worker also raised concern in this area, which was flagged up for him by the case of a White child whose social service assessment was poorly handled:

> 🗨 *There's the example of a Social Services case locally where a girl who had sought CAB support was asked by Social Workers in front of her parents what her family grievance was – this lack of good sense and poor communication is exactly what sent the African 8 year old [Victoria Climbie] in London to her death.*

**Welfare systems administration**

A number of participants shared their views about the way in which benefits are administered, in terms of

- staff attitudes
- form filling
- reservations about taking up benefits

In a few of the cases reported, participants described their perceptions that staff were unresponsive to their needs and insensitive or insulting in their attitude to their clients. Often the cases involved more than one agency, with poor performance on the part of one service, leading to a general breakdown in trust between the client and the welfare services, between whom clients made little distinction.

Two cases illustrate participants' concern about insensitivity and negative attitudes.

---

**Case study 1:**
A couple with mental health and other social exclusion difficulties complained of consistently unhelpful, confusing, inconsistent and punitive action by the social services and benefits agencies. The couple's complaints of poor professionalism on the part of service-providing staff included an incident in which a member of staff wrongly alleged that the White female of the couple was not the mother of their Mixed Heritage child and should not be eligible for benefits. They also described another incident in which a staff member was reported to have threatened 'I'll get you'. The case involved a spiral of deteriorating relations between service staff and the couple, which the couple felt was motivated by racist discrimination. They described their frustrations in not being able to evidence racial prejudice, which they felt was indicated by comparison with similarly circumstanced friends who did not receive the same

---

treatment, and by comparison with the White partner's relatively good experience of services up until she met her Black partner.

**Case study 2:**
A health professional described how on returning to the UK with her British husband and child, she experienced real difficulties, not in getting work, but in finding her way through the administration necessary to be allowed to work. To add to the difficulty in navigating her way through an unfamiliar process, she experienced intimidating behaviour from administrative staff:

🗨 *To get my national insurance number I had to go through an interview in the Benefit office. They asked me everything including how I met my husband. I felt insulted especially as I come from the EU. They treated me like a refugee with no passport - it was very intimidating. It was insulting as I'm not asking for citizenship, I'm asking to be an asset, to work for the population and pay tax.*

The health professional's experience of finding welfare and other administrative systems unfamiliar and complicated was echoed by several other participants. This was raised as a particular concern for people who spoke limited English. In chapter 8 we examine how English as an Additional Language tutors have found themselves acting as informal welfare workers, helping students cope with form filling, and other Black and Minority Ethnic participants described fulfilling the same role for peers with less English than themselves. Some participants described how some forms – such as Working Families Tax Credit applications – were even beyond strong English speakers, and how others – such as Child Benefit forms - were easier but only if you had fairly good English. In chapter 8 we look at suggestions for improving support in accessing welfare administration, including multi-lingual Welcome Packs, provision of information through the English as an Additional Language Service, and information and support provided through rural Minority Ethnic networks.

However, a couple of points were made by participants about reluctance to take up benefits, that information and help with form-filling alone would not address. One professionally qualified Asian single parent described how he had finally succumbed to encouragement to accessing benefits once he had run out of savings. He had held out hope that he would remain financially independent through work, and was disappointed that the employment service hadn't been more active in supporting him in his desire to find work. A Chinese waitress observed that her low-income peers in the restaurant industry were also unlikely to take up benefit entitlements:

> 🗨 *Chinese don't like to use benefits - prefer to earn money - there's 'no face' in benefits - especially men like to feel they can earn own money.*

Reluctance to use benefits born of the feeling that self-sufficiency is a marker of personal dignity was also raised by the Asylum Seeker participants in this research.  For them, the bar on working once they arrived in the UK and their dependency on the state was a matter of real frustration.  Their need to be seen to be financially self-sufficient was made further acute by their awareness of the belief among members of the public that they were here for financial benefit.  Moreover, with many people coming from countries which do not have welfare state systems, the notion of benefits is an alien one, and with which many people are unlikely to identify personally. These experiences indicate that several barriers exist between welfare resources and many low-income families to whom they are eligible.

This handbook and supporting tools ⚒ can be accessed at [www.DevonREC.org](www.DevonREC.org)

# Chapter 11
# SUPPORTING SERVICE PROVIDERS

## Themes in this chapter

- Staff awareness and competencies to act on race equality
- Data dependency
- Ethnicity record keeping and monitoring
- Outreach and consultation
- Impact Assessment
- Improving feedback and listening ⚒.

## Introduction

In chapter 2, we set out the brief for the research including the need to recommend the kinds of support required by service providers in order to help them respond to the recommendations arising from the work with Black and Minority Ethnic participants.

To this end, the brief for the research with service providers included:

- research with service-providing staff amongst the breadth of agencies operating in rural areas to assess and acknowledge the help they needed in addressing race equality
- provision of research findings and development of recommendations for action that address the concerns of Black and Minority Ethnic people and give service providers rurally relevant guidance
- development of a business plan for the Racial Equality Council that would drive its future rural work and set the basis for rural partnerships with other Agencies.

The research responded to the brief with the following information outputs:

➔ The business plan was produced as part of the Rural Outreach Project, and is a separate document which can be found at the Racial Equality Council's website www.DevonREC.org  Please refer to this document to find out more about the REC's plans for the next 3 years.

➔ During the 3 years of research, the project worked with a range of service-providers to give them advice as it emerged from the research, and helped develop projects and bids for concrete action on the ground. A list of this work is set out in chapter 2.

➜ The final findings and recommendations that are rurally relevant to service providers are provided in four places in this handbook:

1. This chapter provides a specific focus on the issues raised by service-providers themselves
2. Information that will help service providers is laid out as part of the emerging discussion within the various chapters in this handbook
3. Chapter 12 looks in particular at the recommendations that were made specifically by the participants themselves to guide priorities for action.
4. The Summary Report provides an overview of all the key findings and recommendations.

The brief for work with service-providers was fulfilled over the 3 years of the project by listening to staff concerns among a range of service providers through workshops, meetings and phone discussions with over 180 staff.

It became clear very early on in the research that most service-providing staff struggled with knowing how to respond in the rural setting to race equality. It also became clear that most organisations had little clarity internally about what was going on in terms of race equality, especially within larger organisations. This situation began to change somewhat towards the end of the project when the effect of the Race Relations Amendment Act (2000) was beginning to focus Public Bodies in response to their Specific Duty under the Act to produce a Race Equality Scheme. However, it was still clear that in many organisations, information about race equality procedures and action was not transmitted to staff. In the wake of the amended legislation, Inspectorates and Government support agencies such as the Audit Commission and DIALOG then set about conducting their own research into organisations' race equality practice, to check for, encourage and chivvy action.

Amidst this flux it was decided that a systematic audit of organisational practice was an inappropriate focus for the Rural Outreach Project's research. Instead the project concentrated on developing an understanding of service providers' common difficulties and of the support they felt they needed in addressing race equality issues in rural areas. There was a general feeling among these participants that a frank recognition of the difficulties that individual staff faced was needed as a starting point for overcoming institutional inaction. Whilst the research did hear from some staff who were evasive and even hostile about the issues, the majority of staff were frustrated by their organisation's inertia. Most displayed real

interest in the issues and a desire to be told how they could engage and take action.

## What were the issues for service providers?

For many of the service-providing staff we spoke to, the change in legislation was welcomed in principle, albeit not understood in practical terms. Most knew by professional instinct more than by awareness of the Act that they should be doing something, but overwhelmingly they wanted help with the *how*. Many staff frankly described the difficulty of starting from a base of ignorance and lack of exposure to issues of race inequality, and the majority had not read or had sight of their organisation's race equality policies or schemes. Some others were able to suggest ideas for action themselves, but had had no influence in promoting these ideas within their own organisations. Most staff also felt that their best intentions were frustrated by the rural nature of the Black and Minority Ethnic population: Without geographic communities or community organisations to refer to, staff felt at a loss to know how to reach out to Black and Minority Ethnic people and improve service/user relations. Such reactions summed up the overall picture of the situation described by frontline service-providing staff.

There are a number of direct and obvious responses to this overview.

➔ The first is to underline the need for staff training that has a practical, competency based and rurally relevant curriculum. Training tailored to specific needs is available locally from the Devon Racial Equality Council which commissioned this research. Organisations who commission training from urban or national sources should question the extent to which the training offered addresses rural issues.

➔ A similarly obvious response is to stress the need for communication of policies in a manner that actually gets to staff and helps them to absorb it. Only organisations themselves will be able to sit down and look at their communication and team structures, in order to assess how best to get information to staff. But a good starting point in making that judgement is to ask staff what information they do listen to (and why), how they get hold of it, and where they gather to discuss it with each other.

➔ Two other key responses include: supporting the use of staff ideas by improving the effectiveness and reputation of staff suggestion schemes within organisations; and appointing or recruiting *competent* staff as Race

Equality Champions/Advisors to improve flow of ideas to and from staff as well as to deal with instances where race inequality is identified.

➜      The issue of overcoming outreach to and dialogue with the Black and Minority Ethnic community is not something that can be addressed without multi-agency effort and a commitment to building Multi-Ethnic infrastructure in rural areas. On this issue a single, major proposal is made in this research. The recommendation is that agencies collaborate to fund the appointment of specialist race equality community development workers in each District to facilitate rural multi-ethnic networks and activities, and to build the basis upon which Black and Minority Ethnic rural people can derive peer support, self-organise and engage with service providers. This proposal is discussed further in terms of its advocacy among the Black and Minority Ethnic participants, and it is also set out in detail in the Racial Equality Council's business plan. Two districts have already responded to this proposal and have submitted funding bids for it.

This chapter will examine further these recommendations together with some of the other issues that arose frequently in the work with service-providers, which can be summarized under the following themes:

- Low awareness and limited race equality competencies among staff
- Data-dependency in a data-scarce environment
- Lack of understanding of Ethnicity Monitoring principles and failure to capture meaningful data
- Difficulties with outreach and consultation
- Consultee exposure and fatigue

- **<u>Low awareness and limited race equality competencies among staff</u>**

---

**Some notes from the research:**

One voluntary sector manager described how the organisation did not proactively recruit Black and Minority Ethnic volunteers for fear that they would experience racism on placement with other organisations.

An advice worker reported that staff were fearful of handing out leaflets about race equality issues to Black and Minority Ethnic people for fear of offending them by treating them differently.

An agency worker described reluctance to provide translated information

---

because of the risk of raising expectations that the service would also be available multi-lingually.

An agency representative reported that a valued Black and Minority Ethnic member of an agency advisory panel left after being described by a colleague as a 'nigger among the woodpile'.

Two groups of trainers found that, even when training was offered for free, audiences such as play workers and clergy expressed limited interest in taking up the opportunity.

A local authority worker described how the organisation needed help to know how to deal with a group of residents who had made it clear that 'they don't have and don't want any Black people living there'.

A number of staff described having attended training events outside the area, in which they were chastised for their ignorance and made to feel responsible for racism in the Southwest. The participants were acutely aware of their lack of knowledge about how to progress race equality and culturally-aware services but described how the training experiences had made them frightened to admit it for fear of recrimination. *'People need a safe environment in which to ask questions and learn in order to make a difference.'*

Senior staff in one organisation expressed real concern that their lack of personal exposure to race equality issues rendered them unable to take responsibility for implementing their Duties under the Amended Race Relations Act.

Senior staff in another organisation described how in addition to race equality guidance materials and handbooks, frontline staff needed training to alert them to the need for the use of such materials *'staff don't know what it is that they need to know'.*

One health worker reported asking her Trust if there was any form of anti-discrimination policy governing staff and patient relations. She was told '*no policy existed because there was no problem here'.*

The picture emerging from work with service-providers was that, whilst a few staff had both race equality skills and experience, most had had little experience of race equality practice in their work. For the majority, this stemmed from a number of factors:

♦ Organisations' lack of systematic planning of activities that staff could follow

♦ Poor communication to staff about the organisation's commitment to race equality and what was expected of staff members

♦ Lack of training related to staff's specific roles on how they could play a part in their organisation's responsibilities to promote race equality

♦ Lack of good quality, rurally relevant and empowering training

♦ Limited levels of interest among colleagues about race equality, having a 'slowing down' effect on team effort and interest, even where some individuals were motivated

♦ Lack of staff exposure personally or in the work setting to the real consequences of race inequality for Black and Minority Ethnic people

♦ Lack of ability to imagine and 'think into' what the impact of race inequality is, or how organisational processes can bring inequality about

♦ Inability to take frequent advice on the issues because of lack of competent specialist workers within organisations, and because of the limited funding capacity of specialist agencies such as the Racial Equality Council to respond to the high levels of demand throughout the county.

Most of these factors would be overcome by key measures including:

➔ **Good quality, role specific, rurally relevant training.** Such training needs to be enabling and go beyond consciousness/ awareness raising, and therefore involves more time than a day. Moreover, in situations where staff have had no exposure to the issues the first stages of sensitisation will take considerable time before job-focussed training issues can be addressed. To optimise the use of expenditure, training could be delivered distinctly but simultaneously across all the equality themes (race, ability, sexuality, gender, age) whilst pitching training sessions at specific role types (customer care, staff management, work relationships, service planning and evaluation etc). Training curricula can also be tailored to the differing levels of legal detail needed by the various grades of staff. The degree of training needs to be proportionate to the potential a staff member has in his/her role to exert powers over Black and Minority Ethnic staff/ service users. This power analysis should be done in respect of his/her organisational seniority and management functions or in respect of his/her role in facilitating a person's access to the service. Training must enable staff to work out the practical things they can do in relation to their roles if it is

to be effective. All training must also be accompanied by facilitative changes in the way that organisations operate, to enable staff to implement the things that they are learning to do. The impact of training should be monitored by thorough appraisal systems, which should also enable staff to flag up where the organisational environment is making it difficult for them to use their learning.

➔ **Strong leadership and clear organisational commitment.** Public bodies must now comply with the Race Relations Amendment Act (2000), and produce Race Equality Schemes of work setting out how they are taking account of their race equality duties, in every part of their work. Organisational commitment is not communicated corporately through the simple existence of a Race Equality Scheme itself, but in the messages that senior staff communicate about the importance of implementing the Schemes of work and measuring their impact. Senior staff themselves need competent understandings of race equality, if their messages are to enlist the confidence of staff in their leadership on the issue. The translation of leadership commitment into corporate commitment is only achieved by enabling all staff to be clear about what practical activities they are being expected to undertake as individuals. In the research, we found that most staff did not know what their organisation's race equality policies were or how to implement them. Moreover, staff were very sceptical about their senior and executive managers' commitment to race equality, and assumed that all that was expected was to vaguely satisfy some of the Inspectorates' tick boxes on the matter. It was generally perceived that attention to race equality would require extra resources and that within organisations' grand scheme of priorities resources would not be justified. In fact the perception among many staff that their organisation paid only lip-service to race equality was expressed by staff in a manner that was precipitately indicative of a loss of faith in their employer's driving values. This creates an argument that leadership and commitment to equality and quality in service delivery is an important factor in maintaining staff morale. The argument follows the line that staff take organisational tokenism as a signal that by extension their work is of token value. Institutional tokenism undermines individuals' vocational attitudes to their roles, thereby diminishing job satisfaction and damaging morale. The Local Government organisation DIALOG will be publishing its own arguments for the prioritisation of race equality,

making the legal, business and other cases for this, particularly in rural areas.  This guidance will be available in autumn 2003 from DIALOG@lg-employers.gov.uk where the cd of the report entitled *Race is Relevant* can be ordered at a price of £30. Other research describing *Action on equality and diversity in local government*  and presenting the arguments for such action can be found at www.local.odpm.gov.uk/research/crosscut/crosscut.htm . Ultimately, the law places a Duty on Public Bodies to promote race equality, and only those in positions of power in organisations can enable their staff to fulfil this obligation, by commissioning training and developing a culture in which commitment to making services accessible to the hardest-to-reach is seen as the best indicator of the level of quality and commitment applied to the service-delivery ethos.

➔ **Use of appraisal systems to support staff and monitor progress in relation to race equality.**  Another means of transmitting information to staff about Race Equality Schemes is through appraisal systems, allowing staff and their managers to work out role-specific responses to their organisation's race equality schemes, and enabling managers to identify staff who particularly need training.  This requires, however, that training is prioritised for staff who conduct appraisals, to make sure that they themselves are able to help staff to identify positive action they can take and to assess weaknesses in understanding or performance.

➔ **Availability of specialist advice and advocacy staff**. In the course of the research we were directed to many people who had been given responsibility for race equality issues in their organisations, often within a wider 'diversity' brief.  Most of these staff whom we encountered were diffident about this designation, and felt ill-prepared.  Typically the role was appointed to an existing member of staff who was given the task of checking out what the organisation had to do in terms of government expectations in one form or another.   Whilst several of these staff approached this task with vigour and saw it as an issue of quality service, others were not proactive, and most certainly did not see themselves as a point of reference or expertise on the issue for other staff to access. By contrast, what service-providing staff canvassed in this research wanted was a point of reference to whom they could bring issues and incidents for competent and sensitive resolution, and someone to whom they could turn for expertise in dealing with specific client cases and with planning in general.

Many staff felt that case-by-case advice was likely to be the most effective way of helping them address race equality and build their competency to do so. Most service-providers did not have that facility available to staff.  In the absence of this facility, many organisations were turning to their Black and Minority Ethnic staff to act as race equality experts, which these staff often felt placed an unwelcome spotlight upon them.  Many felt uneasy about being singled out to comment on the organisation's plans when their own experience of prejudice in the organisation had not been addressed. Moreover, most Black and Minority Ethnic staff felt that, whilst they could contribute to their organisations' race equality initiatives by making suggestions and providing feedback, their own ethnic identity did not qualify them to speak as representatives or specialists on behalf of the whole, diverse, Black and Minority Ethnic population. (🎤 *I don't like standing out here and that people think I am a race expert…People don't realise that Minority Ethnic people are not homogeneous.)*  Hence, for these reasons outlined above, access to specialist advice is a key issue for organisations.  There are a number of means by which to address it:

➢ Access to specialist, local, race equality community development workers (such as proposed by the Racial Equality Council).

➢ Multi-agency access to trained and supported Community Contributors, who would bring forward learning from Multi-Ethnic networks (such as proposed by the Racial Equality Council), and also their own expertise or experience of specific issues (e.g. health, housing)

➢ Consultancy services from the Racial Equality Council on specific areas of policy or practice development (either on a fee-by-case basis or as part of a Service Level Agreement).

➢ Complainant Aid services from the Racial Equality Council as part of multi-agency case support.  However, service providers need to sign-post staff who are often unaware of referral services to this facility.

➢ Appointment of specialist staff to act as race equality advisors and champions.  This could be done either by recruiting staff with specialist skills in cross-cultural communication and service provision and with counselling and mediation skills, or by training an existing member of staff with a strong aptitude for this work.  Staff in this position, however, need to have influence at a senior level in the organisation to bring about

change and build the confidence of staff in their efficacy, but they also need to be seen as sufficiently detached from the influences of internal organisational politics to gain staff trust. Conceivably, such specialist staff could also be shared among local or neighbouring organisations, provided that they could make themselves sufficiently accessible and known to staff.

➢ Staff also suggested that they would value 'buddy schemes' in which they could have a link with a staff member in another organisation with greater experience of race equality issues and multi-ethnic working. It was also suggested that these schemes would allow for exchange periods during which staff gained experience of working in a multi-ethnic setting. This idea was especially popular among health staff. The idea has many benefits in that it allows for a kind of on the job training during exchange and through telephone access to their buddy. However, the idea does not necessarily provide for rural dimensions of race equality to be covered.


- **Data-dependency in a data-scarce environment**

Another key factor preventing race equality action in organisations was the assumption that nothing can be done without quantitative and geographic data about the location and density of Black and Minority Ethnic people and the perception that that data is not available. This assumption that data must come before action appeared to stem from several sources:

- the belief, still widely held by many people, that the minority ethnic population in Devon is so small as to be negligible and that only numeric data will prove otherwise
- the tendency to argue that unless 'sufficient' numbers of people are proven to exist as a significant proportion of the population action cannot be justified. (The CRE code of practice on the Race Relations Amendment Act (2000) nullifies this argument: *"Due regard does not mean that race equality is less important when the ethnic minority population is small".*)
- the belief that somehow demographic data will supply service providers with all the information they need to plan services, or that it will help them find Black and Minority Ethnic communities. (Most service providers need qualitative information to address their consultation duties under the Race Relations Amendment Act (2000) and, as chapters 3 and 5 describe, it is rare to find geographically clustered co-ethnic communities.)

- the tendency to look to quantitative data for help, when no community leaders can be identified to help agencies access qualitative data.
- The typical reliance among agencies upon sample questionnaire and tick box surveys, which inevitably fail within a random sample to elicit more than a handful of responses from Black and Minority Ethnic people, making the statistical value of this information minimal.

One Local Authority representative epitomized this data-dependency with the remark that they would not take action on race equality until the Racial Equality Council had told them where the Black and Minority Ethnic people in their district were.

For some purposes demographic data is a real need, for example in setting benchmarks for monitoring the number of people accessing services. This benchmarking and monitoring can be invaluable in flagging up where there is inequality of opportunity. Many people pointed out, however, that Census data is the only source of demographic data available to them but that it goes out of date rapidly. Given that the rural Black and Minority Ethnic population has increased on average by over 100% over 10 years this is a valid concern. There was also considerable lack of faith in the 1991 Census in relation to ethnicity data, because people believed that the collection of data from the Minority Ethnic population had not been thoroughly pursued or supported. For example, information from the Devon & Cornwall Chinese Association indicated that the number of Chinese people in the county was far higher than the Census suggested. The 2001 Census has used new data collection and analysis methods, which it hopes has addressed those issues. More information can be found on these methods by looking at the Office for National Statistics web site and referring to information about the 'One Number Census'.

Whilst the 2001 Census remains an important source of information, and provides a greater depth of accessible data this time round because of advances in information technology, the issue of the need for constantly up-to-date data is important. Data specialists suggested during the course of this research that the only way to get better information, would be via collection of ethnicity information through the data collected when a person registers with a GP (doctor). Almost everyone registers with a GP within a year of moving to an area. Travellers are the main exception to this rule, and this issue is being addressed in Devon through the multi-agency Health Forum. Patient information is already used widely for all kinds of government statistical planning and demographic analysis, and is processed in such a way that patient confidentiality is not compromised. One of the

fields of data not yet collected at GP registration however is ethnicity. If it were, this data could help to produce regular data on Minority Ethnic demography, along with all the other demographic analysis that GP data currently provides. This research proposed early on that this issue should be addressed, and referred the issue to the Health Authority and to the County Council with a specific paper on this matter. It is an issue that has attracted interest elsewhere in the UK and has been the subject of some Department of Health pilot projects.

- **Lack of understanding of Ethnicity Monitoring principles and failure to capture meaningful data.**

The research found that data is also scarce in Devon, because agencies are struggling to capture data about the ethnicity of their own service-users and staff. On the whole, service-provider participants described a very poor picture of the way that agencies approach Ethnicity Record Keeping and Monitoring (ERKM).

Fundamentally, even though many staff knew that somewhere along the line ERKM was expected of their organisations, very few had a clear idea about the rationale for ERKM or how it could benefit them as service - providers, or their service-users. We also found that the lack of understanding among service-providers about why they should be doing ERKM communicated itself to service users who felt very suspicious of agencies' intentions in collecting the data, and worried about how it would be used. This in turn fed back to the service-providers, either anecdotally or because of the low numbers of people filling in ERKM questions, who became yet more worried about asking ethnicity questions which they could not justify themselves.

We even heard from sources in an Agency who described an argument within the service about the value of ethnicity monitoring. According to the sources the prevalent view was that everyone should have same access to services and that therefore special service monitoring for certain groups was unnecessary. We also heard from service-provider staff who reported that their organisations did do ERKM but that they didn't know the results. Some service provider staff felt that their organisations were doing ERKM just so they could tick Inspectorates' boxes to say they had.

Apart from the lack of understanding of the principles of ERKM, staff also described mechanistic problems which lead to poor data availability. The

first weakness in ERKM systems was the point at which data is collected. Mangers described how staff simply forgot to ask clients about ethnicity, and others described how staff were too embarrassed to ask for fear of causing offence. For a few participants, the whole idea of ERKM was too confused in their minds with the notion of racial segregation to feel comfortable with it. Some participants reported problems further down the ERKM process, in that different ethnicity classification systems were being used within single organisations. The underlying reasons for this included attempts by staff to devise systems that would collect more detailed information than the broad census classifications, and therefore be more meaningful practically, and the obligation to use different government departments' systems. We also heard of instances in which the paper-based classification systems used to collect data were not the same as the computer based classification systems that were used to process the data. The consequence was that ERKM data could not be collated within organisations, and that similar problems existed with merging or comparing data between organisations. Furthermore, we also heard that sharing of ethnicity data between agencies was noted especially as a rural problem because it was perceived that, in rural areas with small Black and Minority Ethnic populations, agencies have had less experience of race equality and of data protection work. Senior staff also described a lack of understanding among colleagues of the way ethnicity information can be used under the Data Protection and Crime and Disorder Acts, and noted that agencies erred on the side of caution because of this lack of awareness.

There are good reasons to collect ethnicity data, among them

♦ The need to assess whether members of the Black and Minority Ethnic population might be experiencing discrimination in the way services are made accessible to them or delivered to them

♦ The need to be able to communicate with people who have specific interests or needs about opportunities or to seek their advice

To be convinced of these reasons and to understand them in the context of the particular services they offer, service providers need good training about ERKM. Staff need to be clear about the purposes of ERKM, how to design collection and analysis systems, how to process and use the data, and how to feed back the benefits to Black and Minority Ethnic clients/staff. Staff who are responsible for managing ERKM systems and frontline staff who administer it need to be able to clearly advocate its benefits, in order to gain the confidence of Black and Minority Ethnic people in the process. In chapter 4 we have also proposed that confidence in the process is improved – for those supplying and using the data – by

using a classification system that facilitates prescribed classification and self-description simultaneously. Such a system is laid out below:

| Please select and tick heading below and describe your ethnic identity as you wish, alongside it: | | | |
|---|---|---|---|
| | ✓ | | Your own description: |
| White | | British | |
| | | Irish | |
| | | Other white | |
| Mixed | | White and Black Caribbean | |
| | | White and Black African | |
| | | White and Asian | |
| | | Other mixed | |
| Asian or Asian British | | Indian | |
| | | Pakistani | |
| | | Bangladeshi | |
| | | Other Asian | |
| Black or Black British | | Caribbean | |
| | | African | |
| | | Other Black | |
| Chinese | | Chinese | |
| Other | | Other ethnic group | |

This system provides data that can either be accessed in detailed or aggregated form, depending on the appropriate user purpose. It also enables respondents to describe themselves in a way that they feel comfortable with. The research has also found that increased ERKM response rates are likely if ERKM forms contain a clear description of the way in which the data will be used, who will see it in its original form, and the benefits of monitoring ethnicity. Done better, ERKM processes could provide an immensely improved quantitative demographic resource both within agencies and across agencies.

- **Difficulties with outreach and consultation, and addressing consultee exposure and fatigue**

Most organisations, however, described a need for good qualitative data as the basis on which to address race equality issues effectively. Whilst ERKM is a good way of flagging up potential areas of discrimination (and is therefore the basis for many of the Specific Duties on public bodies under the Race Relations Amendment Act (2000)), active dialogue with

Black and Minority Ethnic staff and clients is needed to investigate the causes of problems and to identify the most effective ways of solving them.

Most good practice guidance on outreach and consultation is usually based on the premise that qualitative data should be sought from Black and Minority Ethnic and Faith organisations in the locality of concern. The assumption is that these organisations exist, formally network with a considerable membership, and can either speak for that membership on the basis of internal data gathering processes or can facilitate consultation with members. As described in chapters 3 and 5, in rural parts of Devon, there is almost no formal networking of Black and Minority Ethnic people. What exists tends to be informal, remains out of the reach or knowledge of the majority of Black and Minority Ethnic rural dwellers, and is not geared at addressing welfare and social inclusion issues. Similar limitations for faith groups are also described in chapter 9. Even the regional and centrally based Minority Ethnic / Race Equality groups and services that do exist are not immune to this problem. In chapter 2 we set out how this research tackled the problem, and demonstrated that without the creation of a Black and Minority Ethnic rural infrastructure there is no easy way of addressing the difficulties of rural outreach.

The presents a real problem for service providers and also adds to the 'invisibility' of the Black and Minority Ethnic population. As a consequence, most service providers had no specific inclusion measures in place aimed at Black and Minority Ethnic people, and others relied heavily on one or two known Black and Minority Ethnic staff and contacts as consultation references. Staff and such consultees alike were unhappy about the levels of exposure and expectation overload placed on individuals, with one staff member commenting that in their experience, due to the amount of agency demand at any one time:

> *20 agencies could be descending on just 1 Black person*

During the course of the research, an analysis of this problem, as felt by service-providers, was constructed together with a solution framework to address the issues. This analysis is set out in the web-based appendix to this chapter (www.DevonREC.org), in the section entitled *'Effective engagement – a rural strategy for Black and Minority Ethnic inclusion and support'*. The technique used in constructing this analysis is known as Objective Oriented Planning and has the benefit that, in constructing the problem analysis, it also examines impact and the benefit that the solution construction also provides a description of the knock-on benefits of resolving the problem.

The outcome of the analysis of the problem of outreach for service providers was that the following measures are needed to support rural service providers in meeting their outreach and consultation duties:

➔ Better demographic information as a basis for planning and focussing consultation, ideally provided through GP registration data processing (as described above).

➔ Better data-sharing between agencies, facilitated by data management specialists with an understanding of the legal framework in relation to the promotion of race equality and elimination of racism.

➔ Community development outreach workers, with race equality specialist skills, to establish and facilitate Multi-Ethnic networks bringing together Black and Minority Ethnic rural people and enabling them to set the consultation agenda via the networks.

This latter recommendation is perhaps the most important measure that service providers could take to support their staff with outreach and consultation, and to address the concerns of the Black and Minority Ethnic population. These networks would serve a number of purposes, including the opportunity for people to meet and raise issues of concern in a relaxed setting. By having these networks, the members would be able to collate the issues of concern, discuss them and put them forward to the relevant service providers. In this way Black and Minority Ethnic people would have specific and creative opportunities to inform the development of services in their communities, and to raise issues in a way which feels 'safe' and 'positive' amongst other network activities. This form of networking and opinion gathering would cut out the need for numerous, agency-led and snapshot consultation exercises. Moreover, this research has demonstrated that outreach to people in rural areas requires multiple lines of outreach, extensive effort applied to 'snowballing' contacts, and a great deal of time and face to face work with individuals, because of the lack of rural Black and Minority Ethnic 'representative' groups. Many rural service providers approached the project wondering if we had found the magic ingredient that would succeed in helping their various consultation exercises reach a significant number of Black and Minority Ethnic people within their sample. However, the project experience indicates that quick snapshot exercises in the current rural situation are unlikely to reach Black and Minority Ethnic people because of the lack of infrastructure or groups through which to reach people. The only magic or panacea-like ingredient then is this missing ingredient of a rural Minority Ethnic infrastructure. To address this problem by creating and facilitating rural networks will take resources, but has benefits that would more than

compensate for the current frustrations agencies face in meeting their specific duties, and it is an outlay that can be shared with great cost-efficiency between service-providers. The Racial Equality Council's business plan sets out the costs of facilitating such networks with community development support. The Racial Equality Council also has fully worked up project proposals and person specifications, which have been the basis of bids with two Districts and with the Children's Fund to draw down government and voluntary sector funding for rural networks. Other agencies interested in partnership working to establish rural networks in this way are also invited to contact the Racial Equality Council.

The primary benefits of such networks for the Black and Minority Ethnic members are discussed further in chapter 12. However, there are also multiple spin-off benefits for agencies. For example, evidence collected during this research indicates that paper-based consultation exercises are unlikely to generate responses from key sections of the Black and Minority Ethnic population for reasons including time pressure, cultural differences in interest in written media, language and literacy. The ability to conduct orally-based and language-sensitive consultation through networks would enable agencies to change their consultation culture and overcome communication issues and the difficulties of knowing how many languages in which to provide written information in mail-shots (over 50 languages are spoken by pupils in Devon Schools). Unions could also be helped to make their services accessible to a wider membership, providing individuals with another layer of support. There are also the benefits for agencies described earlier in this chapter of having specialists on hand to provide advice and to make referrals to specialist support. Networks also provide the opportunity for distribution of information, for example through a network newsletter. Such media could help employers to meet their workforce proportionality targets by attracting the interest of potential Black and Minority Ethnic applicants. Networks also provide the means by which skills among the Black and Minority Ethnic membership can be used to support race equality initiatives: For example, the establishment of a volunteer/professional interpreters' pool, or the creation of a community contributors' service, in which people with specialist interests and skills can be recruited to provide advice.

Even with the existence of facilitated community development networks agencies still need to think carefully about the way they plan the use of consultation with the Black and Minority Ethnic population and the participation of community contributors into their structures. Consultation is not an end in itself. To be meaningful, it must ultimately lead to

participant influence and improved relationships between service and user, or employer and employee.

The web-based appendix to this chapter (www.DevonREC.org) contains a section about increasing the participation and influence of Black and Minority Ethnic individuals. It provides further details about what both participation and influence can mean, and the points in the service-provider/user relationship when user participation in shaping services can be sought. The web-based appendix (www.DevonREC.org) then provides a tool for thinking through the design of participation-influence (consultation) process in your organisation.

- **Impact Assessment**

The ability to consult with Black and Minority Ethnic service-users and public is a pre-requisite of the Specific Duty upon public bodies to assess the impact that their services are having upon Black and Minority Ethnic people. Given the difficulties described in this chapter with outreach and data collection, Impact Assessment is a daunting challenge for most service-providers. The proposal in this research, that access to consultation information could experience an accelerated paradigm shift into gear through Multi-Ethnic rural networks, would be an unprecedented help to agencies in working out how to improve the impact of service provision to Black and Minority Ethnic people.

The web-based appendix to this chapter (www.DevonREC.org) also provides some help with a method for assessing the impact of policies and practices that govern the way that service-providers work. This method has been piloted with one District Council, but there is no official, recommended method, so whilst models such as the method provided in the appendix are not yet widely tested, they do at least provide a staring point for agencies to experiment with and develop.

The Impact Assessment method proposed in the web-based appendix (www.DevonREC.org) ties in with the participation-influence model in the Appendix, which we have called the participation pyramid. The participation pyramid describes the stages that need to be gone through in order to feed consultation data into an organisation, and take that information through a process of dissemination and development so that it ultimately leads to changes and improvements in service delivery. There are 5 steps in this participation-influence process. The Impact Assessment

method can be used at Step 3 of the process, in which consultation information and other monitoring data is used to decide which services need improvement and how, and what new opportunities there are for promoting race equality. The Impact Assessment method also provides the means for identifying and designing monitoring systems that will improve the flow of information about service delivery and flag-up problems. The method basically consists of a matrix of questions, which can be adapted by service-providers, to suit the type of service that is being assessed. The method also makes suggestions about who should lead this process. Information about the legal background of Impact Assessment is also included in the web-based appendix (www.DevonREC.org).

Information about Impact Assessment will also be available from Autumn 2003 from DIALOG in the form of the report *Race is Relevant* and can be ordered from DIALOG@lg-employers.gov.uk.

**A final note about improving feedback from staff and clients:**

Direct feedback from staff and clients as issues arise is a good means of picking up consultation information as issues arise. However, success in getting feedback depends on people feeling that their views will be handled well. In the web-based Appendix to this chapter (www.DevonREC.org), a method called the Quick Evaluator is set out - a means for staff and managers to encourage clients and employees respectively to feedback information about their experience as service users and employees.
In the course of the research a participant also suggested a simple listening framework, to help service-provider staff to improve the way they handle feedback and complaint and to derive benefit from the information. The framework is set out below, and could be the basis for a card which staff can keep as an aide memoir:

| Addressing inequality |
|---|
| ✓ |
| ❑ **Welcome** the fact that a problem has been identified. |
| ❑ **Listen** carefully to what has been experienced. |
| ❑ **Empathise** with the way the problem is being felt. |
| ❑ **Explore** the detail and the facts of the problem sensitively. |
| ❑ **Plan** a mutually agreed course of action. |
| ❑ **Feed** the issue into your Equality Steering Group for action. |
| ❑ **Report** back to the complainant on progress. |
| ❑ **Check** that the issue has been resolved. |

## Appendicies

This handbook and supporting tools ✖ can be accessed at
www.DevonREC.org

The Appendix to this Chapter is web-based and includes:

- ✖. Increasing the participation and influence of Black and Minority
  Ethnic individuals – designing consultation into your planning and
  impact assessment process
- ✖. Impact Assessment – a method
- ✖. The Quick Evaluator technique
- Effective Engagement – a rural strategy for Black and Minority Ethnic
  inclusion and support
- ✖. Objective Oriented Planning – a technique used in the research
  for developing recommendations with workshop participants.

# Chapter 12
## PROMOTING CULTURAL DIVERSITY &
## IMPROVING RACE EQUALITY – *the participants' suggestions*

## Introduction

A comment heard often in race equality circles, and once again in this research was that *'race equality work should be done with people, not to or for them'*.  It's an issue that Race Equality Councils and any one else interested in race equality work must heed and it was with this in mind that the Devon & Exeter Racial Equality Council's Rural Outreach Project was set in motion.

The project was designed so that Black and Minority Ethnic participants spoke for themselves.  Participants weren't asked to put ticks in someone else's preconceived boxes.  Questions were open and participants were supported with creative thinking space – especially in workshops and in discussion.  Ideas brought up by participants helped to shape the research, as they were raised again for debate with others.

So perhaps the project's most important function was to facilitate the arena in which rural families and individuals could set Devon's race equality agenda.  Participants did this by deliberating on their experiences and then after much sharing and discussion, responding to the question:
***What would your suggestions be for the best way to promote cultural diversity and better race relations in Devon?***

Participants usually made these recommendations at the end of their individual contributions to the research, in specific response to a request for their advice about the best means of promoting cultural diversity and race equality.  This chapter focuses on these proposals.

From the responses, a number of key areas of concern emerged:

| Recommendations for Promoting Cultural Diversity & Improving Race Relations |
|---|
| Order of priority is determined by the frequency with which these recommendations arose. |

1. **Consciousness raising and training (including in schools)**
2. **Networks and peer support**
3. **Bridge building across cultures – celebrations of culture and diversity**
4. **Improving access to information and services**
5. **Race equality support services**
6. **Equality in employment**
7. **Political action and leadership**
8. **Media**
9. **Initiative on the part of Black and Minority Ethnic individuals**
10. **Consultation and influence**
11. **Effect and promotion of demographic change**
12. **Inter-religious understanding**
13. **Cultural centres**
14. **Closer look at trans-racial adoption**

It should also be noted that, in addition to the priorities identified by participants in this chapter, many key learning points and recommendations also arose from the main body of the discussion with participants in addition to the priorities they selected above for race equality action. Major learning points also emerged from the research when taken as a whole. These learning points supplement and underpin the priority recommendations put forward by the participants, and are discussed in chapters 1 – 11 of this Handbook. The Handbook has been structured by identifying the subjects that attracted the greatest density of discussion among participants, and apportioning each of these to a chapter. (A similar method was also used to construct the analysis of the participants' priority recommendations.) Chapters 1 – 11 set the scene for the key recommendations put forward by the participants in this final chapter, and examine the underlying trends and background issues that also need to be addressed. Please refer to the chapter summaries, in addition to this chapter for an overview of all the emergent recommendations.

## How were these key recommendations formulated?

Participants were asked for their suggestions about how to promote cultural diversity and improve race relations. We went through all of the responses and allocated each of the ideas expressed by every participant with a label which briefly summarised the ideas. We then sorted and grouped these concepts under emergent headings. By looking at each heading and counting the number of ideas that had been grouped within it, we were able to see the amount of concern associated with each recommendation. That is not to say that some recommendations matter and others don't. They all matter. But it does enable us to see which actions the participants feel will make the most difference.

In this chapter we look in detail at the ideas within each recommendation, and explore some of the issues that will be relevant to service-providers in addressing them. Particular attention is given to the commentary for the first two recommendations. This is because the body of the research confirms that the need for improved consciousness-raising and training, and the creation of rural Multi-Ethnic networks, are major strategic activities required to advance race equality and support cultural diversity in rural Devon.

The recommendations as put forward by the participants are set out in the boxes below, illustrated with participant anecdotes, and the recommendation boxes are followed by discussion and links to related chapters.

---

### 1. Consciousness raising and training

We collated 62 suggestions from participants under this heading.
Of the 62, 29 related to education in schools.
The remaining 33 suggestions related to other audiences that participants felt should be targeted for consciousness-raising, and the manner in which they felt it should be done in order to change attitudes.

#### Audiences

Participants' feeling about whose awareness needed to be raised ranged from the general to the specific.

- Several people felt attitudes across society needed to change.
Others felt that in particular, important audiences for attention are:

- schools
- parents

---

- older generations
- service-providing staff

> *I don't know if I can find a better life in the UK. Perhaps it would be better if people in Devon can change their mentality.*

Concern about general consciousness raising was usually attached to a feeling that only an attitudinal change in society would make a difference. Participants simply wanted an end to rude, invasive and offensive language and behaviour. You can see more detail about the kinds of reactions many of the participants were subjected to in chapter 6. In the chapter 6, participants also describe how they deal with those reactions. Many respond by trying to engage in conversation and trying to inform a person's attitude. It's often difficult or impossible to do this. It's also unreasonable to expect the individuals of the minority population to single handedly field the prejudice that comes without warning from parts of the wider population.

> *Awareness raising means it needs to become real… so the people who are targeted need to speak up. But that's difficult to do and you hope it will just go away.*

One participant suggested an alternative to individuals' isolated attempts to change a few attitudes:

> *You could have leaflets advertising cultural diversity and better race relations, left in public places, such as Town Hall, Libraries, Sports Centres.*

Other participants identified specific sections of society where consciousness raising could be concentrated.

The majority view was that children needed to be educated in school about issues of culture and race relations. Concern was expressed for the ability of white local young people to integrate into cosmopolitan work and society outside of Devon, as well as for the welfare of Black and Minority Ethnic children experiencing racist bullying.

> *All schools should have many topics of discussion about other religions and cultures, otherwise children will get the shock of their lives when they eventually leave Devon!*

But most importantly, the focus on work in schools arose from the view that it is only possible to eliminate prejudice by working on the next generation whilst they can still be reached through the school environment.

*You need to focus on work in schools – it's too late for adults.*

*The only real way to get change is through education projects in schools - i.e long term initiatives. You can't change the adults. You can only work with the kids and give them understanding of each other to carry through to adult life. You can't change racism in adults.*

Other participants cautioned that work with children had to be accompanied by work with parents:

*Education in schools is the only way forward, but it's difficult if the kids are surrounded by racist views in society - like those of my parents-in-law – I haven't made any difference to them in years.*

Some participants also felt that attitudes among the older generations also needed attention:

*Getting rid of the prejudices which are rooted in some older British people would help.*

The workplace was also identified as a key target audience for consciousness raising, because of the benefits it would bring to the Black and Minority Ethnic population as a workforce and as users of services. Perhaps a key reason why participants identified schools and the workplace as prime audiences is because of the opportunities those environments present for children and staff to spend time giving considerable thought to the issues, and for skilled facilitators to help with examination of the issues and the responses that are needed.

*We need to raise awareness in staff, the population and organisations. We need to break down prejudice which comes from irrational ideas or from inability to cope with complex ideas. Schools have a very important role in promoting race equality.*

Several participants pointed out that it's not only the choice of audience that matters, but also the way in which race equality is covered that is important.

**<u>Getting messages across and understood</u>**

A number of ingredients for successful consciousness raising were suggested:

- Getting the reality of racism understood through empathy.

*Most people don't believe rural racism exists. To say ' we don't tolerate this' requires you to say it from a point of belief rather than dogma or policy. So you need to convince people that racism and discrimination exist. The Stephen Lawrence Inquiry was just another Inquiry but what made it different was the reaction and involvement of the mother and father. It was something you could see and the break up of the family and the emotions touched everyone across the land - everyone could empathise with those emotions. You need to **feel** it to see the senselessness.*

*You have to show people in the community that discrimination could spread and has wider effects. You need to find the point that touches the officials' worlds - you need to find their sensitive points.*

- The need to penetrate the armour and world-view of prejudice.

*Most bigots have a buffer around them and don't get touched by the community. If they really believe in <u>in</u>equality they'll structure their lives so as not to allow anything that will contradict their belief.*

- Education about global issues.
- Providing a learning environment in which it is safe to make mistakes and in which trainees are able to test their ideas out.

*Training needs to be interactive to check people's understanding and to let them test out their thoughts. People need to know they're allowed to make mistakes in the training environment.*

- Black and Minority Ethnic people as educators/ trainers.
- Confidence-building initiatives for Black and Minority Ethnic members of the public so they can take the lead on bridge-building
- Black and Minority Ethnic members of the workforce providing mentoring support for staff wanting to implement race equality in their work – for example as trans-cultural medicine mentors for other Health staff .

- Practical training for service providers' 'how to' do race equality.

  *Service providers really need training in the 'how tos' and also they're worried about being PC which holds them up.*

- Packaging of race equality training within equal opportunities training for service providers, in order to get more people 'in the door'.
- Spreading training over a period of time.

  *Awareness raising is [should be] gradual – it produces tensions to force people to respond – the result in America is effective segregation, with Black kids' school buses.*

- Mainstreaming education about different cultures, world affairs and multi-culturalism in all aspects of the school curriculum. E.g. History, English language, Citizenship, Sports, Religious Studies, Science etc..
- Involving local Black and Minority Ethnic families in sharing aspects of their culture in class.
- Cultural exchange – schools linking with multi cultural schools, visits and opportunities for intercultural play.

  *Kids miss out here all the time because they're all white Christian - they lose out and are very sheltered in education because diversity is not around them. Most kids haven't seen black children. As a teacher I try to include multi-cultural links from the point of view of multi-ethnic Britain. It's difficult to bring mutli-culture into education because of lack of resources and time and money. I'd like to have an exchange - but where is the nearest multi cultural school? – I'd just like the kids to have intercultural play. There could be intercultural visits - a proper school-to-school link, not just a one-off session. This would alleviate ignorance and racism in parents and in the children's heads. Kids here never use racist language but I suspect that due to lack of exposure parents may be racist due to ignorance. Lots of kids have never even been to the beach or to restaurants or eaten other sorts of foods.*

- Using education about race equality as an alternative to punishment for children who bully their Black and Minority Ethnic peers.
- Education for pupils about promoting equality and tackling racism, combined with training for school management and staff on how to prevent and address racism.

*The schools need to be more aware. My daughter said that at school in Sidmouth she said she was coffee colour but the teacher insisted that she was white. Schools need to accept colour and should have some way of checking kids are alright and checking that teachers are not prejudiced (like my headmaster had been) and checking all kids are getting a good education. They should do education on anti-discrimination.*

- Consciousness raising – among FE & HE students through sport, quizzes, food festivals

Training and consciousness raising is the prime recommendation put forward by participants in this research. It came up so often, because they felt that ignorance is the main cause of prejudice. The only way to counter ignorance is to provide the kind of information that will help people see things differently. The key environments for this work are in schools and in the workplace, where people in positions of responsibility have the opportunity to facilitate education about race equality, for important and sizeable audiences. Consciousness raising is also important because as a proactive, preventative measure, it's more likely to have long term impact. There's also another reason why it's better to prevent a problem than to focus on picking up the pieces: the pieces are often kept out of sight. You can read more about how people cope with prejudice and racist incidents in chapter 6, but you will see that there are many reasons why people don't report the racism they experience. This makes preventative measures all the more important.

*Awareness work will have ultimate benefits for those Minorities who prefer to keep quiet rather than report.*

For the participants, the key components of the recommendation to raise consciousness are:

- Changing attitudes in society
- Forming attitudes in schools
- Workforce training

All of these can be addressed in particular by the public sector . They are also important issues for the media and employers in all sectors.

### Changing attitudes in society
One of the interesting things about the Race Relations Amendment Act (2000) is the general Duty on Public Bodies to promote good race relations. This is most obviously understood in terms of addressing an organisation's

functional relationships with its Black and Minority Ethnic staff and customers.  But there's another way of thinking about it that ties in with the research's recommendation that attitudes in society need to be addressed. If we ask '*Who has responsibility for raising awareness in society?'* the answer could be fudged. But if we think about Public Bodies' position in society, both as a reflection of the public face of society and the architect of our social forces and fabric, then our public services are certainly part of the answer. In this sense, there's a duty upon Public Bodies to take the lead in both acknowledging diversity in society and in examining and addressing anti-social prejudice in it. In this way, Local Authorities, Health Trusts, Schools, the Police and other services have a responsibility not only for raising awareness internally with staff, but also for external awareness raising. This puts the call for someone to address attitudes in society in a fresh, sharp, perspective. Public Bodies can respond by thinking widely and laterally about how they can use their interface with the public and with staff to promote good race relations in society. Public Bodies have multiple channels of communication with the external world: inside and outside their many buildings, through their newsletters, through the activities they run, through their workers and members out in the community. These channels can be identified and used for sending out clear, positive messages. There's opportunity for general statements about cultural diversity and how it is valued, and opportunity for more tailored consciousness raising. Organisations and departments can identify specific sections of society with whom they work (e.g. young people, elderly, parents, tenants) and deliver race relations messages in settings and terms that are meaningful and engaging for that audience, and tie in with normal activities. The ROP participants were also keen to help in this consciousness raising.  Discussed below under *Bridge Building Across Cultures – Celebrations of Culture and Diversity,* participants raised ideas for events in which culture could be shared, enjoyed and cross-cultural understanding built in which they could take part. Public Bodies have the settings and the audiences – day care for the elderly, community facilities, family initiatives (Sure Start, school/parent projects and the like), and ROP participants have indicated that with good facilitation and support many Black and Minority Ethnic people would be active in connecting cultures within communities.

The media also has a key role to play in public awareness raising.  See the recommendation 'Media' in section 8 below.

### Forming attitudes in schools

For the research participants, the key to the future of good race relations in Devon rests in the formation of *children's* attitudes, relationships and

world-views. There is considerable activity in a number of schools who make great efforts to look at issues of world affairs and to study global cultures. This goes a long way towards addressing the participants' concern. However, the work that goes on does depend on the commitment and initiative of interested teachers and of development education practitioners.

🗨 *I'd like to see more done in schools to promote race equality. Just an hour here or there from a visitor is too superficial. You need to show children that minorities are real people.*

Without an overall strategy to support Devon's teachers in multi-cultural education, pressures on them often preclude added-on initiatives. For example, development education practitioners often experience difficulty in getting take-up of their services, even when it is free to schools. In this sense the coverage of these issues is sporadic. Schools' ability to deal with racist bullying also varies, and specialist help can improve schools' capacity to prevent incidents and work with perpetrators and victims where bullying does take place. You can look at some of the experiences relating to education in chapter 8. The pinning of hopes for improved race relations on education in schools implies the need for a strategy to support all Devon's schools in this work. Several participants also pointed out that race equality in education needs to be mainstreamed. This advice would require a systematic change in the current place of race equality in schools' work. Mainstreaming involves the joint working of the County Council Education Directorate, the Local Education Authority and all schools and involves looking at 3 aspects of work in schools:

1) How the distinct themes of appreciation of cultures and religions, cultural history, mutli-culturalism in Britain, world affairs and race equality can be built into the curriculum.
2) How anti-racism strategies can be built into school culture, policy and practice and how staff can be trained and supported to implement this.
3) How academic councils, the LEA and the Education Directorate can develop a strategy to support all schools with 1) and 2).

Devon has many schools and it makes sense not to expect them to address these themes independently and in isolation. DEREC has proposed a project in which these key education partners could be supported with specialist advice and with training in schools from DEREC and DDE (Devon Development Education). You can find more detail about this in the Racial Equality Council's Business Plan (on the web-site www.DevonREC.org ). In summary, the proposal comprises a three-pronged approach:

- anti-racism
- cultural awareness
- global awareness

which would be delivered through three settings:

- as policy and practice development with school management.
- as INSET with teachers and curriculum support
- directly in the classroom with teachers

In this way, race equality can be built into the attitudes of pupils and staff, and into the schools' institutional and curriculum practices.

### *Raising consciousness in the workforce*

Most Public Bodies will know that race equality training is a Duty upon them under the Race Relations Amendment Act (2000). It's a Specific Duty that requires staff to be trained so that they are able to respond to the law and deliver all the activities that each Public body will have planned in its Race Equality Scheme. (The production of a Scheme is also a Specific Duty). In this way the law expects more than just awareness raising to be done with staff. It's far more focussed on making sure that people are provided with the *competencies* to deliver on race equality. The law also expects Public Bodies to assess how well they are delivering services to Black and Minority Ethnic people and the impact their policies are having. (You can find more information about Impact Assessment in section 10 below, 'Consultation & Influence' and in chapter 11.) Based on the assessment of this impact service providers are expected to work with their staff to make any necessary changes.

The law translates into 4 points for change in attitudes and behaviour in organisations:

1. Consciousness raising
2. Role-specific competency training
3. Assessing impact of service delivery and employment functions
4. Working with staff to address impact.

Staff need to know not only what race equality is all about and why it matters to real people, but also how they can address the issues in their daily work and how their organisation will make it possible for them to do so. There is a potential environment for institutional racism in services that do not know how to reach, talk to or take account of Black and Minority Ethnic people. Overcoming this requires institutions to provide the kind of 4 point framework described above, in which all its staff are empowered to

make changes and act on the learning they gain from consciousness raising training.

This framework is relevant to all aspects of good practice in service delivery. The same process can also be applied to issues of equality other than race. Some participants noted that the cause of race equality would gain a greater audience if the different equality themes were covered together in training. The concepts behind race equality and the framework of action set out by race equality law can be used for good practice in all equality matters. It's important (and a legal requirement for Public Bodies) to think distinctly about race equality, but it's useful to plan it alongside other equality work for mutual benefit.

Chapter 11 provides information about training issues and tools for conducting Impact Assessment.

## 2. Networks and Peer Support

We collated 31 suggestions from participants under this heading.

Participants had a number of ideas about activities they'd like to participate in with other Black and Minority Ethnic people and about the way in which those activities should be run. These can be summarized as network functions, activities and qualities:

### Functions

- Peer support
- Overcoming isolation as Black and Minority Ethnic individuals
- Interest groups
- Support for Mixed Heritage families
- Support for Young People
- Support for Women
- Support for the Elderly
- Co-religious support
- Co-ethnic support
- Confidence building for individuals
- Access to information about services and opportunities, tips from each other.
- Friendship
- Mentoring

- Opportunities to share and celebrate culture with other minority ethnic people

*You need young people's groups or something with activities to help people meet each other.  People I know are older with children, so I can't go out with them.*

*I don't think it's good to have a small community of Brazillians or any other if they don't mix with white people.  But it's good if they can help each other build confidence and learn about how to make friends and find out about things… my Brazilian friends have helped me feel less isolated - I have people to go out with and talk to.*

*I would like to see activities for the elderly organised around intellectual interest.  I would love the network cultural event idea with food and a talk.  The main problem for me with that would be transport. You could tie in with a voluntary transport scheme.*

*We'll need some kind of social network to cope with being a mixed race family with a daughter.  Some [other] Indian people I wouldn't want to deal with.  So a network would be a friendship need, not a co-ethnicity need.  It would need to be very informal (and not bureaucratic) – like the Black Networking Group.*

*Rural networks are a really good idea especially for women.  You need events with a theme to attract people.  Then build in networking and mentoring.*

*I know less than 5 other minority ethnic people, but they need a lot of things to gather them together like a common place where they can meet on a weekly basis.*

## **Activities**
- Themed events (food, dance, countries, etc.)
- Events just for women, just for young people, just for Mixed Heritage Families etc.
- Cultural celebrations
- Creative events
- Talks and social interaction for the elderly (multi-ethnic, Jewish and Chinese events)

- Co-ethnic activities
- Co-religious activities

*I would like to be part of a network. It should have a theme, for example the United Nations, that makes the point of it being an anti-xenophobic club. It should promote community spirit and deal with issues and problems and be a talking shop for people to share their experiences. You need to attract everyone and keep formal meetings to a minimum.*

*I'd like to know other people of my ethnicity so a network would be good in that way - you could have arts and food and involve the wider community.*

*Group meetings are not a good idea because they're too much like therapy. Fairs and social events would be best. Don't make people sit down and talk, but give them opportunity to do what they want. Have opportunities to learn about other cultures - e.g. cooking, workshops, how to look after your hair, where the churches are - that cater for cultural sensitivity.*

*You need to have events that people feel passionate about - for example Mums and toddler's groups, women's groups, study, dance and music*

*I don't want to be in a more Jewish community but I would like to meet people of the same faith as me because we would have something to talk about.*

## Qualities

- An eye on the future as well as the past
- Events should feel informal
- Careful and expert design and facilitation of events
- Sustainable funding and provision of facilitation workers
- 4 networks (North, East, South, West) because Devon is so big.
- People should leave each event feeling a boost in confidence or that they have achieved something.
- The opportunity to give and receive peer support should not be accompanied by expectations that friendship or help should necessarily extend beyond the network events.
- Facilitators should ensure that network members don't experience pressure from other members to conform to particular cultural or

religious views.

- Members should not feel that by participating in a peer network it causes them exposure as a minority in their home community.
- Transport to events should be available, especially in rural areas, and especially for the elderly.
- Cultural differences among people gathering for multi-ethnic events, including feelings about White members of multi-ethnic families, need to be facilitated sensitively.

*Rural networks could work if sensitively done and if there's no pressure to share other people's ethnic identity and values.*

*I tried to help set a multi cultural network up with a few people some years ago but it stopped because the person leading on it left the area.*

*Information networks would be worth trying but it will be difficult to get people to attend because they'll feel they're identifying themselves as BME.*

*You have to organise events and have to have facilitators to draw people out.*

*You need to start by finding out what people want to achieve from the day. Organise events around people's needs. They'll need to feel that they've achieved something.*

*It would be easier to meet people through a network setting because there'd be less obligation to get involved with people. The attraction of a network is just to hear people's stories. It's nice to chat. It would be good to share stories about practical issues in the network - for example like getting indefinite leave to remain.*

*I attended the Eid and Divali meeting with my wife. There were lots of other White Brit friends of Indians invited to the Divali festival. At Eid the Indians complained about the British people having attended the Divali meeting, because it could threaten their culture. They want the meetings as a way to preserve the culture.*

Second to consciousness raising, creation and facilitation of peer support networks was the main initiative that the participants wanted to propose. Some networks do exist, but rurally speaking most people are not involved

in them. This lack of rural Black and Minority Ethnic infrastructure was also a key problem for our service-provider participants (see chapter 11). But, for reasons of isolation described in chapter 5, to address the need for networks, a catalyst is needed to enable Black and Minority Ethnic people to find peer support and build supportive links and communication with services.

*Networking – a rural sparsity*
A defining character of the difference in nature between the rural and urban Black and Minority Ethnic populations is the extent to which they are networked. The rural demography is distinctive in the geographical dispersion and the cultural disparities of the individuals and families that make up Devon's Black and Minority Ethnic population. Rural Black and Minority Ethnic people are not living in geographical, co-ethnic clusters as is typical in many urban areas and some other rural regions (see chapters 3 and 5). There are some formal and ad hoc networks working across the South West and encompassing Devon, but much of the activity is regional or centres on the cities, and the research indicates most rural people are not formally networked and have little peer support. In the rural districts, in terms of widespread accessibility and provision of welfare-oriented services, there is no real Black and Minority Ethnic voluntary sector or infrastructure.  What exists in the rural areas tends to be based on the energies of individuals, is not formally organised, and is socially oriented rather than organised to provide welfare services or representation.

---

The networks that already exist in Devon include:

- The Black Networking Group, working across the far South West.  It is a small voluntary group with a few rural district members and organises annual events, including family days. It has a race equality resources collection and an internal newsletter.

- The Islamic Centre for the South West is in Exeter. A number of Muslims from the rural areas attend the Mosque or are in contact with key members of the Centre.  The Islamic Centre founded the Olive Tree project with the Exeter Council for Voluntary Service,  which initially provided English as an Additional Language support to women, in Exeter, and which has expanded to encompass many other activities, including work with the Chinese community in Exeter.  The Olive Tree is developing from a project into an organisation.

- A group of Muslims meet for prayer at a Mosque in Torbay.

- Groups of Muslims meet for prayer in northern Devon. On occasions, over 200 people  have gathered for key religious events.  The

community would like to establish a community Mosque.

- Many Asian people in North Devon often join annually for an event that coincides with either Muslim, Sikh or Hindu festivals. Different people organise the events each year voluntarily. The network is informal.

- A number of Portuguese-speaking people gather from time to time for social events in Exeter and South Devon. The network is informal, and contacts and events occur on an ad hoc basis by word of mouth and via a private English/Portuguese language teacher.

- The Jewish community in south and central Devon has a couple of informal networks that depend on volunteer capacity and have provided support for secular Jews through a range of social and interest-based events.

- The Devon & Cornwall Chinese Association is based in Plymouth and includes a number of rural members.

- The Devon & Cornwall Refugee Support Council has supported refugees in south Devon.

- Through the Planet Rainbow project for Mixed Heritage families in Exeter, we have also heard of a few groups of families who have been meeting rurally – for example a group of Black families in Totnes.

The lack of formal (as opposed to ad hoc), widely accessible rural network infrastructure has to do with the usual isolating features of rurality itself and some distinguishing characteristics of rural Black and Minority Ethnic ethnography.
The issues include:

- Rural distances.

- Individual outlooks shaping identity.

- Attitudes and concerns about groups and co-ethnic relationships.

- 'Invisibility' of the 'visible minority ethnic' population members to each other in the rural landscape.

- Predominance of different ethnicities in any one area as opposed to co-ethnic clusters

- Lack of means for people to find each other.

- Integration into the local community.

(For detail, see chapter 5.)

The key characteristic of the Minority Ethnic population in Devon is that it's composed of a great diversity of individuals and outlooks.  People live as individuals and families around Devon's large landscape – unlike urban areas, there are no co-ethnic 'communities' as such. Consequently, we found that peoples' individual life experiences and their relationships in the rural community in which they live were more likely to influence their decisions about the attitudes they take towards identity and living as a minority member of a rural community. For some participants this kind of individual cultural autonomy was a choice, and they described how life in Devon offered the opportunity to avoid some of the pressures of community life and the cultural and political group dynamics found more usually in urban co-ethnic communities. It was striking that the more individualistic a person's sense of identity and the more conscious a person was of this, the more reservations a person had about seeking out co-ethnic relationships.

A more fundamental cause of the lack of spontaneous networks and organisation in rural areas lies in our finding that many people in rural Devon have a low awareness of the existence or extent of their local Black and Minority Ethnic population. Most participants needed to think hard to recall the other minority ethnic people living in their area, and some felt there were no other minorities in Devon. This research even put participants of the same villages in touch with each other. It was apparent that this kind of 'colour-blindness' mostly arose from participants' lack of co-identification with other ethnicities and the absence of co-ethnic clusters as a marker in the community.

Combined with rural distances and isolation (Devon being one of the largest counties in the UK) these are the reasons that many rural people don't spontaneously network co-ethnically and there are no social commonalities drawing people together on a multi-ethnic basis.  More detail about the factors causing multiple layers of isolation can be found in chapter 5. Issues surrounding friendship and co-ethnic sources of support are also considered in chapter 5.

The factors that mitigate against people being able to or inclined to find peer support and form networks shouldn't be taken however as a signal that people don't want it. The participants' recommendations, and the activities listed in the box above, show that it is needed but needs facilitation to happen if it is to be accessible to isolated individuals.  The factors that separate people in rural areas, facilitation can help to overcome. Some participants described their own efforts to hold events and get people together, and the problems they encountered as volunteers acting independently, in sustaining or widening this outreach. The success of the

informal Asian network in North Devon and Portuguese-speaking network in South and East Devon illustrate the interest in networks, but also demonstrate that without the benefit of resources and facilitation informal networks are limited in their outreach and perform mostly social rather than welfare functions. The ideas put forward by the participants describe the provision of peer support through a programme of events that address a number of social and welfare concerns with facilitation that can work with a diversity of cultures and deal with complex needs and group dynamics. Facilitation is also important for the purposes of advertising and making networks accessible to ethnically and rurally isolated people.

### *External stimulus and sustenance of networks.*
The type of network needed to address the recommendation is one with an external catalyst, resources and good quality facilitation. The paradox (of the need for a peer network consisting of people with very little in common with one another in identity terms), requires a unifying project to catalyze and sustain a response and to maintain an overview. The expressed need to ensure that peer support doesn't become peer burdening also underlines the need for careful facilitation and recourse to external support sources.
In response to this need, and in the absence of any other established race equality organisation working in the rural Districts with the capacity to catalyze Multi-Ethnic networking, the Racial Equality Council has developed project plans to establish networks and provide specialist facilitators and outreach workers. These plans have already been developed with agencies in two Districts and other partners, and it is hoped that agencies and partners will also support the proposal in other Districts.

### *Networks – a safe bridge between Black and Minority Ethnic people and Services.*
With overcoming social exclusion being the obvious function of such a network, the proposal has a natural relevance to the interests of public bodies concerned with social welfare and inclusion as well as race equality organisations. Moreover, the existence of facilitated networks could also address some of the problems which service-providing participants in the research identified as barriers to Black and Minority Ethnic access to services. It would also help overcome the barriers that currently prevent public services from meeting their Duty under the Race Relations Amendment Act (2000) to consult with the Black and Minority Ethnic population.

In this sense a major benefit of a network, to both its members and to service-providing agencies, is the opportunity it provides through its

facilitation to provide a permanent listening and consultation mechanism. In principle, networks are the ideal safe and supportive environment through which members can be enabled to express their current concerns and ideas and feed them through to the relevant agencies and forums such as community planning forums and community safety partnerships. In this way network members can raise the issues that *are* of concern to them, rather than a few individuals being badgered, as is the present model, by multiple information-hungry agencies on a plethora of issues that may or may not be an issue for people.

Community planning requires on-going consultation mechanisms to be in place in the community, if it is to be meaningful and if it is to be sustained as framework for reinforcing local democracy. A variety of approaches are being taken to implement local consultation structures, and many rely upon open meetings and surveys as their mechanism. These approaches are unlikely to engage Black and Minority Ethnic individuals. This research indicates that Agencies would be wise to jointly support Multi-Ethnic rural networks and derive the consultation information they need from the much wider base of feedback information that networks would provide. Agencies are currently trying to find means of jointly rationalising and improving consultation with the Black and Minority Ethnic population through the Devon Consultation Group. The Multi-Ethnic Network idea has been explored during a meeting with the DSG and in discussion with the DCC representative to the group, and was welcomed in principle. The proposal represents best practice in that it allows the Black and Minority Ethnic network members to set the consultation priorities and agendas themselves. But it also presents the opportunity for the DCG members to make best use of the proposal by periodically synthesising lists of data needs for planning of services. The network facilitators – specialist community development workers - could then discuss these data needs with the Group, provide existing data, and collect other data as appropriate during the course of their work The benefits of this methodology are numerous:

- The community development workers would act as a confidentiality buffer between consulting agencies and Black and Minority Ethnic people

- A Black and Minority Ethnic perspective would be available to meet all the agencies' Community Planning and Best Value review duties, as well as facilitating impact assessment under Race equality Schemes.

- Agencies' and districts' consultation with Black and Minority Ethnic people would be co-ordinated. This means that a larger area and population set can be drawn from, which would increase statistical reliability on common issues. The consultation methodology would

increase not only data quantity but also quality. (At present reliance on random sampling with ethnicity monitoring questions does not yield sufficient Black and Minority Ethnic data, either pan Devon or in specific districts. See chapter 11.)

- Data collection would be ongoing and user-centred rather than intermittent and agency-centred, but would still meet agency data-needs.

- Black and Minority Ethnic people in Devon would feel the consultation work of the development workers to be supportive and part of a relationship. This stands in positive contrast to consultations which come from multiple fragmented sources, may lack sensitivity and relevance, and often place a repetitive burden on a few known Black and Minority Ethnic individuals to 'represent' the Black and Minority Ethnic population perspective.

- The community development workers would be a point of reference through which Black and Minority Ethnic people can enquire as to the impact that consultation has had on services. This means that consultation would be two-way.

- The consultation methodology would help service providers overcome the frustrations of lack of time, data protection constraints and lack of outreach know-how.

Most importantly, consultation would be only one aspect of the community development workers' brief. Their key role would be the support of Black and Minority Ethnic people in rural areas, assisting with case-work, advocacy and sign-posting people to appropriate sources of help and helping them access appropriate services. Their part in supporting a Black and Minority Ethnic consultation framework for Devon would be part of that supportive brief by helping to ensure that services meet real, articulated need.

The community development aspect of the workers' role would provide other benefits for agencies, namely:

- A resource to be used by the Race Priority Action Teams (RPATs) under the district Community Safety Partnerships. By linking RPATs to people's everyday experience in the community, the workers would be enabling the RPATs to both proactively and reactively deal with racial discrimination – something most RPATs are currently struggling to do.

- A means for the Racial Equality Council to build rural networks for peer support and to stimulate the development of a Black and Minority Ethnic voluntary sector in Devon. The County Council would then

have the opportunity to develop a supportive compact with a Black and Minority Ethnic voluntary sector.

- A means for grant-making bodies (e.g. Community Fund et al.) to have a Black and Minority Ethnic voluntary sector infrastructure created, so that their funds can be used by constituted grass roots organisations, which are at present virtually non-existent in Devon. Agencies' support for the community development worker /network initiative will thereby have added value in that it will enable a newly created Black and Minority Ethnic voluntary sector to draw down new sources of funding into Devon.
- A means to make sure that Black and Minority Ethnic rural residents are enabled to know about and access the full range of services they may need, whether from the statutory, voluntary or private sector.
- A means for service-providers to reach out to people through foreign language speaking development workers (peripatetic workers who form part of the Racial Equality Council's proposal), reaching especially women, elderly, and young immigrant men who do not speak English.

### Inter-Minority Ethnic race equality work

The research has also heard about intercultural tensions sometimes arising when religion and cultural identity are deeply intertwined, but expressed differently, among various nationalities within the same faith group. The research also heard from participants about inter-racial prejudices on the part of some Minority Ethnic individuals themselves. This suggests that there is also room for Multi-Ethnic networks to facilitate consciousness raising work among different Minority Ethnic groups, as well as in the wider community.

| 3. Bridge building across cultures: celebrations of culture and diversity |
|---|
| We collated 31 suggestions from participants under this heading. <br><br> - Activities and events are needed, aimed at exchanging information about one another's culture and celebrating culture and diversity. <br> - These events could be hosted, and gather people together, through the networks described earlier in this chapter. |

- Events should enable Black and Minority Ethnic network members and their families to enjoy the expression of culture in a safe, appreciative setting.
- Sometimes these events should be aimed at co-ethnic groups of people.
- Sometimes they should be aimed at Multi-Ethnic gatherings.
- Other events should enable Black and Minority Ethnic members of Multi-Ethnic rural networks to raise awareness of culture and diversity among the wider public.
- Events aimed at the wider public should also incorporate celebration of Devonian culture and language.
- Events should celebrate culture through mediums such as food or dance.
- Events should be hosted in rural communities.
- Food outlets – restaurants, delicatessens and Multi-Ethnic community cafes - could also be a focus for celebrating culture in themselves, and could also be a venue for social and cultural gatherings.

  🎤 *I'd like to know other people of my ethnicity so a network would be good in that way - you could have arts and food and involve the wider community.*

This recommendation is closely linked to the participants' interests in rural networking, because the need to find a means of getting people in touch with each other is a pre-requisite of the ability to run events. As described earlier in this chapter, some informal self-organised activity does take place, but most of the participants had not been involved in such opportunities and the opportunity to gather around cultural events was a widely felt gap. The participants' descriptions of the types of events they would like to see could be the substance of Multi-Ethnic network events, or could be the subject of activities currently run in Exeter by projects and faith groups extended into rural areas too. Some of the participants' suggestions could also be of interest to rural communities and organisations interested in running activities to promote cultural awareness and celebrate diversity.

| **4. Improving access to information and services** |
| --- |

We collated 19 suggestions from participants under this heading

The majority of the interest expressed in improved access to information and services related to English language support. Some specific suggestions were made:

- English language support could be offered with the option of participation on a skills/time bank basis, so that learners of English as an Additional language - especially low income learners - can offer their own skills in return for coaching.

- English language support should also address the particular needs of women, in terms of curriculum content pitched at the learner's welfare needs and reducing social isolation, and in terms of appropriate learning settings.

- First-language support networks would help to reduce isolation for women learners of English of an Additional Language.

- Means should be found to provide multi-lingual information and interpreter support to those who need it.

    🗨 *Main problem with access to service is language barrier (esp, doctor, dentist, hospital, evening classes, public transport, advice and info). I speak only Chinese.*

- Black and Minority Ethnic people's language skills could be better used by the creation of an interpretation network, especially for complainant aid. Some people would wish to provide their skills on a volunteer-expenses basis, other would need to have the costs of their professional time covered.

Several participants felt that access to information and services could be overcome best through sign-posting services and with help in navigating their way through service provider's systems.

- Some suggested that such sign-posting could be provided by a multi-lingual welcome pack providing information about relevant national, county and local services.

- Other suggested that sign-posting and help with service-navigation would best be done by specialist community development workers (such as the workers who would facilitate the Multi-Ethnic networks proposed earlier).

> 🗨 *It would be really useful if there were community development workers to refer to, to help with finding out about services for patients and to refer patients onto.*

- Some participants also felt that help with system navigation could also be done by service-providing staff themselves, taking the time to explain services clearly in person and help people with paperwork.

- In particular, it was noted that communication about services and information is best done orally, avoiding reliance on written media.

  > 🗨 *Bangladeshi people are not keen on filling forms in – they even resist my credit scheme because it involves reading adverts! Older people often don't speak much English, and don't read much in whatever language.*

- It was also suggested that access to information and services would be improved through having a proportional workforce (in ethnicity terms) extending a means of identification between service providers and users (especially in social care).

- Participants also felt that an improved gateway to wider support and services could best be provided via doctors, community nurses, health visitors and midwives.

- However, participants also suggested that the experience of accessing health services themselves, and on-referral services, needed to be improved through trans-cultural medicine training and information handbooks for health practitioners in hospitals and the community, GPs in particular.

- It was also proposed that information could be distributed to Black and Minority Ethnic individuals via GPs (doctors or practice staff) who are trusted, seen usually once a year and who could download, print and provide leaflets as relevant.

> 🗨 *Most Chinese people don't read - they put it in the bin. Most people also won't talk long like this. People won't answer questions, but they would take information from the Doctor. They might look at a Chinese information pack.*

Other ideas and recommendations relating to improved access to services are also covered in chapter 10, which looks specifically at health and welfare services, and in chapter 5, which examines the factors that cause isolation and language barriers in particular. chapter 11 also examines some of the issues that impede the ability of service providers to engage with Black and Minority Ethnic people to make services more responsive and accessible.

| 5. Race equality support services |
|---|

We collated 17 suggestions from participants under this heading

Some comments related to ethos of race equality work, and advocated:

- Focus on equality, not vulnerability.
- A spirit of delivering race equality initiatives 'with' and not 'to' or 'for' Black and Minority Ethnic people.
- Equality means working with difference.

Some comments picked out specific groups around which work should be focussed, in particular support for Black and Minority Ethnic:

- Staff
- Teenagers
- Tourists
- School pupil victims of racial bullying

Suggestions also highlighted issues that needed attention in terms of the way that support is delivered, including the need to:

- Ensure that the racial equality council has the capacity to take on complex and difficult cases
- Provide local race equality support surgeries (e.g. at CAB or other drop-in centres) and advertise through local Multi-Ethnic networks.
- Ensure that cases are appropriately allocated to complainant aid workers, taking account of skills required by case specific and gender, cultural and faith sensitivities.

🗩 *For a closed session for just minority people it's better to have a support surgery once a week at the market drop-in centre. It would need to be advertised in the library and local newpaper (the free one) or it could be at the CAB.*

Recommendations were also put forward for specific activities and measures, including:

- Black and Minority Ethnic young people's development: teamwork and leadership skills, and entrepreneurship training and mentoring.
  🗩 *You could do with an initiative to look at leadership, teamwork and entrepreneurship and some mentoring to help young people look at their dreams and help them to follow them. Mentoring schemes work well. You need to find the Black and Minority Ethnic kids by getting out on the streets. Kids like doing their business on the street.*

- Links and initiatives between youth and race equality services: – support surgeries; street/detached outreach; intercultural/ inter-religious work through music.

- Clear communication about institutional racism – what it is and how it works – to both institutions and Black and Minority Ethnic people too**.**

- Conscious inclusion of anti-Semitism in the anti-racism brief of the REC.

- Inclusion within the REC brief of measures and partnership initiatives to address prejudice experienced by Travellers and homophobia.

- Management of inter-religious sensitivity in general racial equality work and prevention of disenfranchisement of individual groups from Multi-ethnic race equality work and services.

    🗨 *We need the recognition by the REC of anti-Semitism. For some people I think it would be hard to take on anti-Semitism case-work. There's a feeling in Devon of a very Arab influence and a pro Palestinian march - has this affected DEREC? Has it checked this out? It's been very hard since September 11th and the worsening situation in Israel.*

Suggestions were also made about the future profile and accessibility of the Racial Equality Council (REC), including the points that the REC should:

- Have a higher profile in the public and among service-providers (providing improved access to its services).

- Make its principle duty to promote the interests of the Black and Minority Ethnic population clearly understood.

- Underline the independence of the REC from its funders, and demonstrate that activity is driven by Black and Minority Ethnic interests and not by funding.

- Establish a Racial Equality Council youth council – thereby building future infrastructure and taking on the emerging issues of race equality as experienced by young people.

All of these recommendations have been taken on board by the Racial Equality Council which has already incorporated many of the suggestions into its forward-planning 3 year business plan.  For example, the business plan includes a proposal for an empowerment project, aimed at developing leadership and teamwork skills among Black and Minority Ethnic young

people.  The project would aim to promote access to and advancement in the workplace and stimulate entrepreneurial and grass-roots activity, in particular the development of a Black and Minority Ethnic voluntary sector. The need to improve rural, local access to complainant aid services is also incorporated into the business plan, with proposals to work with partners to increase the capacity of local organisations to deal with race and discrimination cases, and to provide increased specialist backup and peripatetic services.  The participants' recommendations that do not fall within the business-planning brief have also been disseminated to the Executive for priority attention.

| 6.  Equality in employment |
| --- |

We collated 14 suggestions from participants under this heading.

Eliminating racism in employment was seen as a key means of improving race equality.  Some specific measures were suggested including:

- Positive action on recruitment – welcome statements (and guidance about how to draft them)

- Positive action to promote managerial status within the Black and Minority Ethnic workforce.

- Separation of ethnicity monitoring forms from job applications (using separate envelopes and removal of all personal details from application form)

  🔊 *The main problem is we can't tell why there are problems with job applications.  So it would be best to de-personalise all personal details from application forms.*

  🔊 *There should be separate ERKM envelopes which are not opened until **after** the interview - that's a good idea.*

- Explanation to applicants about how ethnicity record keeping and monitoring is handled and why it is done, in order to build confidence in the benefits that ethnicity monitoring can bring to race equality.

  🔊 *There's a general worry among Black and Minority Ethnic people caused by the feeling that everyone wants to monitor them.  This is very counter-productive and causes people to put up walls.*

- Providing for people to describe their ethnicity in their own terms on ethnicity monitoring forms.

- Creation of an ethnically proportional workforce – and for nationally advertised jobs the use of national census proportions, not local percentages.

- Better support for Black and Minority Ethnic people in finding work (better communication of transferable skills to employers; information for employers about the comparability of work within systems and job settings overseas; translation and accreditation of qualifications gained overseas; help with adapting to UK norms and culture in applying for jobs and going through interviews.)

The participants' experience of life in the workplace is covered in detail in chapter 7. Issues relating to ethnicity monitoring – of both the workforce and service uptake – are also covered in chapter 4. These issues are also picked up in chapter 11 in which service providers and employers also describe the difficulties they encounter with ethnicity monitoring, and suggestions are made for dealing with these problems, in addition to the suggestions made in the box above by Black and Minority Ethnic participants themselves.

### 7. Political action and Leadership

We collated 14 suggestions from participants under this heading.

Participants described several indicators that would help to demonstrate political commitment and leadership to addressing race equality, including:

- Clearly stated coherent messages
- Funding from public bodies for race equality initiatives and services
- Sustained action by contrast to frequent appearance and disappearance of initiatives, measures perceived as tokenistic, or frequent changes in personnel with race equality designations
- Changed behaviour by service-delivery staff, prompted by better understanding on the part of management about difficulties existing at the point of delivery.
- 🕭 *The Devon and Cornwall Police Force is committed at corporate level to race equality and eradicating inappropriate behaviour. But senior police officers need to spend time with officers at the grass roots, to find out more about working with attitudes and confidence levels to make their [officers'] behaviour supportive of diversity and make equal opportunities a reality.*
- Increased political representation by Black and Minority Ethnic people.

- Action to support equality for Travellers, including increased provision of stopping sites and shake up of planning permission systems and decisions that discriminate against the Traveller and settled-Traveller community.

- Evidence that the outcomes of research and consultation, such as the Rural Outreach Project, are used by service providers in planning action.

  🗨 *People are mistrustful of organisations prying into their lives especially if they can't see likely results.*

- Reports evidencing the monitoring and evaluation of race equality policy implementation

Participants also referred to strategic political measures that they also felt would have the effect of improving race equality, including:

- Impact assessment of international policy on community relations

*Racism not just due to fear and hostility. It's also whipped up by political agendas e.g the war on terrorism and Iraq – they have to make people want to go to war with another civilisation. So I don't blame people for being hostile on the street. The Government accusations of a culture of being barbaric and autocratic become very difficult to fight on a personal local level.*

- Poverty reduction measures to address socio-economic frustrations of wider society that get irrationally displaced as racial intolerance.

- Mitigation of the threat to rurally-based livelihoods and the knock-on effect of that threat on relations with 'in-comers'.

Chapter 11 looks in greater detail at the support needs expressed by service providers. The findings echo the need expressed by Black and Minority Ethnic participants for leadership to be exerted by senior Public Body staff and politicians as a means of driving and enabling change at the point of service outreach and delivery. Research conducted recently by the Local Government Association also stresses the pivotal role of leadership in public bodies, not only on the part of Chief Executives but also on the part of Heads of Services (senior management) and elected members.

| 8.  Media |
|---|
We collated 11 suggestions from participants under this heading.

The media was seen as having a key role to play in valuing and encouraging local diversity and combating negative typecasting.

🗩 *Life in Devon would be improved by articles in the papers about valuing diversity of people here and the businesses.  It will encourage more people to come including people to invest.*

🗩 *Improve race relations by publicizing on TV, radio, magazines, newspapers, that Britain is multi-cultural (and fortunately most British people are tolerant and learn to cope).*

Participants suggested that the media can tackle racist attitudes in society specifically through comedy, and through increased presence of Black and Minority Ethnic broadcasters and actors – especially in soap operas.

🗩 *Spike Milligan in 'Chicken and chips' used the tactic of showing how ridiculous prejudice is – a tactic that should return.  More Black and Minority Ethnic actors on TV –especially the soaps would be good.*

Participants also suggested that cultural diversity could be promoted by coverage of 'real people' stories in the media, but that means need to be found to enable people to speak about their experience without fear of exposure or exploitation.

🗩 *The newspapers etc. should talk about stories of real people in mixed relationships - to show we're real people, not aliens, not to be frowned at.*

In the course of the research, we came across a number of initiatives in the media, particularly television, to address race equality and cultural awareness.  The project was often approached with requests for help in advertising to participants opportunities to get involved with media projects.  In a few cases, where one or two participants had expressed interest in this, the project was able to help make the links.  However, there remains a problem in that it is inappropriate as well as impractical for organisations such as the Racial Equality Council to individually get in touch with its many contacts every time a broadcaster or other service-provider wishes to involve members of the Black and Minority Ethnic population.  By contrast, several participants did feel that people should put forward their real life stories into the public domain as a means of raising awareness.  However, at the same time, participants pointed out that people

_____

should not risk further vulnerability in the process of exposing their experience to the media, and described the need for a safe means of sharing and passing on real-life cases. Multi-Ethnic peer networks present an opportunity for people to come together in a safe setting to describe their experience. Networks could also present the opportunity for Black and Minority Ethnic people to drive the process of sharing their stories themselves, through literary and arts-based projects. Networks also provide the opportunity for far less intrusive advertising of opportunities to take part in external initiatives, such as media interest, through network newsletters or magazines and advertising at events.

---

### 9. Initiative on the part of Black and Minority Ethnic individuals

We collated 8 suggestions from participants under this heading.

These participants felt that promotion of cultural diversity and race equality should be taken on personally by Black and Minority Ethnic people living rurally, in their communities and in their work.

🗨 *Attitudes change e.g. when a White person finds themselves in position of having to depend on a Black person's help.*

For some of the respondents, this view was born of a pessimistic appraisal of the commitment of anyone other than affected individuals to respond to incidents. It was also sometimes born of the perception that there was no race equality work going on in rural Devon. For most of the participants, the outlook was also rooted in individuals' commitment to building relationships in the wider community, instinctive decisions about how best to survive in their local community and a sense of self- reliance.

The suggestions for individual initiative centered on working at one-to-one relationship-building and joining in and 'fitting in' with the community. 'Self-improvement' was also seen by some as the best line of action in the absence of the ability to change others.

🗨 *To feel welcome depends on the image you portray and how accessible you are to the community – you need to come out and relate to people, this leads to acceptance.*

---

The participants' suggestion that Black and Minority Ethnic people should take on initiatives to promote race equality and cultural diversity was often followed by references to their desire to take part in events that would celebrate culture and build bridges in the community, such as described earlier in this chapter under *3. Bridge building across cultures:*

---

*celebrations of culture and diversity.* The suggestions were also linked to the ideas that Black and Minority Ethnic people should also be involved in consciousness raising and training events, see *1. Consciousness raising and training.*

Chapter 6 looks in greater detail at the participants' experience of racism and their strategies for coping with it. (Chapter 7 also looks specifically at people's experience of discrimination at work.) Chapter 6 goes on to examine some of the factors that prevent people from reporting racism and cause people to depend on self-reliant coping strategies. Whilst the duty must remain with society and its infrastructure to eliminate racism from its midst, the role that Black and Minority Ethnic individuals play in transforming attitudes, as a matter of necessity and personal courage, must be supported. During the course of the research, many people asked for help with anecdotes and reactions that they could employ to challenge racism when it affronted them. Participants were all asked about their coping strategies and their suggestions for other people in the same situation. Whilst a few had ideas to recommend, many others described how they never failed to feel confounded by discrimination or astounded that people should feel such prejudicial attitudes. The need to find more response tactics was echoed in the participants' call for peer support opportunities, through which members could share experiences and ideas and reduce the sense of personal isolation that is exacerbated by experience of prejudice. We also noted that service-providing staff wanted the same kind of advice about comments and tactics that could be kept 'up one's sleeve' so that, just like the Black and Minority Ethnic participants, they would be better ready to challenge racist behaviour and comments. Some suggestions are made in chapter 6 about the tactics advocated by participants, but supporting individuals in one-to-one and work-situation attempts to counter racism remains an area that needs to be addressed with action-research, production of resources, and dissemination.

| 10.  **Consultation and influence**. |
|---|

We collated 6 suggestions from participants under this heading.

Consultation and outreach were seen as a means of improving race relations between service providers and Black and Minority Ethnic people. Some specific points were also made including:

- The suggestion that consultation and reporting of incidents or complaints could be improved through creation of a joint agency telephone support service, advertised through the media including local papers and Health Trust newsletters etc.

  🗨 *I think more people would prefer to share their views by having a telephone number they can contact people on.*

- Black and Minority Ethnic people should be able to participate more widely in consultation but without feeling that they are being singled out as individuals.

- Outreach needs facilitation through neutral outreach workers, who would work to overcome suspicion, be non-intrusive and be a means of avoiding the problems of written-media outreach**.**

Organisations often rely on the reporting of incidents or complaints to flag up the need for re-evaluation of policies and their impact.  This is especially true since sample surveys carried out by agencies as part of their standard consultation usually fail to pick up any significant number of Black and Minority Ethnic respondents, and therefore do not act as a good means of picking up problems. The research shows that the Black and Minority Ethnic response to prejudice, discrimination or poor service is usually to absorb it rather than to report it.  More information about this can be found in chapter 6.  It's only at the end of their endurance that most people will complain and then with reluctance for fear of exposure and reaction. Isolated Black and Minority Ethnic people do not like to 'stick out', especially on matters in which they have been made vulnerable and which make them a complainant. Backlash and outcry cannot be depended upon alone to inform Impact Assessment. Neither is there a framework for consultation in Devon with the Black and Minority Ethnic population. The information that is required for Impact Assessment can only be procured if a safe route is provided for people to express themselves. Under *Networks and Peer Support* above, participants set out their second key recommendation: that peer networks should be facilitated in which people can meet, share experience, collect information, access support and enjoy an environment that celebrates identity and cultural interest.  This is the safe environment in which people's experience, views and ideas can be

expressed, debated and amassed. It's the opportunity through which the isolated and disparate identities of the rural Black and Minority Ethnic population can come together to raise issues, find common ground and be active in informing services, without prejudice of personal security or repetitive exposure to multiple consultation agendas set by Devon's many agencies. This kind of consultation mechanism is the means by which Public Bodies' Duty to assess the impact of policies could be made far more achievable, but it is a measure that needs public bodies' support to sustain the facilitation of independent networks and dialogue about services and issues of concern. Consultation in this way would be good race relations in itself. It would also be a single means of making best value use of public funds to achieve a Duty of outreach to a minority population of individuals who by their disparate nature are difficult to access. More information about service providers' own concerns over consultation and Impact Assessment are discussed in chapter 11, which also provides tools for conducting Impact Assessment and for strategic planning of consultation.

---

### 11. Effect and promotion of demographic change

We collated 5 suggestions from participants under this heading.

Some participants felt that acceptance of cultural diversity and improved race equality would come about as an inevitable result of the natural growth of the Black and Minority Ethnic rural population and, in particular, the effect of the increasing numbers of Mixed Heritage families.

Participants also noted that, at the same time, preparation amongst agencies and race equality services should be made to cope with increasing exposure to previously latent prejudice that would accompany the growth in the Black and Minority Ethnic population.

It was also suggested that measures should be taken to encourage more Black and Minority Ethnic people to live in Devon, and to help Devon communities to be more welcoming and receptive of in-comers. This was suggested both to open communities up to the benefits of multi-cultural society, and as a way to give more rural people experience of cross-cultural relationships with the attendant awareness raising effects.

🕮 *Promote the existence and benefits of diverse cultures to rural communities - even in rural Devon we are a multi-cultural society!*

---

> 🗨 *Race relations will improve if more Black and Ethnic Minority people are encouraged to come to Devon and thereby White people will become more accustomed to Black people: people may be indoctrinated from birth but will change as a result of one-to-one relationships. However racism in job opportunities will have to be overcome to achieve this.*
>
> 🗨 *There's lots of BME and other incomers now in Devon so you need to be more welcoming. You need to get people to live and let live. The future of society is multi-racial.*
>
> 🗨 *Devon is a white area with a small number of minority ethnic groups and I personally feel that as more ethnic groups are moving here racial abuse incidents are going to be on the increase. Unless people are made aware of the consequences of their actions not just legally but also emotionally for their victims, racism will continue.*

More information about the demographics of the Black and Minority Ethnic population can be found in chapter 3. Issues about attracting and retaining Black and Minority Ethnic members of the workforce and business sector are also discussed in chapter 7.

| **12. Inter-religious understanding (including within the Black and Minority Ethnic population)** |
| --- |
| We collated 4 suggestions from participants under this heading.<br><br>This recommendation highlights the faith dimensions of ethnicity and participants' concerns about the attendant religious issues in multi-ethnic society.<br>Specific suggestions included:<br>• Promotion of inter-religious understanding – through use of counselling and listening techniques, comedy, and sensitively facilitated social events.<br>• Cultural and inter-religious exchange initiatives – especially for young people |

Chapter 9 looks at the prejudice and tensions described by participants in relation to faith-identity, and religious isolation. According to Census 2001, 67% of the Black and Minority Ethnic population (including Europeans) ascribe to a religious identity. This project has also shown that religion is a key part of ethnic identity in either faith or cultural terms. Hence is it logical that inter-faith work is an important element of cross-cultural understanding. Some inter-faith activities already take place in

Exeter, through groups such as the Council of Christians and Jews, the Inter-faith group and inter-faith events hosted by the Society of Friends. The research also suggests that this work is also needed in rural areas and among religious groups within the Black and Minority Ethnic community in order to promote cultural awareness, race equality and community cohesion.

As one participant described, inter-faith activity can have deep effects, and can be especially important when messages about religious and cultural issues are enmeshed in media coverage of the international political scene, with consequences felt by Black and Minority Ethnic people locally in Devon.

🕮 *The eagerness of the people wanting to know about each other was exciting - Not only to learn and develop dialogue but to recognise differences and unravelling where misinformation is coming from. For example Israel and Palestine - if people really listened and understood the issues for both and understood what's at stake for each, it would lead to mutual understanding. We need listening techniques.*

| **13. Cultural Centres** |
|---|
| We collated 4 suggestions from participants under this heading. |
| Global Centres, Multi-Ethnic community centres, and faith centres were all suggested as a focus for education, consciousness raising and cultural gatherings. They were proposed both as a facility for interaction among Black and Minority Ethnic people and for connection with the wider community. |

Typically, cultural and education activities have been organised in Exeter, using a variety of venues, for events such as the annual Respect festivals, Inter-faith meetings, co-ethnic gatherings and the delivery of projects serving groups such as Mixed-Heritage families, women learners of English as an Additional Language and the Chinese school. The Islamic Centre in Exeter and Faith centres in Plymouth have been a focus for partnership meetings and activities and now Devon Development Education (DDE) and partner organisations in Exeter have established a Global Centre at 15 York Road in Exeter (contact DDE about the services and resources on offer at devondeved@eurobell.co.uk). The Global Centre will provide an educational focus for exploring diversity globally and locally too.

There is great potential in the idea that community facilities attached to faith centres could provide important opportunities for promoting religious understanding and for community cohesion.   The Olive Tree project has shown too, how needs identified in a faith community (the Muslim community) can also be a catalyst for services encompassing the needs of other Minority Ethnic groups. Some participants also felt that because of the diversity ethnicity and faith of the Black and Minority Ethnic population, there remains a need for venues that can act as a marker on the landscape and as a place for people to gather on a multi-ethnic and multi-faith basis.  With such diversity, multi-ethnic initiatives are a pragmatic response to making sure that individuals of all ethnicities and faith backgrounds are included. Such initiatives are yet to be developed in rural Devon and have yet to find a recognised home. Given the variety of initiatives and centres of activity in Exeter, such as the Global Centre, the Racial Equality Council, and faith centres, it is important that networking takes place between them to ensure that individuals have the opportunity to find out about everything that is currently available.

| 14. Closer  look at trans-racial adoption |
| --- |
| We collated 2 suggestions from participants under this heading. |
| For these participants, addressing the problems of trans-cultural adoption and promotion of co-cultural adoption were the key measures that needed to be taken. |
| 🕬 *The main problem is white parents adopting or fostering Black kids. You need to encourage more Black people to foster or mentor Black kids.* |

More information about some issues raised by adopted Black and Minority Ethnic participants can be found in chapter 10 within the section on *children and services.*


This handbook and supporting tools ⚒ can be accessed at www.DevonREC.org

# RESOURCES LIST

| |
|---|
| **Some sources of information and help** |
| Demographic data and statistics |

- This Handbook, Census 1991 & 2001 information in chapter 3.
- www.ons.gov.uk  Census and other data.
- Life in Devon website www.devon.gov.uk/lifeindevon

| |
|---|
| Research and survey findings – local and national |

- This Handbook
- DCC Information Centre E-mail: info@devon.gov.uk
- Commission for Racial Equality main site and *Connections Magazine* accessible via www.cre.gov.uk
- Black Information Link www.blink.org.uk
- Joseph Rowntree Foundation www.jrf.org.uk
- Scarman Centre research on rural racism in Suffolk www.le.ac.uk/scarman/researchmain.html
- Professional Institutes
- Devon Strategic Partnership website including Mori research on what people think of life in Devon www.devonsp.org.uk
- Research done by Race Priority Action Teams – including Teignbridge and South Hams RPATS
- Devon Consultation Group (contact Malcolm MacDonald at Devon County Council)

(Also see articles and journals, below)

| |
|---|
| Impact Assessment and Race Equality Scheme Action Planning. |

- An Impact Assessment method and definitions of Institutional Racism and Racist Incidents (chapters 4,7,11 in this Handbook)
- *Race is Relevant* a guide on Impact Assessment can be ordered from DIALOG@lg-employers.gov.uk.
- Local Government Equality Standards
- Commission for Race Equality performance management guidance www.cre.gov.uk
- Diversity in Action in Local Government (DIALOG) www.lg-employers.gov.uk/dialog/current/ca.htm - Comparable policies and Impact Assessments done by other public bodies

---

| Toolkits, resources, good practice guidance |
| --- |

- Tools in this Handbook ✖ see contents
- www.dmuracetoolkit.com housing toolkit
- www.raceactionnet.co.uk challenging neighbourhood racism
- www.devon.gov.uk/dcs anti-racism in curriculum and education
- www.hospitalchaplain.com faith and culture in health care
- www.sccd.org.uk/resources Networking and other resource packs
- www.connexions_cd.org.uk/pdf/Travellers_making_Cxs.pdf *Travellers Making Connexions* Traveller Youth issues manual
- www.healthforum.org.uk The Health Forum (pan Devon Multi Agency forum) will also be publishing a Manual for Health work and multi-agency initiatives with Travellers on the theme of 'Traveller's Wellbeing' available online from October 2003
- *Traveller Education Service:* Redworth House, Ashburton Rd, Totnes, TQ9 5JZ. 01392 386811 or at the Traveller Education Resource Base in Plymouth on 01752 256739 (Wednesday afternoons).
- *Gypsy Liaison officer* 01884 243819 Pblayney@devon.gov.uk Alexandra Lodge, 5 Old Road, Tiverton EX16 4HQ
- *ACAS* www.acas.org.uk – equality in employment issues
- *ACAS Bullying and Harrassment at Work – a guide for employers* www.acas.org.uk/publications/AL04.html
- ***ACAS Bullying and Harassment at Work – guidance for employees*** www.acas.org.uk/publications/AL05.html

| Community views (including voluntary and community sector organisations working with Black and Minority Ethnic people) |
| --- |

- This handbook
- Expert & Community contributors/ citizen's panels & juries (The Racial Equality Council may be able to suggest some contributors – you'll need to pay expenses).
- Directory of Useful Contacts http://www.devon.gov.uk/diversity
- Guide to Culture and Religion http://www.devon.gov.uk/diversity
- Results of your own consultation, involvement and engagement activities (built up over time)

| |
|---|
| Staff and client feedback ( ➔ if you monitor these by ethnicity) from: |

➔  Complaints procedures
➔  Staff suggestion schemes
➔  Staff, client and public surveys
➔  Staff performance appraisals
➔  Whistle blowing procedures

- Equality Champions and Equality Steering Group Members
- Feedback and advice from the Devon Racial Equality Council  on complainant aid
- Trade Union stewards
- Guidance on How to Introduce Ethnic Monitoring in Service Delivery www.devon.gov.uk/diversity
- Ethnic Monitoring – A Guide for Public Authorities (Non-Statutory) available from the DCC Information Centre, County Hall, Exeter.
- Ethnicity monitoring form in chapter 11 of this Handbook.

**Journals and articles**

- Commission for Racial Equality Connections Magazine (as above)
- Devon County Council Information Centre www.devon.gov.uk
- Diversity in Action in Local Government (DIALOG) (as above)

**Some of the reports referenced during the Rural Outreach Project:-**

➔  Amliwala. U (2000) *Equality through Partnership: Equal Voice Follow-on Report*.  Summary Report.  Portsmouth Racial Equality Action Group.
➔  Azar. 1999 M *Exeter in Black & White.* A joint project with Devon County Council, University of Exeter, Department of Politics.
➔  Baldwin. M (1996) *White Anti-Racism: Is it Really 'No Go' in Rural Areas*. Social Work Education 1996 Vol 15. No.1.
➔  Brown. M *The Unheard Cries* (1998) CRE Connections Magazine.
➔  Centre for Enterprise and Economic Development Research, Middlesex University Business School (2000) *Mapping Ethnic Minority Owned Businesses in Devon and Cornwall - Who are they and what are their needs?* Executive Summary Report for Prosper.
➔  Commission for Racial Equality *Equal Opportunities Is Your Business Too:* Good Practice Guide for Small Firms.  CRE, Equal Opp's Commission, NDC.
➔  Commission for Racial Equality *Ethnic Minority Women* CRE Fact sheet 1997.

→ Commission for Racial Equality *Standards for Community Development*

→ Dalech.M (1998) *Challenging Racism in the Rural Idyll,* Final Report of the Rural Race Equality Project, Cornwall, Devon & Somerset 1996-8. NACAB

→ De Lima, Philomena JF *Rural racism: mapping the problem, and defining practical policy recommendations.* Draft report copy of research commissioned by the CRE.

→ DETR (2000) *New Deal for Communities: Race Equality Guidance.* Department of the Environment, Transport and the Regions.

→ *The invisibility of Gypsies and other Travellers* Friends, Families & Travellers Newsletter. Jan - Mch 2000.

→ Givens.N, Almeida.D, Holden.C & Taylor.B (1999) *Swimming with the tide: ethnic minority experiences in initial teacher education.* Multicultural Teaching. Pub Trentham Books

→ Government document 2003 *The Race Relations Act 1976 (Amendment) Regulations 2003.*

→ Government document 22/10/02. *Statutory Instrument, Religion or Belief Discrimination* (coming into force 2/12/03).

→ Government document October 2002 *Equality & Diversity – The way ahead.*. Briefing on changes to the law and changes lead by European directive.

→ Government document October 2002. *Equality & Diversity – Making it happen.* Government briefing on proposed government equalities infrastructure.

→ Halliday. Dr.J (1999) *Telling a different tale: Social Needs in Rural Devon*. Devon Community Foundation.

→ Hawes. D.J. (1996) *Delivering Health and Welfare Services to Gypsies and Travellers.* NHS Executive South and West.

→ Henderson. P & Kaur. R (Ed.) (1999) *Rural Racism in the UK: Examples of Community Based Responses.* Community Development Foundation Publications.

→ Home Office (1999) *Stephen Lawrence Inquiry: Home Secretary's Action Plan*.

→ Home Office (2000) *Stephen Lawrence Inquiry: Home Secretary's Action Plan – First Annual Report on Progress.*

→ Home Office *The Stephen Lawrence Inquiry Report* Home Office.

→ Jay. E (1992) *"Keep them in Birmingham"* – Challenging racism in South-West England. Commission for Racial Equality.

- Jones. A *Ethnic Record Keeping and Monitoring Systems (ERKM) pack* Devon County Council
- Jones. A & Mullins. D (1998) *Out if Sight Out of Mind: The assessment and provision for black and minority ethnic housing needs in the South-west.* Centre for Urban and Regional Studies, University of Birmingham.
- Kingsley. S *Ethnicity Monitoring in Primary Care: Key Findings of Projects in Liverpool, London and East Midlands.* Department of Health Ethnicity Monitoring Project:
- *Race equality improvement project for local authorities with small Black, Asian, and Ethnic Minority populations.* Local Government Association www.lg-employers.gov.uk/equal-pol-sl.html
- Mackeith. L (2003) *'Local Black History - a Beginning in Devon'* A brief booklet on the history of people of African descent, commissioned by the Archive and Museum of Black Heritage. Email AMBH for details <admin@aambh.or.uk>
- Mc Leod, Owen & Khamis. *Black & Minority Ethnic Voluntary & Community Organisations – Their role and future development in England and Wales.* Executive Summary Joseph Rowntree Foundation.
- *Minority Ethnic Issues in Social Exclusion and Neigbourhood Renewal.* www.cabinet-office.gov.uk/seu/index/minority.htm
- Moussa Jogee, Saroj Lal. (1999) *Religions and Cultures - Guide to Beliefs and Customs for Health Staff & Social Care Services.* Religions & Cultures Publications.
- NCVO (1994) *Staring at Invisible Women: Black and ethnic minority women in rural areas research report.* National Council of Voluntary Organisations
- Nizhar. P (1995) *"No Problem Here? Race Issues in Shropshire".* Race Equality Forum for Telford and Shropshire.
- Nota. J (2001). *Organisational Development & Capacity Building: an assessment of its relevance, meaning and application to contemporary EMVOs in the UK.*
- OFSTED *Raising the attainment of minority ethnic pupils - School and LEA responses* Office for Standards in Education
- Suzin. K (1996) *Voices from the Margins: A Qualitative study of the experience of black people in Devon.* University of Exeter.
- Swarup.N (1992) *Equal Voice: Black communities' views on housing health and social services.* Social Services Research and Information Unit, Portsmouth Polytechnic.

→ The Runnymede Trust (1994) *Multi-Ethnic Britain: Facts and Trends* The Runnymede Trust

→ The Runnymede Trust *Cohesion & Justice in the future of Britain*. Summary of the Parekh Report. Runnymede Trust.

→ Walker. J (2000) *Rural Anti-Racsim Project Report*. National Council for Voluntary Organisations.

| Some other useful website links |
|---|
| Black South West - www.bswn.org.uk |
| Bullyonline - www.bullyonline.org |
| Equality South West - www.equalitysouthwest.org.uk |
| Fair Play SW - www.fairplaysw.org.uk |
| Rural Race Equality Project - www.rrep.org.uk |
| Black Britain - www.blackbritain.co.uk |
| Black Environment Network - www.ben-network.org.uk |
| Black Information Link - www.blink.org.uk |
| Commission for Racial Equality - www.cre.gov.uk |
| Empower Net - www.empowernet.org |
| European Commission Against Racism – www.ecri.coe.int |
| Equality Alliance - www.equalityalliance.org.uk |
| Equality Direct Helpline - www.equalitydirect.org.uk |
| Equal Opportunities Commission - www.eoc.org.uk |
| International Centre for Holocaust Remembrance www.wiesenthal.com |
| Independent Race and Refugee News Network (IRR News) www.irr.org.uk/news |
| Multikulti - www.multikulti.org.uk |
| Multifaithnet – www.multifaithnet.org/index.html |
| National Civil Rights Movement – www.ncrm.org.uk/southwest/index |
| Race on the Agenda **-** www.rota.org.uk |
| The Monitoring Group – www.monitoring-group.co.uk |

Any omissions/errors/feedback?
Please contact us at the Racial Equality Council at - www.DevonREC.org